

P23-16, WAN Non-Cost Evaluation Option 1 Leased Fiber	Points Earned	AT&T Leased Fiber	Points Earned	WANRack Dark Fiber	Points Earned	WANRack Leased Fiber
Criteria / Points Available						
Non-Cost: Section 3.0 Scope of Work Points Available: 20	20	100% Excellent	16	80% - Good. (Build out time is outside our current need for a July 1 start date)	16	80% - Good. (Build out time is outside our current need for a July 1 start date)
Non-Cost: Section 2.10 & 3.1.3 E-Rate Capabilities Points Available: 10	10	100% Excellent	10	100% Excellent	10	100% Excellent
Non-Cost: Section 2.8 & 2.9 Vendor Questionnaire & References Points Available: 10	10	100% Excellent	10	100% Excellent	10	100% Excellent
Total Score Points Available: 40	40	40.00	36	36.00	36	36.00
Notes: Non-Cost Determined Utilizing Scoring Matrix Relative to Points Available: Excellent=100%, Very Good= 90%, Good=80%, Adequate=70%, Marginal=50%, Poor=25%, Unacceptable=0%						

P23-16, WAN Cost Evaluation	Points Earned	AT&T	WANRack Dark Fiber	WANRack Leased Fiber
Criteria / Points Available				
Total Cost to Provide Leased Fiber Service as per the terms and conditions of P23-16. Points Available: 60	60	\$18,350.00 Per Month / \$220,200.00 Annually / \$1,101,000.00 over 60 months	\$14,280.00 Per Month / \$171,360.00 Annually / Construction Cost: \$5,237,864.00 \$6,094,664.00 over 60 months	\$14,880.00 Per Month / \$178,560.00 Annually / Construction Cost: \$5,295,140.00 \$6,187,940.00 over 60 months
Total Score Points Available: 60		60.00	10.84	10.68
Notes: Cost Evaluation Formula: (Lowest Price/R-where “R” represents the cost of proposal currently being ranked) x Points = Score)		Pricing referenced above includes Erate Funding consideration.	Pricing referenced above includes Erate Funding consideration.	Pricing referenced above includes Erate Funding consideration.

P23-16, WAN Summary	Points Earned	AT&T Leased Fiber	Points Earned	WANRack Dark Fiber	Points Earned	WANRack Leased Fiber
Criteria / Points Available						
Non-Cost Points Available: 40 (Includes all elements of Section 3.0, 2.8, 2.9, 2.10, 3.1.3)	40	Excellent 100%	36	Deducted points for buildout dates not being able to meet our timeline	36	Deducted points for buildout dates not being able to meet our timeline
Cost Points Available: 60 Cost Evaluation Formula: (Lowest Price/R-where “R” represents the cost of proposal currently being ranked) x Points = Score)	60	Full Cost Points Earned	10.84	Points Earned Based On Cost Evaluation	10.68	Points Earned Based On Cost Evaluation
Total Score Points Available: 100	100	Highest Scoring Vendor for Solution	46.84		46.68	

P23-16, WAN Final Award Summary	AT&T	WANRack Dark Fiber
Final Evaluation of Leased Fiber Versus Dark Fiber Category Winners		
Provide WAN Service For Designated FCS Locations. FCS evaluated all cumulative costs for a period of 10 years.	The AT&T solution is for Leased Fiber	The WANRack solution is for Dark Services
Estimated Total Spend Over a 5 Year Period	\$ 1,101,000.00	\$ 6,094,664.00
Estimated Total Spend Over a 10 Year Period	\$ 2,202,000.00	\$ 6,951,464.00
Award Recommendation	FCS recommends AT&T for award for Leased Fiber. When comparing the total cost of ownership over a 10 year period, AT&T is the most cost effective solution.	