

**MINUTES OF THE PATERSON BOARD OF EDUCATION
SPECIAL MEETING**

January 22, 2019 – 6:05 p.m.
Administrative Offices

Presiding: Comm. Oshin Castillo, President

Present:

Ms. Eileen Shafer, State District Superintendent
Ms. Susana Peron, Deputy Superintendent
Robert Murray, Esq., General Counsel

Comm. Emanuel Capers
Comm. Manuel Martinez
Comm. Eddy Olivares
Comm. Joel Ramirez

*Comm. Nakima Redmon, Vice President
Comm. Robinson Rondon
*Comm. Kenneth Simmons

Absent:

Comm. Jonathan Hodges

The Salute to the Flag was led by Comm. Castillo.

Comm. Martinez read the Open Public Meetings Act:

The New Jersey Open Public Meetings Act was enacted to insure the right of the public to have advance notice of, and to attend the meetings of the Paterson Public School District, as well as other public bodies at which any business affecting the interest of the public is discussed or acted upon.

In accordance with the provisions of this law, the Paterson Public School District has caused notice of this meeting:

**Special Meeting
January 22, 2019 at 6:00 p.m.
Administrative Offices
90 Delaware Avenue
Paterson, New Jersey**

to be published by having the date, time and place posted in the office of the City Clerk of the City of Paterson, at the entrance of the Paterson Public School offices, on the district's website, and by sending notice of the meeting to the Arab Voice, El Diario, the Italian Voice, the North Jersey Herald & News, and The Record.

Comm. Castillo: If you could all just bear with us for a little bit. We have one presentation that we need to get through. Then we're going to go into a Health Benefits Update and we're moving Public Portion up so none of you guys are waiting for us to vote for the resolutions. We just want to make sure that everyone is heard. Just bear with us while we get through the first presentation.

PRESENTATIONS AND COMMUNICATIONS

Update on the 2019-2020 School District Budget Priorities

Ms. Shafer: Good evening. At this time, I'll call our Business Administrator Richard Matthews up to give us an update on the 2019-2020 School District Budget Priorities.

Mr. Richard Matthews: Thank you, Madam Superintendent, and good evening to you, Board Commissioners. Tonight, what I'm going to be going through is more of a budget priority wish list, things that we want to add to the budget, which are not in the budget right now. We're going through some budgetary projections, and talk a little bit about our cost drivers and our budget calendar. You all should have received the budget calendar. There's a lot of detail to the priorities. I'm going to hit some of the high points. If you go to page one, these are all items that we're trying to put into the budget and these are all under the category of academics. You see there's \$100,000 in there for 504 services. There's an alternate program that we're trying to do for \$90,000 with the HoHoKus program for 10 students. It's \$50 a day times 180 days. There's \$100,000 in there for a grant writer. We've had a grant writer in for the past couple of years and we want to put that back into the budget for 2019-2020. Moving down there's an in-school suspension center that we're looking at regarding staffing, furniture, supplies, etc. It's \$540,000. At the bottom of that page there's an increase for dual enrollment and AP courses for \$225,000. You can ask questions at the end. If you go to the next page near the top, under the category of academics there's \$130,000 for that. As you know, we want to bring back the Marching 100. More towards the middle under musical instruments, there's \$20,000 per school for 5 schools. Bringing back the Marching 100 is going to be a number of years process. We keep chipping away and putting money into the budget so that we can eventually have them back. There's money in there for computer labs. There's money for PD for teachers.

*Comm. Redmon enters the meeting at 6:10 p.m.

Mr. Matthews: Ms. Shafer goes out into the community and talks to the teachers and the kids and gets feedback. This money for PD is based on input from the teachers. At the extreme bottom is \$400,000 for staffing, resources, and transportation to expand our magnet schools. Going to the next page we're getting more into increasing personnel and our head count. At the top of the page there's \$1.2 million for putting in 12 teachers. There's the salary and benefit projection and that's so we can make our class sizes smaller and allow our kids to grow. We added in personnel last year some reading specialists. We want to do the same thing again in 2019-2020 so we have two positions there for reading specialists. Moving down to the bottom of the page, there's \$1 million for substitutes. Whenever these teachers go out for professional development, we have to have substitutes to take their spots so there's \$1 million in there. Then there's a supervisor of art and music. There's a supervisor for assessment. These are some additional head counts that we're trying to put into the 2019-2020 budget. Again, these are not in the budget right now. We still haven't had our revenues. The Governor's speech is not until March 5. You'll see that on the calendar coming later on. We're looking more into operations. For academics and bilingual you see there's \$2.3 million in there for Newcomers High School grade 9. There's \$1 million in there for staff. There is \$380,000 for Spanish resources, \$390,000 for Arabic resources and \$390,000 for Bengali. That number is \$2.3 million. Moving down to the middle, we're putting in behaviorists. There are two there. We're getting back to bringing music and art back into the schools. This is there for music teachers. There's a reading specialist. There are six. There are physical education teachers. Supervisors for the P-Tech grant that we got for PANTHER Academy. There are five

positions for world language at \$500,000. That \$1.2 million is a typo. If you go to the next page, we're still talking about personnel. We're still putting people back into the classrooms. We're putting a lot of money back into classrooms. Instructor for Delta classes; Operation II teacher coordinators at Eastside High School and John F. Kennedy; there's a dental hygienist; there's a bilingual coordinator; there's a supervisor for art and music; and staffing for PD. You have three new child study teams, two preschool and one bilingual. On the next page we're getting more into facilities and technology. We already have a PO for School No. 13 for auditorium seats. We're going to try to do another school. We have about 25 schools that need new auditoriums. We can't do all 25 schools in one year so we're going to chip away at that. Next year we want to do five schools and we'll do five the following year. Instead of looking at the problem, a lot of times we have 25 schools and the number is massive so we do nothing sometimes. Now we want to take the approach that we can start chipping away. We're never going to get all the money from the state into our capital reserve to solve all our problems that we have in terms of facilities and operations. We think this is a better plan to make sure we start to get things done. There're lockers. You should have seen lockers in some of the schools. I know we're putting in lockers into International. We're putting school buzzers at School No. 10 and School No. 2. We looked at the high schools. We have a lot of points of entry where we have to make it safer for the kids. We're looking at putting new locks at John F. Kennedy and Eastside High School. Over the last 10 years the facilities budget has been cut. A lot of their manpower has been stripped. A lot of work that should be done during regular times is getting done in overtime because of a lack of resources. We had to put more money back into facilities so the work can be done in regular time. They can start doing some PM that's not getting done. We have to commit resources to them so they can do the work to keep our schools clean and safe and cut back on emergency repairs and stuff like that. There's money for PD. We're putting money back into our teachers so they can be more professional and grow in their positions. There's money there for security lockdowns. We've met with vendors and gone into different schools to see how they do actual lockdowns. This is a whole automated system to be able to put our schools on lockdown. There's money there for security cameras, special education, and technology for wireless access points. We got the one-to-one initiative so now we have to start building infrastructure into the middle schools. There's money in for that. There's money in for technicians so that guys can go out there and be more responsive to the needs of the schools wherever there's something going on regarding technology. When things are breaking down, we want to be more responsive. Right now, our response times could be a little bit better. To make our response time better, we have to add some head counts to our technology field staff. Just closing out, in terms of the last page there's overtime, PD for technology, air conditioning that we're going to put into some of the MDFs. This number for our budget initiatives is not in our budget. We're actually still compiling the budget. It's \$52 million. It's very ambitious. I'm not sure we can get that number into the 2019-2020 budget, but we'll keep working with Ms. Shafer and others. At the last meeting we had asked the Board to give us their top ten for the budget for 2019-2020. We need your input and feedback. These are the main cost drivers in terms of the budget. \$325 million of our budget is dedicated to salaries and benefits. Special education is also a main cost driver. It's \$10 million. Charter schools are \$66 million going out the door. Our enrollment is still growing, but off the bat that money goes out the door. PCTI is about \$20 million. Between charter schools and PCTI, \$86 million is going out the door. Legal is \$8 million. Facilities are \$28 million. Security is \$7.5 million. Under PCTI and out of district placements, that's \$41 million. That's another \$20 million for out of district placement. That's a cost that's very variable. It changes all the time. We can get kids any time that have to go out of district and we have to find the money. We have to make that work. We have to be in

compliance. We're constantly being barraged with additional costs beyond the budget year. These are the main cost drivers.

