

**MINUTES OF THE PATERSON BOARD OF EDUCATION
SPECIAL MEETING**

April 13, 2016 – 6:36 p.m.
Administrative Offices

Presiding: Comm. Chrystal Cleaves, Vice President

Present:

Dr. Donnie Evans, State District Superintendent
Ms. Eileen Shafer, Deputy Superintendent
Sidney Sayovitz, Esq., General Counsel

*Comm. Oshin Castillo
Comm. Jonathan Hodges
Comm. Errol Kerr
Comm. Nakima Redmon

Comm. Flavio Rivera
Comm. Kenneth Simmons
*Comm. Christopher Irving, President

Absent:

Comm. Lilisa Mimms

The Salute to the Flag was led by Comm. Cleaves.

Comm. Redmon read the Open Public Meetings Act:

The New Jersey Open Public Meetings Act was enacted to insure the right of the public to have advance notice of, and to attend the meetings of the Paterson Public School District, as well as other public bodies at which any business affecting the interest of the public is discussed or acted upon.

In accordance with the provisions of this law, the Paterson Public School District has caused notice of this meeting:

**Special Meeting
April 13, 2016 at 6:30 p.m.
Administrative Offices
90 Delaware Avenue
Paterson, New Jersey**

to be published by having the date, time and place posted in the office of the City Clerk of the City of Paterson, at the entrance of the Paterson Public School offices, on the district's website, and by sending notice of the meeting to the Arab Voice, El Diario, the Italian Voice, the North Jersey Herald & News, and The Record.

PRESENTATIONS AND COMMUNICATIONS

Discussion on Internal Audit Report Findings on Early Childhood Provider BJ Wilkerson Memorial Child Development Center for the 2014-2015 School Year

Ms. Toni Scholing: Good evening. My name is Toni Scholing and I work in the Department of Early Childhood Education. I'm here to present an audit report issued by

the Paterson Internal Audit Unit. This report addresses two centers owned by BJ Wilkerson Memorial Child Development Center. BJ Wilkerson has 17 classrooms and services 255 Paterson children. The auditors noted four findings as follows. The first finding says the provider underspent the NJDOE preschool education budget by \$69,007.19. In the second finding, the auditors noted minor accounting and coding errors. In the third finding, the auditors noted several unallowable expenditures. Finally, the fourth finding addresses executive director compensations. That concludes the report. Are there any questions?

Comm. Kerr: Is there a corrective action plan here?

Ms. Scholing: Yes. We prepared a corrective action plan, which is presented to Dr. Evans and then sent to Trenton. Subsequent to that, we send a CAP to the center. The CAP is included.

Comm. Hodges: This probably isn't a question for you. I know that we're very careful with every penny that they spend. Are we equally as careful with the educational outcomes of the students? Have we noted what they have done?

Ms. Scholing: I believe you're referring to an educational question.

*Comm. Irving enters the meeting at 6:41 p.m.

Ms. Susana Peron: Yes, that is a part of what we do in the Department of Early Childhood. We have a new assessment system from the Creative Curriculum, which is an actual online detailed assessment for children. It encompasses all of the domains for the children and all of the objectives of the curriculum.

Comm. Hodges: If we're going to present this kind of audit, and this isn't my first time asking this question as you know, we should be talking about that too. I really want to know about that more than I want to know about the concerns financially that the state is worried about. The funds are the state's issue. The education is ours.

Ms. Peron: Noted Commissioner.

Comm. Hodges: Thank you.

Comm. Cleaves: Are there any more questions? Thank you.

Facilities Redistricting and Options for School Assignments

Dr. Evans: The reason actually that we called this meeting at this time is to discuss facilities redistricting options that are being considered for the two new schools that we are planning to open this fall, as well as giving you an update on the move from the current site of Don Bosco to the swing space at Paterson Catholic where it will reside until a new Don Bosco is constructed and then move them back. First, we'll have Ms. Santa come forward and give you an update on the Don Bosco transition.

▪ Don Bosco to Paterson Catholic

Ms. Maria Santa: Good evening, Commissioners. At your table you're going to find a blue folder that contains the documents that I'm sharing with you this evening. One of them is the action plan that you have seen before. Today it's the updated version because my purpose today is to walk you through some of the updates in terms of the

things and actions that have been done and implemented already to prepare us for the move from Don Bosco, their current site, to their new site which is going to be Paterson Catholic. At the left-hand side of your folder you'll find the action plan for their relocation.

*Comm. Castillo enters the meeting at 6:44 p.m.

Ms. Santa: You're going to see that all the actions that have been completed indicate so on the right-hand side of the paper, the date each was completed, and the outcomes of each one of those actions. I want to report to you that everything on the action plan up until March 31 has been implemented and completed as planned. That includes everything from ordering the moving materials for teachers to pack, meeting with parents. We have met with parents at School 5 and School 27 along with the parents from Don Bosco. We have held two meetings at each one of the schools. Ms. Warren, who supervises School 5, met with that principal and the principal at Don Bosco attended that meeting so that parents could be introduced and could ask questions. We did the same at School 27. The principal from School 27, along with myself and the principal from Don Bosco, met with the parents and Ms. Shafer joined us for those meetings. At each one of those meetings we handed to the parents a Q&A. When we did the first meeting parents had several questions that we brought back and we produced answers for. Then at the second meeting held at each school we handed out the responses and you have those on the right-hand side of your folders for both School 5 and School 27. What you are also going to see is the floor plan with the preliminary room assignments at Paterson Catholic. At Don Bosco the principal has worked closely with Mr. Neil Mapp in our facilities department to assign the spaces so that the students can have their homerooms designated in preparation for the move. Some of the other updates include a walk-through that was conducted with the SDA representatives. They came and walked through Paterson Catholic with us, us being the principal of Don Bosco, the Director of Facilities, Director of Technology, and the food services department. All the departments that needed to be represented were there. The walk-through was conducted. The SDA has left us with a schedule of plans and activities that they have to conduct from their end to make sure that the building is ready to be opened and to receive the students. On our end, we have our action plan, the facilities department also has their action plan, and so does technology. We talked about the parent meetings already. With each report card night from now until the closing of the school year every parent will receive a note reminding them that this relocation is happening and the grade levels that are moving over. Phone calls have been sent to parents also after each meeting has been held and prior to each meeting being held. We wanted to make sure that we communicated with parents in different ways. All students, as you know, are moving from School 5 and School 27 only from those two schools into the new building for Don Bosco. I also wanted to share with you that all the supplies for the teachers to begin to pack have arrived. Teachers have been given a set of instructions in terms of how to pack, when and how to do it and the materials are already at Don Bosco. Some next steps for us will include the moving contract being finalized and that is something that our Director of Facilities will do for us. That is the next item on our timeline on the action plan. We gave it a date of April 30 and you see that it has no note indicating it's been completed because that date is not here yet. So that would be an immediate next step for us. As we continue to plan, transportation lists are being prepared by Ms. Lisa Vainieri so that we have every grade level listed. Every child that needs to be on a bus will be listed. Every parent will be receiving a letter indicating the bus route, the time of pickup, and all the information that they need. One step that we added to the action plan was we're sending home a survey to the parents concerning transportation. Many parents have expressed that they would like to drive their children there and they would not take the transportation. Because we've heard

this from the parents a survey is going out at School 5, School 27, and Don Bosco for them to let us know whether they want the transportation or not. Once we receive all those surveys back, Ms. Lisa Vainieri will make sure that her list reflects that accordingly. We have a list of things that teachers need to do to move that has been distributed to the teachers and explained to them. The next step would be for the actual move to happen, which we know will be in the summer. The packing the teachers will do and will be compensated for that as we have done previously with teachers that relocated into Colt Street from HARP. Then in the summer we are looking forward to offering an open house to the parents once the school is ready – hopefully in late August at the latest – for parents and students to be able to go into the new Don Bosco, the swing space at Paterson Catholic, to receive information, walk the facility, and see the designation of classrooms and what has been done at that building. That is my update at this time. If you have any questions, I will gladly answer them.

Comm. Hodges: One of the problems that we have noted over the years in dealing with the SDA is when we tried to open School 24. They had a punch-list. At first they agreed to do all these things and then gradually they backed away from it. I'm very curious to see what they plan to do in terms of technology. They said that they were going to bear all of those costs. Do we have an exact punch-list of what that is? And can we get that in writing?

Dr. Evans: There are conversations currently taking place between our staff and the SDA staff over the lists. We have developed a list. In fact, we've done one walk-through. I was on the first walk-through where that was one of the items that we discussed. A follow-up walk-through has since taken place with members of our staff, Mr. Morlino's staff, and our technology staff. I'm awaiting the results of that before we engage them further. I had a very brief conversation with Mr. McKenna three or four weeks ago just after the walk that I went on reminding him of their commitment to satisfy the needs and expenses that we would incur as a district to assume the property. He wanted to have a follow-up conversation also after our respective staffs had their second walk-through and then determine what the final list they were going to bring back to both of us looked like.

Comm. Hodges: We couldn't get decent whiteboards in that building. They backed away from that, let alone some of the other things with the lack of padding on the walls. All of those things they refused to do at School 24. So I would really hope that you're going to get a written agreement ahead of time that they're going to do this, that, and the other, establish what that list is, and then hold them to that. I actually want to see that list personally.

Dr. Evans: Is Mr. Morlino in the audience? His staff is preparing information along with the SDA staff to get to us.

Comm. Hodges: We had to make them go back to repair the noise that was in the auditorium that was awful. We had to pressure them repeatedly over and over again. In fact, it was the Board who pushed that agenda. That's why I'm so conscious about this. They have not always been amenable to follow-through on the things they said they were going to do. We had the same thing in International High School where they finally decided they were only going to do this instead of doing all the other things they originally agreed to do.

Comm. Irving: Dr. Evans, can you just ensure that following your conversation with Mr. McKenna it makes sense to communicate with him what everyone agreed on. You can

then give the Board that communication thereafter. Thank you. Are there any other questions?

Comm. Kerr: Ms. Santa, you noted in your presentation that there are some parents who will be getting back to you regarding whether or not they will take their kids to school. I see here an estimate of half a million dollars for transportation. What if some parents decide to take their kids to school? Will that impact this allocation?

Ms. Santa: It may be that the number of parents that indicate they are driving their children is a high number and that means that we will need one or two less buses, but we won't know until we have those responses from the parents. I will tell you it's not a lot of parents that I have heard indicating that. Even the handful that are saying that's what they want, that's why we're sending the survey, so that we can follow up with those parents. We're not just going to take the survey and say this is it. We will follow up with a phone call. We want to ensure that is clear. I can assure you that number will go down depending on the number of students that will or will not require busing.

