

SCHOOL COMMITTEE

(Official Report)

Regular Meeting

March 20, 2018

Called for 6:00 PM in the Dr. Henrietta S. Attles Meeting Room, Cambridge Rindge and Latin School, 459 Broadway, Cambridge, for the purpose of discussing any and all business that may properly come before the Committee.

Members Present: Ms. Bowman, Ms. Dexter, Mr. Fantini, Ms. Kelly, Mr. Kimbrough, Ms. Nolan, Mayor McGovern

Mayor McGovern in the Chair.

Also Present: Student School Committee Representatives Juliette Low Fleury and Paul Sullivan

A quorum of the School Committee being present, the Chair called the meeting to order at 6:00 PM.

On a motion by Mr. Fantini, seconded by Ms. Nolan, on a voice vote, the rules were suspended to allow the Student Representatives to give their report at this time, since Paul Sullivan has to leave to be in a play.

1. Student School Committee Report:

Mr. Sullivan reported that the Never Again movement is the biggest event going on at this time. The students have been marching, they went to Union Square and met with Somerville students and on to the State House. The students intended to go to the national walkout but was snowed out. The students are still meeting regularly, coordinating efforts and reporting on responses to this cause. There was a school wide X block on this issue.

The Light She Gave play will be performed tonight. Mr. Sullivan will be playing a father in the show. They have entered their show in the MA Theatre Guild Competition and are competing in the State finals. They are one of fourteen competitors out of 140 schools. Over the weekend, on Saturday, there are 12:30-3:30 p.m. timeslots at the John Hancock in Boston.

Ms. Low-Fleury reported that students also met with other students at the Kennedy building of Harvard University to network with Parkland students and others from around MA. The 10th and 9th graders are gearing up for MCAS prep.

We returned to the regular order of business.

2. Public Hearing on the Budget (3 Minutes):

The following individuals were heard:

- Dan Monahan, Lexington Avenue, re Budget, he supports all of the initiatives and budget adjustments. Paraprofessional to teacher pipeline is a very positive step in the right direction. Black and Brown families are not heard on the topic of teachers of color in the upper schools. He also spoke on cultural proficiency, comparing it to cultural hygiene.
- Math upper school educators, re Upper School Math, educators are still concerned about the planning process of upper school math. The proposal was given to them on Friday and they have

not had the time they need to digest it and then report their feelings on it. The educators are the ones that need to make it possible. (10 signatures on file in the School Committee office)

- Deb Logiudice, Oakland Street, Baldwin school teacher, re class size, they have 4 kindergartens. They have added strands to accommodate larger enrollment. The 2nd second grade classrooms have been moved. She gave the stats on how many kids are in each grade and she has 21 kids in her 4th grade and so do the teachers in each of the other classes. Some classes have 22 kids. The supports are appreciated, but they are not ideal. The problem of increasing enrollment at the Baldwin needs to be addressed in a permanent way, not by bits and pieces.
- Michelle, Curreri Franklin Street, Stoneham, Baldwin educator, she wants her kids to have the same experiences as other kids at Baldwin. One of the biggest frustrations of teaching is not being involved in the plans of the changes to come. She does not support the class size plan. The teachers are looking for comparable sizes. 24 students aren't acceptable. The behavior challenges are significant, they deserve input into the school they devoted their careers to.
- Karen Engels, Wendell Street, she commends the budget proposal she has seen so far, she is happy with the increase for socio/emotional learners, and lowering the MCAS technology, she would like to see the high number of students with the high level of SEL classes be lowered; there are too many students in the classroom, to be served well. They are torn between attending to the child in need or the rest of the class. The interns are not able to attend to a child in need if they when they are "in the moment". A paraprofessional would help a lot more. The interventionist is her second concern; she is hoping that the School Committee sees this as an important component in the schools. Her last request is for buses for field trips. The teachers are spending a lot of time doing fundraising and it is not a good use of their time. She is asking for 1 bus per class per year.
- Monica Velgos Harvard Street, parent involvement, 15 different schools were represented by parents at a Cambridge Y, where they discussed concerns about different issues. Some School Committee Members attended, and a group of parents asked for field trips and the School Committee and Dr. Salim came up with a \$60,000.00 increase for buses. Thank you all. They are now planning for a district wide parent summit to be held on May 12th at the FMA for all parents and caregivers. It will feature a parent workshop and will include taking next steps on the issues that matter most to them. There is an interest form that can be found at cambridge.org.
- Donielle Buie, Memorial Drive, parent involvement, they want to build a strong community by bringing parties together to create change. It is a grass roots effort, organized by parents, for parents and they are thanking School Committee and the District for what they have already done. In order to be successful, they need to raise money for under privileged parents to lift as many barriers as possible. They need child care. The summit will take place at the FMA on May 12th 10-12:00 noon. They need 2,000.00 for this event. They want to connect with all parents and raise awareness so all needs can be met.
- Claudia Zorrilla, Standish Street, re Budget, asking for 3 additional resources at the Amigos School, they are thankful for the para and math interventionist. They need a full time special education teacher at the Amigos. 390 students are in the Amigos, it is unique and hard to succeed with such a large student population for a JK-8 model. They also want another aid for the 4th grade classroom.
- Jacob Walker, Walden Street, CRLS student, re Budget, for the past 4 years he has taken computer science classes and he is here in support of more computer science teachers. He is in the co-op program at Amazon and he feels the program is important but cannot support supply and demand. Ms. Atwood and Dr. Wu have done an outstanding job but they need more help. They choose not to take their planning periods in order to teach more classes, the experience is valuable and they should accommodate this emerging and strong subject. Computer Science needs to be encouraged in the high school.
- Liz Atwood, Whittemore Street, RSTA educator, is disappointed to find out that the request for another computer science teacher was denied. Without another teacher, they will be turning students away; especially students of color. The class that will get cancelled is AP computer science principles; turning away students from an AP course which has a large number of AA students seems like a step in the wrong direction. In 2014 they only had 69 students and now in 2018 it is up to 312 students. DESE is moving toward making computer science a graduation