Comm. Castillo: Can I ask everyone in the back to bear with us just a little bit longer? It gets a little difficult for us to hear on this end. He's almost done. We've instructed him to go as fast as he can. Bear with us for just a few more minutes, please.

Mr. Matthews: This is where our money comes from. Our main source of revenue is through the state, \$446 million. This is based on flat funding. Last year we got \$20.2 million from the state. This is based on the number remaining flat. We're projecting \$42 million from our tax levy. We're projecting a bank cap of \$5 million. The total operating budget is \$528 million. We will be going through this in greater detail as we move on throughout the year. This is a breakdown of what we see as far as appropriations. You see the budget is \$580 million, but we really control about \$160-170 million. That's what we really control. These are important dates. This is not the entire budget calendar. These are some of the things that you guys should be looking out for in terms of our timeline to get the budget to county and what happens after the budget goes to the county. We have a public hearing, final adoption. These are key dates that we have to keep in mind. We will go through the budget on the March 6 meeting, but our deadline to get the budget to the county is going to be on March 20. That's the absolute last day that we can get our budget to the county. It has to be balanced. We all have to have our input. We need your feedback. April 22 is the absolute last day that the county gets to approve our budget. We have a hearing date of April 24. The last day for a public hearing is May 3. The last date for the public hearing is on Tuesday, May 7. Are there any questions?

Comm. Ramirez: In terms of some of the priorities that you've put in there, I would like, through the Superintendent and with her permission, to start to explore just adding the actual legitimate Halal food implementation. I know years ago Dr. Evans created this vegetarian option and the community has been reaching out to many of us in terms of it not being enough. It's not enough to meet the needs of the students that adhere to those dietary restrictions under Halal, our Muslim students. If we can look into a true Halal implementation as we are getting all these budget numbers, I know we're going to have to seek a vendor and that's going to have an impact on the budget. Through the Superintendent, I'd like to have that request put in.

Ms. Shafer: Let me just comment on that. We do plan this year within the next month to pilot two schools, one elementary and one high school.

Comm. Ramirez: Do we know which ones?

Ms. Shafer: Not yet.

Mr. Matthews: We have a food service meeting tomorrow at 9:00 and it's on the agenda.

Comm. Capers: Thank you for this presentation. It was very well thought out. I like the different initiatives. It's very progressive. I like it. There are a few things that caught my attention. I think it's a great plus how we're attacking the security about buildings. Do we know how many schools do not have full security systems? Is that going to be addressed in this budget?

Mr. Matthews: When you say full security, do you mean lockdown?

Comm. Capers: Cameras and lockdown systems. If those schools don't have cameras, will that be addressed in this budget year?

Ms. Shafer: We have a full listing. I can get that to the Board. Again, it's going to be like Mr. Matthews said - a three-year plan. There are many that need to be done. We can't do it all in one year.

Comm. Capers: I just want to see which schools are going to be done this budget year. I think this goes to you, Ms. Shafer. The equity audits for the elementary schools will be done next year because we're doing the high school ones now, correct? Okay. Another initiative you want to implement is a school suspension center. This is the first time I'm hearing this. Where is this going to be located? What's the process on this one?

Ms. Shafer: We gave you a five-year document on planning the budget. This is a planning year for that so we can eliminate these out-of-school-suspensions and have a central hub where students would come that were suspended. They will receive counseling, restorative justice circles, as well as their academics, and not be home or on the streets doing some other things to get in trouble.

Comm. Capers: Wouldn't this be cheaper if we just go back to ISS in every school?

Ms. Shafer: No. We have ISS. This is for students who based on what they did deserve out-of-school-suspension. But rather than going out on the street or being home watching TV or whatever they're doing, they need to understand the behavior so when they come back, they don't repeat the same thing.

Comm. Capers: Would this be a partnership program with another non-profit?

Ms. Shafer: Yes. We don't have any right now. We're in the planning stage.

Comm. Capers: You have the coding courses here. Is this districtwide, the implementation of three coding courses at the elementary level?

Ms. Shafer: Yes.

Comm. Capers: There are some things that I think need to be in this initiative. Some of these schools have outdated restrooms. These bathrooms are just outdated and need to be addressed. Water fountains need to be addressed, and also some of the technology in these classrooms. We go to these different conferences and some schools are still using chalkboards. We need to start using smartboards if we're going into one-to-one. If the district is moving that way, we have to change all the way around, making sure smartboards are in all of our classrooms.

Ms. Shafer: That's a good point. We have \$6 million to have working technology in the classrooms. It's the first one.

Comm. Capers: Is that \$6 million tied in with the one-to-one rollout in the middle schools as well?

Ms. Shafer: Yes. That's only about \$1 million for the rollout. We have \$5 million to do some of the other things in the classrooms.

Comm. Capers: You mentioned auditoriums. Some of our auditoriums don't have good sound systems. Are we addressing those in those different schools?

Mr. Matthews: That's not included, but we'll take a look into it and include it on our next presentation.

Comm. Capers: Before we get to our preliminary budget, are we going to see a balanced budget before we give it to the county?

Mr. Matthews: You have to be balanced before it goes to the county.

Comm. Capers: Is the Board going to see it?

Mr. Matthews: Yes, we're going to have a bunch of meetings going through the budget, things that are going to be priority in 2019-2020 or pushed out a couple of years. We want to make sure we get everybody's input. We're not going to be balanced when we get the numbers from the Governor on March 7. We're going to be totally unbalanced and we're going to need your input to actually get to a balanced budget.

Comm. Castillo: Ladies and gentlemen, I'm sorry. The recording is having a very difficult time. It's picking up your side conversations. Bear with us a few more minutes and we're going to jump right over to the health plan.

Comm. Redmon: To answer most of your questions that you threw out to the Board, Comm. Capers, that's the reason why we separated facilities. You're the chair of facilities so you can bring that to your committee. I know you're on technology so you can bring that also to technology. Oh, you're not on technology this year? I know you're on I&P so most of the questions that you had, refer them back to your committee so then we can bring them back to Mr. Matthews. We can make sure we're doing the priorities right for the budget. This year we do have an extra two weeks. I don't know if Mr. Matthews told you that. We're now back to local control so we're following the local control budget, so you have an extra two weeks. We still want to make sure that we keep the timeline that we have. If any last-minute adjustments need to be made, we can still make them on a timely basis before we submit it to the County Superintendent and before it goes to final approval.

Mr. Matthews: Comm. Redmon, I just want to mention that the budget calendar is on the website.

Comm. Redmon: Yes. Each Commissioner has time to put their input. We're asking that you do your input as soon as possible because once we start the process I don't want to hear that we did not have time to review. We know from the process last year how that was followed. The new Commissioners might not understand the process, but you can ask us how to do it and we will be available to help you.

Comm. Olivares: Good evening. Under the line of academics and bilingual, I would like to know what criteria were used.

Mr. Matthews: Which page are we on?

Comm. Olivares: On the fifth page. The line item is academics and bilingual.

Mr. Matthews: \$2.3 million.

Comm. Olivares: It says that the allocated Spanish resources are \$381,000, Arabic is \$387,000, and Bengali is \$387,000. The population in Paterson is overwhelmingly

Hispanic and so I would like to know what criteria were used to break down those numbers, please.

*Comm. Simmons enters the meeting at 6:30 p.m.

Comm. Castillo: The allocation of the funds? Why more money to the other two as opposed to...?

Comm. Olivares: Correct.

Comm. Castillo: I just want to make sure I got your question. Is it due to the Newcomers program?

Mr. Matthews: Yes. This is academic bilingual.

