



HIGH-QUALITY TUTORING DATA ANALYSIS

Prepared for Dallas Independent School District

October 2023

TABLE OF CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION 3

USER’S GUIDE 4

DATA AND METHODOLOGY 5

RECOMMENDATIONS..... 6

KEY FINDINGS..... 7

INTRODUCTION

Dallas Independent School District (Dallas ISD) has partnered with Hanover Research (Hanover) to explore the effects of ELA and math tutoring on the academic achievement of students who participate in the program. The 2021-22 (2022) school year was the first year that Dallas ISD implemented the tutoring program in Grade 4 to Grade 12 and it has continued into the 2023 school year.

Hanover has conducted a descriptive analysis to report on ELA and math tutoring participation rates and the performance of students who participate in tutoring relative to students who did not participate or were not eligible for tutoring. Results from the analysis are reported using this interactive Tableau dashboard. The analysis focuses on providing answers to the following questions:

RESEARCH QUESTIONS

- How does program participation look across student groups? Across schools?
- How does program dosage correlate to formative outcomes in the program, if any?
- How has the program impacted performance gaps between program students and students who are not eligible for support?
- How do the outcomes of eligible students and participants look after the program versus before?

USER'S GUIDE

Hanover has produced this interactive dashboard to display the outcomes and characteristics of ELA and math tutoring participants and non-participants. This analysis uses data from students in Grades 4-12 from the 2022 and 2023 school years, which includes information on student enrollment and demographics, ELA and math tutoring participation, and assessment outcomes from MAP, STAAR, EOC, and course grade outcomes.

The dashboard includes four interactive pages:

Tutoring Participation – This page reports ELA and math tutoring participation in the district by student demographics and by school. Hanover uses the following participation category definitions:

- **Eligible Participant:** A student with positive tutoring hours or a student classified as TIA.
- **Eligible Non-Participant:** A student with 0 tutoring hours.
- **Not-Participant:** A student who was classified as EOC/MAP, Exempt, or Withdrawn as well as students who were found in the demographic/enrollment file who were not found in the tutoring hours file.
 - **Note:** This group excludes students in PK to Grade 3 due to no or low tutoring participation.

Participation Side by Side – This page reports ELA and math tutoring participation for two student groups broken down by grade. Student demographic and academic filters allow the user to compare the two groups side by side.

Academic Outcomes – This page reports end-of-year EOC, STAAR, MAP, and course grade outcomes broken down by tutoring participation.

Tutoring Outcomes – This page reports MAP and STAAR outcomes for students prior to tutoring and after tutoring, if applicable.

Along with these interactive pages, Hanover also includes pages summarizing **Recommendations, Key Findings**, and a page providing additional details on the **Data and Methodology** used in the analysis.

DATA AND METHODOLOGY

Dallas ISD provided Hanover with student enrollment and demographic data, ELA and math tutoring participation data, and assessment outcomes from MAP, STAAR, EOC, and course grades. The data provided is described below:

- Demographic and Enrollment Data – This file contains enrollment and demographic data for all students.
- Course Enrollment Data – This file contains course enrollment and performance for the 2022 and 2023 school years.
 - Outcomes: End of year ELA and math course grade
- EOC Data – This file contains EOC assessment outcomes for the 2021, 2022, and 2023 school years.
 - Outcomes: Proficient on EOC Algebra I, EOC English I, and EOC English II
- MAP Data – This file contains MAP assessment outcomes for the 2021, 2022, and 2023 school years.
 - Outcomes: Proficient on MAP Math and MAP Reading, Met projected growth on MAP Math and MAP Reading
- STAAR Data – This file contains STAAR assessment outcomes for the 2021, 2022, and 2023 school years.
 - Outcomes: Proficient on STAAR Math and STAAR Reading
- Tutoring Hours Data – This file contains ELA and math tutoring participation for the 2022 and 2023 school years.
- Tutoring Sessions Data – This file contains tutoring session data for students who participated in tutoring in the 2022 and 2023 school years.

Hanover made the following key data-handling decisions:

- Students who were found in the enrollment and demographic file but not in the tutoring hours file were assumed to have not been eligible to participate in tutoring.
- Science and social studies outcomes were excluded from the analysis due to low counts of tutoring participation in these subjects.
- Students in PK to Grade 3 were excluded from the analysis due to no or low counts of tutoring participation.
- Hanover derives a student's tutoring group size using data from the Tutoring Sessions file.

RECOMMENDATIONS

Based on the results of the Descriptive Analysis, Hanover recommends that Dallas ISD:



Continue to investigate ways to increase tutoring implementation at the school level. Hanover found that the proportion of eligible students who participate in tutoring varies considerably by school, ranging from no participation to full participation among students who were eligible for tutoring services. This may be addressed as the district moves from vendor tutoring services to site-based tutoring services.



Encourage student participation in tutoring sessions at a higher frequency for each subject by promoting equitable participation across schools. Hanover found that students with more tutoring sessions had higher proficiency rates on academic assessments. Determining what barriers may be preventing students from engaging in tutoring sessions, through survey and qualitative data, may provide insight to district leaders and lead to the identification of additional supports that are needed. Assessing student and staff experiences can also help Dallas ISD determine ways to improve tutoring implementation at the school level, as well as identify existing strengths that may be built upon.



