

SCHOOL COMMITTEE

(Official Report)

Regular Meeting

January 2, 2018

Called for 6:00 p.m. in the Dr. Henrietta S. Attles Meeting Room, Cambridge Rindge and Latin School, 459 Broadway, Cambridge, for the purpose of discussing any and all business that may properly come before the Committee. The School Committee will vote on adoption of the FY2018 Proposed School Department Budget.

Members Present: Ms. Bowman, Ms. Dexter, Mr. Fantini, Ms. Kelly, Mr. Kimbrough, Ms. Nolan and Mayor McGovern

Also Present: Student School Committee Members Juliette Low-Fleury and Paul Sullivan

Mayor McGovern in the Chair.

A quorum of the School Committee being present, the Chair called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m. and read the call of the meeting.

1. Public Comment:

No one signed up for public comment

Mayor McGovern spoke about the common goal of the City Councilors and School Committee; noting both sides will accomplish their common assignments even though they may not always agree and may become frustrated at times. That is okay if we remember that as long as we care about all children, we will succeed.

On a motion by Ms. Nolan, seconded by Ms. Bowman, it was voted to close public comment.

2. Student School Committee Report:

Paul Sullivan reported that today was the first day back for students, a wonderful warm sub-zero day with lots of learning happening.

Juliette Low Fleury had no news to report.

Ms. Nolan brought up the fact that there has been some feedback from parents over cold schools and transportation issues. Superintendent Salim asked Mr. Maloney to come to the table and explain what is happening with the heat situations in the schools and delays with the MBTA. Mr. Maloney agreed that it was a challenging morning; there was some trouble in individual unit vents in some classrooms at the Cambridgeport, Amigos, CRLS, Longfellow and the King Open. They had no heat and the issues were resolved by late morning. Unfortunately, some classes were 45 degrees, therefore once the issues were resolved it still took quite some time for the rooms to actually warm up.

The diesel busses had a hard time once they left the Somerville yard, due to fuel coagulating which makes for obvious functioning problems. Messages regarding these issues were communicated over twitter about 7:15 a.m., however not everyone received the messages.

Mr. Fantini thanked the administration adding parents informed him their phone calls were responded to and communication remained ongoing throughout the morning. This is very important and the effort is appreciated. Mr. Maloney gave the credit to his assistant, Ms. Joanne Johnson.

Mayor McGovern introduced his Educational Liaison, Ms. Elizabeth Liss, to all in attendance and announced that Ms. Kathleen Kelly was elected Vice Chair of the School Committee.

3. Presentation of the Records for Approval:

On a motion by Ms. Nolan, seconded by Ms. Bowman, on a voice vote, it was voted to accept the Minutes of the Regular Meeting of November 21, 2017 as presented.

4. Reconsiderations: None

5. Unfinished Business/Calendar: None

6. Awaiting Reports: None

7. Superintendent's Agenda:

7a. Presentations: None

7b. Innovation Agenda:

7c. Consent Agenda:

Ms. Kelly moved, seconded by Ms. Dexter, to bring forward the Superintendent's Consent Agenda for discussion and adoption. Mr. Fantini moved, seconded by Ms. Bowman, for adoption of the Superintendent's Consent Agenda, on the following roll call vote, **items #18-01 through #18-04** were adopted: Ms. Bowman YEA; Ms. Dexter YEA; Mr. Fantini YEA; Ms. Kelly YEA; Mr. Kimbrough YEA; Ms. Nolan YEA ; Mayor McGovern YEA.

#18-01 Special Needs Contracts for Day and Residential Program Services not Available from the Cambridge School Department: that the School Committee award contracts to the institutions as detailed in the list in amounts not to exceed the shown rates, having been approved by the Operational Services Division of the Commonwealth of Massachusetts, funds to be provided from the General Fund Budget and/or Grant Fund Budget.

	#	Amount
Day Program Tuition Contracts	2	\$75,585.88
Residential Program Tuition Contracts	0	
45 Day Program Contracts	0	
Total	2	<u>\$75,585.88</u>

#18-02 Contract Award: that the School Committee award a contract to the following vendor for Professional Development, funds to be provided from the General Fund Budget, Chapter 30B of the laws of the Commonwealth of Massachusetts having been complied with:

Commonwealth Learning Center, 220 Reservoir St. #6, Needham, for the period November 1, 2017 to June 30, 2018, in the amount of \$32,500.00.

#18-03 Contract Award: that the School Committee award a contract to the following vendor for Plumbing and Maintenance, funds to be provided from the General Fund Budget, Chapter 30B of the laws of the Commonwealth of Massachusetts having been complied with:

Metropolitan Pipe, 303 Binney Street, Cambridge, for the period November 1, 2017 to June 30, 2018, in the amount of \$70,000.00.

#18-04 Approval of Gifts to Cambridge Public Schools, that the School Committee accept and approve the following gifts and receipts as described:

1. \$5,000 to the Rindge School of Technical Arts' Culinary Arts Program made from New England Development Co., for student participation in the Cambridgeside Half Marathon. Funds will be used for food costs as well as chef coats for graduating Level 3 Culinary Arts students.
2. \$300.00 to the Rindge School of Technical Arts Carpentry program made from Carpenters Local Union No. 40. Funds will be used to purchase tool boxes and other instructional materials.

8. Non-Consent Agenda: Nothing was moved to the non-consent Agenda.

9. School Committee Agenda (Policy Matters/Notification/Requests for Information):

On a motion by Ms. Kelly, seconded by Ms. Bowman, on a voice vote, it was voted to bring the School Committee Agenda forward for discussion and adoption. Ms. Kelly removed item **#18-05** and **#18-06**, Ms. Dexter removed item **#18-07**, Ms. Nolan removed item **#18-08**.