Comm. Castillo: Is it because we already have the ESL program?

Mr. Matthews: It's split in thirds in terms of resources. In terms of the budget process, it's a big list. This particular piece came to me. The department that gave me the allocation for this here, we're going to have to go back to them and get that information and get back to you with it. To let you know, the budget process is a team effort. A lot of items come to us in terms of them doing the research and getting us supporting documentation. I'm going to have to get back to you on how the allocation came to be in thirds.

Comm. Castillo: Correct me if I'm wrong, but is it because we already have certain programs at Eastside and we have to allocate more funds to the other two to balance it out?

Ms. Peron: That's correct. Although we are predominantly Spanish speaking and our English language learners are predominantly Spanish, we do have a lot of resources allocated now for Spanish. We're trying to catch up with the Arabic and Bengali resources. Those are very tough to come by. We have been really working with book companies, conferences, and academic resources that can provide these to us. We're a little bit behind in those resources in the other languages. As far as our Spanish resources, every year we've allocated money for our Spanish speakers. That's why it looks a little bit off, but it's that we're trying to catch up.

Comm. Olivares: If I understand it correctly, what's happening is that we're spending much more money on the Spanish population and less on the other populations. Is that what it is? Who has the breakdown? How can we see that breakdown? That's what I'm asking. I would like to see that breakdown to see what it is. Thank you.

Ms. Peron: We can get you that.

Comm. Martinez: As our Vice President mentioned, I just wanted to remind all the Commissioners to get your top ten priorities in as soon as possible because that's going to be what's going to drive this process. The sooner we get that in, the sooner we can move this along. The intent of this process is to get as many of these dollars back into the classrooms. That's our priority for our teachers and our scholars. The sooner we get this in, the better we can get this process under way. It's just a reminder to get that in as soon as possible.

Ms. Shafer: It looks like we put together a budget of an additional \$52 million. The reason we did that is because over the past eight years we were underfunded by \$280 million. We lost 526 staff members. If you put all that together, we have a lot rebuilding to do. That \$52 million is what we need immediately in order to address some of the needs that we have in the school with our students and with our staff. That's why it's not a wish list. It's what's necessary after you underfund us \$280 million. We still have a long way to go to catch up.

Comm. Castillo: Thank you, Mr. Matthews. I'm glad that for a long time we've done the budget and for the first time I think we're moving more money into the classroom. I do want to thank your entire department for allocating those funds and bringing more money into the classrooms where they're really needed.

Health Benefits Update

Ms. Shafer: First, let me say to John thank you for coming out tonight. We are in this together. It affects all of us. I am happy to say, and you should have received my message yesterday both in writing and on the telephone, that we did come to an agreement that CIGNA and Atlantic Health now have a contract. There will be no disruption in health benefits. I'm going to introduce Giovanni Mancini to go over the update.

Comm. Castillo: Before you even start, I'm going to throw this one out there. I want to thank everyone for coming out on this very cold night. Commissioners, can we please hold the questions until the end? For everyone, I'm moving public portion right after this presentation to make sure that you guys are all heard. Madam Superintendent, before we even go through the presentation, I do want to ask you and our BA for a full presentation on how much it would cost to go back to the state plan. What does that look like in a breakdown? We can double-check those numbers as well to make sure that we're educated on this Board before we continue and make any other decisions.

Mr. Giovanni Mancini: Thank you, Madam President. Madam Superintendent and Commissioners, thank you for having me here tonight to speak. I'll try to be as brief as possible on some of the early pieces and some of the background. We're going to go through a quick marketplace update on how we got here and some of the concerns over CIGNA and Atlantic Health Care Systems and the contract negotiations that have ensued over the last few weeks. Then we will go into the employee benefits program that's here today. We will talk a little bit about the plan's performance, fiscal responsibility, member services, and then the program's flexibility as it relates to the ongoing negotiations that just wrapped up. Then we will talk a little bit about the renewal expectations for 7/1 and what some of the members and the administration can expect to hear from us in the upcoming weeks. We'll get right into the health care marketplace update. These first couple of slides will just try to illustrate a little bit about what's going on in the current marketplace. As we stand today in the United States, health care is essentially almost 30% of our total GDP. It's overtaken the government as the largest employer of people. In New Jersey, it's 31% of our total health care spend. Over the last 10 years or so, this is an illustration of the SEHBP and the medical increases that have been received over that last decade. Only four times have the increases been under 10%. Our goal at 7/1/2018 was to reduce the total overall economic hit to the employees, the administration, and the taxpayers. As we look into some of it, now the US is the largest employer of health care in total. In New Jersey of our 20 largest employers, six are hospitals and nine are inside of the health care arena. You can take a look at some of those numbers there. There are 113 hospital systems currently inside of New Jersey. We're seeing rapid consolidation of these health

systems into larger conglomerates with larger leveraging power as a result of that. Inside New Jersey there have been mergers and acquisitions on some of our largest hospital systems – Robert Wood Johnson with Barnabas in Rutgers. We've seen Hackensack and Meridian in 2016. Then there's speculation about what will happen with all the Catholic hospitals that we have. There might be some rapid consolidation there as well. All of this means that this leveraging power is going to increase for the hospitals and as a result the discounts that we have become so accustomed to inside of our health plans are at risk and that's what these negotiations have been about. Between CIGNA and Atlantic Health this is a brief timeline that goes through when we first were made aware of some of the issues and the potential termination between CIGNA and Atlantic Health, and then some of the steps that were taken to alleviate some of those concerns. Finally, 1/1/19 being able to share with Paterson Public Schools that an agreement had been reached and that Atlantic Health Systems will remain in-network with CIGNA for the foreseeable future. The five key takeaways and some of the things we want to talk about here - this is going to be something that's going to continue to be the norm. This is not going to be an outlier in our opinion. We expect there to be continuous contentious negotiations between hospital systems and insurance companies as a result of their sheer leverage. What we do find and what we're proud of is that we were able to offer five different options to Paterson Public Schools in the event that a termination did take effect on 2/1. That's important flexibility that you have to know that you have. In a two-week time period, we would have been able to turn out any bit of information if the Board had to decide to take one of those options. Thankfully, because of this 1/1/19 update that we were able to get we don't have to take any of them. We continue as status quo. Let's go into some of the plan itself, the fiscal responsibility and the update on where our spending is going currently. If we took a census as it states today, the total SEHBP bill for the year would be \$93 million. That would be the total cost of the plan, including employee and Board contributions. It's an important number to remember. The plan's maximum liability, the total cost that can be spent in this year, is going to be \$83 million. That's an immediate \$10 million savings realized by this Board of Education. Currently, we're running better than projected. If the year were to continue on the way that it's moving right now, we're running at a projected \$77 million in total spend for this year.

Comm. Castillo: Ladies and gentlemen, we will all hear you and your comments. Let's just get through this presentation because we all want to hear what you want to say. But let's get through what he has to say right now. Thank you.

