

Matawan-Aberdeen Regional School District Evaluation Committee Report for the Custodial & Management Services RFP

1. List of Proposers:

- Pritchard
- Aramark
- S.J. Services

2. List of Evaluation Committee Members:

- Lindsey Case, Business Administrator
- Richard Carlson, Director of Operations & Maintenance
- Christopher Villa, Supervisor of Operations & Maintenance
- Michael Wells, Principal

Evaluation Committee Report

3. Cost of Proposals (Ranked from lowest to highest five-year price):

Matawan-Aberdeen COST COMPARISON OVER 5 YEARS							
Description	Details	Pritchard		Aramark		SJ Services	
		Percent	Total Charges	Percent	Total Charges	Percent	Total Charges
Custodial	Charge for Employee Wages		\$7,308,288.00		\$7,377,518.16		\$7,767,552.00
	Charge for Health Care Benefits	40%	\$2,922,240.00	42%	\$3,104,924.29	34%	\$2,651,303.00
	Charge for Other Fringe Benefits	0%	\$0.00	0%	\$0.00	15%	\$1,185,841.00
	Charge for Payroll Taxes	17%	\$1,224,138.24	16%	\$1,154,243.62	19%	\$1,514,670.00
	No. of FTEs (1 FTE=2080 Hrs. per Yr.) -		32.00		32.00		32.00
	Avg. Hrly. Wage Rate (Excl. Benes. & Taxes) -		\$21.96		\$22.17		\$23.34
Custodial Overtime	Charge for Employee Wages		\$375,186.60		\$378,740.68		\$398,763.90
	Charge for Payroll Taxes	17%	\$62,843.76	16%	\$59,255.57	19%	\$77,756.00
	Number of Annual Hours		11,390		11,390		11,390
	Avg. Wage Rate Excl. Benefits & Taxes		\$32.94		\$33.25		\$35.01
Custodial - Head/Leads	Charge for Employee Wages		\$1,744,288.00		\$1,751,263.06		\$1,844,752.00
	Charge for Health Care Benefits	37%	\$639,240.00	40%	\$701,111.94	35%	\$652,323.00
	Charge for Other Fringe Benefits	0%	\$0.00	0%	\$0.00	15%	\$273,360.00
	Charge for Payroll Taxes	17%	\$292,168.24	16%	\$273,992.44	19%	\$359,723.00
	No. of FTEs (1 FTE=2080 Hrs. per Yr.) -		7.00		7.00		7.00
	Avg. Hrly. Wage Rate (Excl. Benes. & Taxes) -		\$23.96		\$24.06		\$25.34
Custodial Heads/Lead Overtime	Charge for Employee Wages		\$143,760.00		\$144,334.87		\$152,040.00
	Charge for Payroll Taxes	17%	\$24,079.80	16%	\$22,581.79	19%	\$29,645.00
	Number of Annual Hours		4,000		4,000		4,000
	Avg. Wage Rate Excl. Benefits & Taxes		\$35.94		\$36.08		\$38.01
Courier	Charge for Employee Wages		\$228,384.00		\$227,742.73		\$231,545.60
	Charge for Health Care Benefits	42%	\$95,880.00	44%	\$100,158.85	25%	\$58,000.00
	Charge for Other Fringe Benefits	0%	\$0.00	0%	\$0.00	7%	\$16,597.00
	Charge for Payroll Taxes	17%	\$38,254.32	16%	\$35,631.30	19%	\$45,148.00