On a motion by Ms. Bowman, seconded by Ms. Nolan, on a voice vote, it was voted to accept the Report of the December 7, 2017 Buildings and Grounds Sub-Committee.

#18-05, Motion by the Budget Sub-Committee, that the FY 2019 Budget Calendar be shared with Budget Sub-Committee Members, the Committee of the Whole.

Ms. Kelly amended the motion to not only be shared with the Committee of the Whole but also be adopted by the School Committee.

Mr. Fantini suggested placing **item #18-05** on the calendar for the Budget Co-Chairs review.

Ms. Dexter likes Mr. Fantini's idea and suggested the School Committee have a Joint Roundtable with the City Council.

Ms. Nolan is concerned about not adopting the calendar until 3 days before a public hearing.

Ms. Kelly commented that the need to stay in close communication with the district leadership, the Superintendent and the Cabinet means this process needs to move forward asap.

Dr. Salim shares Ms. Nolan's concern about making sure the community knows about public hearings. We do not have a lot of time to wait.

Mr. Fantini motioned, seconded Mayor McGovern, to divide the motion and adopt the dates up to January, and place all dates after January on the Calendar. On a voice vote, the amendment was adopted. On a voice vote, the motion was adopted as amended: *that the FY 2019 Budget Calendar be divided to amend and adopt the January dates on the attached calendar and the remaining dates be placed on the Calendar: January dates include the following Public Hearings:*

That on Saturday, January 20, 2018, the Budget Sub-Committee (Committee of the Whole) will hold a Public Hearing on the FY 2019 Budget Priorities at 10:30 a.m. that will end by 12:30 p.m.

That on Tuesday, January 23, 2018, the Budget Sub-Committee (Committee of the Whole) will hold a Public Hearing on the FY 2019 Budget Priorities for Educators and Members of the Community at 3:30 p.m. and that will end by 5:30 p.m.

That the remaining dates in February, 2018 through May, 2018, be placed on the Calendar.

#18-06, Motion by Mr. Fantini, that given the importance of having a strong relationship with the Cambridge Education Association (CEA) that the School Committee invite the President of the CEA to have a seat along with all School Committee Members and Student School Committee Members. And further that our agenda be changed to add an item that allows the President to address the Committee at each meeting.

Ms. Kelly asked that this motion be referred to the Governance Sub-Committee.

Ms. Bowman and Ms. Dexter both let it be known that they would like to have the conversation tonight.

Mr. Fantini raised the question as to whether or not the CEA President will be able to speak on any issues or only teacher issues. There may be times when the relationship between the CEA and the School Committee are strained; it can be a plus to have the CEA President at the table with the Members.

Mayor McGovern mentioned the value of doing the work in the Governance Sub-Committee and then bringing a recommendation to the School Committee instead of doing the work on the floor at a meeting of the Committee of Whole.

Ms. Bowman stated she usually feels the same; but in this case, she would rather move the motion forward and then work the details out in Governance. Ms. Bowman suggested an amendment to send it to the Governance Sub-Committee after it has been moved forward.

The Superintendent stated that he appreciates the sentiment, but there are some details and there are some parameters that need to be reviewed by legal counsel.

Ms. Nolan supports the spirit of this motion. She suggested we work out the details first if they are not worked out, the motion will become moot.

Ms. Kelly stated she would like her sheet of submissions for positions of Sub-Committee Memberships back to her within a week.

Ms. Nolan suggested having the motion enacted by February.

Ms. MacFarlane addressed the assembly stating it is required that the Governance Sub-Committee go through the Rules of the School Committee in order to begin an appropriate process of amending the Rules and having them adopted, setting parameters with clear rules, guideline and clear structures on issues like Executive Sessions and be put in writing. On a voice vote, it was voted to adopt **item #18-06** as *amended and referred to the Governance Sub-Committee with a goal of bringing recommendations back to the Committee of the Whole by the first meeting in February.*

#18-07, Motion by Mr. Fantini, that the Superintendent provide in accordance with regulations from the Department of Education "The percentage of Vocational Technical education program graduates who are employed in a field related to their program of study, in a military program related to their program of study, or who are enrolled in postsecondary education or advanced training twelve months after graduation" This should be provided by each Ch. 74 program we have.

Further any other data that is used to track the success of our graduates be provided.

Ms. Dexter removed this to hear from Mr. Fantini about what is before us.

Mr. Fantini explained that he intends to focus on Career Education this year. He wants the RSTA program to be more transparent.

Dr. Salim stated that we can work with Dr. Ananis to provide data on where our RSTA students have been working.

Ms. Nolan wonders whether there is a particular reason for only these students and not all of our students. How do we define success, understanding it is not always college.

Ms. Kelly stated she supports this motion and the particular focus being on Vocational Tech and having college credits available in high school is a statewide initiative from the DESE. She would like to develop a sub-committee to work on these issues. Accessing community college courses while in high school was also brought up.

Ms. Bowman wants us to remember the district planning framework and make sure this motion ties into it.

Mr. Kimbrough also supports this motion and talked about tracking students 2 or 3 years down the road after they graduate from RSTA.

Dr. Salim answered that they are graduating in 6 years instead of 4. It is a national issue that they have been watching the disparities widen. They want to start having surveys of recent alums.

Ms. Dexter feels this motion fits in squarely with equity and access. She suggested to amend the motion to add two things:

1. How many students are enrolled in each Chapter 74 program at RSTA.
2. Have a Roundtable on post secondary outcomes with the office of College Success to discuss outcomes beyond high school.

Mr. Kimbrough mentioned career tracking data rather than post college success. Having worked in the schools as a guidance counselor; he does not have any information on students post graduation, it would be good to know what careers they go into.

Dr. Salim will follow up with more specific information on these questions.