Mr. Mancini: There's an additional \$2 million in pharmacy benefit rebates that are going to be available to the Board of Education as well at the end of each quarter as they're made available. Our estimated savings is \$16 million versus the SEHBP, \$18 million if you factor in those rebates. Right now, the medical plan rates that the employees and the administration are paying in collectively are 20% lower than the SEHBP. The Rx plan is trending \$2 million better than the previous Benecard plan that had been in place. Then there's an additional \$2 million in rebates that will come as a result of that as well. When we talk about fiscal responsibility, there are parts of this that I will always agree could have been better in the beginning. I recognize immediately that the original implementation could have been better. I think that's something that I can only apologize for and I do. There was transition of care in the beginning when we went from the SEHBP to CIGNA where members were able to continue to see their doctor if they no longer were in network and continue to receive those in-network costs. That would transition through their care and once that was done that doctor would then be out of network and then that person would find a new doctor inside the CIGNA network to move on. The rate negotiation part is important. In the beginning, a lot of our members had issues with the way out-of-network claims were being processed. I

understand that was a largest point of contention. What I'm really talking about here is chiropractors, acupuncturists, and physical therapists were not being paid as quickly as we had promised originally in the beginning. I recognize that. Since then the most of our high utilization, through WebTPA, the claims administrator, we've been able to pre-negotiate those rates with our largest out-of-network provider and we were able to come to an agreement. We're now doing so with the nine other largest out-of-network providers in order to try to get some form of a contract in place for pre-negotiated rates. That represents 40% of the total out-of-network physicians that are being seen by Paterson Public Schools membership and that's important. Being able to do so only enables us to pay quicker. This is some of the most important work that's being done inside the product right now. All claims are constantly being audited, especially claims over \$100,000. We had a recent claim that got submitted for \$500,000 that is normally paid between \$6,000 and \$25,000. It would have been an enormous expense for the plan itself, which would have only been realized by next year's rate renewal. We were able to catch that right away. Under the SEHBP there's an argument to be made that that would have been paid right away and then attempted to be adjudicated at the end of the year. We were able to catch that immediately and negotiate that currently. The plan document is also a point of frustration at some time. We are administering the plan exactly the way it reads. Unfortunately, in the SEHBP there was some looseness that was being allowed. As a result of that, some of our membership's way of going about life had been essentially moved off course a bit. Under our current plan we're administering the plan exactly the way the state plan and our plan document say it has to be done. Member services are the next part I want to touch on a bit. Our Crumdale advocate, Amairany Martinez, is going to be a full-time member at Paterson effective 2019 and we're actively interviewing to fill her position currently. The Crumdale advocate has fielded over 403 calls personally. WebTPA has assisted with over 18,000 claims that have been called in to discuss. To date, we have filled over \$65,000 in claims for Paterson Public Schools. Personally, Liberty Benefit Advisors have 50 claims that have been escalated to us and we have been able to take care of them. I want to talk a little bit about program flexibility. The out-of-network claims initially caused too much member disruption. We implemented an alternative strategy which has yielded fewer engagements with employee issues. We recognize again the beginning was a concern and is something we believe we have alleviated going forward. We've negotiated plan changes that have helped ease employee access to care. We have an ability to respond to unique instances, such as this Atlantic Health Systems, with a quick response. We were able to jump into action at the beginning of January with less than 15 days. When we got halfway through, we officially notified CIGNA that we had some concerns about their timeliness of these negotiations. We were able to create nine separate ID templates. We were able to have five different fiscal plan options for the Board to consider. We were able to create frequently asked questions, several transition plans, and we negotiated five separate options in the event something were to happen on 2/1. I want to go a little bit into what you can expect for 7/1 and some of the finances as a result of that. We're currently securing competitive stop loss insurance. That's the most important component of any self-insured product, the stop loss insurance itself. Currently \$83 million is the maximum cost of this plan. We're looking at next year's renewal coming in at between \$85 and \$87 million as the maximum cost to the district. With even a 0% renewal at the SEHBP level, on 1/1/20 we would still be 15% lower than the SEHBP on the medical piece. The prescription and drug we can expect continued decreases there through our medical management programs. Then there's an escalator clause inside the Rx agreement where we're going to continue to see increased rebates as a result of utilization. That pretty much makes up the brief piece I have today. I'll open it up to any questions.

Comm. Simmons: Who's your biggest out-of-network provider?

Mr. Mancini: That part I don't have off the top of my head. I'll give you the top 10. I'll have it emailed to the district. We keep a running list of all the 10 out-of-network providers. I can have that to you right away.

Comm. Simmons: You talked about transitioned care. You spoke about it in a way that I don't remember it being discussed with the Board. We were told that doctors that weren't in-network you were confident that you could get them in the network. That didn't happen. I want to know why that didn't happen. You told us you were confident that you could do that.

Mr. Mancini: I agree with the concern there. It wasn't exactly the way that it was explained by us to you is exactly how it felt into place. With the approval of the administration where we have been going is instead of having a direct contract with Paterson and that provider, the agreement for the pre-negotiated rates, which is essentially what we were looking to do ahead of time, is going to be done by WebTPA and the out-of-network providers. That allows us to negotiate the rates ahead of time, pay faster to these out-of-network providers, and it essentially gives us the ability to do what we said we were going to do in the beginning. I apologize for that difference in time period because that part is our fault. We are now able to see these out-of-network providers at pre-negotiated rates. We've done so now with our largest one and we're in discussion with nine of the other top largest. That would be about 40% of the out-of-network providers that are seen here. We would have pre-negotiated rates with all of them and be able to pay them incredibly quickly, as opposed to negotiating each claim as they come in. That's what we do with them currently.

Comm. Simmons: In some cases what happened was doctors wouldn't even see people. They had to switch. They had to find new doctors. It wasn't even a matter of rates being negotiated. They just simply had to find a new doctor.

Mr. Mancini: The beginning was handled poorly. I would agree with you there.

Comm. Olivares: I wasn't here for the negotiations, when you guys were doing that. I'm one of the new Commissioners. Risking sounding stupid, we see all these people here who want SEHBP and we answer to the people of Paterson. That's what the people of Paterson sent us to do. While I don't have a question, I do have a comment. I feel that we as a Board should do everything within our power to make sure that the people of Paterson get what they want.

Comm. Capers: Since the start was handled poorly, what did you guys do to rectify the problem? How will it be rectified going forward?

Mr. John DiMartino: When we first started and the plan first launched on 7/1, our starting point for paying out-of-network providers was too low. That's feedback we received from the membership. During the time that claims were not being paid, that was a time we were holding claims so that way we could pay these providers more up front to cause less disruption. Since that time frame, there's been significantly less disruption on the out-of-network side.

Comm. Capers: In your presentation tonight, you said that we are ahead of schedule in terms of saving money. Where's that number at right now?

Mr. DiMartino: The numbers are subject to change every month, but in general we're trending between \$70 and \$77 million in total spend for the year. That would save the district somewhere between \$16 million and up to \$25 million versus the SEHBP plan.

Comm. Capers: When you did the cost analysis when you did your first presentation to the Board what was that savings like?

Mr. Mancini: \$17 million was the projected savings versus the budget, which was higher than what the state plan actually cost. The state plan renewed at about a flat number this year. This is us telling you that it's \$17 million off the actual number, not even the budgeted number. If we were in the state health benefits plan right now, it would be \$93 million. \$77 million is where we're trending right now and that's on the higher side of the conservative piece. Our maximum cost is at \$83 million in the event that we blew through our stop loss insurance.

Comm. Redmon: My comment is to what you're saying. For the state plan you just said \$93 million. Right now, we're trending at \$77 million.

Mr. Mancini: Inside our plan currently. Yes.

Comm. Redmon: We're trending low because of the actual bills that carried over from July. You're not explaining that properly to our membership. Let's be fair to them and let's get real. When we switched over from June to July, some of those bills were still being paid by the old health plan because we have a carryover period. You will trend lower because we started getting bills the month after that. If we were to switch tonight from your proposed plan from CIGNA to another plan, you still have a two-month carryover period that we are allowed to make sure that our bills are being paid.

Mr. DiMartino: The projections that we're providing include what they call a runout period. It includes projected claims three months after the plan year ends. Even though the first two months are light, we're tacking on two months to the 12-month period and we're still projected under \$77 million.

Comm. Redmon: We really can't project those raw numbers because we're still in a premature period.

Mr. DiMartino: We don't know exactly where it's going to land, but it's no longer a premature year. It's becoming mature and in the last couple of months we've seen what that maturity looks like. We used that maturity to determine what the rest of the year is going to look like.

Comm. Redmon: Right now you're using projections. Let's be realistic.

Mr. DiMartino: We will not know the final number until the end of the plan year.

Comm. Redmon: Exactly. I would prefer you to say projections than to give us actual numbers. When you say projections, then we can say room for error. Right now, we're only in a six-month period. We started on June 1 and now we're here in January. Right now, we don't have the true actual numbers so we can't compare our state plan to what we have now. I would say these are projections that you're giving us. Let's be realistic.