requirement, looking at that eventuality even adding one more teacher this year will not prepare us for that. These classes prepare students for high paying careers.

- Jen Richards, Aberdeen Court, re Budget at Haggerty School, she has an email with 45 signatures from the Haggerty School, she thanked the district and the committee for their support over the years, she stated that there are quite a few kids with special needs in reading and math and this cohort needs help, there have been fewer tantrums, and anxiety issues, they want more co-teaching as a successful model.
- Edwidge Procule, Windsor Street, her daughter will graduate in June, but she does not know where she is going, she is learning about the budget. She is part of the school council.
- Aristos Koyanis, Sunset Road, re class size, parent of a 3rd grader at Haggerty school, he thanks the School Committee for what they have done for the Haggerty School. Having a full time special educator in the classroom makes a huge difference. One aid last year did not do the justice that they see this year with a real teacher. He also has a first grader at the Haggerty and at current enrollment, they expect 33 kids in each classroom, he wants funding to make the class sizes smaller. It was a challenge, but it was also a success.
- Beverly Steinberg, Griswold Street, re special start program, she is here to support her colleagues and to thank everyone for considering the special start program.
- Theresa Brown, Huron Ave, re Budget, thanked the administration and the Committee, informed the assembly that she read the whole 200 pages of the proposed budget, thanks for the family liaisons and thanks for the \$60,000.00 for buses for field trips. She is asking for full time social workers for all schools. There is not enough playtime; we keep pushing academics on the little ones. Suicides have increased in ten year olds and under because we don't let them play. She supports inclusion at the Haggerty, the co teaching model at her school should be a model for years to come at other schools too.
- Evren Celimli, Walden Street, PAUS and Haggerty, co-teaching in the classroom has helped his daughter tremendously.
- Lauren Gibbs, Newport Road, re Budget, her daughter benefited tremendously from a counselor of color, she supports guidance counselors of color, there are so many more kids in the system, there needs to be a lot more counselors and supports for more teachers of color. She wants kids to have classrooms where they can engage in learning in a smaller environment especially for the younger grades.
- Betty Colombo, Davenport Street, this is her first meeting to show her family support for the RSTA computer science classes. Her son will place out of Computer Science 1 and 2 in college, she learned about tonight's meeting from the RSTA teachers. She is disheartened to hear that they have been denied their request for one more teacher. Computer Science is going to be required everywhere and we should support it. This is the only high school in Cambridge and we need to explore this topic. The oldest son was able to get into what was needed because of RSTA, she fears for her youngest son. She wants them to have STEM classes.
- Michael Colombo, Davenport Street, CRLS senior, fell in love with RSTA when he went through exploratory. IT will be his major in college, he fit into all of his college courses because he was introduced to them here, AP computer science principles is important because it allows students to get more comfortable taking the more advanced course. He has been accepted to an engineering program with a minor in math thanks to RSTA. He suggested, chromebooks be used for teaching computer science.
- Michael Tuyo, Lopez Ave, re RSTA additional teacher, he studied under Mr. McGlathery back when he was in class and now he has kids in Mr. McGlathery's class; the kids need to leave the CRLS with all of the skills they will need to succeed in the job market. He finds it extremely hard to believe we cannot afford another teacher in the classroom. Computer science teachers are modern day carpenters.
- Dawn Baxter, Kinnard Street, she feels that although CRLS has a good success rate, other students from other districts are making the Cambridge kids have more limits. She doesn't understand why kids are being locked out of what they want to pursue. Opportunity seems to be disappearing.
- Max Katz-Christy, Elm Street, IT-2 student, he loved Dr. Wu and Ms. Atwood, they need more help, there are not enough passionate teachers in RSTA. There is a lot more demand for developers and expanding that program would be very beneficial.

- Mary Elizabeth Cranton, Ellsworth Avenue CSUS teacher and parent, she thanked School Committee for the family liaison and she is happy about the 7th grade heterogeneous classroom, she didn't expect to be speaking about computer science, getting 1:1 technology is very exciting. The upper schools need more opportunity to explore computer science, she has a kid in Ms. Atwood's class and he wishes he knew more about this in upper school.
- Carol McGill, Waterman Road, when kids are given the right supports and if we set them up for success they will succeed. She is advocating for co-teaching. The Haggerty school has a good model that can be used as a pilot, it does not make sense to let it go away. The preliminary data is good and we need to keep this model going. She is advocating for full time paraprofessionals in the first grade.