	No. of FTEs (1 FTE=2080 Hrs. per Yr.) -		1.00		1.00		1.00
	Avg. Hrly. Wage Rate (Excl. Benes. & Taxes) -		\$21.96		\$21.90		\$22.26
General Manager	Charge for Employee Wages		\$568,464.00		\$509,402.36		\$524,014.40
	Charge for Health Care Benefits	8%	\$46,800.00	17%	\$87,468.41	11%	\$58,000.00
	Charge for Other Fringe Benefits	0%	\$0.00	0%	\$0.00	5%	\$26,008.00
	Charge for Payroll Taxes	17%	\$95,217.72	15%	\$77,644.40	19%	\$102,180.00
	No. of FTEs (1 FTE=2080 Hrs. per Yr.) -		1.00		1.00		1.00
	Avg. Hrly. Wage Rate (Excl. Benes. & Taxes) -		\$54.66		\$48.98		\$50.39
Custodial Evening Supervisor/s	Charge for Employee Wages		\$337,970.00		\$346,199.40		\$344,448.00
	Charge for Health Care Benefits	14%	\$46,800.00	17%	\$59,445.17	17%	\$58,000.00
	Charge for Other Fringe Benefits	0%	\$0.00	0%	\$0.00	5%	\$18,484.00
	Charge for Payroll Taxes	17%	\$56,609.98	15%	\$51,604.62	19%	\$67,164.00
	No. of FTEs (1 FTE=2080 Hrs. per Yr.) -		1.00		1.00		1.00
	Avg. Hrly. Wage Rate (Excl. Benes. & Taxes) -		\$32.50		\$33.29		\$33.12
Clerical	Charge for Employee Wages		\$277,056.00		\$284,004.71		\$279,780.80
	Charge for Health Care Benefits	0%	\$0.00	11%	\$31,854.81	21%	\$58,000.00
	Charge for Other Fringe Benefits	0%	\$0.00	0%	\$0.00	5%	\$14,917.00
	Charge for Payroll Taxes	17%	\$46,406.88	16%	\$44,433.73	19%	\$54,554.00
	No. of FTEs (1 FTE=2080 Hrs. per Yr.) -		1.00		1.00		1.00
	Avg. Hrly. Wage Rate (Excl. Benes. & Taxes) -		\$26.64		\$27.31		\$26.90
Contractor Start Up Charges – attach detail breakdown							
Years total amount amortized over: 5	Input Total Start Up Charges Amount		\$0		\$0		\$0
Contractor Equipment Budget/Pool =	\$125,000						
Years total amount amortized over: 5	Total Equip. Budget Pool Amount	\$125,000.00	\$125,000.00	\$125,000.00	\$125,000.00	\$125,000.00	\$125,000.00
Contractor Charge for Computerized Quality Assurance System			\$2,750.00		\$1,274.19		\$15,000.00
Contractor Charge for Office and or Warehouse Rent			\$0.00		\$0.00		\$0.00
Contractor Charge for Required Office Equipment			\$3,685.00		\$52,321.53		\$35,000.00
Contractor Charge for Supplies & On-Going Operating Costs							
Enter Cost Per Employee	Input Cost for Employee	\$2,167.87	\$466,092.63	\$1,087.97	\$233,914.14	\$2,760.20	\$593,443.00
Contractor Management Fee		3.4%	\$601,006.11	3.5%	\$626,996.13	1.7%	\$345,000.00
District Charge for Contract Monitoring			\$126,720.00		\$126,720.00		\$126,720.00
Total Contract Charge Over Five Years			\$17,899,329.27	\$17,989,782.89	\$20,104,732.70		