Mr. DiMartino: We can project the maximum cost allowed in this plan, which is \$83 million, towards the cost that would be in the SEHBP. We are 100% confident that you'll save at least \$10 million, \$93 versus \$83 million.

Comm. Redmon: I'm sorry. I hate to go back and forth, Madam Chair. The reason I'm asking these questions is because it's frustrating as a Board member. I have met with you behind the scenes and we talked behind the scenes. I'm not like what I'm asking you I have not asked you before. It's frustrating when we have to go to the general public, which is our teachers, and we have to explain to them what's going on. Again, I asked for projections because it's fair to say these are projections because it's a six-month period. We don't have a whole year behind us. You keep predicting these numbers and they keep changing. From the time that you started and even talking to us now, your projections have changed. I would prefer for you to say right now you're not sure what our projected numbers will be for the year. I can respect you more saying that than what you're giving us now. Right now, it seems like you're trying to sell me a whole bunch of goods. I'm being honest because all the goods that you're trying to sell me make me ask even more questions. As a diligent person that's there, I will prefer you to say you really don't know and don't have the answer and you can get back to me. I would prefer that than to give me something here standing in front of our general public.

Comm. Simmons: Just a quick comment touching on what Comm. Redmon spoke about. I spoke with you guys earlier today or yesterday as I was reading some of the information. We have an issue, but I feel like you're trying to sell me something again. I don't want to feel that way. Secondly, I'm all for the district saving money and I mentioned this last year. One of the questions I asked was will that savings be passed on to membership. From what I'm hearing and talking to teachers and those who are covered in the plan, and even in my own analysis because I asked for a side-by-side plan so that I can review myself, some of what I saw was a lot of higher out-of-pocket costs for many members. Everyone knows that from the beginning I wasn't in favor of it for those reasons. I'm all for saving money, but not at the cost of those people that are covered by the plan.

Comm. Castillo: I want to thank you for the presentation because I think this is possibly one of the most transparent conversations that we've had. At least we know numbers. We may not agree, but I think it's the first time you've actually apologized to the membership and said it was rolled out poorly. Not that that fixes everything, but at least at this point it's good that you're acknowledging it. We've been telling the membership that we're a partnership and we're trying to look out for them. By default, they're helping our students. I think that is something that all of us want to honor. We want to make sure that they're not having to make phone calls during their break periods to doctors. We want to make sure that they don't have to worry about these things. They have a lot of work. Many of them have a ton of students and we expect the best from them. That's what we have to do. We sat in a meeting in November, Comm. Redmon and I, and we heard the stories. We said we were going to do better. We're here in January and we're still not doing better. I can't continue to come to the membership and say this is what we're going to do, it's going to work, and it's going to be great and by the fall it's a whole different story. Madam Superintendent, I think we were going to do whatever we could to make sure that they have the services that they received without adding any other extra stress like health care, something they shouldn't be worried about. Once again, I would like to ask you for those numbers for our next presentation so we can fit it and see how we're going to manage it and what it looks like to move into the state plan. How much would it cost us? The day that we have that presentation I'd also like to make sure that Mr. McEntee and the membership get an invitation to that meeting so that they can see in real time the numbers that we'll be receiving as well. Thank you.

Comm. Martinez: I just wanted to piggyback on the comments that Comm. Simmons made. I know this is a tight situation for everybody. While as a district we're happy to hear about the cost savings, we also have to keep in mind the audience that we have in front of us. I say that with respect to everyone in this room. The folks standing behind you don't want to hear about the cost savings to the district. What they want to hear about is that their services are going to be uninterrupted, their families are going to be cared for, they can take care of themselves, do their job, and give our children what they deserve without having to put all the extra time to everything that's going on. I say that respectfully. Understand where they're coming from and what they want. If we can meet them there then we'll be on the way to making progress. Just please be cognizant of that.

Comm. Castillo: Thank you, gentlemen.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

It was moved by Comm. Redmon, seconded by Comm. Ramirez that the Public Comments portion of the meeting be opened. On roll call all members voted in the affirmative. The motion carried.

Comm. Castillo: I just want to remind everyone if it's your first time here we have three minutes for each speaker just to be respectful of everyone else's time. We definitely want to make sure that we hear you guys. In the back, please help us out. Our sound system sometimes with so many people is not the greatest. We want to make sure that we hear everyone that's at the podium. I also want to say that we work together. Please let's be respectful of each other. We know we're not very happy of things that are going on, but let's keep that.

Mr. John McEntee: Good evening members of the Board. Madam Superintendent, I want to thank you for your hospitality this evening, especially for working with us. We know that there are a lot of great people on the Board. All of you are great people. We know that in the end we're going to get through this problem. Thank you first and foremost. Where do I begin? Do I start with the phone calls at three in the morning that an infant can't receive a feeding tube because the hospital is saying it's not medically necessary? Do I begin with the patients saying that procedures, operations, and doctor visits aren't going to be honored? Do I begin with our employees spending countless hours calling, emailing John DiMartino, Julie Jackson, WebTPA, and Texas? Where does it end? We're not here to cast blame. We all know that this needs to be fixed and fixed quickly. I can't tell you how many members are here because they stopped allowing them in when it became a fire hazard. But when I look behind me, I didn't only see teachers. I see our hard-working educational support professionals. I see our principals. I see our vice principals. I see our supervisors, custodians, and maintenance workers. I see a lot of faces out there that are hurting. They need help and they need it fast. I can't tell you how frustrated I've become. I've learned a lot more about health benefits in the last six months than I care to know. In fact, I probably know more about my members' health than I should know. I'm the only one they can get a hold of 24 hours a day, seven days a week. Under Blue Cross/Blue Shield, the Crumdales of the world, the WebTPAs of the world, they existed but they existed inside the Blue Cross/Blue Shield model. We're now dealing with people out of state who don't know our names. They don't care whether we get the services. They're passing calls along and we at the PEA are trying to intersect where things are going wrong. Over 500 people don't show up to a meeting with their children and their spouses unless something is truly wrong. Take a look into that crowd. They mean business. Let's fix this problem and let's get on with our work. We've got a lot of great things

going on in this district and it shouldn't be overshadowed by what's going on with our health care. Let's fix it. Let's go.

Ms. Gina Desino: Good evening everybody on the Board. To all the faculty out there and everybody that's here, thank you for being on our side, some of you. I sent an email when this whole Atlantic Health System thing was going on. I live in Sussex County. I drive over an hour and ten minutes to work every morning and I'm here every morning early and most of the time I stay late. I'm here for the students. I need to let you know that two weeks ago my daughter went into respiratory distress where she couldn't breathe. She's 10 months old. I had to worry that there is no hospital within 20 miles of my house that I can get my child to in case something happened. That's what's wrong. With Blue Cross/Blue Shield this would have never happened. On Friday my daughter goes into surgery to have her tonsils and adenoids out. I call WebTPA to make sure everything is on board because I'm proactive about this whole situation. Do you know what the lady on the phone told me? I'm sorry, it's not covered. Have a nice day. I said, "Excuse me?" I was so irate I had to hang up the phone. I went to the surgery and it better be covered. Guess what? I would have never had to deal with that with Blue Cross/Blue Shield. Please let us go back to the state health benefit plan. We're not saving any money. The district is saving money. I'm willing to pay the money to go back. Thank you and have a good night.