On a motion by Ms. Nolan, seconded by Ms. Bowman, The Public Hearing on the Budget was closed at 7:30 pm.

On a motion by Mr. Fantini, seconded by Ms. Bowman, a fifteen minute recess was called at 7:30 p.m. The time for recess having expired, the meeting reconvened at 7:45 p.m. The Committee of the Whole returned to the regular order of business.

1a. Public Comment (3 Minutes):

No one signed up to speak on Public Comment.

On a motion by Mr. Fantini, seconded by Ms. Kelly, it was voted to close public comment.

3. Presentation of the Records for Approval:

On a motion by Mr. Fantini, seconded by Ms. Nolan, on a voice vote, it was voted to accept the following Minutes as presented:

- Regular Meeting, March 6, 2018
- Roundtable Meeting, Counseling Program Review, March 8, 2018

4. Reconsiderations:

5. Unfinished Business/Calendar:

6. Awaiting Reports:

7. Superintendent's Agenda:

7a. Presentations:

7b. CPS District Plan:

Dynamic Diversity Development Program

Dr. Salim introduced both Ms. Barbara Allen and Mr. Ramon De Jesus for the presentation. Ms. Allen, Executive Director of Human Resources, introduced Ramon De Jesus to the assembly as a new member of the CPS district five months ago. He is the Program Director for the Dynamic Diversity Development Initiative.

Mr. De Jesus stated he is excited to be here and to discuss what Dynamic Diversity Development looks like. He will share what his observations from the past five months. He is honored to be in this role, not all districts offers an employment opportunity that puts equity foremost in education. He made it clear that he is not working alone, others before him and departments are now currently working to have teachers that look like all kids; in particular our black and brown children.

Mr. De Jesus began the presentation. He discussed his observation and listening tours, over his first three months in order to understand CPS; meeting with the CEA Educators of Color Group, the Black Student Union, Diversity Advisory Committee, Community Partners, Instructional Council, and City Leaders as Catalysts for Diversity, Equity and Inclusion. These different groups are not always in communication with each other, he is working to bring them all to one table for an exchange of common ideas.

Equity & Access

- 3-D: Dynamic Diversity Development Initiative
- Creation of the position of Program Manager for diversity Development
- Equity Initiatives at CRLS: Level Up and 1:1 Technology
- Leadership for Equity training for Principals and Administrators, offered by the Disruptive Equity Education Project (DEEP)
- Cultural Proficiency Train-the Trainer Program at Wheelock College: preparing one educator per school to provide cultural proficiency training and coaching within their school community.

Defining Dynamic Diversity Development

- Purpose: the purpose of this initiative is to accelerate efforts to reach the School Committee's goal of having a district-wide staff of at least 30% people of color and yield greater synergy between recruitment, hiring, retention and cultural proficiency programs.
- Terms: we define dynamic diversity as providing all students with access to a diverse educational staff and role models. The student-teacher diversity gap is a matter of urgent local and national concern. Research indicates that substantial academic, social, and other educational benefits are gained by students of color and by all students when provided access to a diverse learning environment.

Value of Teachers of Color: Added Value (there are 2 pages of this title)

Qualitative Research

- Black male teachers describe positive beliefs about their Black students' academic abilities (Lynn 2006)
- Black teachers draw on culturally relevant pedagogy to increase learning and engagement for their Black students (Ladson-Billings 2009)
- Latine male bilingual teachers enact practices that facilitate their Latino students' learning and engagement (Lara 2015).
- Teachers' perceptions about students' academic ability increased when the students were the same race (Ouazad 2015).
- Students perceive minority teachers more favorable than White teachers (Cherng and Halpin 2016)
- Assigning a Black male to a Black teacher in the third, fourth, or fifth grades significantly reduces the probability that he drops out of high school, particularly among the most economically disadvantaged Black males (Gershenson, Hart, Lindsay, and Papageorge, 2017).

Entry Plan

Observations

District at a Glance: Teacher Diversity

Elementary

Upper Schools

CRLS

Reaching our Goal: Every Hire Counts

- Across the district, 22% of our teachers identify as People of Color (POC).

- Four of our schools have already met, or exceeded our goal of 30%.
- Twelve schools would need 5 or fewer hires to reach 30% representation in the classroom.
-

Advancing Relationships

Internal, Local, and National Visibility

National Recruitment: Teacher Preparation

- In a 2017 report, the Center for American Progress found that 19% of New England enrolled education majors identified as POC.
- From 2006-2014 there was a 2% reduction in POC pursuing education majors in Massachusetts
- Similarly, there is not one diverse and selective teacher preparation program in all of New England, with the highest concentration of these programs located in California, Texas, and Illinois.
- Is expanded national recruitment the answer?