Continue data collection on ELA and math tutoring participation to facilitate a more conclusive impact analysis evaluations in the future. By having additional ELA and math data, Hanover will be able to support Dallas ISD with understanding the levers that impact student outcomes. Having additional years of tutoring and outcomes data allows a more robust impact analysis that compares students with similar pre-tutoring academic performance and other characteristics. Reviewing Section II: Best Practices for Data Collection and Monitoring of Tutoring Programs of this report, [Impact and Monitoring of Tutoring Programs](#), may be helpful for Dallas ISD as the district continues to support staff as they take more ownership in the tutoring process.

KEY FINDINGS



ELA tutoring participation increased from 7 percent of students (Grades 4 to 12) in 2022 to 19 percent in 2023. Similarly, math tutoring participation increased from 6 percent to 16 percent. An additional 3 to 21 percent of students were eligible for tutoring each year but did not participate.

- Students with a disability, students who are economically disadvantaged, students with Limited English Proficiency (LEP), students receiving Special Education (SPED) services, students with a 504 plan, as well as Black, Hispanic, and male students had higher eligibility and participation rates compared to their peers for both subjects. For example, 45 percent of students receiving SPED services were eligible for ELA tutoring and 25 percent participated compared to 22 percent and 11 percent of students not eligible to receive SPED services.
- Tutoring participation varied considerably by school, ranging from less than 1 percent to 53 percent for ELA and less than 1 percent to 56 percent for math. Among students who are eligible for tutoring, there was a wide range of actual participation at the school level for both subjects. For example, at Thornton Elementary School, just over half of the students (53%) were eligible for Math tutoring but just 5 percent participated. At Budd Elementary School, half of all students were eligible for Math tutoring and 46 percent went on to participate.
- Students in elementary school had the highest participation rate (20% for both ELA and math), followed by middle school (14% for both ELA and math), then high school (9% for ELA, 4% for math).



Overall, tutoring participants had a slightly higher rate of proficiency on end-of-year assessments when compared to eligible non-participants. This finding holds for both 2022 and 2023 and across grade levels.

- For example, in 2023, 35 percent of ELA tutoring participants achieved proficiency on the STAR reading assessment compared to 31 percent of eligible non-participants. In the same year, 42 percent of math participants achieved proficiency on STAAR math compared to 41 percent of eligible non-participants.
- For all assessments, students who were eligible for tutoring, regardless of participation, had lower proficiency rates than students who were not eligible for tutoring.



There were notable differences in proficiency rates for EOC, MAP, and STAAR outcomes between students with different tutoring group sizes. For all math assessments, students with a TIA teacher (TIA students) followed by students with a medium group size (4-9 students) had higher proficiency rates compared to those students tutored in other group sizes. For all ELA/Reading assessments, TIA students followed by students with a small group size (1-3 students) had higher proficiency rates relative to other group sizes.



For students in Grades 8-12 that took EOC assessments, Hanover observed increased EOC proficiency rates associated with students that had 40 or more tutoring sessions. For MAP proficiency, STAAR proficiency, and course final grades, little to no association was observed between number of tutoring sessions and average performance.

- For example, in 2023, 43 percent of students that had 40 or more sessions were proficient on EOC English I compared to 30 percent of students that had less than 40 tutoring sessions.



Comparing 2023 math assessment performance relative to the year prior, tutoring participants improved their average rate of performance on all three available math outcomes. A similar trend was observed in 2023 STAAR reading performance, while the year-to-year difference in MAP reading outcomes was not clear. Eligible non-participants also tended to improve year-to-year proficiency rates. Furthermore, average proficiency rates for MAP and STAAR (both subjects) decreased slightly in 2023 for non-eligible students, relative to that group's 2022 performance.

- For example, math tutoring participants saw an increase of 6 percentage points in MAP proficiency rate in 2023, compared to 2022. ELA tutoring participants saw nearly the same MAP reading proficiency rate in 2023 as they did in the year prior.

ABOUT HANOVER RESEARCH

Hanover Research provides high-quality, custom research and analytics through a cost-effective model that helps clients make informed decisions, identify and seize opportunities, and heighten their effectiveness.

OUR SOLUTIONS

ACADEMIC SOLUTIONS

- **College & Career Readiness:**
Support on-time student graduation and prepare all students for post-secondary education and careers.
- **Program Evaluation:**
Measure program impact to support informed, evidence-based investments in resources that maximize student outcomes and manage costs.
- **Safe & Supportive Environments:**
Create an environment that supports the academic, cultural, and social-emotional needs of students, parents, and staff through a comprehensive annual assessment of climate and culture.

ADMINISTRATIVE SOLUTIONS

- **Family and Community Engagement:**
Expand and strengthen family and community relationships and identify community partnerships that support student success.
- **Talent Recruitment, Retention & Development:**
Attract and retain the best staff through an enhanced understanding of the teacher experience and staff professional development needs.
- **Operations Improvement:**
Proactively address changes in demographics, enrollment levels, and community expectations in your budgeting decisions.

LEADERSHIP SOLUTION

Build a high-performing administration that is the first choice for students, parents, and staff.

OUR BENEFITS



EXPERT

200+ analysts with multiple methodology research expertise



FLEXIBLE

Ongoing custom research agenda adapts with organizations' needs



DEDICATED

Exclusive account and research teams ensure strategic partnership



EFFICIENT

Annual, fixed-fee model shares costs and benefits