Mr. Fantini stated some students graduate from high school with 12 college credits. Bunker Hill offers one course at our high school. This is an issue that should be discussed at a Roundtable. On a voice vote, on the amendment, **item #18-07** was adopted as amended. *Further any other data that is used to track the success of our graduates be provided.*

#18-08, that the Report of the December 5, 2017 Attendance Violation Policy (AV Policy) Ad Hoc Sub-Committee meeting be accepted as presented.

Attendance Violation Policy Sub-Committee Meeting
December 5, 2017 – 3:00 PM – 4:30 PM
Dr. Henrietta Attles Meeting Room

Called for the purpose of discussing the Attendance Violation Policy.

Members Present: Ms. Dexter, Chair; Ms. Kelly, Ms. Nolan

Also Present: Deputy Superintendent Turk, CPS Attorney Ms. MacFarlane, Principal Smith, Assistant Principal Tynes, Dean Espinosa, Dean VanBlaricum, Jean Cummings Cambridge Day Reporter, Juliette Low Fleury Student School Committee representative, Elaina Wolfman a Senior and member of the Cambridge Youth Council (CYC), Rory Miller a Junior and his 2nd year on the CYC, Lace Campbell CYC, Nancy Tauber of the Family Policy Council, and several students (who may be taking video and audio).

A quorum of the Sub-Committee being present, the meeting was called to order by Ms. Dexter who read the call of the meeting then turned the meeting over to Elaina Wolfman and member of the Cambridge Youth Council (CYC), then to Principal Smith.

Public Comment:

- Elaina Wolfman stated last year the CYC collaborated with administration to add on to the AV Policy to motivate disengaged students to come to school and be on time.
- There needs to be equitable penalty when “life” happens as some students don’t have parent’s to call to excuse them because of time, language barriers, etc.
- They want to have less students AV punishments and have student voice in the policy.
- Originally they wanted to have a fixed number of minutes and 12 chances to arrive more than 15 minutes late before getting an Attendance Violation (AV). The majority of kids come within the first 15-20 minute threshold. Others are chronically late rather than 5-6 minutes-15 minutes which we consider chronic.
- Every minute of 1st period counts. They know as students what they want and what is best for them. The Administration owes them the lesson if they are late, there are consequences and to show teachers that their class is important.

- There is a Problem with Aspen counting minutes. They do not want deans or clerks adding up student's late minutes at the end of a quarter.
- She passed around the buyback policy (on file in School Committee office) that is in the Handbook now.
- Students can buy back their 10% of time and make work up (work in the library, etc.).
- Students must meet with their Dean of Students for a contract to make up work, which varies by Learning Community.
- Going to the donut shop is not a good excuse (extreme circumstance).
- They don't want anything to be left to interpretation for personal bias to come in.

Ms. Dexter is happy students are involved and working with the administration in bringing this forward.

Principal Smith thanked all for the opportunity to talk about the Attendance Violation Policy (AVP) in the Handbook. When this came before the School Committee last Fall, administration was still in consultation with the CYC about the final aspects. He distributed 10 copies of a presentation that highlights some elements of the CYC's presentation to administration last Spring, stating we want to be successful with our attendance policy which will only work if students buy into it.

Principal Smith briefly explained the policy changes that have happened over the past 4-5 years. Goals of the policy is to emphasize being present and on time. Our policies are in place because we want students to understand there are consequences (losses, limits, punishment). Each student is an individual and extenuating circumstance factors need to be taken into account; not all students that gets an AV will have a point reduction. We wanted to have a policy to restore damage that tardiness and absences have caused.

He showed slides on the Attendance Violation Failure Policy (on file in the School Committee Office) There are limits before a student received an AVF a combination of 12 tardies and 4 unexcused absences – (3 unexcused tardies equals 1 absence). Last year, after exploratory meetings CYC students wanted to use a 10% reduction but students were able to do buyback. The CYC's reflection on arriving 1 minute or 15 minutes late were recorded and looked at the same way, which was true.

MBTA, traffic and bike lines can take more time to get to school and students still end up walking in right after the bell. There is an MBTA transportation screen outside the main office so we can see when the T is running late. It doesn't tell what time students will arrive and administration wants to be accommodating for that.

If student's arrive at school and haven't had breakfast, they may stop at Broadway etc. and will be late. CRLS does not keep our lunch area open because they have to transition to lunch preparation. We try to be accommodating when we know the students individual situations.

There was a proposal to create a minute policy but, ASPEN, our current student information system has no way to calculate minutes. We would have to manually calculate over a threshold of 130-180 minutes to track student's progress which would be a difficult task for the significant number of student's that come late.

There are two student "special" MBTA busses; the #69 to Lechmere and #83 to Rindge Ave. & Russell Field that leave school at 2:30 PM. Principal Smith has tried to get the MBTA to flip them to come to school rather than leave school with the T has not been successful. There is only one #72 bus coming to school dedicated to students from W. Cambridge. We support the policy brought to us this year as an opportunity that students will agree to and deans will support, because the student chooses.

We collaborated on the 17-18 AV policy and support and endorse the same number (4 unexcused/absences/12 tardies). A few weeks ago we changed from 10% to 10 Points reduction and a buy back opportunity is imbedded to earn back the grade. **AV can only be bought back once in a term.**

Over the past 4-5 years many students had to wait 5 minutes in tardy lines when they were already late. We know their intention is not to be late; they want to be on time. Now in the morning Deans are at the doors greeting students with "Good Morning, you made it here" and chat a few minutes instead of "the day just started and you're already messing up".

The 2017-18 handbook is online. We are no longer printing it.

Daily attendance is counted during block one. Teachers must review and input attendance twice during each class. ASPEN's default is Present and only changes when a staff person manually changes it. Deans review attendance daily and communicate with families through School Messenger which sends out email, phone calls, texts and online for absences and tardies. Parents can also log on to ASPEN and see student's attendance.

