CHULA VISTA ELEMENTARY SCHOOL DISTRICT

84 EAST "J" STREET • CHULA VISTA, CALIFORNIA 91910 • (619) 425-9600
EACH CHILD IS AN INDIVIDUAL OF GREAT WORTH

MINUTES
BOARD OF EDUCATION

Regular Meeting
January 20, 2021
6 P.M.
Dr. Lowell J. Billings Board Room, Education Service and Support Center
Streamed Online

ORDER OF BUSINESS

1. OPENING PROCEDURES *Opening Procedures*

A. Call to Order

President Reyes called the meeting to order at 6:03 p.m.

B. Roll Call

Members Present:
Dr. Eduardo Reyes, President
Ms. Kate Bishop, Vice President (Virtually)
Ms. Lucy Ugarte, Clerk (Virtually)
Mrs. Leslie Ray Bunker, Member
Mr. Francisco Tamayo, Member

Members Absent:
None.

Others Present:
Dr. Francisco Escobedo, Superintendent
Mr. Oscar Esquivel, Deputy Superintendent (Virtually)
Dr. Jeffrey Thiel, Asst. Supt., Human Resources (Virtually)
Dr. Matthew Tessier, Asst. Supt., Innovation and Instruction (Virtually)
Mrs. Soreli M. Norton, Asst. to the Supt. and Board of Education

C. Pledge of Allegiance

Board Member Bunker led the Pledge of Allegiance.

2. APPROVE AGENDA (Action) *Approve Agenda*

Motion: TAMAYO, Second: BUNKER, Vote: UNANIMOUS

3. SPECIAL RECOGNITION, ORAL PRESENTATIONS, WRITTEN REPORTS, AWARDS, AND HONORS *Presentations/ Awards*

A. Presentation of Newly Hired and Promoted Employees

There were no introductions.

B. Presentation of District Winners of the Holiday Greeting Card Competition

Dr. Tessier introduced three winners of the District Holiday Greeting Card Competition. He presented a PowerPoint that showed the artwork of First Place Adriel John Canilang (Grade 6, Muraoka), Second Place Victoria Newman (Grade 3, Chula Vista Hills), and Third Place Marisol Sanchez (Grade 6, Muraoka). He also said each of the three winners will receive a monetary gift and that the artwork, along with all the entries were sent to the digitally to District partners and community. All three students said a few words, expressing thanks for being selected and urged everyone to stay safe.

Board Members congratulated the students; thanked them for caring for the community, sharing their art, and giving them a bit of holiday cheer during a rough year; and commended them on their composure and on their artistic and speaking ability. President Reyes said this is another example of student talent and how the District promotes arts, creativity, and culture in students.

C. Report on Support Provided to District Parents

Dr. Tessier stated that Board and community input, specifically the parent group, dictated the need to increase parent engagement and parent support for student education. He said this resulted in the employment of a full-time parent liaison through the Local Control and Accountability Plan process. He introduced District Parent Liaison Angelica Maldonado. Ms. Maldonado presented on how she is engaging parents and what the District has done to help support the community, and specifically parents during the COVID-19 pandemic. She also answered questions from the Board.

Board Members thanked Ms. Maldonado for the presentation and for her work with parents and the community. They also commented on the information provided an on the importance of supporting parents.

4. COMMUNICATIONS TO THE BOARD OF EDUCATION *Communications to the Board*

A. Chula Vista Classified Employees Organization

Chula Vista Classified Employees Organization (CVCEO) President Peter Zeitler emphasized that Ms. Maldonado has done a great job. He congratulated the three students recognized for the holiday card competition, saying that it was difficult to pick the winners, because all students who entered the contest were winners, and highlighting the impact of the District's Visual and Performing Arts Program. Mr. Zeitler acknowledged Attendance/Welfare Specialist Yolanda Sierra, who retired after 30 years of service; Clear View Secretary Elizabeth Castro, who will replace her; and Claudia Echeagaray, who was promoted to English Learner Support Technician. He said that regarding the current solar project, he believes the District should explore installing [charging] stations at the Education Service and Support Center, since that would benefit employees. Mr. Zeitler commented on the Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) that gave some employees a COVID-19 stipend and stated other employees such as Custodians, Attendance Health Secretaries, Secretaries, and Computer Technicians, also deserve COVID-19 pay.