Comm. Kerr: My hope is that this estimated budget covers everything.

Ms. Santa: That number would cover everything.

Comm. Kerr: If everybody decides to take the bus...

Ms. Santa: That's why it's so high. Every student was accounted for in that number. As we're meeting with parents some of them are indicating they prefer to drive their child.

Comm. Kerr: Okay.

Comm. Hodges: The only concern I have is they may view that as a possibility now, but when they get up in the morning and encounter the traffic having to come from that part of town across the river... They may indicate right now they plan to do that, but what provisions are we going to make when they change their mind?

Comm. Kerr: This budget covers everything.

Comm. Irving: That's the point.

Ms. Santa: Everyone is factored in. That's why we're following up with a phone call after the survey, to make sure that parents do understand the process as well.

Comm. Hodges: Give them a couple of weeks before you call them back.

Comm. Irving: Are there any other questions? Thank you, Ms. Santa. I want to apologize for being late. I got hung up in traffic. Thank you, Comm. Cleaves, for starting.

- **School No. 16 Opening**
- **Dr. Hani Awadallah School Opening**
- **School No. 21**

Dr. Evans: You have before you a memorandum from me. I'm going to speak from that document because it provides an overview of the kinds of things we've been looking at, the issues we've been dealing with and addressing, and taking into consideration

information that Board members have shared, some in meetings reflecting your thoughts and what you'd like to see happen as well. By sharing with you a table that represents my thinking at this point in time, which are captioned in three options, one or more of those options address the kinds of things that you all have been sharing that you'd like to see happen at the school, as well as information that the facilities planning committee, which also gave recommendations when it met just under a year ago, and the activity that resulted in the development of the facilities plans. Their thoughts are represented in the final five-year facilities plan that was submitted first to you and then ultimately to the New Jersey Department of Education. As everyone is aware, School 16 and Dr. Hani Awadallah will open this fall when the school year begins, early in September 2016. We're doing everything we can to ensure a smooth opening. In fact, one of the items attached to that package you have is an action plan that was crafted. Dr. Linda Crescione has been in the lead in not only the items on the action plan, but leading us to make sure that we do the things that it indicates we need to do in order to be prepared. In consideration of student and program assignments, there are a number of factors that have to be considered. You have, for example, scattergrams that illustrate where the students in some of the programs that you have suggested be included as well as some of the information shared by the facilities planning committee, particularly around the Newcomer's program in particular, actually reside in the district. What you have are two 8.5 by 14 sheets and each one of those dots on those sheets shows where the students in those programs actually reside. There's one for the Paterson Newcomer's program and there's one for the Young Men's Academy as well. That's information that we wanted to know as we were synthesizing the information that we had and the information that you all shared that reflected your wants and desires as well. I note five items that are worthy of consideration as we move forward in developing the three options that we present to you. The first item, School 16 and Dr. Hani Awadallah, were constructed in the south and southwestern regions of the city where schools at the time that they were conceptualized were most overcrowded. They still are overcrowded and we probably have more busing from School 9 to School 25 and other schools across this region because of the number of students who populate that particular region. Similarly, School 16 presents a challenge at School 24 and other schools in the region as well. The district recently completed and submitted a five-year facilities plan that you're very much aware of and you received that in late summer of 2015. Then ultimately we submitted it to the State Board of Education shortly thereafter. In it the committee was asked to indicate special programs that it would like to see represented in the schools as well. They did and one of the examples of the programs included Full Service Community Schools. They noted the schools where they would like to see them as well as the Newcomer's program. The reassignment of selective programs, including Newcomer's and the Young Men's Academy, is likely to create opportunities to relocate students to other schools and other programs across the district. We currently have some of those programs in leased facilities and we are working very aggressively to get out of those leased facilities in particular because those are funds that we can use to enhance our building. Some of the programs are in facilities that currently do not meet 21st Century learning standards. Both Young Men's Academy and the Newcomer's program must be reviewed to ensure implementation that is consistent with their program design and best practices. We took that into consideration as we looked at it as well. More specifically, when we look at the Newcomer's program, it wasn't designed for a youngster to spend their entire education career between fourth and eighth grade in that site. They should be there long enough to acquire English skills sufficient for them to survive in a general education setting. That should be approximately a year because we do have bilingual programs or other programs in our schools to help youngsters who may be struggling but do have a decent command of English. It's not meant to be the school for a youngster to stay for a number of years. The Young Men's Academy, on the other hand, was fraught with

challenges from the beginning because there were students who were identified with that program that really were not the targeted population in the narrative description that was identified that indicated who it was for, the kinds of needs that the students represented and those kinds of things. Unfortunately, there were some in some of our schools who took advantage of an opportunity to move students that didn't necessarily meet that criteria. So my point here is that for both programs we need to make sure that the criteria for those programs are followed and that youngsters assigned to those programs are there for as long as they need to be. But particularly with Newcomer's, when they get to the point where they're acquiring English sufficient to manage themselves in a general education setting, then they are transferred to their home school to continue. And then with the Young Men's making sure that the youngsters who come into the program are students for whom the program was designed. School 21 is being looked at as well. I mention that because School 21 impacts on our elementary schools in particular next year. The Board has communicated clearly and others as well, and rightly so, that we have some challenges there that we need to address. No question about it. That statement is put there basically to say we're going to address those challenges and we're looking at some alternatives. We're not planning to reassign the students in School 21. Don't get me wrong. I don't want any parent walking out thinking we're going to move kids at School 21. No. We're going to tighten things up there and actually look at the staff and leadership and address the challenges that we've had, including recruiting and retaining highly qualified teachers so that we can move forward with that school. One of the options that I think would work there is taking the school and creating small learning environments within the school in much the same way that we did at Eastside and Kennedy, but on a smaller scale and for the younger kids. Again, it's targeting the population that's there. If there's space and youngsters want to participate in a small learning community, a thematic school if you will that we identify as a school within a school, then we would take advantage of that opportunity as well. Moving ahead in considering Hani Awadallah and School 16, there were a number of advantages and disadvantages that we took into consideration as the options that I'm going to share with you and you have it in your packet began to surface. I'm at the A list now. We have to consider the distribution of residences for students enrolled in both programs. Those are the scattergrams that I alluded to that you have. I initially thought that for one or more of the programs the students may be more tightly clustered in a region, but that wasn't necessarily so. They are distributed across the district for both programs. Secondly, special programs assigned to both School 16 and Hani Awadallah would result in lowered capacity for neighborhood students. Again, when both of these schools were approved – and that occurred before I came to the district – I was advised that one of the big issues was overcrowding that continued to persist in this district and we should always consider that even when we consider special programs. Capacity to absorb future growth in community surrounding School 16 and Hani Awadallah would be limited. Similarly, there would be limits on growth for future programs. However, there are some advantages. There are some things that we really need to take to heart here. The facilities planning committee made recommendations for the addition of selective programs to several of the schools, including School 16, in the facilities plan that was developed and informed by this group. Number two, the assignment of special programs and services to both schools frees buildings, albeit substandard in terms of the 21st Century learning that we talked about, for other uses by the district and at a lowered cost. There are some programs or offices that we are considering to move into any building that we vacate at this point. The assignment of students in special programs to the new buildings affords them the opportunity to benefit from facilities that meet 21st Century learning standards. For example, one of the things that the SDA is doing is providing computers for every kid and I believe every faculty member. That's an example. We'd like to do that in every school and maximizing the opportunity for students to access that level of technology

and other amenities in the buildings certainly is something that we want to take full advantage of, whether it's a special program, a unique program, or the general population in the school. In the packet that you have you have an action plan that includes all the activity that has been underway and I alluded earlier to Dr. Crescione and the work that she's done to lead this. She's been shepherding the development and the implementation of this action plan and all of us have been contributing in our own ways to actualizing it or to make it happen. At some point you may want to take a look at that to get a sense of the kinds of things that have already happened or are underway. Lastly, I want to call your attention to the three options that are there. One or more of these options takes advantage of recommendations that some of you have made individually in one-on-one conversations that we've had. Or you made comments at Board members that suggest some things that you'd like to see happen. Rather than go through it in great detail, I think it's pretty self-explanatory. I give this to you and before you do I'm going to give Dr. Crescione an opportunity, who has shepherded this action plan and has information that she wishes to share as well with regards to the kinds of things that need to be taken into consideration as you give us feedback in terms of what you would like to see happen.

Dr. Linda Crescione: Good evening, Commissioners. Thank you, Dr. Evans, for those words and for explaining to our Commissioners a lot of the issues that I have currently been undertaking. If I can ask you just for a few moments to look at the action plan, even though Dr. Evans alluded to the fact that many of these things are in effect, I just want to highlight a few of those things for you if I could. Regarding the staffing, I just would like you to know that the principal postings have been completed. We have interviewed principals for the position and recommendations were forwarded to Dr. Evans. We're in the process of making that final determination. The VP postings also have been completed for those schools and the staffing postings have already been completed. As you know, the staff for both of the schools will have the opportunity to apply to the buildings. In particular the staff from School 9 will be given first priority in the staffing at Hani Awadallah. Those things have already occurred. Regarding the student enrollment plan, that's something we're going to be discussing this evening. I've been meeting with Ms. Peron regarding the curricular model and we are well on our way in determining the supports that will be needed for our regular, special education, early childhood, and our bilingual students. The budget has also been prepared and has been given to Ms. Ayala. That has also been completed. As you know, in order to develop the transportation plan we need to first decide on the redistricting model, which we are discussing this evening. Following that is parent communication. That's one of the key areas that we will need to do and look at seriously because we really want the community support. We want the community to know everything that we're doing and planning. Again, until this determination can be made it was difficult to have those meetings because, as you know, one decision impacts the other. We will be planning those as soon as the final decisions are made. In terms of the facilities report, I know that Mr. Morlino is not here this evening but according to Mr. Mapp, we should be receiving the TCO for Hani Awadallah in six to eight weeks. I am not sure yet on the TCO for School 16, but we are very confident that both schools will be opening this September, which is wonderful news. That's a little bit about the action plan. I know the purpose of this evening is really to talk primarily about the redistricting options that Dr. Evans has discussed. I know there are three on the table before you and Dr. Evans has shared a little bit about the pros and cons of each. I would like to just begin by saying that I fully appreciate that this is an important decision that each of you is asked to make regarding the redistricting of these schools because we're all here for the same reason. We all want what's best for all of the students of the district. I ask you, however, in considering the options that are before you a couple of points. One point that I would like to share is information that has been given to me by Mr. Morlino and Mr. Mapp from