What we Know:

- The path towards a teaching license in Massachusetts is one of the most rigorous in the country; out of state teachers do not receive permanent reciprocity.
- The MTEL presents a significant barrier, in particular to POC. Approximately 40% of Black and Latino test takers failed the Communication & Literacy Skills MTEL in 16-17.
- Most teaching is local. Educators often serve no more than 10-40 miles from where they completed their K-12 education.
- External perceptions and documented reality

Collaborate Externally: Local and National

The Posse Foundation, Inc. Mr. De Jesus stated that he is a product of this foundation.
The Fellowship Black Male Educators for Social Justice
Boston College
UMass Boston
BU school of Education
Breakthrough Collaborative

Collaborate Internally: Paraprofessionals

- Our paraprofessionals are arguably the most diverse group of employees that our children interact with on a consistent basis
- Supporting our Paraprofessionals is of urgent importance:
- They know our children – 52% have served our community for 4+years.
- They want to lead in CPS classrooms – 85% indicated an interest in pursuing a teaching credential that leads to a role within our schools.
- They need our support – 105 responses were received to a survey sent out to 230 individuals. A 46% response rate.
- In response, we are in active conversation with Boston University, Boston College, and UMASS Boston to develop opportunities leading to low-cost Masters Programs for our Paraprofessionals.

ED-Vance: Para to Teacher Pipeline Partnership

BU School of Education

- Partnership between the Cambridge Public Schools, Boston University School of Education and the Kellogg foundation
- Articulated pathway for paraprofessionals and external ED-Vance Fellows of color to obtain a Master of Arts in Teaching focusing on urban education.
- CPS Paraprofessionals would remain salaried employees, completing practicum at a predetermined CPS elementary school

- External Ed-Vance Fellows are being recruited nationally at Minority Serving Institutions and Community Based Organizations
- Tuition reduced by 75%

Collaborate Internally: CPS Students

- Cambridge Public School students are passionate, dynamic, and engaged.
- They are partners in this work and hold us accountable.
- Cambridge's Minority reports Volume 1
- Students addressing micro-aggressions and lack of teachers of color at Cambridge Rindge and Latin School

Collaborate Internally: Current Educators

- Support the work of the CEA Educators of Color committee and the CRLS Educators of Color.
- Commitment from each of these groups to candidate referrals.
- This has led to referrals for educators of color who are being cultivated for future opportunities
- Participation at local recruitment fairs.
- Expand of the work of current groups to establish district-wide Employee Resource/Affinity Groups that promote professional development, community engagement, and a sense of belonging.

The path forward

Guiding Principles to Move the Work Forward

- We must recruit with intentionality
- Understand the local and national landscape
- Invest time wisely: use data to inform where we establish visibility.
- We must support our community members
- Partner with our current educators and their professional development
- Involve our educators and students in creating what they wish to see
- We must work to retain our community members
- Provide safe and inclusive spaces for our educators from marginalized backgrounds

Upcoming Events

Recruitment Fairs

March 20th – Boston College Education Career Fair.
March 21st – Wheelock College Education Career Fair
March 22nd – Lesley University Education Career Expo
March 29th – Howard University Education Career Fair
April 19th – MERC Career Fair

Conferences

April 28th – Empowering Educators of color Conference (Providence)
May 29th - 31st – COSEBOC: Annual Gathering (Boston)
July 29th – August 1st – Guiding the Way to Inclusion (D.C.)
November 8th -10th – Race Forward: Facing Race Conference (Detroit)

Mayor McGovern thanked them both for the presentation and opened the floor for comments, questions and concerns:

Ms. Dexter thanked them both for the presentation also. She has two questions: Paraprofessionals are up to 40% from 30%? Entry point for future teachers, it is easier to bring in paras of color and does it set up a hierarchy?

Mr. De Jesus stated that it behooves us to see educators as equals in the classroom, on the surface when we see a white teacher and a para of color, does this create a problem and will it hinder the pathway forward. We have work to do with all of our biases. CPS should be recruiting educators of color. He is wary of hiring paras of color with out having a dignified next step.

Vice-Chair Kelly spoke on the statistics of the MTEL exam. What do we do at a state level to address it?

Mr. De Jesus stated that we know the impact of standardized tests of people of color. What does the test lift up? There are supports for MTEL test preps; he is looking forward to moving the needle forward on this issue. On the state level, there is only one way to play right now. Why should master teacher from Texas have to jump through a lot of hoops to do what he already knows how to do.

Vice-Chair Kelly stated it is the same for the social workers. She appreciates his comments about additional pathways.

Ms. Nolan stated she appreciates the comments and she is excited to know he is going to Race Forward, she is also excited that we have been talking about this for a long time and tonight it is presented it in a way that makes it seem more of a reality and we can see the path forward to make good on the promises. She wants to hear more about Growing Our Own to mean Our Own Students.

Mr. De Jesus stated that Ms. Ellissa Spellman and the Breakthrough Collaborative come to his mind. He wants to expand on the Grow Your Own as a long-term goal, admitting it is a difficult also a goal. We must begin by presenting teaching as a rewarding career. It comes up in conversations but the beginnings of a "Grow Your Own Program" seem to be in tandem with breakthrough since Breakthrough hires our students to teach. The question now becomes how do we get them back? We would have to wait another 8 to 10 years before we ask them to come back to CPS and teach.