B. Chula Vista Educators

Chula Vista Educators (CVE) President Susan Skala wished everyone a Happy New Year and a happy inauguration day to the whole nation. She said she is looking forward to the work the new administration will undertake to heal the nation. Ms. Skala expressed that she was moved by Board Vice President Bishop's comments regarding a land acknowledgement and read a statement that acknowledged the Kumeyaay. She mentioned that a lot of good things have happened with CVE—the MOU for the hybrid model, a calendar [for the 2021-22 school year] with fall break and three-week winter break, and a good retirement incentive. Said she appreciates the incentive is capped at $100 thousand for upper management, a nice gesture for the rank-and-file workers. Ms. Skala pointed out that it has been exactly 10 years since the last retirement incentive, one of Dr. Escobedo's first actions as Superintendent, and congratulated him on a decade of service to the District and the community. She remarked that, holding Board meetings virtually, the current way of receiving input is not the optimal. Ms. Skala also addressed the anti-CVE rhetoric that has been part of Oral Communications since July. She urged CVE Members to bring any bullying allegations to CVE leadership for resolution and parents and community members to reach out to CVE so they can share all the good things they are doing to support a quality, free public education.

5. ORAL COMMUNICATIONS

Oral Communications

Oral Communications provides the public with an opportunity to address the Board on non-agenda items. Speakers are requested to limit their remarks to three minutes (approximately 390 words). Comments submitted by completing the "Request to Be Heard" form accessible here

(English) and her (Spanish) by the deadline of 12 noon on the day of the meeting, will be read at the appropriate time during the meeting. The Board shall limit the total time for public input on each topic to 20 minutes. With Board consent, the President may increase or decrease the time allowed for public presentation depending on the subject and the number of persons wishing to be heard. No Board action can be taken.

Comments received were read:

- An anonymous "Enraged Parent" – Regarding schools not being open for in-person instruction.
- An anonymous Parent/Teacher/CVESD Employee – On female bias and lack of representation of African Americans in District staff.
- An anonymous Instructional Assistant/Student Attendant (IA/SA) – Regarding concerns about IA/SAs not being included in the first round of vaccinations.
- An anonymous IA – On concerns about an opening being filled by an employee on the reemployment list.

6. APPROVE CONSENT CALENDAR (Action) *Consent Calendar*

The following items listed under Consent Calendar are considered by the Board in one action. There will be no discussion on these items prior to the time the Board votes on the motion unless members of the Board, staff, or public request specific items to be discussed and/or removed from the Consent Calendar.

Before approval of the Consent Calendar, President Reyes pulled Items 6.G. and 6.I.

Motion: BISHOP, Second: TAMAYO, Vote: UNANIMOUS

A. Adopt Board of Education Meeting Minutes: Organizational Meeting December 15, 2020

B. Approve and/or Ratify Human Resources Items A Through G **2020-21.046**

C. Approve Year-Round Calendar for the 2021-22 School Year

D. Approve Memorandum of Understanding with Chula Vista Classified Employees Organization Regarding a 2020-21 Early Retirement Incentive Program

E. Approve Memorandum of Understanding with Chula Vista Educators Regarding a 2020-21 Early Retirement Incentive Program

F. Adopt Resolution Regarding Early Retirement Incentive Program for Certificated, Classified, and Nonrepresented Employees **2020-21.047**

G. Approve Memorandum of Understanding with Chula Vista Classified Employees Organization Regarding Working Conditions During the COVID-19 Pandemic During the 2020-21 School Year

Comments received were read:

- Five anonymous Classified Staff Members/CVCEO Members – Requesting the Board expand COVID-19 pay to other staff members.

Responding to a question from Board Member Tamayo, Mr. Zeitler said the agreement was not put to vote by the membership and that it was what the District offered due to the cost of paying all other staff classifications. Clerk Ugarte said that she would vote yes on the item because it does not preclude discussions of providing COVID-19 pay to other employee groups and asked the District to go back to the table. Vice President Bishop concurred.