the facilities department. I am hoping that possibly Mr. Mapp, who had to pick up his child today, and Mr. Morlino, who's teaching at Rutgers, said he would do his best to try to get here this evening. I'm hoping that he may be able to come and expound more on these points. I need to again bring your attention to the fact that the intent of both Hani Awadallah and School 16 was to alleviate overcrowding throughout the district because these are two neighborhoods that are very overcrowded. As many of you know, I was principal at School 9 for 20 years so I am very well aware of the community and the fact that it has been very overcrowded for most of my career. As Ms. Warren can share, the students at School 9 have been bused for years, kindergarten, first and second grade to Dale Avenue. Other students and other grades have been bused to School 7 and School 25. So it is truly a community, the South Paterson neighborhood, in need of that new school. I say this from personal experience and I also share that knowing Dr. Awadallah as I did and many of you did, if he could stand at this podium, and I look at Dr. Hodges and those of you who knew when he came how passionate he was, he would be the first one to say that this community school is something that they have been waiting for, for many years. I'm not sure, but I would say 2004 was the initial plan for when they broke the Gorney & Gorney Funeral Home down. It's been that many years. Many of you are shaking your heads so you remember. I believe that this community and the importance of Hani Awadallah is clear. Going back to the SDA, they are sharing that they gave an educational adequacy approval for a k-8 program at Hani Awadallah and for pre-k-8 program at School 16, which is what the buildings were designed for. That changing grade configuration and changing the purpose of the program and putting in a blended program when it was designed with a single educational adequacy approval may be difficult and it may need to go before the SDA or the NJDOE again for final consideration. For instance, with the Young Men's Academy, they're all boys and we would need to have the facilities for the restrooms reconfigured. That may need approval as well from the SDA to make any facility reconfigurations, as well as scheduling and classroom space. If we were to divide the Young Men's Academy into two distinct programs or wings it would change the configuration of the school dramatically. That's something that I'm more than happy to share with you and show you the floor plans of the building so that you understand the difficulty of formulating a specific wing in a school that was not constructed as such. Also, both programs would require two administrators and both schools were not configured to have two administrator suites. Again, the original intent and model of the school is different than what we are doing with combining the school-within-a-school program. In addition to that, I want to share a few other things as well. One thing that I have a little concern about, and I know we have shared as a group, is that if we are making this recommendation that the community of South Paterson and CJR9 and School 16 should be or have not at this point been invited to the table to hear the comments and concerns that they may want to know. So I do want to bring that out to your attention. At this point there hasn't been input from the community and whether we were to bring any program, regardless of whether it's Young Men's or the Newcomer's program, into either of these schools it will possibly mean that neighborhood students would be limited in their attendance and may ultimately need to go to other schools or be bused to other locations. I know that is something that I want you to consider in making these decisions. In speaking about School 16, I truly believe I am able to speak more so about School 9 and that community. I would ask Ms. Peron to come up and just share her thoughts a little bit about the Newcomer's program and the impact that will have. As you see, with the Newcomer's program there are approximately 320 students and we couldn't fit them into one location. It meant that we are going to put certain grades at School 16 and the other grades at New Roberto Clemente. We are in essence dividing the program into two sites because we didn't have room for all of the students at one particular site. Ms. Peron can speak to that in greater detail and then I'll be glad to come back and share any other questions that you may have.

Ms. Peron: All I really have to add to this conversation is that I'm most concerned about the goals of the Newcomer's program and those are four main goals – to assist the students in developing academic skills, to assist them in acquiring English language proficiency, to assist students in their adjustment to school coming into the US, and to enable them to mainstream successfully into a traditional classroom. When we set out to develop Newcomer's, it was a solution to a challenge that we have with many students that we have coming into the district who are academically below grade level for two years and who don't speak English and don't have knowledge of what a formal school setting is. When we set out to develop Newcomer's we looked for a location because traditionally these programs are not based in a traditional classroom. The needs of these students are different. We have to look at acclimating them into this country. Many of them do come at the middle school age level, which is why we're faced with the challenge of newcomers and the space for newcomers. Our numbers tend to grow in the grade levels of 6, 7, 8, and even at the high school level. We have a facilities challenge. We know that the culture and climate of a Newcomer's school should be a place where families walk in and learn about the United States form of schooling and have a staff that understands the needs of the newcomers. I'm not only speaking of Latino children. I'm speaking of bilingual children, immigrant children, and refugee children. This is about a newcomer. This is about a person who comes into the United States from a foreign country and that has these particular needs. The connection to a newcomer needs to be fostered. It needs to be nurtured. The leader of the school and the staff of the school needs to understand the particulars of what these children and families face. The program needs to be in a place where the environment is inviting and provides resources to families in this community so that they know where to go and whom to access in their given language. We are still faced with this challenge in this district because we don't have the people and the staff that can do this for all our newcomers in this district. That is a challenge that we continue to explore, review, and meet. I was very happy that we had the opportunity to go into a standalone school like School 11 for our newcomers because finally we had a place where we could provide these services to our kids. Is it a substandard school? Yes, it is. Is it an environment that needs to be upgraded? Yes, it is. Just like School 11, we have School 17, School 14, and many other facilities that need the same. I, as a Chief Academic Officer, stand before you to say that the goals of this program, like the goals of this district, like the mission and vision of Paterson Public Schools, is what I am concerned with. I am concerned with all of our kids. I want all our children to have the best educational opportunity, the best environment that's most conducive to learning. It is with a heavy heart that I see that we are leaving School 11. I know that it is a place where our kids have grown, but like Dr. Evans says, they do not stay for the long haul. It is not meant to be a place where they spend four years. It is meant to be a place where they can transition out into the mainstream environment and classroom and the traditional classroom. We have exited many newcomers and we have the numbers to show that we do successfully transition those newcomer students out into the regular school system, maybe into a bilingual program because they still need the supports of learning English with them when they walk into a traditional school setting. I don't know if I answered the question. I know that I'm answering the question to the best of what I believe in and what I know is educationally appropriate for all our kids. They have a program that has intent, that they have a leader that understands the needs of the population, and that they have all the resources to meet the challenges of the 21st Century. I want the newcomers to have a place. I want them to have a leader that understands what their needs are. I want to have a place where families walk in and are invited, heard, and helped with resources. That is what I want. Breaking them up is the result of the challenge that we have with our facilities and the numbers of our kids. When we first opened up Newcomer's our fourth and fifth grades are not large because

we're still waiting for our population to come in. But as the grade levels increase, the numbers increase. That is the challenge that we face. I hope that you have heard and you understand where we're coming from. We are constantly in review. We are constantly in need of recommendations.

Comm. Irving: I'll let Dr. Evans finish up any comments he has and then we'll open the floor to the Board to ask any questions of you and Dr. Crescione related to the respective options and the maps that we have here. Dr. Evans, anything further?

Dr. Evans: No, other than simply to orient you to the sheet you have that lists the three options. One of the options is not to move anybody. That's an option. Two other options obviously are reflective of information that some of you have shared with me in conversations. Collectively, I need to hear from the Board before we put this in final form.

Comm. Irving: Let's open the floor up for feedback, comments, and thoughts.

Comm. Cleaves: I just want to understand your three options. For instance, option number one, where the Xs are, are those the move?

Dr. Evans: If there's an X there, it may mean there's a program already there. In fact, in the case of School 21 there's already a bilingual program there.

Comm. Irving: I think the Xs indicate where the programs will move to.

Dr. Evans: They would be there. Whether they're already there or not, they would be there next year.

Comm. Irving: That's correct. Case in point, option one proposes the Newcomer's stay at School 11, Young Men's Academy goes to Smith Street, and bilingual stays at School 21. Option two splits Newcomer's between School 16 4-6 and New Roberto 7-8. Young Men's would be at Hani Awadallah and bilingual stays at School 21. With option three Newcomer's stay at School 16 and New Roberto, but Young Men's goes to School 21 and bilingual stays at School 21.

Dr. Evans: The split for Newcomer's is an attempt to divide it approximately in half. It's not exact, but it's as close to half as possible. That program is about 320 kids.

Comm. Irving: Dr. Evans, what's the game plan? If we're able to split the program in two separate schools New Roberto is still a 21st Century learning school and a fairly new facility. What would be the plan as far as leadership for somebody to shepherd the kids who are now 4-6 and 7-8?

Dr. Evans: There are a couple of options. One is each school would have a principal. Then we could have two models. One could be a separate principal responsible for that program or a higher level vice principal responsible for that program who reports to the building principal at both sites. That would be one option.

Comm. Irving: To me that sounds a lot better than just having to pay for principals for populations that are less than 120 kids. To have an administrator in charge of all the programs probably makes the most sense. Are there any other thoughts or questions?

Comm. Kerr: Going over this and listening to Ms. Peron it seems to me like our primary focus is a new building more so than what is being taught inside the building. I heard

her mention that given preference she would rather have a building that stands alone for that purpose. Of the options that we have here only one option reflects that position and that's option number one.

Comm. Irving: ...which is to keep the kids at School 11.

Comm. Kerr: It's not fancy. I know the idea is that it's a new building, but if we are to develop a true Newcomer's program that adequately addresses programming for all those kids, I would rather see a self-contained building. You'd lose fewer resources in sourcing that building than you would have considering what we are going through right now fiscally. I know it's fancy and everybody needs a new suit, but the reality is it might not give us all that we need to have. I come from a third world country. We could learn under a tree. It was important, but it wasn't the core of the matter. It's important that we have 21st Century learning centers, but I am more concerned about what is being done in that building as opposed to the building itself. I just think I need to make that point. Dr. Crescione talked about the Hani Awadallah School in the southern end of the city. If you start moving kids into that building, it's going to create a lot of pressure for the community that exists there right now. There are a lot of pieces here that we need to consider before we rush into satisfying our material needs as opposed to our intellectual needs.

Comm. Simmons: Just to piggyback on what Comm. Kerr said, I think I heard the same thing. The students in those areas where those new schools are have been waiting for a school. Particularly at School 16, those students have been displaced already. That neighborhood has been waiting for a school. We have to keep that in mind. For me, option one makes sense for that reason. It keeps the boys where they are on Smith Street and it keeps School 11 where it is. It keeps both of those programs where they are, but we need to consider heavily those students who have been displaced already and waiting for a new school.