Ms. Jaclyn Amato: Hi, I'm Jaclyn Amato. I'm a second-grade teacher. I just wanted to tell you about my story and the need for state health. On May 31, 2015, I was finishing up my third year of teaching and I had just gotten married eight months ago. I was 29 years old, in the best shape of my life, training for a marathon, and starting a new chapter in my life. At 6:30 p.m. I went to feed my dog and my life instantly changed. I had a stroke. My husband called 911 and I was taken to Chilton where they diagnosed me and treated me with TPA to help reverse the side effects of the stroke. That was \$40,000. They wanted to airlift me to Overlook, but the weather was so bad they took me in an ambulance. I was rushed into emergency surgery to remove a clot from my brain. It was over \$50,000 for my first night in the ICU and the surgery. After a successful surgery, I spent three nights in the ICU and one in a regular room. It was about \$150,000. I was sent home and unfortunately the next day I suffered another stroke and I was back in the ICU for 24 days. I finally came home at the end of June and I was sitting on hundreds of thousands of dollars in medical bills. Not just my hospital stays, but now all the bloodwork, tests, and doctor visits I require. I was scared that my new life had just begun, but I was going to be close to \$500,000 in debt before I could really even begin my life. In October of 2015, after going back and forth talking to Blue Cross, they never gave me an issue. It was just a lot of phone calls. I received my final bill, \$25. In August of 2016, I found out I was pregnant. Because of my history I was required to be seen by a high-risk OB, hematologist, and primary care. At 20 weeks they discovered an issue with my pregnancy and I was taken out of work. I was now getting ultrasounds and bloodwork almost two times a week. I was on Lovenox, which is an injectable blood thinner that costs \$9,000 a month. I paid \$21 for a three-month supply. For over three months I was going to the doctor almost three times a week and getting ultrasounds, which are extremely expensive. The bills were coming in by the thousands of dollars, but they were always paid by Blue Cross and I never had an issue. At 35 weeks, I was diagnosed with placental abruption. I was rushed into an emergency C-section and I needed a blood transfusion. That meant a five-day stay for me and a 10-day stay in the NICU for my daughter. Between myself and my daughter, I've come close to \$1 million in medical bills – a healthy 29-year-old whose life was turned upside down in one second, but then saved by amazing medical professionals under our state insurance. They also saved my daughter's life. In the end, it only cost me some scars, time in the hospital, and maybe \$100 out of pocket. Done!

Mr. Sasha Wolf: Ladies and gentlemen of the Board, Madam President and Ms. Shafer. My name is Sasha Wolf. I have the proud honor of representing the hard-working men and women of the Paterson Education Association, the Paterson Food Service Association, as well as the over 200,000 members of the New Jersey Education Association. I'm here to give a little bit of a history lesson and hopefully perspectives. You've heard from the President and some of the members already about the problems with this plan. When we met with the district in the spring, they painted a picture of doom and decline of the SEHBP. Rates were going to skyrocket and we were going to be priced out of this plan. I'm actually happy to tell you that the rates for the SEHBP have now declined this year. I would be leery of any projections that anyone is making about the SEHBP. Also bear in mind that the SEHBP continues to innovate. They have a Direct 0 plan, which means \$0 copay for in-network, which is better right now than what we're offering here. There's also the innovation of the Paladina Health Clinic, which is located right here in Clifton. They have unlimited access to personal doctors, access to urgent care, no copays or fees for visiting, no deductibles, and evening and weekend hours. It is direct primary care and promises to save the district and our members money. However, because we are no longer in the state plan, our members do not have access to this service. While we tried with the district to convince them to stay for this reason, they refused. The state plan also has NJ Well program, which promotes healthy living and offers incentives to do so. Right now, the continued existence of that program as it relates to our local plan is in doubt. We are also concerned with the consolidation of hospitals that are going on, which is why we were so scared about the possible departure of Atlantic Health Systems for CIGNA. But think about this, if we're worried about the consolidation of hospitals in the health care industry, what does it say for a district the size of Paterson having to negotiate against some of these behemoths? Wouldn't it be in our interest if we had the bargaining power over a half a million, as they say in the industry, bellybuttons, in the state plan? We need to that leverage. Otherwise, we're going to get swallowed up. We will not be able to compete and our members will have to pay more. You've heard about the time and expense spent by our members trying to deal with these claims, time that could be spent in the classroom and preparing. It is in our best interest to fix this. Thank you.

Ms. Noreen Veloz: Hi. My name is Noreen Veloz. I've been with the district way over 10 years. You invested in me. You invested almost \$100,000 in education to make me the best teacher I could be for the students. Right now, I'm in extreme pain. I don't know how I got hurt, but I have a horrible backache that sent me on December 30 to Immedicenter and December 31 to the ER and to the doctor. They had requested an MRI. It was denied. I was supposed to go last week and I'm not getting any answers. I called Ms. Martinez. She's very nice and very polite. "I'll get back to you." That was yesterday. I'm still waiting. You invested in me, but if I'm not healthy, you're not getting your return back. I should not be here worrying and making phone calls. I want to be here. I don't want to take sick days off. I was even making my MRI after school. That's all I have to say. You invest in all of us. Keep us well. If there's a problem we should be able to rest and know that we're going to get better and get back to the children of Paterson. Thank you.

Mr. Charles Ferrer: Good evening, Charles Ferrer. As Comm. Simmons said, I'm all about trying to save money. Most people are. We use coupons. We do all kinds of things to budget and save. But when there's a problem that exists it needs to be fixed. I remember when we first started this process we were told that we're using the CIGNA network of doctors. Make sure that you tell them that they have to contact WebTPA because if you contact CIGNA, they will deny you because you're not with CIGNA. Then when my members started sending me denial letters from CIGNA, denying

procedures that they said weren't medically necessary, that was a problem for me. We're not supposed to be dealing with CIGNA itself. We're just supposed to be using their network of doctors. If we're using their network of doctors that means that they're already approved so there shouldn't be any problem. Why do we have problems? And it's not just us. It's everybody here. Maybe a lot of people aren't talking about it and I'm tired of people talking about I need to have my hip replaced but I'm afraid to go to the doctor because it might get denied so you'd rather suffer than deal with some of the aggravation that members are dealing with. Dealing with this insurance plan during lunch, prep, and after school has become another job. Unacceptable! As I said, I'm all for saving. I was happy on December 14 when I received that waiver money in my bank account that I can't get through the state plan. But I'm willing to give that up to go back to where we need to be so that we can have what we used to have. When we first started the state plan, it was known as the Cadillac of insurance. Now I thought we were riding in a hooptie, but someone said we're not even in a car right now. We might be on a bike. It's unacceptable. Things were said to people that turned out not to be true. I heard the complaints about WebTPA and how they treat our people or the staff of this district. They should be glad that they're in Texas. Since they do everything big in Texas, if we can get a hold of them down in Texas, we would go big on opening up a can. We need to do what's right. We need to come back home. We stepped out on faith trying to see if it works. It's not working. We need to come back home where we belong and get the services that we're accustomed to, not just for us, but for our children. When you deny babies and people reconstructive surgery and MRIs and things like that, I'm sorry. Just one other note - we pay a portion of the expense and since we pay some of that cost, we should have a say. If we want to change the law a little bit and if you want to foot the entire bill, then maybe we have to shut up and take what we have. But since we pay some of that money, especially the people at the top, we have a right to have some input. Please hear us loud. Please do what's right. I'm not going to say it anymore. I'm just going to turn around and show you. Thank you.

Ms. Nikki Baker: Good afternoon everyone. I'm Nikki Baker. I'm wearing a mask for two reasons. It's a symbol of how we should go back to our health care and because I am sick this week. I don't have a lot of sick days and I was also pleasantly denied from a doctor this week. I had to go to a new doctor. Fortunately, I did get that medicine, but I lost a week out of work. Because I waited so long my health is a little bit more extra than it would be if I had. I wasn't going to share that, but I'm sitting here short of breath. The first day back to work and I was fairly healthy and it shouldn't be that way. When we hear our members' families and babies being denied urgent and prudent health care, then that's a problem. I was on the negotiating team. I sat there in that room when the gentlemen were told by our health care experts that this would be occurring. I've written a whole elaborate thing, so I'll read part of it. I'm glad that we are here and you are committed to rectifying everything. It is sad that we're here for these circumstances. I believe that we should have stayed in the state health plan with Horizon Blue Cross/Blue Shield. During negotiations, health care experts sat with the representatives of WebTPA and Liberty outlining the massive issues that are occurring right now. However, the crisis has become exponentially worse than originally anticipated because now we're dealing with lives. People and children have literally died. Infants and people who were pregnant lost their kids because they were waiting on health care or denied. How can you deny an infant in NICU their feeding tube? I can't even imagine. The members of my building have countless stories. I can't even tell you how many. I can't even imagine our President John McEntee and what he does. He does not sleep. He takes and channels these calls and I commend our leadership for what they do. This is not a numbers game any longer. This is life and death, services being delayed or denied, financial hardships due to unpaid or underpaid

medical bills, our members, their dependents, myself included. Please go back. Thank you.