Ms. Nolan wants to know if it is more of a challenge to attract or to retain?

Mr. De Jesus stated that he just got back from Boston College; there was a line the entire time. Half of all teachers do not return to the classroom after 3 years of teaching, it is not uncommon in other communities. If they leave because of climate or a sick parent or more money it is fine, but if it is because of culture we have problems. All districts have those same problems.

Ms. Bowman thanked Ms. Allen and Mr. De Jesus for the presentation and welcomed Mr. De Jesus to the district. She stated that we require an associates degree in order for the entry level of teaching and then what does it take to get the to the master's level. She followed up with if we have educators with the credentials to be educators, why are they entering as paras?

De Jesus stated most paras come with bachelors, some come with masters. Most of the upgrading covers bachelors to masters pipeline not associates to masters pipeline. Yes it is problematic, looking at the survey that was recently administered, there are those who keep not passing the MTEL, therefore they don't get the license to teach. Do we facilitate the people in our system as paras to pass the MTEL? There is a pattern. There are people of color with abilities and are struggling, what should we do? What is the strategy? We are perpetuating this inequity.

Mr. Fantini thanked the Superintendent and Ms. Allen for getting us to this place by creating this 3-D structure. He is confident that we will accomplish our goals. We tried this once before and it was difficult. After they go through everything else, including passing the MTEL, they still need to go through our interviewing process and there is a problem there. There are some systemic problems we have in the hiring process. As it stands, they get their masters, they pass the MTEL and then they still cannot get

hired. The Dept of Human Services has a pipeline that we should tap into. We should ask Lesley College what they can offer to become partners in this. Housing probably is an issue.

Mayor McGovern asked about housing, what do we offer? What can we do to draw teachers here?

Ms. Allen answered that in terms of the cost of housing in Cambridge; yes it is a barrier to recruiting all teachers, not just teachers of color. We deal with it everyday. Even if we had the ability to offer more money; which we cannot, it may not work because of the high rent for a small living space. Ms. Allen made it clear that we are not allowed to pay people more or less based on skin color.

Ms. Allen stated that she has no doubt that if there is an opportunity to entice people here, Mr. De Jesus can do it.

The Mayor stated that he doesn't want teachers to leave the district for fault of our own and mentioned the training on cultural proficiency; shining light on the fact that the teaching is not by teachers and/or not people of color.

Mr. De Jesus reflected on who ultimately makes the hiring decisions. The principals are the ones that do the hiring. He is in contact with the principals and they are working together to help elevate the hiring process of people of color. He has been collaborating and updating the teacher job descriptions to include language that speaks to individuality rather than cookie cutter similarities.

The Chair also agreed with Mr. De Jesus about how important is it for kids of color to have teachers of color; adding he wants all kids to be taught by teachers of color.

Ms. Kelly in the chair at 7:55

Ms. Dexter asked if there are certain areas of academia where it is hard to find teachers of color. Mr. De Jesus stated yes, math and science. It is not unique to Cambridge, the entire nation is clamoring for educators of color in these two subjects; adding this does not give us the liberty to step away from the challenge.

Ms. Dexter asked if we have we been anymore successful in special education than we have been in general education or is it the same. Mr. De Jesus answered that most folk that are ready to head OSS are not people of color.

Ms. Bowman went back to the numbers of paras of color with credentials to teach and the number of teachers of color that we actually have teaching; she stated it comes down to systemic racism. She asked why the presentation focuses on the fact that 40% failed the MTEL and not on the fact that 60% passed the MTEL test, which is the majority. We should not approach the work from a deficit; we should engage the ones who pass.

Mr. Fantini asked for updates on the progress HR is making.

Vice-Chair Kelly stated that on the systemic piece, for the success levels across the state, a social worker has to have at least two times as many hours to complete their degree as compared to the internship of teachers.

Mayor McGovern in the chair at 8:15 p.m.

7c. Consent Agenda:

On a motion by Mr. Fantini, seconded by Vice-Chair Kelly, it was voted, on a voice vote, to move the entire the Superintendent's Consent Agenda forward for discussion and adoption. Ms. Dexter removed items **#18-57 to #18-61** to the Non Consent Agenda.

8. Non-Consent Agenda:

#18-57, Contract Award, that the School Committee award a contract to the following vendor for consultant services, funds to be provided from the General Fund Budget, Chapter 30B of the laws of the Commonwealth of Massachusetts having been complied with:

Transpar Group DBA School Bus Consultants, 18 SW 3rd Street Suite 200, Lee's Summit, MO for the period April 2, 2018 to October 15, 2018, in the amount of \$39,650.00.

Ms. Dexter wanted to know what this contract is about and if this is in or out of district. She wants to know if there is a way to provide the high school with buses because of the AV issues of tardiness.

Mr. Maloney stated that this contract is primarily for the Eastern Bus Company. The general bus contract is quite high. CRLS buses may be something that they can come up with an estimate for in a few weeks. The state law to provide buses is for a minimum of two miles.