Comm. Hodges: My concern is the poor way we started the Young Men's program. Remember, the Young Men's program has the lowest performing students in this district in the general population, which are African American males, and the next lowest performing students in the general population, which are young Latino males. It became a dumping ground, as opposed to what it was supposed to be, a laboratory to provide a new model for teaching this population. This was supposed to be a technologically infused place where you could try out new learning strategies, bring on hands-on project-based learning, and get these kids involved very early in the learning process. That was the original design. Instead, it became just a dump with very little technology. I don't need to discuss the building. It defeats the purpose of establishing the school in the first place. We didn't give them the services that they needed. We shorted them across the board. Quite frankly, looking at what we've done with School 21, I could not countenance sending anybody to School 21 based on people's promises of what they're going to do. We've been promising them for a year. You're going to promise me that next year you're going to do a much better job? You're going to get those kids and move them from a very bad situation and now we're going to suddenly revamp School 21? Not until I see it. I'm not going to believe anybody until I see it. The principal came to the curriculum committee and he talked about what he wanted to do with that program. He wanted to take these kids and give them a new excitement for learning. He wanted to give them technology. He wanted to give them hands-on learning. He wanted to change the way they were taught, which by the way, when we went to Boston it's some of the approaches that everybody in the country is moving towards. It's all project based. You're changing the whole model of the classroom where the kids are learning and they're engaged. They're not just sitting in rows like the

normal classes anymore. They're out there doing things and they're learning by doing and they're using new technology. That's what we originally wanted Young Men's Academy to do and what the principal has said he wants to do. He has gone out to William Paterson and brought a professor-in-residence to do just that. But we're going to put them in facilities that are substandard. How do we do that? The educational option, which should be the important factor here, is that program needs to be substantially upgraded. If the SDA, god bless them, is going to give them technology, new equipment, one-to-one that will put them in an environment where educationally they can finally flourish, and change the notion of this school being a dumping ground to this being a magnet for young Latino and African American men to change their idea of how important education should be, that's what I would like to see. We owe them that and we owe the whole process of trying to change that lower performing student group and encouraging them to do better. Option number one, you can't say that they should stay there and you can't put them in School 21 because you haven't fixed School 21. You promised to, but you have less money. So how are you going to do that? You have fewer services that you can provide. You can't promise me that you're going to do anything at School 21 because I don't see where the resources are coming from. The only option that I see available to us is to put them in another environment that they can thrive in and, by the way, sell that school and get some money back for our budget.

Comm. Rivera: Ever since I've been on the Board, I've noticed that the closing of School 11 has always been part of the district's plan. It was part of the plan that was presented or given to me at one time. I forgot the name of the exact plan, but the input of the community was used to determine the use for the new School 16. You guys presented that to us and it included the closure of School 11 and moving them into School 16. Every list of budget reductions that you have presented to the Board included the closure of School 11 and moving to School 16. I just want to throw all those things out there. I was a newcomer. When I came from Dominican Republic, I went to New York for a little bit and then I came to Paterson. I was put in School 20 at the time. I guess they didn't even have a bilingual program because I remember being in a class the whole day with everything in English. I used to get about 45 minutes a day of the English language and the name of the teacher at the time was Ms. Love. I don't think she's still around. That was a long time ago. The bottom line is we're here to serve all the kids. All of our kids have needs. Before I started working for the City of Paterson a long time ago while I was in college I was a substitute. So I saw a lot of the conditions of a lot of the schools. I saw School 6 really bad. I saw School 21. I don't like the way the environment at School 21 feels either regarding the facility. This discussion and my fight have never been about getting a new facility to a specific group. It's just where the location of the facility is and what the district's plan from day one was, which was to close School 11 and move them to School 16. We have highly paid professionals in the district that made this decision. The Superintendent gets paid a lot of money. I am here to provide my opinion on certain things and let them know what the need of the whole community is. That's what I'm here for and if I disagree on something I let him know. If I disagree on what they're doing administratively and I might have an idea or an opinion about something, I'm going to let him know also. Year after year it was part of the district plan to close that school. I don't like the way this thing is heading and I'm glad we're heading in the right direction as of late. The bottom line is all of our kids have needs. I would like to see 10 new schools so everybody is happy. But the bottom line is the SDA just built two of them. I'm happy for the kids that are going to Hani Awadallah. It doesn't matter where they come from. That school serves a need. School 16 serves a need also. School 11 we saw an opportunity to close that school and at the same time we can generate revenue out of that school. A lot of resources would not go into that school because maintaining that school open, and maybe that's not part of the discussion right now but it's one option here, doesn't

serve the district any purpose at all. It actually hurts the district to keep that school open because you have to put resources into it. You're going to have to put additional staffing into the other two schools. The bottom line is that it's not cost-efficient to keep that there and it doesn't do a service to any of the kids in the district, no matter where they're from. That school is definitely going to be closed. A comment was made here that the input of the community was not used to create these three options, and I'm glad we at least have three options instead of just one. I appreciate that. I want to thank you, Dr. Evans. Susie Peron said that usually you have a higher need for the higher grades. I don't want to complicate this whole thing, but this is what's presented here. Normally you have a higher need for grades 6-8 and this option here says 4-6. Basically what I'm telling you is we have to look at numbers to arrive at a conclusion. For example, last time you presented us with a few options. That was a few months ago. We started analyzing which schools in the area were overcrowded, and maybe some of you guys can correct me, and there were some schools at capacity, but the only one that was overcrowded at the time was School 24. Again, you gave us the report. That was the time that we had a report here on the screen and I had a different one in front of me. I said how come the one on the screen doesn't reflect the closure of School 11 like the one I have in front of me which references a plan that we paid a lot of money to put together using the input of the community. That was back then and this is where we are now. I like the options that are in front of us, but could we just have those options based on need? For example, if the grades that are in more need are 6-8, could we look at that instead of 4-6? Or maybe you have your reasoning for just having 4-6. That school has capacity for 710 kids. How many kids are at Newcomer's right now?

Comm. Irving: 300.

Comm. Rivera: Then the other kids that are going to go into the school are the neighborhood kids. Correct? I don't understand the reasoning. You might have it or maybe I missed it. Why just do three grades? Given the numbers I saw before, the other schools are not that overcrowded. We're still going to move some kids from the other schools into that new school. Is there a reason why the plans were done in this manner and not just move the full program?

Dr. Evans: Because just under half of the capacity of the building would be taken by one program and that means a larger number of students in the neighborhood would have to be displaced.

Comm. Rivera: That's fine. It was just a question. I want to conclude by saying that what we have here in front of us is not us fighting for a school. It's been the district's plan since day one. You know this, Dr. Evans. It's been the plan since day one. It was the plan a few months ago. It was the plan as far as maybe a month ago when you submitted all those reductions. I just want to put that out there. Thank you.

Comm. Castillo: As Comm. Rivera said, School 11 had been on the books for a long time. But I think the most important thing is many of our schools have a lot of facilities issues. We can name all of them. We have buildings that are extremely old. The thing with School 11 that I saw and I still see here, and Ms. Peron please correct me, is that a high percentage of the students from School 11 do live in that area. Visiting School 11, like Dr. Hodges said a while ago for the all boy's school, it was a dumping ground. It was a great program that was created for our kids. It's a program that I think was a great idea. But it hasn't flourished as many of us wanted it to because School 11, correct me if I'm wrong, was closed prior to putting the Newcomer's in there. We reopened it just to put these kids in there. If it's a program which these kids are

circulating in I think it's a good way to give these kids more energy, more power, and they want to learn. Within the school they don't have a bathroom on the first floor. The third building was burnt down. They don't have a fire escape. I know a lot of these schools are in bad conditions, but if you open a new facility where most of the residents are I think it's just a great idea. If you had the possibility of renovation, it would be one of my top priorities. We don't have that money. It's sad that these kids don't even have a cafeteria to eat in. They eat in the basement and the ceiling is so low that once you have five kids in there it's insane. Why not give these kids the opportunity to learn, to have technology, to want to grow, and want to be better. Just as Comm. Rivera, I was a newcomer student. I went into School 18. So I know what the proper tools and materials can lead you to. These kids lack the same technology that the kids in the all boy's school do. The facilities are bad. They are terrible to go in there. So why not give these programs a new face? Why not give these kids the idea that they care? You have a great principal, you have great teachers, but they're still lacking. They still need more just to get acclimated. I think the biggest idea of moving these kids is great. These kids are learning English, but if you put them in a school where you have other kids that are from the community it forces them and it helps them to speak the language. You have kids in a new program that the teachers and the principal speak Spanish. Even though you're teaching them, it's difficult for you not to answer back when a child speaks to you in Spanish. But if they have kids that don't understand the language, it kind of pushes them a little harder to learn and to acclimate and be part of the community. I think that's one of the things. It's not about which program. It's just about a facility. If we can help those kids in the area, then why not? I would say the same thing if a school opened by School 14, School 6, and School 27. If we have the power or the tools to encourage a few kids to become better students and to be the best that they can, why not if it's just to move them over? It's sad to walk into the facility. Even in the area where these are these kids are venturing off to the stores. The bus is a horrific scene. That area just to drive on a regular basis is horrible. Imagine all these buses coming in and out. I think the teachers and the principal are doing an amazing job just trying to get these kids into buses to make sure that they're safe and that they don't venture off. I think we have to take all these things into account as well.

*Comm. Simmons and Comm. Rivera leave the meeting at 7:44 p.m.

Dr. Evans: I just wanted to mention the fact that you have a scattergram here. Each one of those dots is a kid. So the kids are distributed when you look at it across the district. That's one point. There was another point that you made that I wanted to respond to having to do with the building and the recommendation of the committee. The facilities planning committee actually recommended closing School 11 and petitioning SDA to build a new school on that site.

Comm. Irving: Thank you. Are there any other comments?

Comm. Hodges: Yes. I would love that. In fact, anything that forces them to consider a new building I'm for. When we fought for School 16 many people here weren't here for that. School 16 had 250 kids with one set of bathrooms. It had a wall which when you open the wall it exposed three different classrooms. When we saw it we went nuts because it was one of the oldest schools. It was atrocious. We fought to get that school closed because it was an outrage. We brought the SDA here and they were shamed into doing it. We brought the press and showed them the conditions those kids were under to convince them to close that school and make that one of the priorities. They fought forever and dragged their feet, but we did that. I personally got accused of stalking two governors behind that. Not one, but two. Corzine publicly said I was stalking him, chasing him around the state for the money. I understand the need. Also,

there was a need at School 17 and School 3. We lost out on School 3. That was one of our intended projects to get, not a renovation, but a brand new school at School 3. That was lost in all this nonsense. Again, from my point of view I was concerned about how Dr. Crescione talked about the staff. How do you bring in different sets of staff and the facilities to house that staffing?