Motion: TAMAYO, Second: BUNKER, Vote: UNANIMOUS

H. Approve Memorandum of Understanding with Chula Vista Educators Regarding Working Conditions During the COVID-19 Pandemic During the 2020-21 School Year (Hybrid Instruction)

I. Ratify Contract Administrator Agreement with the San Diego County Schools Fringe Benefits Consortium for the Period of January 4, 2021, Through August 31, 2023

Board Member Tamayo said he wished to abstain from this item.

Motion: BUNKER, Second: UGARTE
Vote: Ayes: BISHOP, BUNKER, REYES, UGARTE
Noes: NONE, Abstain: TAMAYO

J. Adopt Resolution Declaring February 5, 2021, as *National Wear Red Day®* in the Chula Vista Elementary School District **2020-21.048**

K. Review and Accept Quarterly Report to the San Diego County Office of Education on *Williams* Complaints for the Period of October Through December 2020

L. Approve Wilkinson Hadley King & Co. LLP as Auditor for Fiscal Year 2020-21 for the District Financial and Compliance Audit, and the Measure VV and Measure M General Obligation Bond Programs Financial and Performance Audit Required Under Proposition 39

M. Approve Award of Bid No. 20/21-3 to Presidio Networked Solutions Group, LLC, for the Purchase of Network Hardware Equipment for the Period of April 1, 2021, Through March 31, 2022

N. Accept Donations **2020-21.049**

O. Ratify Purchase Orders, Warrants, and Checks Written/Issued Through December 31, 2020 **2020-21.050**

P. Approve Inservice/Travel Request **2020-21.051**

7. PUBLIC HEARINGS

Public Hearings

Public Hearings provides the public with an opportunity to address the Board on specific items. Comments submitted by completing the "Request to Be Heard" form accessible here (English) and here (Spanish) by the deadline of 12 noon on the day of the meeting, will be read when each item comes up for discussion and the Board President announces the opening of the public hearing. The Board shall limit the total time for public input on each public hearing item to 20 minutes and speakers are requested to limit their remarks to three minutes (approximately 390 words). With Board consent, the President may increase or decrease the time allowed for public comments depending on the number and the length of the "Request to Be Heard" forms received.

A. (1) Conduct Public Hearing Regarding Short-Term Classified Employee; and

Dr. Thiel explained a public hearing is required to hire a short-term classified employee who will provide services to the Emergency Preparedness and Security Department in the form of administrative support during the pandemic. He thanked Mr. Zeitler for understanding the need to hire this employee.

President Reyes opened the public hearing. Dr. Escobedo said no comments were received. President Reyes closed the public hearing.

(2) Adopt Resolution Regarding Short-Term Classified Employee to Perform Specified Service for the Period of January 21 Through April 30, 2021 **2020-21.052**

Motion: TAMAYO, Second: UGARTE, Vote: UNANIMOUS

8. ADMINISTRATIVE ACTION ITEMS

Administrative Action Items

None.

9. FIRST AND SECOND READINGS, BOARD POLICIES, ADMINISTRATIVE REGULATIONS, AND BOARD BYLAWS

First and Second Readings

None.

10. GENERAL INFORMATION ITEMS/REPORTS

Information Items/Reports

A. Report Calendar to Board of Education

B. Report on the Governor's 2021-22 State Budget Proposal

Mr. Esquivel presented an overview of the Governor's proposed 2021-22 budget. He shared information on the economic activity during the pandemic, including the nation's gross domestic product, California's unemployment rate, the estimated three big revenues (personal income tax, sales/use tax, and corporation tax), and surplus and shortfalls of the budget. Mr. Esquivel reviewed the K-12 education budget Governor proposed, including items such as the Local Control Funding Formula increase, ongoing Special Education funding, deferrals buy down, and a variety of one-time grants. He also covered the new federal COVID-19 stimulus package, first interim multiyear projection through 2022-23, budget proposal changes and their impact, and next steps in the Governor's budget process. Mr. Esquivel also provided a list of items the District is watching, such as legislative response to the Governor's proposal and economic improvement.