Language already exists in the handbook on the website. The process is not explicitly laid out in the handbook because we wanted to talk directly to the student. We were conserving information. Student and Dean speak about options (community service, a project, stay with the teacher after school), as long as they are in the process of restoring the grade and true to the contract.

Ms. Dexter asked for student questions.

Laura Marsey a Sr. shared that they had this conversation in STARRS. How can we let the whole student body know this and understand the Policy?

Principal Smith stated that we want kids here on time every day. Deans have conversations with those students about what they can do. It is in the student handbook.

Veronica Voucova a Sr. asked how does the ten point reduction affect foster children or take the bus? Do they talk to the Dean and get the same 10 point reduction?

Dean VanBlaricum answered because we were unsure if this was approved or not, this term we worked at reducing the 10% not a 10 Point reduction. Extenuating circumstances can be communicated to the guidance counselor, social worker, dean or clerk. If a student lives beyond Cambridge and rely on that service, they would not be AVF'd.

Ms. Nolan stated that the School Committee voted the new handbook language for this term on 9/5/17.

William Read a Jr. added that last week he was late for English and got marked absent but he wasn't. Last year he got a pink slip in CM and knew to get two absences excused. Some students don't look at ASPEN.

Dean VanBlaricum: 1st period daily attendance gets reported to the state and has nothing to do with our AV Policy. The teacher manually marks you from absent to tardy. It doesn't automatically upload daily. We try to catch and correct 1st period attendance. Notifications automatically call home, letters go out, and Community Meeting slips are put in Homeroom folders.

Casey Torres a Sr. asked how would the buyback work one term one semester or only one class during one quarter?

Dean Espinosa stated there is not a limit to the number of times you can buy back.

Principal Smith added in the 13-14 Policy you could only buy back one per term. We don't want to set a pattern.

Dean VB added we determine if it is a family emergency, extenuating circumstances and have to leave the country. Usually it is one hour for one day lost.

Elaina Wolfman stated the term is only 45 days and being absent 4-8 times or 20 times tardy for that time period without a parent calling is unrealistic.

Casey Torres: If student's have to travel across the buildings they are late. A lot of teachers are strict about going to the bathroom during class. If they stop on the way to class they are late. Lunch policy says no food in class there are always long lines in the café and not enough seats so students have to rush eating.

Dean Espinosa: Realistically of 2,000 students not even 5% of students AV. Only a small portion of students can't get to class on time.

Elaina Wolfman noted that students get the same punishment if they are one minute or 79 minutes late for the period so they take their time getting to class. Administration needs to figure how to incentivize students.

Casey Torres: I get to school 3 minutes early but do I get breakfast or just go to class? If I have a good relationship with the teacher, I ask can you let me slide this one time.

Yusuf Zerboa a Sr: There could be a better way to penalize rather than taking off the 10 points. If a student has an unexcused absence they cannot make up the work don't take off 10 points.

Principal Smith: We struggle with 10% vs. 10 points. If late 10 minutes you are missing content because one piece builds on another. We want students to understand there are consequences for their actions. It is important to be places on time. We are moving forward with the 10 point policy the CYC can review the policy. There should be a natural correlation between your attendance and grade in class. Data suggests there are times when they don't link up.

Elaina Wolfman stated if three quizzes are missed it would drop my grade far more than 12 absences.

Principal Smith: I'm glad the deans are reasonable. When student's come in as unexcused tardy, the teacher needs to create a consequence.

Grace McCartney a Sr. stated that ASPEN is lame, ineffective, and can't update attendance instantly, have you thought of replacing it? I'm shocked that we are inhibited by our technology if it is not serving the purpose.

Principal Smith: It is a district system. There are some challenging technological issues we have experienced. The school does the best with what we have.

Dr. Turk added she will take some of these questions to ICTS. The technology may do some things that we are not aware of and if it is something that does not work-we go from there.

Sophie Harrington: When Elaina came to talk Student Government the first thing that came to my mind is the bussing issue. It sends the wrong message to students. Why won't the T change it?

Principal Smith: In 2014-15 when the T was increasing the T-Pass we looked at all bus lines. Two that leave and one coming to school. I'd rather have students coming in on time instead of going home. We have been unsuccessful in changing them. When the King Open reopens we can revisit this. The #69 bus comes jamb packed in the am. In the afternoon the #83 goes by Russell Field in fall and spring to get kids to practice.

Sophie Harrington, Student President: In suburban communities there are school busses, has the district ever considered getting busses? I would like to have that option.

Principal Smith: We can talk to the administration about that.

Coleena McCodden a Sr. said students should be made aware of the AVF Policy, maybe have homeroom assemblies. She hasn't read the student handbook and doesn't know any students that have. More students could participate if they knew about it.

Ms. Nolan added that this started in 13-14. It was a positive collaborative effort that moved us to this point. I agree that ICTS should be sure that the Deans don't have to manually override data and Dr. Turk will follow up. It's a balance that being in class and on time and to have a restorative buy back. The buyback policy conversation with the Deans ties back to the education and being in the classroom. Community service does not contribute to time in class but it is important to have a range of options. One teacher allows something to slide and another teacher is less generous and we want teachers to be able to have a common understanding of what is sensible.

Ms. Kelly will discuss bussing with Principal Smith and the T to make changes at the state level. Could there be an additional couple of minutes for students to get from one place to the next? In terms of accountability it is how we develop our own individual sense of responsibility.

Ms Dexter: We will move to get this resolved and the community restoration process. There is still a big problem with being late 1 minute or 20. She wants students in school; this process might restore your grade but not classroom time.

Casey Torres: I don't agree with the community service. Some students can be sitting in class looking out in space, are they getting anything out of class time? I did not know about the AVF Policy until today.