Dr. Crescione: At Hani Awadallah, the school would have to be partitioned into wings. By the way, I want to mention that Mr. Morlino is here so he could come up and give additional highlights on the other piece. The concern is that right now the way the enrollment has been redistricted the population at Hani Awadallah with the current configuration is about 662 students. That's not including the additional students from Young Men's that would be there. It is going to necessitate that some of those students do move either back to School 9 or another plan.

Comm. Hodges: What about School 16?

Dr. Crescione: At School 16 the current enrollment there, because it's a pre-k-8, is 630 students. If you add the projection, and I think it was 150, you would be way over the capacity at that building as well. Right now the enrollment for both schools, considering the neighborhood, is almost at capacity. If we just consider the neighborhood needs, they are both at capacity. It will necessitate that by moving these additional programs in, I reiterate and that's why I said it, it will impact on the students being moved to other locations. To go back to the comment that Comm. Rivera said that it's only 300 students, the thing that I ask you to remember is to not only think students. Think homeroom. The idea of the sixth, seventh, and eighth grades at Newcomer's requires three homerooms for sixth, four homerooms for seventh, and three homerooms for eighth. That's just that building. They only have at that school the homerooms for each. That would mean that the students would go from k-5 at School 16 and once they reached sixth, seventh, and eighth grades we would have to bus them or move them to another school. So they couldn't even continue their education k-8 if we were to have done that. That's why there are such wide-reaching implications for these decisions. I know they are difficult and I know we all want students to have the best, but I also agree with what Comm. Kerr said that it's not the facility that makes the program and makes it good. It's the leadership. It's the staffing. It's the protocols. I know when you were speaking, Dr. Hodges, about the Young Men's Academy, I was there at the beginning and I do know what the goal was of everyone here for that academy. I also agree that unfortunately the oversight initially of having the proper students placed there fell apart.

Comm. Hodges: And the program as well.

Dr. Crescione: And the program. But I will say, and I say this from the bottom of my heart, that I know that Ms. Warren and the new principal have now the propensity, the professor-in-residence, and the robotics program. I know Ms. Warren could come up and share so many other wonderful things that have been proposed for that school, including a new application process, so that it's not going to be that a principal has the right to say here are the students. There will be a strict application process.

Comm. Irving: With all due respect, I'm just trying to limit this conversation.

Dr. Crescione: That's okay, Comm. Irving. I just wanted to highlight some of the questions.

Comm. Irving: Duly noted. I think there is something to say about the environment in which our kids learn and you know that. I think the programs are important, but that

also is paired with facilities. We know that if you can put young people in optimum situations it gives them a better appreciation for the aesthetics of learning and the kinetics of learning. I'll be very frank with you. The boys' school where the young men are located right now, the facility stinks. I'm sorry. As a parent I would not put my child in that school. I don't care how the hell great you told me the program was. I wouldn't put my kids in School 11 either. I don't care how great you told me the program is. The challenge before this Board is that it is a decision I know you're going to ask us to vote on at a later point regarding the recommendations that are here. This is the conversation that we all have to have with each other and then make a decision upon. Do you just leave the kids where they are? Do we just say for the sake of peace let's leave everyone where they are and let's leave kids in substandard environments? I'm not okay with that. I am absolutely not okay with that. If there's a medium road that helps to alleviate a facility that we know is substandard that we were going to close and where we put kids who come from another country in to learn, that sends a message. Then if we're willing to put kids who are in a low performing subgroup in the district in a facility that we know is substandard and we're saying leave them there, then that sends a message as well. I think that there's got to be a middle ground to find some level of compromise here. I don't think it has to be one way left or right. This is education and this is an elected Board. This is governing and sometimes when you govern you have to make tough decisions and compromises. I don't think everyone is going to get what they want in this scenario. There will have to be a compromise on some level. As I've shared with everybody in this room, I don't have skin in the game either way, but I do think both facilities stink. If we can find a way to get the kids out of both of those facilities and into other places, whether it's School 16 or Hani Awadallah, in my mind I'm thinking about the facility that we're renting from Mayor Torres. He has a possible opportunity. We have to consider what the opportunities out there are.

Comm. Kerr: I heard what you're saying, Mr. President. I just want to make it clear that my understanding of the concept of Newcomer's is everybody that comes for whom English is not their first language or formal education. You're not targeting a subgroup of individuals. I want that to be very clear because you did mention that. Also, I believe this school should be a transition situation where you bring kids into that environment for a very limited amount of time. They're transitioning through so they can be mainstreamed. It's not like you have a child there and that child moves through all the stages of his or her education in that same facility. We have an opportunity to make sure that we are rigorous and robust at the entry level and move them out as fast as we can in order to be mainstreamed. While we do so, I think we also should do the best we can to improve the physical condition of the environment also. My thing is we need to not complicate the matter and make it into a political consideration as opposed to an educational one. We just need to try to be honest with it and try to work with it to make sure that our kids are better served in this area.

Comm. Irving: I tend to agree with you.

Comm. Hodges: How many students are in the Young Men's Academy?

Dr. Evans: 51.

Comm. Hodges: I don't see that impact being that dramatic on a new school, but that's just me. Let's say you doubled it close to 100, I still don't see that being as dramatic. Quite frankly, if you're declaring the program to consist of x, y, and z, it should finally start to consist of x, y, and z. Do not tell parents and me that you're going to open up the Newcomer's school to do these things and then don't it. That's what we've been doing. If you're saying that you're transitioning, let's transition. In the Young Men's

program, I'm going to hasten to add half of the students are Latino. I've been accused of some terrible things, which I'm really annoyed about. Half of those students are Latino. That Young Men's program is not serving the interests of those students. The problem is one of these new schools will provide the environment for that, which we're not providing at Smith Street. We're not doing it. You're definitely not going to do it at School 21. You wanted to tell me let's move them to Napier, but you're cutting the technology people at Napier. That's supposed to be our technology program and you can't put them there either, but you have space. In this particular case the facilities complement the program. I don't care which one you put them in, but give this program the operational chance to be successful.

Comm. Irving: Dr. Evans, when are you looking for the Board to make a decision on one of the three items that are here?

Dr. Evans: ASAP. Depending on the outcome of this discussion, I'm going to go back and have a conversation with staff to digest it all and three is going to become one in terms of what we're going to bring to you to support. I'd like to accomplish that by the Board meeting this month.

Comm. Irving: My preference would be for you to keep three options, but to indicate which one is the preferred recommendation from the administration. I don't want the Board feeling like we're pigeonholed into one decision. I'm wondering is next week enough time to allow Board members to vet the maps that are here and the options that you've already presented. Or do we want to do it at the first workshop meeting?

Dr. Evans: In May.

Comm. Irving: Next week we would like a formal adoption, if you all can get to the Board any updated information that you have.

Dr. Evans: We can do that.

Comm. Irving: Okay. Let's add it to the agenda for next week. Are there any additional comments for School 21 that you have?

Dr. Evans: Not at this point. I will have more the next time we meet when we have a more definitive plan and have conversations with staff and parents. I want to do that before I get beyond where we are now in conceptualizing it.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

It was moved by Comm. Redmon, seconded by Comm. Castillo that the Public Comments portion of the meeting be opened. On roll call all members voted in the affirmative. The motion carried.

Comm. Irving: Comm. Rivera and Comm. Simmons had to leave. I think they've joined Comm. Mimms at an event tonight. I want to remind the speakers we have a three-minute time limit. When you hear the bell, I'll ask you to please wrap your comments up so you can be respectful of the people coming behind you.

Mr. Luis Velez: Thank you, Commissioners. Good evening. Thank you once again. I'm happy to see this Board trying to work for the benefit of the students in the City of Paterson. I'm not a new person coming into this podium. The administration of the school district and also the Commissioners know that I'm regular coming to this podium

and to the Board meetings to bring forward my opinion from what I hear from the community out there and try to bring those concerns to the table to be able to move forward. I have taken notes. Those notes for me have been going back and forth and trying to put something together. Right now they've been mentioning options, but we only heard one, not moving them. We haven't heard two or three from School 16 and School 11. Which one is two and three with the issue at School 11?

Comm. Kerr: After the meeting you'll get them.

Dr. Evans: He can have a copy of this.

Mr. Velez: That's the problem we've had for decades in this district. Everybody speaks at this table. Everybody meets and the last people that know what's going on are the community. Right now everybody travels through Route 80, Madison Avenue, and 21st Avenue and they see a new school getting built. They see another school getting built in Marshal Street, but nobody knows the plan. The community doesn't know. People in the audience do not know what's really going to happen. Thank you for the information. I will read it and then come back to another meeting for that. Right now, the environment of a school is very important. Right now the fifth ward has nine schools. Imagine the traffic congestion that we have on Market Street going down Summer Street all the way around. Right now Dr. Evans, with all due respect, if you sit down a whole day at School 11 the first person that's going to run from that school will be you. Let me tell you why. The fifth ward faces a lot of challenges that we have to work. If you open those windows, those kids are not going to come with a good idea of education. They're going to come with a good idea of what the smell of marijuana is because that's not a good environment around. Do the best thing for the students. Education does not have color. Education does not have a flag. Education does not have a country. Education has people that want to learn in a good environment. I think you should get the first option. Move everybody from School 11, close School 11, and demand the state to give funding to build more schools around our city. God bless.

Mr. Ron Williams: Good evening Commissioners and Dr. Evans. I am Ron Williams, Executive Director of BJ Wilkerson I and III. DOE conducted an audit at my school. We did not get the opportunity to have an exit conference to discuss some items that were opened. When I communicated with Dan Sackner to give us an exit conference, it did not happen. Particularly, recommendation number four is the one that I'm concerned about because that has nothing to do with the scope of DOE. The scope of DOE, which I understand, was to audit DOE schools and that happened, but there was no conversation. What I'm requesting is for you to retract recommendation number four from the audit and not have this feeling or question of attack on me and my school. I would like the members of the Board and Dr. Evans to take that into consideration, to retract recommendation number four.

Dr. Evans: I'm going to depart, with the President's permission, from protocol. Typically, we wait until the end of the comments before I respond. But in this particular case, I need to respond at this point. Dan Sackner actually reports to an individual in the New Jersey Department of Education. The district is not the entity to which you need to appeal as it relates to the reports that Dan prepares. His boss actually resides in Trenton. We can facilitate your communication with that individual, but we really don't have the authority to do what you're asking us to do.

Mr. Williams: Thank you. What I was asking is that the recommendation should be retracted because it was out of scope. That was my request.