Ms. Robin Caprio: Good evening everyone. My name is Robin Caprio. I've been a Paterson Public Schools employee for over 14 years. I pride myself on having wonderful attendance and a work ethic. But we all work hard. We work really hard every day to do our best here in Paterson. We all take pride in our jobs and in the care we deliver to each and every child and every family every day, but we too need to be cared for. You've heard numerous horrendous stories about the health care coverage under CIGNA. One story should have been enough. We are all here today because we want to go back to Blue Cross/Blue Shield and we want and need you to fight for us. Added stress every day worrying about our loved ones and ourselves for the health coverage leads to our own bad health. It makes much more sense to stay well rather than try to get well. With the exception of our loved ones, there's nothing in this world more important than good health. Thank you for hearing me.

Mr. Michael Renn: Good evening. My name is Michael Renn. I'm here to speak about a situation with our current health care. This evening I will share with you my story. I know the talk between our previous health care provider and our current provider plan has been better or equal to. I have heard before that there are different ways to figure out how much a doctor gets paid. Unfortunately, there is still a difference in the amount of money that my wife's acupuncturist is being paid. This amount is half to three-quarters of what was paid by our previous carrier. Saying this, we've been informed that we eventually will have to make up the difference or we will be unable to make future appointments. I was told by the Crumdale advocate representative that the bills will be looked over for possible extra compensation to be paid. We have sent in the new bills from the acupuncturist by interoffice mail to the Crumdale advocate with her name on it, but unfortunately the envelope was not delivered and now I must start again at square one. With the old plan, the acupuncturists never asked questions because they believed that they were getting paid a fair amount. Hopefully, this will be taken care of sooner than later since this is the only type of pain relief that is helpful as my wife doesn't want to go on any pain management program that requires pain medicine. There are too many side effects from pain drugs when a person has an immune deficiency. Never had a problem with Horizon Blue Cross and hopefully any problems that we've had will go away so that my wife will be able to continue with her appointments so that she can live a life as pain free as possible. You know, a happy wife is a happy home. Thank you for the opportunity to speak with you today about my personal experience with our current health care provider.

Ms. Lynda Alvarez: Hi. My name is Lynda Alvarez. I'm a teacher. My son had an accident on September 23 last year. He had a lot of shoulder pain and we took him to an orthopedic surgeon and he ordered an MRI. He said most likely it's a labrum tear. My husband the year before, while we had Blue Cross/Blue Shield, went through this. What I wasn't expecting was being denied an MRI. I waited over two weeks and a lot of phone calls to get my son an MRI. When he finally did get it, we were able to schedule a surgery. My husband had it at Wayne Surgical Center close to my house, but they don't take CIGNA. We had to travel 45 minutes and have another two-week waiting period to schedule his surgery because CIGNA only allowed one day a week surgery. My son ended up getting his surgery a month and a day after his accident. During surgery they realized it wasn't a labrum tear, but it was actually detached. My story is to show that it's not equal or better. I went through the same exact thing the year before - the same orthopedic surgeon and the same imaging center - and I had to wait that long. It doesn't get any clearer than that. It's not the same. It's not better. After he gets his surgery, I had to go through the embarrassment of his doctor telling me that CIGNA is

paying the physical therapist significantly less money. The physical therapy place where we go always has no copay for teachers, firemen, police, etc. A lot of places do that. The doctor says he doesn't think he can continue to do that because of how little money they're receiving for services. That's my story and I hope you can fix this problem. Thank you.

Ms. Susan Collum: Good evening. I'm Susan Collum. I just want to go over numbers for a second because sitting here I'm very confused. I tried to find an old newspaper article, but the one I could find was December 3, 2018. It says Paterson school employees get \$214,500 in health refunds. It says 2,500 employees received refunds, the vast majority of which were less than \$200 each, for the switch in our plan. In the paper it said our self-insurance plan cost \$78.5 million for 2019-2020, which is different from what was presented tonight. It said state health benefits were \$99.2 million, which was different. Tonight, it said \$93 and \$83 million. There was a \$16 million difference. Let's just say there is a \$16 million difference. That \$214,000 is less than 1.5%. Of the \$16 million the district is saving less than 1.5% is going to the teachers. Let's say I'm one of those people that saved \$200. One facility that I go to for health care with my daughter I'm spending now close to \$2,240 a year. I never had to pay copay under Blue Cross/Blue Shield, but now I have to pay a copay. So that \$200 that I saved, I'm now putting out of pocket at just one facility \$2,240 more. On top of that, when we first were told that we were switching over I was assured that our bills would be paid in 7 to 14 days. I remember being astonished because Blue Cross/Blue Shield takes four to six weeks. Nope, it will be 7 to 14 days. Now if they send to CIGNA first, they normally deny or it's not being carried over to WebTPA. If they send to WebTPA first, they then have to send it to CIGNA for them to get the codes to get the cost. Then it has to be sent back to WebTPA. Now we're looking at 45 to 90 days. In November I found out that my oldest daughter who has been with me the longest and is almost 14, none of her insurance was being paid. One of her doctors who had over \$3,000 in bills was cutting us off. This is unacceptable. This is not equal or better. This is now becoming a burden to us. We are having to call on our lunches. We are having to take days off. This is affecting our education. On top of that, if we want the kids to invest you guys have to invest in us. If you're not investing in us, we can't give our all. If I have a babysitter, I want one that's well-rested. I want one that's well-fed and someone that's going to be taking care of my children. I don't want someone that's going to be not well-rested, not being taken care of. This is not equal or better and it's out of our pockets even more. Please fix this.

Ms. Honey Kleinberg: Good evening. My name is Honey Kleinberg. I teach at School No. 4. Last year I lost my husband in November after an illness that we weren't expecting. He spent one month in Hackensack University Medical Center. He had open heart surgery with a surgeon that was not in the plan. His cardiologist was not in the plan. The hematologist, neurologist and everybody else was not in the plan, for a total of over \$1 million in bills. Blue Cross/Blue Shield paid every single one of them. I did not pay one penny out of pocket. I can only say thank god we were a member of that health plan. But I'm going to read to you right now pales in comparison to all the stories that I've heard, and my heart goes out to everybody. Just to give you an idea for the gentleman that was talking about CIGNA and how much better they're doing and how great they are, I have a bill here from Aurora Diagnostics for a biopsy that turned out positive. It's dated 8/28. It was paid 11/22. They are balance billing me. When I called Amairany, who was very nice, I was told that there is nothing on the current plan that states that they allow for out-of-network claims to process as in-network for labs. The state health plan, Blue Cross, did. If you went to an in-plan doctor, which I did, and you went to an in-plan surgeon, which I did, the labs and the biopsies were always covered. When the doctor's office from Aurora Diagnostics called, they said that they

would normally just accept whatever the plan paid. However, in this case CIGNA said they're allowed to balance bill, and hence the balance billing. I brought this back to her again because it was about a month since I heard from her. Now she states, and I'm reading directly, "Since I'm a third-party only the member has access because of the HIPA laws." Yet, I have no access. I have no one that I can go to and no number. You can go to WEB and you get the same thing. You go to Amairany, she's very nice and pleasant to speak to, but there's still no doctor, office, or anyone in CIGNA or anyone else that I can take this claim to. It's not a big claim, but there's no one we can talk to. If they can't help us because they're a third party, then who can we take our plan to? Please take us back to the state. I'm sure we're all willing to pay that little difference in order to have the benefits that will take care of us and our family. Thank you.