Corena Espinosa: I strongly think we should abolish the AVF policy. It is an academic punishment. Humans are imperfect. It is impossible to not be biased. Students with the most difficult lives are most impacted by this. It eliminates college opportunity. It is adversarial between parents, schools and students that need these relationships. School Committee controls the budget to support students and can make changes to increase funding.

Sharon Lozada teaches the STARRS Program, asked if we can do another forum for students to talk about issues with School Committee because they know the day to day issues?

Ms. Nolan: Students can communicate through the School Committee, Principal Smith, Deans or Dr. Turk.

Casey Torres: The student is only told they are AVF'ing and he has never been told he can make it up. Put the policy message on announcements and the **WORD** (a CRLS newscast produced bi-monthly by the Media Journalism Class and viewed by the entire school community during Community Meeting) so students know they can buy back. He is going to tell all the kids.

Elaina Wolfman: In the library you get pink slips for overdue books why can't we get an email?

Juliette Low Fleury, School Committee Student Rep. said she can bring student issues to the School Committee.

Ms. Dexter: Terry Gist can give you a DVD audio recording of the meeting.

Elaina Wolfman stated that Student Government can collaborate with STARRS and CYC can make a group presentation and collaborate with administration and School Committee.

Sophie Harrington added we need better communication with more student voices through the student government facebook page.

Ms. Dexter said this will not be the last meeting.

Motion to adjourn by Ms. Nolan, seconded by Ms. Kelly.

Meeting Adjourned 4:48 PM
Terry Gist
Confidential Secretary

Documents: (on file in the School Committee Office)

- Attendance Violation "Buy Back" Proposal
- Amending the AV10 Policy (Cambridge Youth Council) Slideshow
- Email from Sarah Block (CRLS '17)

Ms. Nolan removed **item #18-08** to draw attention to some points brought up in this Report. Some students did not know of policy changes; clearly there needs to be more transparency when a policy changes. What work was done following this meeting? All work needs to be done before the semester ends, which will happen in a couple of weeks.

Dr. Salim does not have any follow up on decisions by high school administration yet, but he will make sure the Committee is made aware of decisions.

Ms. Nolan wants to make sure there is nothing the Members need to do to make sure the policy is being implemented.

Ms. Dexter stated that if there is a revised policy, it needs to be passed by the Committee of the Whole. She wants to make sure grades are not impacted negatively. The issue was brought up that the passing period is for four minutes which is not enough time for students to include going to the bathroom.

Dr. Salim stated the question is around communication and the buy back policy that was developed in collaboration by the Cambridge Youth Council and is in the Rights & Responsibilities Handbook and the Student Handbook as well.

Ms. Kelly stated as it relates to the four minute policy, it should be extended.

Mr. Sullivan commented that he was not at the Sub-Committee meeting, but there is a problem with the buy back policy. Staying after school to buy back time may not be realistic to the students that actually really need access to the buy back. It seems to be targeting certain students and wonders how it can be tailored to benefit all students.

Ms. Nolan stated that the policy is something that is done with the student and the teacher; it is not always after school, it can be at lunch, or whenever they decide.

Ms. Low Fleury stated these policy agreements are with the dean, teacher and student; the teacher has not always been there. They are always after or before school and not at lunch. Students that are late to school often have extra morning responsibilities.

Ms. Dexter would like to see some root cause analysis of why the kids (1/3) that are late are from low income families; in order to know why this is happening. There is a differential impact on low income students therefore creating an inequitable outcome. This seems to add yet one more burden to the students.

Ms. Bowman wants to hear from Dr. Salim as how this relates to part of the framework.

Dr. Salim agreed with Ms. Bowman that chronic absenteeism is part of the framework; part of the effort is to work with the principals to understand what the patterns and barriers are that contribute to it. They are investigating what the patterns at certain schools, at certain levels, around tardiness and if they related to transportation. They are looking at demographics to better understand it.

Ms. Bowman wants to know how soon we will be able to test some of the models from other sources across the country in order to implement them here in CPS.

The Superintendent is not able to provide a specific timeline at this time; however, he will be able to provide some answers to the challenges that exist soon.

Ms. Low Fleury asked what it takes to be unexcused and excused. Aspen cannot keep track of reasons. Some parents are not able to call in for their child which means those kids are not excused. Again, there is an imbalance.

The Superintendent explained they still need to define approved and non approved absence.

Mr. Fantini noted that we could redefine the amount of days for chronic absenteeism and once you hit a certain number you are required to make up days on Saturday. He believes student attendance will pick up. Ten days may be too many days.

Dr. Salim spoke about the value of being in class on time.

Ms. Dexter will try to call a follow up Sub-Committee about this. What about restorative justice? She asked the Committee of the Whole if they are comfortable with students having their grades lowered this semester?

Mayor McGovern voiced his concerns regarding the students that are not in the know vs. the students that are in the know. He also spoke to ten days vs. five absent. The communication piece is the largest piece; he wonders how many students actually read the student handbook. Speaking for himself as a parent, there is a lot of signing without reading. The reality is that when you have 5 inches of paperwork to sign, you honestly cannot read it all.

Ms. Bowman reminded the assembly we voted to create a Communications Sub-Committee.

Mr. Sullivan added to this conversation about communication is similar to the dress code policy they used to have. If students don't know the rules and regulations, empowerment is being denied to the students.

Mr. Fantini moved, seconded by Ms. Nolan item **#18-09**, the Report of the December 7, 2017 Buildings & Grounds Sub-Committee meeting be accepted as presented.

Buildings and Grounds Sub-Committee Meeting
School Committee Room
December 7, 2017
6:00 PM – 8:00 PM

Called for the purpose of reviewing the rental agreement policy, family bathroom accessibility in CPS buildings and CPS sustainability report.