Comm. Irving: As the Superintendent indicated, Mr. Williams, it makes sense for you to reach out to the folks at the State to have a meeting to contest that. If indeed they do contest it and remove the comment, they will have to report that back to the district and we can read that into the record. But I think the report had to be presented for legal purposes because once an audit happens, it needs to be made public within 30 days.

Dr. Evans: I would add, and Ms. Peron can correct me, there have been opportunities for individuals who objected to contents in those reports to present rebuttals in writing and have it included with the report. Am I correct with that, Ms. Peron?

Ms. Peron: Yes, sir.

Mr. Williams: On your comment, Dr. Evans, we did communicate with the auditors in the time frame, but we did not get the exit conference in discussion. Thank you.

Comm. Irving: Thank you, sir.

Ms. Keozsha Alston: My name is Keozsha Alston and I'm a junior at Eastside High School Culinary. I'm here to inform you of what goes on inside my school. Today we were going over the PARCC because we take PARCC in two weeks and inside my school you cannot wear sweaters. If you were to wear sweaters you would get taken out of the class. I think it's crazy that we have to be taken out of class for wearing sweaters. When we get taken out of class and we go into in-school suspension, we don't do anything but write an essay and sit there for that whole block. If you don't do the essay, you stay inside there the whole day. That's basically taking away our learning inside class. Another concern is the locking of the bathrooms. I feel like females especially should be able to go the bathroom. On the first floor where my academy is the bathrooms are locked. We have to find security guards in order to use the bathroom. If a female inside the school has to do their 'you know,' we have to find a bathroom that's unlocked in order to use the bathroom. Another thing is inside the school we're not allowed to drink out of the water fountains. We have to bring money to school to buy bottles of water. My friend almost passed out in gym and she was not able to get water. Her mom does not have money for her to get water. She doesn't have a filter on her sink to get filtered water. She has to find a way to get money in order for her to not get dehydrated inside school. Is there any way that you can possible help us out with the problems inside the school?

Comm. Irving: Thank you. We'll certainly have someone look into it and address the issue. Thank you so much for coming.

Mr. Kevon Fletcher: Good evening. My issue is addressed to everyone, but especially to Comm. Irving. The issue that I have is based upon my school and since you're an alumni I want you to try to help us with these issues.

Comm. Irving: Is that Rosa Parks?

Mr. Fletcher: Yes, I'm a freshman. In our school we have a part-time nurse and I've never heard of that in my life until this year. Our nurse is there from 8:15 to 11:00. What if a student at our school gets hurt? She's not there. What are we supposed to do? We just got a notification about the water in our school less than a week ago. There's no sign on the water and I'm guessing before they gave us the paper students have been drinking it. Currently we're taking the PARCC test. What if the lead in the water affects their brain and they happen to fail the test? The lights in our school flicker on and off. I'm a vocal major and in my class our lights come on and off. It shuts on

and off. In the hallways they go off and they come back on. With the budget cuts for teachers, you guys said that the teachers that are here are going to stay but you won't hire new teachers. When I was in the seventh grade, I didn't have a language arts teacher. I had a substitute teacher the whole year. I don't want other children to go through what I had to go through. I had to restart in eighth grade. You guys said you were going to cut off the after school program in School 6. Am I correct?

Dr. Evans: No.

Mr. Fletcher: I apologize. In Rosa Parks this is our 30th anniversary and we've only had five shows. We're a performing arts high school and about five shows. I think I'm right. Our lockers are less than a foot long within width not length. How is that enough space for our books, coats, and jackets? In the beginning of the winter we weren't allowed to wear coats in school. Why isn't that possible and the heating wasn't on yet? What were we supposed to do? Sit there in the cold? That's it.

Comm. Irving: Great job. Thank you, young man. He's from my high school. That's Rosa Parks right there. The only comment I will make is that those lockers are as old as me. It's almost like a rite of passage, but that doesn't make it right. We'll have Mr. Cozart who's already sitting next to you meet with you to address some of these issues. Thank you so much.

Councilman Alex Mendez: I expect that from Dr. Hodges, but not from you, my brother. Good evening. What a great pleasure to be here with my former colleagues. I love this building, by the way.

Comm. Hodges: You can come back.

Councilman Mendez: I would love to, if you allow me to. First and foremost, good evening to Dr. Evans and staff. I just came here to get more information about the conversation that we had with the Newcomer's program and School 16. I also came here in support of the Newcomer's program and the transition of moving that program to School 16. I heard some of the comments that some of the Board members made, but we have to keep in mind that we're already serving a lot of the population in that area, Dr. Evans. We have 300 students now. The building is over capacity, but out of those 300 students a large population is from that area in School 16. We have to keep that in mind. The capacity of the new School 16 is over 700 students. I think that we can make that happen. Our students at School 11 are at a big disadvantage when it comes to facilities. There's no gym. They cannot utilize any area for gym and for different activities. In my opinion, that building has to be closed. I know that was the plan since I was here on the Board, to close that building. I think this is the opportunity for us to move that program. What makes me more excited about the change is that by changing the Newcomer's they're going to be on the environment and the transition is going to be easy. You will see the change and improvement of the program when you connect the Newcomer's with the regular classroom. You will see the change and you will be impressed. I think that we can work with the numbers in the population. Please take a look at the numbers of students that we're serving in the Newcomer's program that live in that section. That's definitely going to help you. In talking about the area of School 11, on Market Street we have the New Roberto Clemente, the Old Roberto Clemente, Eastside High School, and in the back we have School 15. Somebody spoke about the condition and the traffic. It's out of control. Quite honestly, it's really out of control in the morning and in the afternoon. I think that if we're planning to keep and renovate that building, it might be good for a community school from that section of people that live in that area, but not for school transportation to drop off and pick up the

students because it's out of control at this time. Please take that into consideration and take a look at the numbers that we already serve. That's going to help you to determine and make a better decision. Thank you so very much and have a great night.

Comm. Irving: As Comm. Hodges said, if you want to switch with any one of us, you let us know.

Ms. Rosie Grant: Good evening ladies and gentlemen. Thank you for this opportunity. It was interesting listening to the conversation tonight. I had come to you before after my first visit to the boy's academy and talked about the conditions of the building and so on. They do need to be moved out of that building. There seems to be consensus here and I'm happy for that. As you consider that move, please consider that while there are 50 kids right now, they are growing. You only have three grades and every year you're going to add a grade. That is the plan. Please do not stick them in a place where they can't grow and the school will have to move again. These boys are already feeling somewhat disenfranchised because of where they are. I do want to say, however, that I had the opportunity to work with the new principal and the staff around programming and building culture and understanding inside the school. They've got a good layout of where they want to go, so I expect this program to blossom. I do plead with you to give it the facility in which it can blossom and help these guys get to the point where they know that they are cared for and that they're loved. I've heard them described in all kinds of different and various ways. They're our kids and it's our responsibility to educate all our kids and to make sure that they know that they feel valued. That is the message that I wanted to bring you tonight as you consider where to put what kids. Thank you.

Ms. Marcella Simadiris: Peace and Blessings. To begin, I just want to share with you the New Jersey Clean Communities Slam Dunk Junk that's going to be going on in Tyrone Collins Park on April 23, the day after Earth Day. Earth Day is April 22. On April 22, Dr. Frank Napier School 4 Environmental Club is going to go to Tyrone Collins Park as long as we get our field trip approval and we're going to start the prep work for the big event. The event is going to be huge. New Jersey Clean Communities through the city is going to be providing music and food for Saturday. We're going to have help from Habitat for Humanity and City Green on that Friday with the prep work. I just want to bring awareness to that piece and let you all know. I'll hopefully get you a copy or I can leave these and you can make copies. Then I want to just discuss some stuff regarding Dr. Frank Napier Academy. School 28's Environmental Club is also going to help with that piece. I went today and I got some data from the 2015-2016 enrollment district reported data from the NJDOE. It's a zip drive. I looked at it and I just want to go over the numbers of African American males and girls in the Gifted & Talented program. I don't know if you're familiar, but pre-k, kindergarten, and first grade is regular and open to the community. Those three grades take up half of the Black population within that school. Then when you get to the Gifted & Talented program, you only have 19 Black males and 16 Black females. Then when you look at the budget, and I couldn't get into it that deep because you have to make an appointment to go see it, when you compare the budget lines, they have 10 more budget lines. They have five that go towards servicing mildly cognitively impaired students, one budget line towards general supplies resource room, three lines that go towards servicing autistic students, one budget line going towards bilingual students, and four budget lines going to before and after-school programs. The only budget lines that we have at School 4 that they don't have are going towards security. There are some lines that I think go towards the community school piece. I don't know if I'm correct if those are the community school pieces, but they look like it to me. But School 28 has those same budget lines too. I just wanted you to be aware of that. I also wanted you to know that our eighth graders

have to take the PARCC in the morning and then unit assessments in the afternoon. We're the only Priority School that's required to do that. When I'm coming up here all the time and I'm bringing these issues up here it's because there are a certain group of children that are allowed to be treated terrible. I'm going to keep coming up here and I'm going to keep talking about it. I go through a whole different committees and I keep on hearing the state and QSAC. I'm just hoping maybe you guys can create a resolution or advise the district to make it happen that teachers can come to these meetings. I don't want anything that I'm saying ever to get lost. I don't want anybody to translate this information I'm bringing. I don't know if you're able to go to these meetings with QSAC. I don't know. They need to know these things that they're requiring of these specific children and not requiring of other children. It's not right. If you can get some restorative practice development for some of our administrators it would be great. I just don't think we should be focused on security so much at our school. How many self-contained classes are there at School 28? I'm not sure because I couldn't find that information, but I think we might have a bigger special education population than they do. Then they have all these other budget lines that we don't have. Can we get a PowerPoint regarding that? Even if you just get the percentages and demographics and stuff like that. Can we get that? Thank you.