Board Members thanked Mr. Esquivel for making the information easier to understand and commended him on his work with District finances. Board Member Bunker asked about the Reserve for Economic Uncertainties; Mr. Esquivel explained the minimum is three percent and it is capped at 10 percent. Board Member Tamayo requested a list of the potential $3 million in reductions. Dr. Escobedo said a Budget workshop for the Board being planned would be a good time to review the potential reductions. Clerk Ugarte requested furlough days be removed as potential reductions, saying they are not prudent and detrimental to the budget. Vice President Bishop asked about the $9.5 million in cuts for 2020-21 (already in operation) and carryover monies (analyzed throughout the year and minimized as much as possible). She also spoke on potential reductions in 2021-22 and 2022-23 and the one-time grant for returning to school. Dr. Escobedo explained that part of the problem is the 700 reduction in average daily attendance (ADA) that will impact the 2022-23 budget. He said the issue with the "Safe Schools for All" proposal is its many requirements, one being the need to test on a weekly or biweekly basis, which alone would deplete any funds received. President Reyes said although smaller, budget cuts are still needed and expressed concerns with the ADA decline. He said the District needs to not only stop the declining ADA but to reverse and increase it, and requested the District contract a communications and outreach firm. President Reyes said the firm would help provide the community with information on next steps on reopening, encourage student retention and recruitment, and provide important updates on the collaborative efforts with the County of San Diego regarding the vaccine rollout.

11. RECESS TO CHULA VISTA ELEMENTARY SCHOOL DISTRICT PUBLIC FACILITIES FINANCING CORPORATION

Public Facilities Financing Corporation

President Reyes adjourned to the Chula Vista Elementary School District Public Facilities Financing Corporation meeting at 7:41 P.M.

CHULA VISTA ELEMENTARY SCHOOL DISTRICT
PUBLIC FACILITIES FINANCING CORPORATION

AGENDA

BOARD OF DIRECTORS MEETING

1. OPENING PROCEDURES

Opening Procedures

A. Call to Order

Director Reyes called the Board of Directors meeting to order meeting at 7:41 P.M.

B. Roll Call

Dr. Eduardo Reyes, Director
Ms. Kate Bishop, Director (virtually)
Ms. Lucy Ugarte, Director (virtually)
Mrs. Leslie Ray Bunker, Director
Mr. Francisco Tamayo, Director

Members Absent:
None.

Others Present:
Dr. Francisco Escobedo, Superintendent
Mr. Oscar Esquivel, Deputy Superintendent (Virtually)
Dr. Jeffrey Thiel, Asst. Supt., Human Resources (Virtually)
Dr. Matthew Tessier, Asst. Supt., Innovation and Instruction (Virtually)
Mrs. Soreli M. Norton, Asst. to the Supt. and Board of Education

2. ADMINISTRATIVE ACTION ITEMS

Administrative Action Items

A. Elect Current Board of Education President Eduardo Reyes as Chairperson of the Chula Vista Elementary School District Public Facilities Financing Corporation Board of Directors

Motion: TAMAYO, Second: BUNKER, Vote: UNANIMOUS

3. ADJOURNMENT OF CHULA VISTA ELEMENTARY SCHOOL DISTRICT PUBLIC FACILITIES FINANCING CORPORATION MEETING *Adjournment*

Director Tamayo motioned to adjourn the meeting.

Motion: TAMAYO, Second: UGARTE, Vote: UNANIMOUS

President Reyes adjourned the meeting at 7:42 P.M.

12. RECONVENE TO CHULA VISTA ELEMENTARY SCHOOL DISTRICT BOARD OF EDUCATION PUBLIC SESSION *Public Session*

President Reyes reconvened to public session at 7:43 P.M.

13. BOARD COMMUNICATIONS *Board Communications*

Ms. Bishop:

- Echoed Clerk Ugarte's comments regarding parents reaching out to them. Said she has an open-door policy and multiple parents and teachers have communicated with her. Thanked them and mentioned that she is looking forward to talking with those whom she hasn't been able to schedule yet.
- Thanked everyone who joined the meeting, knowing there are other big things to follow up on in the capital.
- Thanked Dr. Escobedo and the Information Technology Department for making the Board meetings more accessible through quick links and reminders directly from the website's front page. Added that meetings are about public input and communication, the Board wants to make their work as transparent as possible, and she appreciates Dr. Escobedo for taking their concerns into consideration and making the change.
- Reflected on the fact that the Board meeting was taking place between the national tribute to the Reverend Dr. Martin Luther King and Black History month and on the day that the first Black woman was sworn in as Vice President, a momentous time to be alive. Shared that she was overjoyed that in December, at her first meeting as a Board Member, the establishment of the Black Learners Advisory Council was approved. Commented that it was fantastic to hear from those who worked to create the group.
- Stated that the equity audit being performed in the District is a great step in the right direction but that anti-racism is not a passive goal; it is an active word, something that we need to continually strive for. Said our students are our legacy in this world and that Dr. King believes the arc of history is long and bends towards justice but that the fight for justice has been borne on the backs of countless Black, Brown, and Indigenous people who put their lives and livelihoods on the line. Commented that we honor them by teaching our kids to be anti-racist so they can grow up and finish our work

to dismantle systemic racism and creating real equity. Remarked that she looks forward to seeing how teachers and schools take the opportunity to educate students about not only Black history but current events that affect Black Americans.

- Urged the District to take into account the fact that there are no Black employees at the top, which is a concern to her. Said the District needs to get a pipeline of Black men into teaching and leadership positions.
- Ended her comments with a comment by National Youth Poet Laureate Amanda Gorman, who spoke at the inauguration: "There is always light if only we're brave enough to see it. If only we're brave enough to be it."

Mrs. Bunker:

- Wished everyone a Happy New Year. Said we are off to a good start, although there is much still to do.
- Remarked that she has been talking with principals and a recurring theme in their conversations is the three G's—grit, grace, and greatness. Commented on examples, such as the virtual longevity Awards that was very well done and showed the grit of teachers and other staff. Said another example is that staff members are performing jobs different from what they are used to and doing so with grace in order to support students. Mentioned that parents have been very gracious, and students are showing their grit and grace by doing their best during this new way of learning. Stated that this year will show the staff members', students', and families' greatness and that she looks forward to continuing the year.

Dr. Reyes:

- Reminisced that a year ago we were excited about 2020 and all the good things we would accomplish but it turned out to be a challenging year. Mentioned the pandemic that claimed many lives around the world, the internal political struggles, the many people who have lost jobs, the many families struggling with childcare and distance learning, and the academic toll virtual learning has taken on students. Said District educators have done an incredible job, but it can never be the same and we know that but that we have to stay safe, as there have been too many deaths already.
- Commented that today, during the presidential inauguration, he kept hearing the theme was unity, working together, working as one, and working as a team. Said he reflected that District has always been an exemplary district and that a district is excellent not because of its programs, buildings, equipment, or supplies but based on its student outcome—how students do overall (academically, in the arts, creatively, social-emotionally, in sports), which is what makes Chula Vista Elementary great and that it happens through the work and collaboration of every single person who is part of the District. Added everyone has a different role and contributes in a different way but are equally important; included parents, who are integral partners.
- Stated that yes, 2020 was difficult, harsh, and challenging but everyone worked in unity and thanked everyone because, even when facing

individual challenges, they continue to work to ensure students are safe and are thriving. Added this is why the District is Number One—because its employees continue doing what needs to be done to ensure students succeed. Urged everyone to persist in their efforts and said things will get better.

Mr. Tamayo:

- Stated that he attended the School Services of California's budget review, a three-hour presentation which Mr. Esquivel nicely summarized in about ten minutes. Said he enjoyed being able to look at the future of the state budget and how it impacts District schools and students.
- Expressed his continued gratitude to teachers who face continued difficulties and challenges while trying to teach virtually. Said online learning is different and difficult, and it especially because teachers struggle to keep students engaged, something he has noticed with his own children. Said he could not do what teachers do every day and thanked them for always being there for the students.
- Said the Board and District deal with many processes, but there is also a personal and human side. He acknowledged some recent losses: [Instructional Assistant] Victoria Zavala, who lost both parents to COVID-19; [Teacher] Lilia Rodriguez, who lost her father in an accident; and [Teacher/CVE Vice President] Rosi Martinez, who lost a close family member. Sent his condolences and empathy and said they are in his thoughts and prayers and that they are not alone.
- Remarked that today's [presidential] inauguration was a momentous day with fabulous speakers and with a change in tone at a national level. Ended his remarks with a quote, "If we merge mercy with might and might with right, then love will be our legacy and change our children's birthright." Said this quote talked to him because it referred to children and about the future and that is what the District does—try to educate the future, to change children by educating them, giving them tools, and closing the achievement gap. Said he hoped everyone reflects on the quote and realize the importance of their work in the community.