Members Present: Ms. Bowman, Chair; Mr. Fantini, Ms. Nolan

Also Present: Mr. Maloney, COO; Ms. Spinner, CFO; Mr. Konjic, Director of Facilities; Chris Lim, Susan Ruff, Alex Loud, Tina Kapur, Robert Harmon, Seth Yarden, Doug Feinburg, Matthew Mazzotta, Robin Chen, Irving Allen

A quorum of the Sub-Committee being present, the meeting was called to order by the Chair, Ms. Bowman, who read the call of the meeting then turned it over to Mr. Maloney

Mr. Maloney stated that we did not change the Rental Agreement Policy, we implemented an on line system for better record keeping that is more user friendly. Our gyms, cafeterias and auditoriums take a lot of abuse by the public. He reminded all that we are first an educational institution and that facilities is

the last to be given funds. We would like a greater fee schedule but did not propose that. The existing policy from 2001 calls for 4 hours on Saturday and Sunday and some weeknights for the 2 gyms to be used for youth groups. So that no group monopolizes the gyms no groups get more than 4 weeks use of the facility. At one time there was a scholarship of \$10,000 however that no longer exists.

Monopolization-when the Spring groups came for free space, it had already been booked by the Winter groups. Youth groups of 50 or less and don't have food can use the gyms for free during the week nights. We have numerous youth groups beyond athletics looking to use our facilities. He received complaints from parents about the wear and tear of our facilities. A number of groups want to use the auditoriums but the Principals say the families raise funds to make improvements to them and they are not happy with the facilities condition.

Ms. Bowman asked Mr. Maloney to speak to challenges/issues raised on the weekends.

Mr. Maloney said the fee is \$35 on Saturday and \$45 on Sunday. We require a custodian in the building. Principals are concerned about safety with their buildings being opened in the evening and no one at the door and want a Security officer added, which was denied. All doors are to remain locked when the buildings are in use and if a person on a team needs to get in they will call/text the coach to get in the building. If we find doors jammed open the permit holder will get a warning the next time the permit will be revoked. Last year we had computer technology thefts in the buildings. We are spending \$50,000-\$100,000 for custodians which takes funds from schools. As a former Cambridge Youth Soccer parent, if someone could not pay the parents on the team would contribute \$5.00 each to cover the cost so that child could attend and not be left out.

We measure income status by free/reduced lunch and right now we have 61% full pay and 39% low income students. We have the means to pay for custodial salaries. What if the youth fee on weekends each year matched the SES ratio of the district? Whether groups are athletic or non-athletic they would pay 60% on weekends. We don't know what your scholarship ratio is but our proposal is 60/40% which is representative of the city. By doing that it would increase the district subsidy for youth organizations in Cambridge. It could be in excess of \$20,000 if we implemented that. It would respect youth groups and pass that benefit on to their members. To issue a free for all when we know 60-70% are not low income would not be the best public policy. 40% discount will be helpful to youth groups. We have looked at tax returns for youth groups which are quite healthy.

Ms. Bowman restated that 60/40 split is for our cost of custodian staff not a facility fee.

Mr. Maloney said about four-five years ago a person that was a very good record keeper retired, we did not have an automated system. We have also had a change of facility manager. The new person that was doing this began issuing permits without charging youth groups. The new system is to flush it out and see what is happening. It was not an intentional decision. It is not in my authority to give things away for free. What was never meant to be free, it was to be subsidized 15 years ago.

Ms. Spinner added this is something that the School Committee, Buildings & Grounds Sub-Committee and Youth Groups need to work on to resolve. We took a number of old policies to create one comprehensive policy. A prior \$10,000 scholarship was for youth groups to use the facilities 4 times which was hard to maintain. This proposal of a fee cost share will be simple for us to administer and a positive solution.

Ms Nolan commented that we have always had a policy to encourage and support the use of our facilities. We have to recognize there is wear and tear on the buildings and the cost for custodians. She supports keeping the cost as low as possible. We need to be clear communicating to our users to keep the doors closed is a safety issue. The policy cost did not change. Some of you benefitted from it some did not. Having the system in place will be more equitable. There is still a cost to us as a district. We are not talking about the wear and tear on the building. At some point if this inhibits our ability as an educational institution we might have to go to the City to subsidize it. During the budget session we can remind the City because they want to support it. The War Memorial covers the cost of it and a huge

percentage is the public. The 40% cost share is a good way to move forward and we can revise it over time so students aren't being left out.

Mr. Fantini asked what is the total cost of the use if we paid?

Mr. Maloney answered that a rough estimate would be \$50,000 for the weekend and would result in a \$20,000 subsidy to the School Department, which is double any official amount of what is on the books.

Mr. Fantini said a lot of groups try to piggyback on other groups using the gyms.

Mr. Maloney responded that's still the policy.

Mr. Fantini: If that's correct, it won't be \$50,000.

Ms. Spinner said most of the Youth groups want the gyms on Saturdays. There might not be another group in the building. It is not always practical. We are fully subsidizing. If there is more than one user in the building they would split the custodian fee.

Mr. Fantini: What is normal? The minimum of 2 hours. What is the usual usage?

Mr. Maloney: It would be difficult to say what is usual. Some groups are office workers that use it for probably 2 hours after work, for an athletic group probably 2 hours, churches want 4 hours depending on what the event is.

Ms. Bowman asked when we have renters, would one group rent a facility for 5 hours and have other sub-groups come in under that?

Mr. Maloney confirmed that is what appears to be happening.

Mr. Fantini stated that we could offset our rental costs by increasing rental costs to non-city groups.

Mr. Maloney: Possibly down the road when we have more data. Some gym floors need to be repaired. If there are well-financed for profit outside users we should not pass on that opportunity.

Mr. Fantini thinks it is great public relations to support these groups and the fact that we have not noticed any financial impact. Anyone using our facilities for-profit without paying needs to end. We can re-evaluate next year.