Mr. Fantini asked if we could consider running a bus like a shuttle.

Ms. Bowman stated she is uncomfortable with the low bidder being the determining factor. It was explained as the Lowest "*qualified*" state bidder.

Mayor McGovern asked if we still have the bus from west Cambridge that ran down Aberdeen Avenue, through Harvard Square to the CRLS school. Mr. Maloney confirmed that it still does and is run by the MBTA, not the School Department

Ms. Nolan said it goes from west Cambridge and goes to Harvard Square; we should try to get it to go to the CRLS.

On the following roll call, **item #18-57** was adopted: Mr. Kimbrough YEA; Ms. Nolan YEA; Ms. Bowman YEA; Ms. Dexter YEA; Mr. Fantini YEA; Vice-Chair Kelly YEA; Mayor McGovern YEA.

#18-58, Contract Award, that the School Committee award a contract to the following vendor for professional development, funds to be provided from the General Fund Budget, Chapter 30B of the laws of the Commonwealth of Massachusetts having been complied with:

Lesley University, 29 Everett Street, Cambridge, for the period September 1, 2017 to June 30, 2018, in the amount of \$35,690.00.

Mr. Fantini stated that his goal is to have our kids reading at 3rd grade level. He requested that the Superintendent, in a Weekly, update the School Committee on how well the reading recovery program is working.

Ms. Nolan wants to know if there has been an evaluation on the program.

On the following roll call, **item #18-58** was adopted: Mr. Kimbrough YEA; Ms. Nolan YEA; Ms. Bowman YEA; Ms. Dexter YEA; Mr. Fantini YEA; Vice-Chair Kelly YEA; Mayor McGovern YEA.

#18-59, Contract Award, that the School Committee award a contract to the following vendor for instructional materials, funds to be provided from the General Fund Budget, Chapter 30B of the laws of the Commonwealth of Massachusetts having been complied with:

TCI Brings Learning Alive, P.O. Box 1327, Rancho Cordova, CA, for the period April 2, 2018 to June 30, 2018, in the amount of \$50,000.

Ms. Dexter asked about this curriculum, she wants to know more about what is actually being purchased. How much is on line, how much is actual materials, how inclusive are they? Are we looking at cultural issues; race, gender etc. and she believes we are investing too much on these textbooks. She is concerned about the math curriculum we purchased and we are not using.

Dr. Salim stated this is part of a multi year curriculum phase out. They will have to figure out adjustments. The teaching materials are not online; the technology piece is within the teacher section. The resources are included during the pioneering year.

Ms. Dexter stated she has never seen any data.

Dr. Salim responded there is no survey data, the data is on the ground in the classroom and with the summative assessments with MCAS.

Ms. Nolan asked if this curriculum is available for all languages in the immersion programs?

Dr. Salim does not have that information, but will certainly get that information to the Committee.

On the following roll call, **item #18-59** was adopted: Mr. Kimbrough YEA; Ms. Nolan YEA; Ms. Bowman YEA; Ms. Dexter YEA; Mr. Fantini YEA; Vice-Chair Kelly YEA; Mayor McGovern YEA.

#18-60, Contract Award, that the School Committee award a contract to the following vendor for interactive hardware, funds to be provided from the General Fund Budget, Chapter 30B of the laws of the Commonwealth of Massachusetts having been complied with:

Valley Communications 20 1st Avenue, Chicopee, for the period April 1, 2018 to June 30, 2018, in the amount of \$90,000.00

Mr. Fantini asked to know what is it? The answer is that they are smart boards. He would like to make the other rooms to be more professional for presentations.

Ms. Bowman added that for future reference it would helpful for more a description that gives more context.

On the following roll call, **item #18-60** was adopted: Mr. Kimbrough YEA; Ms. Nolan YEA; Ms. Bowman YEA; Ms. Dexter YEA; Mr. Fantini YEA; Vice-Chair Kelly YEA; Mayor McGovern YEA.

18-61, Approval of Gifts to Cambridge Public Schools, that the School Committee accept and approve the following gifts and receipts as described.

1. A gift of \$1,289.82 to the Cambridgeport School made from O'Connor Portraiture, Inc., as commission for students portraits. Funds will be used for the general support of the school.
2. A gift of \$1,000.00 to the Cambridge Rindge and Latin School made as an unrestricted donation from an estate. Funds will be used for the general support of the school.
3. An in-kind donation to the Visual & Performing Arts Department from an individual donor of photography equipment, including a day-lab slide printer, a print washer, and a darkroom easel

Ms. Dexter asked about the "friends of" organizations and their gifting.

Ms. Spinner answered that when "friends of" pays for part of a trip, it is considered a student activity, it is not something that goes through the School Committee. The funds are held in an agency account.

Ms. Dexter wants data on how much each school is raising. It was brought up that the school department does not get this information. Since this information does not come to the finance department, how can we require this information be sent to the finance department.

On the following roll call, **item #18-61** was adopted: Mr. Kimbrough YEA; Ms. Nolan YEA; Ms. Bowman YEA; Ms. Dexter YEA; Mr. Fantini YEA; Vice-Chair Kelly YEA; Mayor McGovern YEA.