Ms. Ugarte:

- Wished everyone a Happy New Year and happy inauguration day. Said she thinks there is positive change in the forefront for our nation.
- Commented that on the theme of parent communication, giving kudos to teachers, students, and parents is very important due to the distance learning environment and thanking them every day is not enough.
- Shared that becoming a Board Member during the pandemic has been interesting and that normally she would be visiting schools and getting to know their strengths and needs, and that it has been interesting attending virtual award ceremonies, student showcases, etc.
- Remarked that parents have been reaching out and she encourages them, teachers, and the community to continue to reach out. Mentioned that one way she has been visiting schools is through their websites.

- Said the Information Technology Department has been amazing in setting the District up for virtual meetings and communications but there is more work to do. Shared an area in which she has received feedback from parents is what she calls the three-click society, where if we cannot get somewhere with three clicks, we get frustrated. Added that being able to navigate updated school websites is important, so parents can access essential information and that the District needs to make it as easy as possible.
- Addressed staff members who have lost loved ones to let them know they are in our thoughts and prayers.

14. SUPERINTENDENT'S COMMUNICATION

Superintendent's Communication

Dr. Escobedo:

- Said that on the theme of working together, he appreciates the Board for bringing issues up, for working together, for focusing on the individual and on the group as a collective.
- Remarked that recognizing the ones who are suffering and pushing for excellence are mainstays in the District.
- Commented that we work well together not only as a community but also with other organizations such as the City [of Chula Vista], the County [of San Diego] and Public Health Department.
- Acknowledged new County Supervisor Nora Vargas, an amazing leader who has been pushing for a vaccine super station in Chula Vista, which is desperately needed and should happen soon. Said that Ms. Vargas and [San Diego County Health and Human Services Director] Mr. Nick Machionne have been instrumental in this effort, along with partners such as Sharp and the Rotary Club. Echoed President Reyes words that things will get better and said that having the super vaccination station in Chula Vista is one of the ways to make that happen. Added that leadership matters and he is happy to have Ms. Vargas as a new county supervisor.
- Stated that the journey of getting healthier as a city is a quest we need to continue to pursue.

15. CLOSED SESSION

Closed Session

President Reyes adjourned to closed session at 8:07 P.M. in accordance with the following.

Government Code Sections 3549.1(d) and 54957.6: Collective Bargaining/ Employee Negotiations; Agency Negotiators: Fagen Friedman & Fulfrost, LLP and Adams Silva & McNally LLP; Employee Organizations: Chula Vista Classified Employees Organization (CVCEO); Chula Vista Educators (CVE); Nonrepresented Employees

Government Code Section 54957: Public Employee Discipline/ Dismissal/Release

Government Code Section 54957(b)(1): Complaint Against Employee – Appeal of District's Findings and Conclusions in Accordance with District's Uniform Complaint Procedures

16 RECONVENE TO OPEN SESSION *Open Session*

President Reyes reconvened to open session with all Board Members present at 8:50 P.M. and said some announcements would be made.

Board Member Bunker said that in closed session, the Board:

Decided not to consider the appeal of District's findings and conclusions in accordance with District's Uniform Complaint Procedures in the matter of a complaint against Employee No. 2011221297.

Motion: TAMAYO, Second: BUNKER
Vote: Ayes: BUNKER, REYES, TAMAYO
Noes: BISHOP, Abstain: UGARTE

17. ADJOURNMENT *Adjournment*

President Reyes adjourned the meeting at 8:51 P.M.

Francisco Escobedo, Ed.D., Secretary

Lucy Ugarte, Clerk

THE NEXT REGULAR MEETING OF THE BOARD OF EDUCATION OF THE CHULA VISTA ELEMENTARY SCHOOL DISTRICT IS SCHEDULED ON WEDNESDAY, FEBRUARY 10, 2021, AT 6 P.M.