Ms. Bowman stated that it is not equitable for some groups because of our inability to put a policy in place. It's a great public asset for us. Nothing is free and our School District is bearing that cost. I think the 60/40 proposal is interesting and if we share it through all organizations it would be more equitable. If groups are required to rent space in another context, it would be significantly more money.

Mr. Maloney brought up that parents are pushing back and want more done to our facilities. We feel comfortable with the subsidy of 40% on weekends and 100% free on weekdays is very generous.

Ms. Nolan asked if the subsidy included all users? We have category 1, 2, and 3. We wouldn't want to leave out other non-profit groups.

Ms. Spinner responded that groups serving 50% of Cambridge youth puts them in Category 2.

Mr. Maloney doesn't have staff to monitor that. And heat, electricity and A/C are not being subsidized.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Susan Ruff Director of Cambridge Youth Soccer, stated that we only got bills for custodians when we had adult groups. She loves the online permit system and told the coaches to use space during the week. We are using the King gym on Saturday morning. We have other groups that can only practice on Saturday and Sunday. I just found out about this and the scholarship. I have not gotten a bill for our coaches meetings. If we are moving to something different maybe not this winter.

Chris Lim, father of a 4th grader and soccer/baseball coach just rented a time and has \$10.00 fee for use of the facility and custodial fee.

Mr. Maloney stated we would not charge youth group for the use of the gym only the custodial fee.

How do I distinguish the roles when booking the time?

Ms. Spinner said when you become a user you have various accounts and the permit person categorizes your organization. Tier 1 is CPS. Tier 2 Youth organization, City Departments, CPS organizations Friends of or Parent groups, the system assigns the fees. Tier 1 and 2 do not pay space rental fees only custodian fee. If you are doing everything under one user name, there may be some confusion, contact Diane Johnson at the Facilities Department.

Mr. Lim: If we bring in a professional coach it does add up, who signs up, how many sessions and who gets chosen to attend.

There was discussion regarding the cost of hiring professional staff, the fee and demographics of children served

Susan Ruff stated it is \$90 each for fall and spring sessions. Some travel is a little higher.

Mr. Maloney asked what percentage of your families fall into scholarships?

Susan Ruff: about 8% of our kids request a Soccer scholarship

Seth Yarden a parent said during the winter most are once a week. Normal season there is one game a week and 2 practices for a total of 3 sessions. But the games are outside.

Alex Loud, a parent stated that it would be helpful to bring this to the City Council during the next budget session. We need to look at equitability between kids. The city's recent Needs Assessment states families report inability to afford program tuition was one of two core barriers to join after school educational programs, how can we expect them to pay for recreational programs?

He went on to say the approved health and wellness policy from June, 2017 says all K-12 kids will have access to recreation before and after school and to foster lifelong physical activity particularly during the winter. The citywide forum stated that more low income families need to have access in terms of affordably and location. CPS survived for the last 6 years without these fees. We have stated in two documents that a goal is to provide health and wellness to these kids.

Mr. Maloney re-stated it is far greater than a 40% subsidy because 5 out of 7 days is free, not counting heat and wear and tear on facilities. We have an obligation to the school children first then to the community.

Susan Ruff responded Yes, Non-Cambridge residents attend the youth soccer program.

Ms. Bowman: There are multiple organizations that use our facilities. We are not targeting youth sports... How do we manage our spaces as a district? It is complicated. I'm happy that we have had this for many years.

Irving Allen, coach for Cambridge Softball League, stated on Saturday they use the War Memorial. He would like to have known about this earlier. He has two permits for one for \$280 for weekdays at Baldwin and one for \$5100 to use the field house; we charge \$75.00 per season. We have expanded to offer all seasons. Softball costs of equipment (need all sizes catchers gear) and it gets destroyed a lot. I own Paddy's and sponsor a girl's running club. We raised \$6,000 for the running club. This increase is going to kill girl's softball in Cambridge.

How do you determine the size of the group? In the Spring season we have about 200 girls. Winter we have 25 girls so 25 girls divided by \$5,000 is a lot of money. Why are we paying different amounts? Non-profit and for profit. One organization in particular states they are Cambridge based but are not Cambridge based and getting the same privileges.

Mr. Maloney responded that we do charge for-profit organizations and expect them to be honest. Send me an email. We investigate it. We do have an affidavit for users to sign. If I have to hire someone to keep track, all fees will go up.

Matthew Mazzotta has 2 kids, coaches 2 teams and has a busy job. He doesn't have the ability to get in a gym at 8PM and can't do it at that time. The gym space is limited at night. Not just sports groups use it. I don't charge for a session for kids, friends and families for 4 years and never had to collect money and never been charged for it. There is another equity issue here. I'd like to see this for all youth organizations. Kids that can afford to pay go those who can't don't. I'm not running my sessions this year because of this. I'd love a resolution to know if I will be charged and can play this year. I also play with an adult soccer league and pay for the gyms.

It was stated that there is a disconnect, sports is not being viewed as education. It does seem to be an issue. You must get more money from the City. Scholastically sports improve concentration. It shouldn't be separate from scholastic. 4 years ago we started charging \$10.00 from all parents. Some kids can't afford it so we pay. We received a bill for \$800 for rental. Why should we be bearing the brunt of this when it is a bureaucratic error?

Doug Feinburg, a parent of 2 kids in CPS and coaches basketball, baseball, and hockey and uses the Morse and Cambridgeport. The weeknights are hard. The kids are banging off the walls in February and March and opportunities are limited. It would have been good to know about this in advance. We run from the beginning of Feb to middle of April.

Robin Chen asked how does our policy compare to other districts?

Mr. Maloney can make data available but we compare very favorably.

Ms. Bowman: The District acknowledges that there has been a bureaucratic mistake for years where some have benefitted and some have not. The new system will bring us into the 21st century. Sports are an extension of the educational experience and benefit the kids. We will look at the 60/40 recommendation and possible moratorium so we are fair and not going to overburden the district or the sports teams because of what we are trying to do.

