

## Role Play Assignment

---

### You are a member of the...

- \_\_\_ Cabinet Mission
- \_\_\_ Congress Party
- \_\_\_ Muslim League
- \_\_\_ Unionist Party
- \_\_\_ Sikhs

### Your assignment for your team is the following:

- \_\_\_ Chairperson – leader of your group. You always remain at “headquarters.” You receive all other groups’ negotiators and negotiate with them. You present your group’s formal position.
- \_\_\_ Negotiator with the Cabinet Mission
- \_\_\_ Negotiator with the Congress Party
- \_\_\_ Negotiator with the Muslim League
- \_\_\_ Negotiator with the Unionist Party
- \_\_\_ Negotiator with the Sikhs

Each negotiator is assigned to deal with a different group. You go back and forth between “headquarters,” consulting with the Chairperson and the group with whom you are negotiating.

## **Cabinet Mission Plans A and B—a Summary**

### **Memorandum by Sir S. Cripps (undated—probably April, 1946)**

---

#### **Plan A**

A “Union of All-India” will be created, consisting of three parts—each of which will enjoy a great degree of regional and local autonomy.

The three parts will be the Hindu-majority provinces, the Muslim-majority provinces, and the Indian States (called “units”).

The Union government will deal with, at a minimum, the following compulsory subjects: defense, foreign affairs, and communications. A broader list of optional subjects will be made available. These optional subjects belong to the individual units. Units may agree voluntarily to give up some of these optional subjects to the center [union government]. Or units may wish to pool their administration of optional subjects.

The Union government will consist of three equal parts representing the Hindu provinces, Muslim provinces, and the States.

Representatives of each group will first meet separately to create their provincial or state constitutions and any grouping of common subjects. Afterwards, the representatives of the three groups will meet together to decide the form of Union government and agree to a general constitution.

Because there will be equal representation in the Union, no one part could ever permanently dominate another part.

#### **Plan B**

Two countries will be formed from British India—Hindustan and Pakistan. Each Indian State may join either nation or remain independent.

Pakistan will be based on the right of Muslim-majority districts to form a separate and independent state. While specifics need to be discussed further, generally Pakistan will consist of Sind, Baluchistan, and the North-West Frontier Province in the northwestern area. Punjab would be partitioned with the western part going to Pakistan and the eastern part to Hindustan. It is important that, if such partition is made, the Sikhs need to be considered. In the Northeast, Assam will be partitioned, as will Bengal (the west going to Hindustan and the east to Pakistan). Calcutta, with a majority Hindu population, seems necessary for an eastern Pakistan to survive. Its future will need to be negotiated.

Because splitting India into two nations will make defense against external aggression difficult, a treaty will be necessary. It will cover important economic matters, defense, and foreign policy. The treaty will need to include machinery for common planning and decision-making.

## Cabinet Mission's Analysis of the "Large" Pakistan that Jinnah Wanted



“The size of the non-Muslim minorities in a Pakistan comprising the whole of the six provinces... would be very considerable as the following figures show:— (All population figures in this statement are from the most recent census taken in 1941.) The Muslim minorities in the remainder of British India number some 20 million dispersed amongst a total population of 188 million.

“These figures show that the setting up of a separate sovereign state of Pakistan on the lines claimed by the Muslim League, would not solve the communal minority problem; nor can we see any justification for including within a sovereign Pakistan those districts of the Punjab and of Bengal and Assam in which the population is predominantly non-Muslim. Every argument that can be used in favour of Pakistan, can equally in our view be use in favour of the exclusion of the non-Muslim areas from Pakistan. This point would particularly affect the position of the Sikhs.”

## Cabinet Mission's Analysis of the "Large" Pakistan that Jinnah Wanted

---

| Muslim and Non-Muslim Population |               |               |
|----------------------------------|---------------|---------------|
|                                  | Muslim        | Non-Muslim    |
| <b>North-Western Area</b>        |               |               |
| Punjab                           | 16,217,242    | 12,201,577    |
| North-West Frontier              | 2,788,797     | 249,270       |
| Sind                             | 3,208,325     | 1,326,683     |
| British Baluchistan              | 438,930       | 62,701        |
| total                            | 22,653,284    | 13,840,231    |
|                                  | <b>62.07%</b> | <b>37.93%</b> |
| <b>North-Eastern Area</b>        |               |               |
| Bengal                           | 33,005,434    | 27,301,091    |
| Assam                            | 3,442,479     | 6,762,254     |
| total                            | 36,447,913    | 34,063,345    |
|                                  | <b>51.69%</b> | <b>48.31%</b> |

## Agenda for the Conference to Determine the Future of India: March 1946

---

1. Statement by the Cabinet Mission—purpose of conference. Refer to Cabinet Mission Plans A & B, maps, and charts.
2. Statements by interested parties.
  - a. Congress Party.
  - b. Muslim League.
  - c. Unionist Party.
  - d. Sikhs.
3. Nature of the Constitution.
  - a. Each group conducts a strategy session (refer to Role Play Strategy Sheet, maps, and charts).
  - b. Negotiations: Groups are to deal with the following issues:
    - i. Is Plan A acceptable?
    - ii. If Plan A is not acceptable, could it be modified to keep a united India?
    - iii. If not, is Plan B acceptable (an independent Pakistan, but smaller than what the Muslim League had wanted)?
    - iv. What will be the relationship between India (and perhaps Pakistan) and Great Britain?
  - c. A representative of each group reports its progress to the Cabinet Mission.
4. Cabinet Mission reports results.
5. Adjournment.

## Planning Strategy for the Role Play Nature of the Constitution

---

Based on the background readings, what is your group's position on the following?

1. Should an independent Pakistan be created? (What effect would an independent Pakistan have on your group?)
  - a. If an independent Pakistan is created, how large should it be?
  - b. It would be composed of what provinces/parts of provinces?
  - c. Would the Cabinet Mission's Plan B be acceptable?
3. Study the documents, "Cabinet Mission's Analysis of the 'Large' Pakistan that Jinnah Wanted." Why did the Cabinet Mission believe that giving what the Muslim League wanted—a larger Pakistan—wouldn't work?
4. What should an independent Pakistan's relationship be to India/Hindustan and Great Britain? (e.g., should there be a defense treaty? Should Pakistan and India/Hindustan be part of the British Commonwealth?)
5.
  - a. If, instead of partition, there is a "Union of All-India" [federation], how would the Cabinet Mission's Plan A affect your group?
  - b. If there is a federation, how much power should the central government have?