9. School Committee Agenda (Policy Matters/Notifications/Requests for Information):

On a motion by Mr. Fantini, seconded by Ms. Nolan, on a voice vote, it was voted to move the entire School Committee Agenda forward for discussion and adoption. Ms. Dexter removed items **#18-62 to #18-66**

#18-62 Motion by Ms. Dexter, Whereas CPS is charged with supporting and shaping students' cognitive, socio/emotional, and academic development; and

Whereas "Heckman's Curve" shows that early investments in children's lives:

- have the greatest potential to influence children's long term academic and socioemotional outcomes;
- have long-term economic benefits for individuals and communities;
- must be sustained by continuous investments during children's school years; and

Whereas all Cambridge children have the right to a rigorous and responsive education that prepares them for economic self-sufficiency as adults; and

Whereas Cambridge's Early Childhood Task Force identified the need to improve programs and services for children from birth through third grade;

Therefore be it resolved that the CPS FY 19 budget will reflect the CPS community's awareness of the importance of investing in the early CPS grades, pre-K through third grade.

The Mayor motioned, seconded by Ms. Nolan, to bring **item #18-62 and item #18-64** together, on a voice vote, the motion was accepted for the reason stated.

#18-64 Motion by Mr. Kimbrough, Whereas the goal of the Cambridge Public Schools is to prepare students, academically, socially, and emotionally, for college, career, and civic engagement; and

Whereas high school is the developmental period in which students make critical decisions about their adult identity, career interests, post-secondary pursuits;

Therefore be it resolved that the CPS FY 19 budget will reflect adequate investments in all high school programs--CRLS, RSTA, and the High School Extension Program, in terms of academics, guidance and counseling, and extracurricular programs.

Ms. Dexter spoke on **item #18-62**, saying it is a good investment to put the resources in the younger grades where the remediation is and we can save money down the line on higher grades. They go on IEP's in the third grade when the demands are higher; we could prevent this issue and not have so many kids in special education. She would like to open this issue to the floor and find out how other feel on this concept.

Vice-Chair Kelly stated important it is to have early intervention. IEPs get screened in Human Services and then move seamlessly into the schools. She stated this is another way that we look at a statistic from a deficit prospective instead of looking at the students as getting services that help success instead of a judgment on the identity of the student. We should be very careful of how we talk about this.

Ms. Bowman agreed with Ms. Kelly adding students of color are labeled with problem behavior and the system inflates the negative at times. How does this connect to an action item as it relates to adjusting the proposed budget?

Dr. Salim shared a few thoughts on the proposed budget and early childhood and the earlier grades. He emphasized that this is a citywide effort with other partners. We are trying to expand access; our students are making transitions and we need to look at how we are using our resources. We have a very robust budget, we very aware of how we use our funds; not only how much funds are spent. We are also looking at how we use our time during the day.

Related to budget initiatives, SEL needs are recognized as how we support those students that may be in crisis, he made it clear that CPS is also looking at this proactively and looking at Alice Cohen's work.

As it relates to the high school, there is a lot in the motion, he is looking at the student athletes, school counseling program; not just the number, also their roles in approaching the work, the High School Extension Program (HSEP) is in the budget as it relates to requests from the principal, they are continuing to work with the Rindge School of Technical Arts (RSTA) program and different pathways to see how all students can have exposure to college and career.

Ms. Nolan stated it is hard to argue with either of these motions. She didn't know about the Heckman curve. We should step back and look at this as a goal to aspire to. She appreciates what is already in the budget and there is always room for improvement.

Mr. Kimbrough shared his spirit of **item #18-64**, focusing on RSTA especially Bio-technology, Engineering, Inter Communications(BE IT). He also wants us to remember the High School Extension Program (HSEP). He never hears from anyone over there. They are vulnerable scholars; he cautioned that we don't forget about them.

Ms. Kelly stated that she sees these as value statements that support the budget. It makes more sense that we use the framework for this budget.

Ms. Dexter clarified that she is focusing on the revisions to come. There is a lot of money spent on remediation at the CRLS levels. She is making references about the staffing infrastructure.

Ms. Bowman moved, seconded by Ms. Nolan, to amend **item #18-62** to remove the Heckman equation. On a voice vote, the amendment was adopted. Whereas CPS is charged with supporting and shaping students' cognitive, socio/emotional, and academic development; and

Whereas **Remove "Heckman's Curve" shows that** early investments in children's lives:

- have the greatest potential to influence children's long term academic and socioemotional outcomes;
- have long-term economic benefits for individuals and communities;
- must be sustained by continuous investments during children's school years; and

Whereas all Cambridge children have the right to a rigorous and responsive education that prepares them for economic self-sufficiency as adults; and

Whereas Cambridge's Early Childhood Task Force identified the need to improve programs and services for children from birth through third grade;

Therefore be it resolved that the CPS FY 19 budget will reflect the CPS community's awareness of the importance of investing in the early CPS grades, pre-K through third grade.