Evaluation Committee Report

4. Evaluation Criteria - The following was the criteria used by the committee in evaluating the proposals:

The Criteria Used in Evaluating Proposals <i>The points awarded range from 1 to 5, with 5 being the highest score and 1 being the lowest</i>	Weighting Factor	Points
1. Program Price: What is the price of the program proposed and its impact upon the District's operating budgets? Are the charges detailed in the proposal form realistic, i.e., Health care costs, payroll taxes, management fee, etc.	15%	1 to 5
2. Contractor's financial viability, strength, capability and record of performance: Considers the Contractor's capability and experience as measured by financial statements, performance record, litigation, years in the industry, number of public school districts served and references.	12%	1 to 5
3. On-Site Management: Considers the references; proposal resumes, face to face interviews and any other method to discover the capabilities and skill level of the on-site management. At a minimum the proposed candidate must demonstrate the following: On- site Manager(s): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Should have at least two years' experience in managing a comparable sized public school district. • Should have four years' experience in the custodial management industry. • Must have a high school diploma or GED equivalent diploma. • Must be in the process of obtaining or have a Black Seal License by 7-1-2026. • For public safety requirements and in case of an emergency, the General Manager/s must be fluent in English and able to effectively communicate with the District's staff, fire, police and the public in the respective buildings by being able to read, write, speak and understand English. Daytime custodians must also be capable of communicating effectively both in-person as well as via email. On- site Supervisor(s): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Should have at least one year experience in managing a comparable sized public school district. • Should have two years' experience in the custodial management industry. • Should have a high school diploma or GED equivalent diploma. • Must be in the process of obtaining or have a Black Seal License by 7-1-2026. • For public safety requirements and in case of an emergency, the Supervisor/s must be fluent in English and able to effectively communicate with the District's staff, fire, police and the public in the respective buildings by being able to read, write, speak and understand English. Daytime custodians must also be capable of communicating effectively both in-person as well as via email. 	25%	1 to 5
4. Staffing Viability: Considers whether proposed wages and staffing levels are sufficient to recruit and maintain a stable workforce by the proposed wage rates to the following: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The current outsourced average wage rates and wages as detailed in Exhibit 6. • The Consultant's Recommended Staffing, Wage Rates and Salaries as detailed in Exhibit 7. • Are benefits and paid time off provided/offered and employee contribution to insurance premiums and copays/deductibles sufficient to recruit and maintain a stable workforce? • Is the number of proposed custodial, management and clerical staff sufficient to meet the Scope of Work in this RFP? • Can the Contractor meet the Black Seal requirement? 	24%	1 to 5
5. Contractor's Proposed Program: Are the Proposer's program, systems, training, and procedures for custodial and management services thorough and comprehensive to meet the scope of work?	10%	1 to 5
6. Contractor's Start Up/Transition Plan: Is the Proposer's start-up plan customized to the needs of the District? Is the plan detailed from pre-planning (30 days prior to the start of the contract) through the start of the contract and the first three months to September 30, 2026? Did it detail the additional management and resources they shall be providing as well as the startup task, any requirements for the District, implementation date, estimated completion date, and who is responsible (name and title)? Did the plan have 100 or more different (not repetitive) tasks listed covering the startup activities in implementation, management, HR, custodial and training? Was it submitted in Excel format or a Gantt chart?	14%	1 to 5

Evaluation Committee Report

5. Scoring: The following are the actual and weighted points for each proposer:

TOTALS							
CRITERIA	Weighing Percent	Points Awarded (1 to 5)			Weighted Points		
		Pritchard	Aramark	S.J. Services	Pritchard	Aramark	S.J. Services
Program Price:	15%	18.00	17.40	7.00	2.70	2.61	1.05
Contractor's capability and record of performance:	12%	15.00	20.00	11.00	1.80	2.40	1.32
On-Site Management:	25%	16.00	19.00	13.50	4.00	4.75	3.38
Staffing Viability	24%	16.00	17.50	12.00	3.84	4.20	2.88
Contractor's Proposed Program:	10%	15.50	18.50	16.00	1.55	1.85	1.60
Contractor's Start Up/Transition Plan:	14%	16.00	18.00	14.00	2.24	2.52	1.96
TOTALS	100%	96.50	110.40	73.50	16.13	18.33	12.19

6. Scoring Summary

- a. **Aramark: 18.33 Points** – Aramark had the second lowest Program Price. Contractor's Capability and Record of Performance was based on the references provided as well as financial stability, earning first place. For On-Site Management, Aramark's proposed candidate stood out as being the strongest. Aramark ranked first in Staffing Viability, Contractor's Proposed Program and Contractor's Start Up/Transition Plan.
- b. **Pritchard: 16.13 Points** – Pritchard had the lowest Program Price, earning first place. The school districts served, and references had them placed second for Contractor's Capability and Record of Performance. Pritchard's proposed candidate ranked second for On-Site Management and they ranked second in Staffing Viability. Pritchard ranked third for Contractor's Proposed Program and second for Contractor's Start Up/Transition Plan.
- c. **S.J. Services: 12.19 Points** – S.J. Services had the third lowest Program Price. The school districts served, and references had them placed third for Contractor's Capability and Record of Performance. S.J. Services' proposed candidate ranked third for On-Site Management. They ranked third in Staffing Viability and second for Contractor's Proposed Program. Campus Services ranked third for Contractor's Startup/Transition Plan.

7. Recommendation of the Matawan-Aberdeen Regional School District's Custodial & Management Services RFP Evaluation Committee:

- Upon review of the proposals submitted and based upon the RFP evaluation criteria, the committee concludes that Aramark's 2026-2031 Custodial & Management Services RFP proposal is most advantageous for the Matawan-Aberdeen Reginal School District.