Ms. Wendy Guzman: Hello and good evening. It's always a pleasure to be here. Hi, Dr. Evans. First of all, I'm going to say I did hear when you mentioned the three options at the beginning of the meeting. I didn't get to write them down, but I would suggest that next time we do give them to the people who didn't hear them when you mentioned them. That way we can follow through. It thought they were going to be in the agenda. Moving forward, I have a couple of things that I want to speak about. I think I'm honorary and I get five minutes. One of the issues is the young lady from Eastside High School that mentioned the water issue. I want to know what we're doing or what we are going to do with regards to that issue. Are we going to be providing our kids with water bottles? Do we need to get help from supermarkets? How are we going to work around with that? I want to try to stay to hear the response with that. Another one is regarding substitutes. I'm going to put on my mommy hat at this point also. My daughter has gone through three substitutes this school year and she's still with a substitute. She's a very good substitute. I'm not going to say that she isn't. I think she has the credentials to actually be a very good permanent teacher here in the City of Paterson. Unfortunately, we need to understand the environment does affect our children. She started out with her in September and then they changed her again to another teacher around the end of October. Then they gave her another one in November and brought her back in December. Now she's here with this one. Right now we're going through the PARCC. My daughter went to the after-school program so I'm making sure that she gets all the help necessary in order to pass these tests, make it through the school year, and in order to be successful. As a mother I'm going to worry about my child, especially when I served on the Board of Education. I know the issues that we have. But just like my child is going through it, I know there are other children in other schools in the district that are also going through it. I want us to take into consideration and see what we're going to do in this case because it's not just my daughter. There are many other children and other children in her classroom are going through the same issue. Moving forward to the topic of conversation today, which is the schools, I do understand and see that our children's environment does reflect on their learning. The teachers are very important, like I mentioned. My daughter has a substitute. She does happen to be a very good substitute, but teachers have a high motivation on our children. The learning environment also affects them. I see that we have our Young Men's Academy. We need to move them to a better location because our children deserve better learning environments. But when it comes to the Newcomer's School, I also say they also deserve a better learning location. Yes, like Comm. Kerr mentioned, they come from

third world countries where we can learn under a tree, but we're in the United States. We need to get a little bit more upgraded here. It's not just the Newcomer's. It's actually all the children in the City of Paterson. I'm going to cut it short with what Comm. Castillo mentioned. She mentioned the fact that not only will there be learning and being integrated into learning the English language and the basic subjects, but they will also be with other children who can help and motivate them to learn a little bit more. Some of them can actually do homework together. They can meet up, get partnered up, and help each other. Those are different types of motivations that our children in the district need. I feel that moving them into a school where we actually already have children that live in that surrounding area can be a motivation and uplift these children that are just coming to this country, really do not have any friends, and probably only have their families and can actually help them progress. I want us to keep it in mind and work for the best of our children because that's exactly what we're all here for.

Comm. Cleaves: Your daughter goes to Roberto Clemente.

Ms. Guzman: Yes, she does.

Comm. Cleaves: What grade?

Ms. Guzman: Third. That's also one of the schools that came out as affected with the lead situation. That's why I'm also interested to know what we're going to do moving forward with the water. I can provide my daughter with water bottles, but then we have to think about everybody else and all the other children that are actually attending that school. Thank you.

Ms. Marcenia Cofield: Good evening, Dr. Evans and Commissioners. I stand before you as a legal guardian of a student enrolled at Don Bosco Academy. On March 18 this student has educational as well as behavioral challenges. We were in court on proceedings and I was blindsided by a document that had been forwarded to the court about this student without the administration's approval or without district knowledge. The teacher took it upon herself to sit down and type a letter and send it to the prosecutor regarding this child. I was totally flabbergasted. His attorney had no knowledge of it. It was presented the moment that we stepped into court. Immediately after court I went to the school and spoke with administration. She asked me not to come before the Board and speak to you about this situation because the teacher was pregnant. My response to her was, 'And your point is?' I work with pregnant women every day and if her only issue is me and what I'd like to do, then she needs to walk in the footsteps of some of the women that I do work with on a daily basis. I didn't appreciate this because we know the school records contain sensitive information and information that oftentimes follows the children throughout their educational career. Secondly, I filed a HIB report regarding this child on March 16. Here we are April 13 and no response as of yet. Guidelines were not followed. I haven't heard one word from the school. I am a very meticulous person when it comes to documentation. I have my emails. I forwarded Dr. Evans an email yesterday and I have not gotten a response. I've emailed the principal and the assistant principal at the school and no response. My next step now is to file a formal complaint with the US Department of Education regarding his civil rights because they were violated with that communication and it went out on a plain sheet of paper. It wasn't even on school or district letterhead. It was just on a plain sheet of paper, something that I could have sat down and typed myself. It contained some very degrading information regarding the student. To add insult to injury, today I received a letter from the district about him being truant. It struck me odd that the very days they said he was absent are days that the teacher has documented that there were behavioral issues with him. What's going on with our

recordkeeping here? He gets transportation to school. He walks into the school building. There is security there that recognizes him every morning. So I'd like to know where these 13 absences came into play. For three of them, he's had court dates. I provided the school documentation and they're telling me that they don't have it. There's a problem. There's a problem when I find that the administration asks me not to come before the Board and make you aware of the situation. I came today to make it a matter of record so that we are aware that when I go forward with what I need to do, no one is blindsided by my actions.

Comm. Irving: Thank you so much for coming. Can I ask if Dr. Newell can connect with you? She oversees the HIB procedures within the district. That's Dr. Newell approaching you right now. Thank you so much.

It was moved by Comm. Redmon, seconded by Comm. Cleaves that the Public Comments portion of the meeting be closed. On roll call all members voted in the affirmative. The motion carried.

Comm. Irving: Dr. Evans, I'm sure you want to answer some of the statements that are here.

Dr. Evans: Yes. Starting with the Eastside issue one of the things that was mentioned was the selling of water. It is not necessary for water to be sold. In fact, we have heard that water was being sold at Eastside. We looked into it and it's a fundraiser. Water can be consumed through the fountains, but I have a statement that I want to make sure that I cover all of the salient points from and can be considered an update. Our school district is currently conducting a second voluntary water quality testing of all district schools. Remember that last year, the 2014-2015 school year, we voluntarily did testing in a number of our buildings and as result of that 15 school buildings were identified as having one or more outlets – a sink or a water fountain - above the recommended threshold limit for lead per EPA guidelines. These outlets were immediately taken out of commission until repairs were made. As you recall, I noticed that as we tested all schools and outlets for a second time we will advise parents of any outlets found to be of concern. Indeed, as the second round of testing has commenced as a fountain, sink, or any kind of outlet in the school is determined to be problematic in terms of those lead levels then it's immediately shut down and all the parents in that school are immediately notified. Obviously, the fountains that are not affected and the water is fine, well within the limits established by EPA, then consumption continues in those schools. At this point, we don't have a school where we have significant numbers of outlets impacted to the point where students can't consume the water. In fact, it's not necessary that water be sold or given out in any of our buildings at this point as far as the testing that we are doing and continuing to do. If there's a circumstance where someone is being told to bring water or buy water, we need to know that right away because that is not true. The testing is widespread enough now that if there was a problem to that extent we'd be the first to say. In fact, we would provide the water. I just want to make sure everyone understood that we're very aware of the needs that parents have to know what's going on in the schools. We're making sure the minute we find there's a problem in the school with even one water fountain that same day a letter goes out to parents telling them there's a problem. We've been doing that ever since we discovered that the problem existed with the 15 schools that I alluded to.

RESOLUTIONS FOR A VOTE:

Resolution No. 1

Whereas, in the district's Strategic Plan, the fourth priority is to provide efficient and responsive operations by revamping operational procedures and aligned to the Department of Early Childhood Education's (DECE) goal number 1: Increase accountability for performance;

Whereas, the DECE will continue to provide operational guidance to the early childhood centers to promote fiscal accountability, sound effective business practices, and enhance programmatic effectiveness;

Whereas, the Paterson Public School District Internal Auditors conducted an audit of the early childhood center of BJ Wilkerson Memorial Child Development Center for fiscal year 2014-2015;

Whereas, the Paterson Public School District accepts the Internal Auditors' audit report of BJ Wilkerson Memorial Child Development Center in compliance with 6A:23A-5.6, and the District responds with a Corrective Action Plan (CAP) to the Office of Fiscal Accountability and Compliance (OFAC) audit report;

Whereas, the auditors noted deficiencies in the quarterly reports as follows: The Provider underspent the NJDOE Preschool Education approved budget by \$69,007.19. The Auditors noted minor accounting and coding errors. The auditors noted several unallowable expenditures. The auditors also reported on the Executive Director Compensation;

Whereas, any school district that has been the subject to an audit by the Department of Education's Office of Fiscal Accountability and Compliance shall discuss the findings of the audit at a public meeting of the District Board of Education no later than 30 days after the receipt of the audit report; and

Whereas, the Department of Early Childhood Education has addressed the finding in the Internal Auditors' audit report of BJ Wilkerson Child Development Center in compliance with 6A:23A-5.6 and addresses the recommendations contained in the report; and

Whereas, the Department of Early Childhood Education has addressed the finding in the Internal Auditors' audit, the Paterson Board of Education has been the subject to an audit by the Paterson Internal Audit Unit and has discussed the findings of the audit at April 20, 2016, public meeting of the District Board of Education within 30 days of receipt of the audit report; and

Therefore Be It Further Resolved, the Paterson Board of Education within 30 days of the April 20, 2016, public meeting adopts this resolution certifying that the findings were discussed in a public Board meeting and approved the Corrective Action Plan (CAP) addressing the issues raised in the finding of the audit and will submit this resolution to the Office of Fiscal Accountability and Compliance within 10 days of adoption by the Board of Education, and the Paterson Board of Education shall post the findings of the Office of Fiscal Accountability and Compliance audit and the Board of Education's corrective action plan on the District's web site.

It was moved by Comm. Cleaves, seconded by Comm. Castillo that Resolution No. 1 be adopted.

Comm. Hodges: I'm still bewildered as to what's going on with these findings that are very cryptic.

Comm. Irving: I bumped into Mr. Williams at an event and he told me he would be coming tonight. From what I understand – and Ms. Peron can correct me if I'm wrong – an audit was conducted. Mr. Williams is contending that our finding that scrutinizes salary had nothing to do with the audit that should have been performed. He's saying that the finding that scrutinizes salary went outside the scope of what should have been reviewed. The feeling of some is that he is indeed true. Nonetheless, the finding was still written and he is contesting that as we speak. I think he personally feels a little attacked and he's trying to feel vindicated at the fact that there's information that has been publicized that really should not have and didn't need to be investigated. Am I correct?

Comm. Kerr: Let's ask Ms. Peron. As far as you know, should that be a part of the scope of the audit?

Ms. Peron: No. The scope of the audit is the budget. The budget that he signs with the Paterson Public Schools that deals with the collaborative and the DOE portion of the preschool program. That's the scope of the audit.

Comm. Kerr: Do we look at the salaries of the directors at any time?

Ms. Peron: We do. The salary that we pay him is what we audit - his salary that comes from the NJDOE and Paterson Public Schools.

Comm. Irving: He has another business.

Ms. Peron: Yes, he does.

Comm. Irving: And Mr. Williams is contending that the other business has nothing to do with B.J. Wilkerson.