On a voice vote, **item #18-62** was adopted as amended:

Whereas CPS is charged with supporting and shaping students' cognitive, socio/emotional, and academic development; and

Whereas early investments in children's lives:

- have the greatest potential to influence children's long term academic and socioemotional outcomes;
- have long-term economic benefits for individuals and communities;
- must be sustained by continuous investments during children's school years; and

Whereas all Cambridge children have the right to a rigorous and responsive education that prepares them for economic self-sufficiency as adults; and

Whereas Cambridge's Early Childhood Task Force identified the need to improve programs and services for children from birth through third grade;

Therefore be it resolved that the CPS FY 19 budget will reflect the CPS community's awareness of the importance of investing in the early CPS grades, pre-K through third grade.

Mayor McGovern stated if Dr. Ananis does not ask for another computer science teacher and does not want one, we do not give him another computer science teacher.

Ms. Dexter commented on **item #18-64**, enrollment at the high school is increasing at a much higher rate than we increase teachers, which is directly related to the parent that stated that her younger child has less opportunity to get into the desired classes than the older one. Ms. Dexter wants to know how the guidance counselors are going to handle their case loads. Some principals feel under pressure not to ask for things and they have not been producing what the School Committee wants anyway.

Mayor McGovern stated that School Committee does not make personnel decisions. He hopes they are asking for what they need, and if they are intimidated not to ask, that is another meeting.

Moved by Mr. Fanntini, seconded by Ms. Nolan, on a voice vote, **item #18-64** was adopted.

#18-63 Motion by Ms. Nolan, That district budget initiatives include SMART goals for effectiveness tied to a District Plan objective. Further that a 10 year plan outlining reviews for all areas be developed to align with district work and presented to the School Committee with updates on the dashboard.

Ms. Nolan asked what is being planned so the School Committee can know what to expect. For a future budget, we don't need to change this one.

Dr. Salim stated that when you have too many goals and too many outcomes it does not produce the focus or the leverage needed in order to actually gain progressive results. On progress monitoring, there is a team that meets every two weeks. As part of the 3 year district plan, they are continuing to refine and examine.

On a motion by Ms. Dexter, seconded by Ms. Nolan, on the following roll call, the meeting was extended 10 minutes: Mr. Kimbrough YEA; Ms. Nolan YEA; Ms. Bowman YEA; Ms. Dexter YEA; Mr. Fantini NAY; Vice-Chair Kelly ABSENT; Mayor McGovern YEA.

Ms. Bowman moved, seconded by Mayor McGovern, on a voice vote, **item #18-63** was referred to the Superintendent.

Ms. Dexter added that if you look at the city budget, there is data on everything. She would like to have more routine data.

#18-65 Motion by Ms. Dexter, Whereas CPS works in partnership with many community partners who provide high quality out-of-school-time programs, including afterschool programs; and

Whereas community-based programs need participants in order to thrive;

Therefore be it resolved that any organization not based primarily in Cambridge that wishes to provide out-of-school-time programming to CPS students in CPS buildings, including afterschool programming, will require prior approval of the School Committee.

The Chair placed **item #18-65** on the calendar. Debate ceased.

10. Resolutions (letters of congratulations, letters of condolence):

#18-66 Joint Motion by Budget Co-Chairs Ms. Dexter and Mr. Fantini,

That whereas the development of the Cambridge Public Schools budget requires the engagement and input of many Cambridge stakeholder groups, including families, educators, staff, administrators, students, community members, and others; and

Whereas participation in public education is a civic process that strengthens communities; and
And whereas high levels of family and community engagement are associated with increases in student achievement;

The School Committee expresses its appreciation to all those who have communicated resource ideas at public hearings and public comment, emails to the Committee, conversations with CPS administrators and School Committee members, and all other recognized and unrecognized forms of engagement with our schools and the FY 19 budget process.

On a motion by Mr. Fantini, seconded by Ms. Dexter, on a voice vote, **item #18-66** was adopted.

11. Announcements:

12. Late Orders:

On a voice vote, the following late Motion was adopted:

Motion by Ms. Nolan, that the School Committee goes on record in sending a letter of congratulations to former School Committee Member Mr. Mervan Osborne for being appointed Associate Head of School for Student Life at St. George School in Middletown, Rhode Island.

13. Communications from City Officers

On a motion by Mr. Fantini, seconded by Ms. Nolan, on a voice vote, it was voted to adjourn the open session at (10:10 PM)

Distributed Back-up Documents (copies on file in the School Committee office):

Statements and letters left at Public Hearing on the Budget by the following individuals:

- Bette Colombo
- Edwidge L. Hercule (Marseille)
- 33 signatures from Haggerty School
- Monica Velgos
- Donielle Buie
- Claudia Zorrilla-Ramirez
- Deb Logiudice
- Dan Monahan
- Upper School Math Educators

Email communications received:

- ✓ Arti Pandey
- ✓ Fanaye Desta
- ✓ Andrea volpe
- ✓ Joel Howe
- ✓ Bette Colombo
- ✓ Yetbarek W. Ayano
- ✓ Fyuji Morishita

The communications are on file in the Office of the Executive Secretary to the School Committee and can be viewed.

Dosha E. Beard
Executive Secretary to the School Committee