Mr. Fantini recognizes that it is a hardship for some organizations and recommends suspending fees for the rest of the year to look at the data and make a better recommendation that is fair to all users.

Ms. Bowman: If we are doing this for sports teams we need to look at other organizations that are not here so we can benefit everyone.

Ms. Nolan agrees to look at equity and timing. All of us should look at how other districts handle scheduling and fee structure. That is how we came up with this. I think people will be weary if they have to sign an affidavit stating that they are a Cambridge resident. This may be a transition year.

Robert Harmon asked if we are suspending fees for the school or calendar year?

Mr. Fantini said for the school year.

It was mentioned that there has been some overbooking and not needing as much time as they booked space for.

Ms. Bowman: This will be back on the subcommittee agenda. Each voice was heard and we will continue to do the work.

Susan Ruff: If the fees are in place look at sharing costs for the weekend.

Family bathroom accessibility in CPS buildings.

Mr. Maloney has tried to be responsive to having a changing table in the rest room at the Baldwin this year. We have checked with our Principals and it has never been raised. Sometimes we can do it cheaply and sometimes not. Mr. Williams at the new King Open asked to squeeze some space in for a family room but when the bldg. opens that may be changed.

Ms. Nolan said we also have done a lot of work on gender neutral bathrooms and the changing tables issue has spread through the district.

Robin Chen: It is a failure to not provide a space for families with younger siblings to be able to use space. I donated a stepstool to the Baldwin so young kids can have good hygiene.

Ms. Bowman: Everything that comes before us has budgetary implications. We are very fortunate and have a lot of resources in this district. What schools would it make sense to do this in, what would it cost? Where does this fall within our short and long term plans? Looking at one per school based on whatever we decide makes sense.

Ms. Nolan: Let's reach out to the school councils and find out what the needs are and include them in the conversation.

Ms. Bowman said some of our older buildings can't accommodate or have limited space. How can we fit it in the budget and move forward?

Robin Chen said regarding limited space airplane bathrooms have space and walking to school wearing a child and then having a dirty diaper then having to carry them all the way home to change them is not fair.

Ms. Bowman: Last year we were a leader in expanding sanitary products in all our schools but we had to do due diligence on the cost. We use public dollars to move forward with any initiative.

Robin Chen said I started this over a year ago. This benefits equally all people. If a family feels unwelcome in a school it takes time to make them feel welcome again.

Cambridge Public Schools Sustainability Report: We are going to table this for our next meeting.

Ms. Nolan thinks we should do this it is in our policy to get it every year. The city has done so much work around sustainability. Let's make the City a part of the conversation since we don't have a person right now.

Mr. Maloney added that the state school building authority has completed its 3rd update report (on line) and the findings are out and the good news is on the matter of environmental issues, computer technology, every school is rated #1. It is somewhat surprising not one of our schools is rated over capacity. The state said to not read into that because the average is 20% over capacity.

#3 is building condition all were ranked # 1 or # 2. The Cambridgeport and Graham & Parks were ranked # 3.

Mr. Fantini stated that the air conditioning is being brought up again.

Mr. Maloney replied that we have added room A/C's to a lot of buildings but the electric supply is a problem.

Ms. Spinner added that we have been successful and had three projects recently complete; the K/Lo roof, FMA roof and boiler.

Motion to adjourn by Mr. Fantini, seconded by Ms. Nolan

The meeting adjourned at 7:37 PM.

Terry Gist

Confidential Secretary to the School Committee

Documents: (on file in the School Committee Office)

- Agenda
- Parent Statements

10. Resolutions:

Motion by Mr. Fantini that the School Committee hereby goes on record in expressing its deep condolences to the family of Mr. Jake Gannon for their loss; and that the Executive Secretary be and hereby is requested to forward a suitable letter of condolence to the family on behalf of the entire School Committee.

Motion by Mr. Fantini that the School Committee hereby goes on record in sending a Resolution to Anne Cardoso who is retiring from the Peabody School

WHEREAS: *ANNE CARDOSO began her career as a Paraprofessional in the Library at the Harrington School in April of 1993 where she worked until September of 1999 when she started teaching in a 3-4th grade classroom.*

WHEREAS: *ANNE CARDOSO remained at the Harrington School until the building was merged and consolidated in 2003. At the end of the 2002-2003 school year she was given a new classroom assignment at the merged M.E. Fitzgerald and Peabody School.*

WHEREAS: *ANNE CARDOSO's teaching partners were Anna Spera, Harrington School and Peabody School, Katherine Simpson, Lucy Alekseyev, and Kristen Nerich, all at the Peabody School.*

WHEREAS: *ANNE CARDOSO started at the Harrington School working for Mr. Figueredo and Mr. McNulty and at the Peabody School she started with Mrs. Varella, Mr. Mahoney and Mr. Schmitt.*

WHEREAS: ANNE CARDOSO also worked through the tenure of Ms. Scannell and Ms. Ford at the Peabody School.

WHEREAS: ANNE CARDOSO has three children Josh, Jessie, and Alicia.

RESOLVED: that the Members of the Cambridge School Committee extend to ANNE CARDOSO their sincere APPRECIATION for 25 years of excellent service and extend to her their best wishes for continued good health and happiness in her retirement; and BE IT FURTHER

RESOLVED: that a formal copy of this Resolution be prepared by the Executive Secretary to the School Committee.

11. Announcements: None

12. Late Orders:

On a voice vote, it was voted to adopt the following:

Motion by Ms. Nolan to send thank you letters to all that participated in our inauguration program.

On a motion by Mr. Fantini, seconded by Ms. Nolan, on a voice vote, it was voted to adjourn the Regular Meeting (7:20 p.m.).

Dosha Beard
Executive Secretary to the School Committee