Comm. Kerr: So how did we get it so...

Comm. Irving: That's what Mr. Williams is wondering, from what I understand.

Comm. Kerr: That should be separate.

Dr. Evans: I want to emphasize again we're getting beyond the district's scope. OFAC is based in Trenton and Dan is an agent of OFAC. He needs to complain directly to them. He really does.

Comm. Hodges: Let me just say that I've had trouble with this district as retaliation for my inhospitality towards a former superintendent. They went after my partner who had a daycare. They used the fact that even though we had dual businesses they went after us personally because of our operation. So I'm uniquely sensitive to that circumstance. Quite frankly, the staffing and the setting are very familiar, from what I'm hearing.

Comm. Cleaves: I just want to make sure that I'm clear. So, we're only voting on the corrective action plan, not finding number four, which is part of this document that we're voting on.

Comm. Irving: The corrective action plan does not include recommendations for finding number four.

Comm. Kerr: Yes, it does.

Comm. Irving: It doesn't indicate that something needs to be done.

Ms. Peron: Let me just double check. We're looking at the payroll of the center that encompasses all of the employees and the staff. That's basically what our method of implementation is saying, including the director salary that we pay. That's what we're saying in this corrective action. The Department of Early Childhood Education reviews and recalculates all center payrolls, including director salaries, to ensure all payroll agrees to budget. The DECE makes unannounced visits to centers to ensure the directors and other staff is on site. The method of implementation is that we will continue to recalculate all center payrolls to ensure they comply with the approved budgets. The DECE will continue to do unannounced visits to centers. We're talking about his salary on our budget.

Comm. Cleaves: It says salaries. It's plural.

Ms. Peron: Because it's the salaries of the director, any teachers, any teacher assistants, or cooks who we have on the budget.

Ms. Daisy Ayala: If you look at the audit finding, they're not just focusing on the preschool. They're looking at the executive director as a whole. It could be multiple funding. Inclusive of the daycare center and other funding it equals over \$300,000. They're not looking at us specifically, but other sources of funding.

Comm. Irving: But again, the other sources of funding are outside.

Ms. Ayala: It's beyond our control.

Comm. Irving: That's my point. It just seems very punitive and unnecessary. The audit should reflect the work that Mr. Williams has done in the district and the salary he makes. What he does in his free time to make additional revenue is his business. That's between him, his god, and his church.

Comm. Kerr: But there's more stuff behind there.

Comm. Irving: You're absolutely right.

Comm. Kerr: There's a whole lot of stuff.

Comm. Hodges: It has nothing to do with us.

Comm. Irving: That's correct.

Ms. Peron: That's outside of our scope.

Comm. Hodges: If it's the desire of the Board to adopt this, I suggest striking number four.

Comm. Irving: We're voting to accept the fact that we received the audit report. We're not voting to confirm the report. We're not voting to affirm the report.

Comm. Cleaves: But we're voting on the action plan.

Comm. Irving: We're voting on the corrective action. You're right. I'm sorry.

Comm. Hodges: If we can't vote on it, we have to vote with the exception of number four.

Comm. Kerr: I accept the plan as it is. I accept the plan. Let them work it out. Let him call the DOE.

Comm. Irving: That's my point. While I agree and I think this is a little punitive and goes well beyond their reaches, it's not our responsibility. I think at this stage we should just accept the corrective action plan and let Mr. Williams go through the process that he needs to go through. If indeed it changes, I'm sure the state will indicate to us.

Comm. Hodges: No. The problem with that is you can get penalized. We are, in fact, embracing this finding.

Comm. Redmon: We're embracing the findings.

Comm. Hodges: Absolutely. Quite frankly, there's no way in the world I can vote for this given my history, what I've endured, and knowing how wrong it was. I'm not going to put somebody else in that very same situation that was done to me.

Comm. Irving: Especially when district staff has admitted. I hear you. We can move the vote and folks can vote their conscience.

Comm. Hodges: I'll offer an amendment that you include all items except for number four.

Comm. Irving: I don't know if we have the ability to amend. I hear what you're saying. We can accept the corrective action plan with all items except number four and leave it up to the state.

Mr. Sayovitz: If you want to make a motion to amend it, make a motion to amend it and see what Trenton does with it.

Comm. Irving: Sure.

It was moved by Comm. Hodges, seconded by Comm. Redmon that the motion be amended to remove Item No. 4.

Comm. Irving: It was properly moved and seconded that the Board approves Items 1, 2, and 3 regarding the corrective action plan but not Item 4. Understand we need to vote on this first and then if that passes we go back and vote on the actual corrective action plan which will include 1, 2, and 3. Are there any questions on the current motion that's on the floor?

On roll call all members voted in the affirmative, except Comm. Kerr who voted no and Comm. Irving who abstained. The motion carried.

Comm. Irving: Any other questions regarding Items 1, 2, and 3?

On roll call all members voted in the affirmative, except Comm. Hodges who voted no and Comm. Irving who abstained. The motion carried.

Resolution No. 2

WHEREAS, the State District Superintendent forwarded Paterson Public Schools' preliminary 2016-2017 Revised budget to the Commissioner of Education and the Passaic County Executive County Superintendent of Schools for review and approval on March 18, 2017; and

WHEREAS, the 2016-2017 revised budget for the state-operated Paterson Public School District was prepared consistent with the New Jersey Quality Single Accountability Continuum (NJQSAC) focusing on quality performance indicators in all five areas of school district effectiveness: Operations Management, Instruction and Program, Fiscal Management, Personnel and Governance; and

WHEREAS, the 2016-2017 revised budget was prepared consistent with the district's revised Fiscal Policy 6220 addressing budget preparation, with primary consideration given to educational priorities identified by the Board and Dr. Donnie W. Evans, Paterson State District Superintendent, and;

WHEREAS, the Paterson Public School District, consistent with 6A:23A-5.8, the following selected expenditures are identified as included in the 2016-2017 budget with either "not to exceed" appropriations in the case of "maximum travel" or professional services and extracurricular activities, the maximum expenditures for which cannot be exceeded without prior board approval:

	2015-16	1-Feb YTD	Revised 2016-17
	<u>Pre-Budget</u>	<u>Actuals</u>	<u>Budget</u>
Maximum Travel	\$271,644	\$60,666	\$350,000

NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED, that the Board of Education adopt the 2016-2017 budget submitted by Dr. Donnie Evans, State District Superintendent of Schools, which budget reflects an increase in the amount of \$2,500,000 in the local tax levy to support the general fund as reflect herein;

	<u>Budgeted</u>	<u>Local Tax Levy included</u>
General Fund Revenue		
Local Sources	\$ 3,717,160	\$ 0
Tax Levy	\$ 38,955,956	\$ 41,455,956
State Aid	\$ 403,935,340	\$ 0
Federal Sources	\$ 1,043,032	\$ 0
Budgeted Fund Balance	\$ 16,406,456	\$ 0
Withdraw Maintenance Reserve	\$ 2,200,000	\$ 0
Total General Fund	<u>\$ 468,757,944</u>	<u>\$ 41,455,956</u>

		<u>Local Tax Levy included</u>
Special Revenue Fund (net of operating budget transfers)		
State Aid	\$ 52,902,164	\$ 0
Federal Aid	\$ 32,672,026	\$ 0

Transfer from Operation Fund		
Pre-K Special Education	\$ 2,536,583	\$ 0
Total Special Revenue Fund	<u>\$ 88,110,773</u>	<u>\$ 0</u>
Debt Service		
Local Sources	\$ 506,363	\$ 506,363
State Aid	\$ 798,937	\$ 0
Budgeted Fund Balance	<u>\$ 0</u>	<u>\$ 0</u>
Total Debt Service	<u>\$ 1,305,300</u>	<u>\$ 506,363</u>
Grand Total Revenues	<u>\$ 558,174,017</u>	<u>\$ 41,962,319</u>

NOW THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the State District Superintendent hereby fixes and determines that the amount of money necessary to be appropriated for the use of the public schools for the revised budget 2016-17 School Year is \$558,174,017 (five hundred fifty-eight million, one hundred seventy-four thousand, seventeen dollars) of which \$41,962,319 (forty-one million, nine hundred sixty-two thousand, three hundred nineteen dollars) is the changed General Fund local tax levy; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the State District Superintendent hereby certifies that the reallocations and modifications needed to present a balanced revised 2016-17 budget provides an adequate amount of funds to provide for a thorough and efficient education; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the State District Superintendent shall hereby forward to the Commissioner of Education of the State of New Jersey the budget statement, budget statement certification, and supporting documentation as required by statute and code; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the 2016-2017 budget passed on April 6, 2016, be amended as shown in the attached spreadsheets; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that this resolution shall take effect immediately upon its adoption.

There was no motion and no vote. The motion did not carry.

OTHER BUSINESS

Comm. Hodges: It should be brought to the attention of the Board that the organization that you attended...

Comm. Irving: Paterson Pastors Clergy. I just read the article.

Comm. Hodges: Paterson's United Clergy has submitted a press release stating that they intend to seek legal action about this entire situation and they may be going to court. They are in discussions with the Education Law Center and other entities to talk about what that's going to look like. It should be brought to the attention of this Board that they're doing this in support of our actions, which is turning down the budget in recognition that this is not a thorough and efficient budget.

Comm. Irving: It's part of a much longer process. Comm. Kerr, that's the action that I didn't want to bring up at the City Council meeting just because the clergy hadn't

decided for sure when they were going to announce. I think there's an even greater strategy that includes working with families specifically to represent the clergy on behalf of their situation. Is there anything else?

Comm. Hodges: The Board was given a resolution about graduation that was submitted by Darcy Simoneski out of Highland Park talking about the graduation requirements versus PARCC.

Comm. Irving: Cheryl, did you send it out to the Board yet?

Ms. Williams: Yes.

Comm. Irving: You mailed it out?

Comm. Hodges: You mailed it out originally, but we've been so busy and I've not pushed it. There's going to be a delegate assembly on May 11 or May 1. I can't remember, but it's real soon and we need to decide our position before that.

Comm. Irving: Add it to the agenda for the first workshop meeting.

Ms. Williams: For May?

Comm. Irving: Yes.

Comm. Hodges: No, that's too late.

Comm. Irving: When is the meeting?

Comm. Hodges: Early in May.

Comm. Irving: Add it to the agenda for the next Board meeting and put it under 'Other Business.' Have a good night, folks. Thank you.

It was moved by Comm. Redmon, seconded by Comm. Cleaves that the meeting be adjourned. On roll call all members voted in the affirmative. The motion carried.

The meeting was adjourned at 9:00 p.m.