Ms. Lynn Schweyhardt: Good evening. My name is Lynn Schweyhardt. I've been here in the district almost 10 years. I'm a nurse at School No. 21. I don't even know where to begin. As far as the presentation that was done tonight about the plan we now have, there are so many lies I don't even know where to begin. I spent over an hour one Friday afternoon at home after work talking to Mr. DiMartino about questions, concerns, and contacting doctors. I remember telling him if he wanted to contact my six doctors who are not in the plan it would serve me. People come to me. I'm a nurse. They have questions. I know a lot about this and they come and ask me. I can say to them they did contact my doctors and they did join. None of my six doctors were ever contacted to join. They did call one of my doctors to make him agree to accept less money. I was so embarrassed when I heard this. Initially I was balance billed for an amount of over \$100 which I never had to pay under Blue Cross. All of a sudden, I'm getting a bill for it. I called and spoke to Ms. Martinez and the next thing I know my doctor is accepting less money. That really bothers me. It's not what the plan was supposed to be about and what you talked my doctors into. They're decent people trying to help people into accepting less money. I've compared my EOBs from Blue Cross and now. The reasonable and customary is so much less it's unbelievable. Again, I was told, because this entity of being self-employed was smaller than Horizon, the doctors were going to actually be getting paid more money. My concern was CIGNA doesn't pay a lot and that's why doctors don't participate. But I was told they're going to get paid more in this self-insured plan. That also is definitely not true. I'm spending hours of my own time, my lunches, after school, and on Fridays, making copies, sending letters, sending emails, calling my doctors asking people don't send it to collection, mark it that I'm fighting it, to get things paid at the rate that they were paid before at Blue Cross. I recently needed a piece of durable medical equipment. It cost about \$80 to \$100. I was told it is experimental and it's not covered. I haven't figured out yet how to find out from Blue Cross, but I will do this, if it was covered under the plan there. It's the only treatment for the disorder that I have, the only one that has been out there for 15 years. There is no other treatment. It's experimental so they won't cover it. That's what I got back from Ms. Martinez after first calling WebTPA and getting fed up because people didn't even know what I was talking about and didn't even make an effort to research it. It's a medical piece of equipment. They should know what it is if they're doing medical work. We need to go back. I'm tired of spending time. I really believe that somebody's plan is to frustrate us all enough that we end up paying. I know somebody at work already paid \$10 that they should not have. They didn't have to pay it in the old plan. I won't pay \$4. Not because I can't afford it, but if it was covered before it needs to be covered. We are not going away. We're not going to get frustrated and give up. We're going to keep fighting until we get equal to or better than, which is only going to happen with the state health plan. Thank you.

Ms. Erica Santiago: Hello. My name is Erica Santiago. You all know me because I've been here before. Normally, I come here very calm to offer constructive criticism

whenever I can give it. Today, I'm not happy and I'm sorry that I'm here to vent along with everyone else. I guess it's just one of those nights, so bear with me. My goddaughter, Olivia Gutierrez, is a student at School No. 27. Her mother has given me permission to speak on her behalf because she couldn't make it here tonight. My goddaughter has been dealing with a bullying issue. She and her friend have been targeted by the same little girl. I will not say her name because she's a child and that's just not right. Incidents have been repeated to Vice Principal Perez and they have not been reported to the principal or the guidance counselors. For four months these girls have been dealing with this one particular little girl that has been doing everything from throwing out racial slurs, to body shaming, to saying to one of the girls "Go kill yourself!" I don't understand how all of this was told to Vice Principal Perez and the only thing she had to say in response was "ignore her." That is not something to be ignored. Not only is this girl now to be found out to be a problem child at this school and to have several other instances against her, why is now someone doing something about it? I want to know if on Friday we emailed several people in the district, including the bullying coordinator, Mr. T.J. Best, why has he yet to respond. We're talking about children so I'm going to take this to a childish level. I don't understand how, when people throw up the bat signal Robin and Commissioner Gordon show up, but Batman is nowhere to be found. That doesn't make any sense. I understand he is a man that wears several hats and he also is a member of several committees and that's understandable. But either he needs to do his best or change his name from Mr. Best to Mr. Labels because that's all he seems to be good at. Thank you.

Ms. Elizabeth Elias: Hi everyone. For the teachers that don't know me, I'm Elizabeth. I'm here all the time. I had several issues that were on the agenda from HIB law, attendance, and all these things. But since you guys are talking about health, let's get to an open understanding of how if we all work together you will have less stress and less health issues. Do you see how you guys are coming here today for health? I'm so sorry, but there's a PTO committee that we have for parents and teachers that we need some of you to come in for. I'm one of the parents that talk good about you. I go to Trenton. Not every teacher is the same, just like not every parent. You guys need to get the people that have been making the decisions without you knowing. They need to ask Mr. McEntee and some of you guys before they make the decisions, which is common sense, and just share it with you guys. You shouldn't even be here but that's how it is here in this district. Everything is done and it stays where you guys don't know. Just like you guys are here, I'm also dealing with school lunches being cold. My daughter is getting bullied by a teacher. We all need to work together. I know you don't all have the time, but just like you have that union, you should make it your business – Mr. McDowell, it's a good time for you to start taking numbers – to communicate with teachers so we can see when we're lacking communication. At this point, it's either the teachers and the parents come together against everybody else, or you guys are going to be by yourself. I would like to stand with you guys, but there's too much back and forth going on. A lot of kids get sick because they eat those nasty lunches. Cancer comes from nasty lunches. I'm not trying to stop your vibe today, but a lot of that stress that you have is from those kids having socioemotional learning that's coming from home. You guys are under stress and we're not coming together. I know you're in a room with a lot of kids, so you need to demand that too. You will have less stress if you ask for our help. We don't know when things are going on. Instead of just being teachers, it should also be parents. Just like we have a PTO, you should invite us. If you invite me, I will come and talk with you. I'm being honest. It's either now or never. We are in 2019. It's time for you guys to do something for the parents to come in. I may not agree with everything your boss does or what the union representative does, but I do agree that coming together is going to work. Just like you want health benefits, I also want you guys to be teaching my kids. Our kids are lacking from a lot of

socioemotional things. My kids are good. My kids get everything. I can tell you there's stress at school because of the lunch. She doesn't eat lunch. I work three jobs to do what I have to do. I can't say all the teachers are not good. Ms. Shafer is not at fault, but these decisions that are made in their spaces should be something they should be sharing with you guys before they even make it. You guys allowed that. Just like we get nothing for our kids, you are getting nothing. Take my number down, 862-579-1609. I'm that parent. I went to Trenton on January 2 and I'm going to keep on going to Trenton. This is a space to talk, but you have to come more often. Mr. McDowell is in charge of the community engagement. PTO stands for parents and teachers, not just parents. I want you guys to know that I'm here for you guys, but I need you to be here for us too. Thank you.

Ms. Marcella Simadiris: Praise the lord everybody. Let me apologize if anybody is offended by my praises. It's always crazy that people frown upon those who choose not to pledge allegiance to a country, but find it taboo to sing praises to someone's creator. I'm getting balance billed also and that has never happened in the old plan. I just want to say that. There's a scripture that tells even when we're doing good, we are rotten. So I have been praying hard that the injustices I witness don't make me unjust and that I'm able to do justice and have mercy. Like health insurance, working and learning conditions are essential for our health and our students' health. Last year I inquired about the improper cleaning up of vomit. Concerned even more given the flu-related deaths of teachers and students last year in this very state, I pressed for answers when management and labor leadership were silent. On page 14 of your Paterson Public Schools facilities management catalog it indicates the equipment required to clean up vomit. I have evidence that shows that that was not available. As I pressed for answers, I was written up. I followed up with a grievance. I met with Mr. Rojas and my labor representation. I was told that we would have to meet again after Mr. Rojas followed up with my administrator. To this date, we have not reconvened and as I celebrated Martin Luther King Day yesterday and I participated in marches one of the quotes that was reiterated by Martin Luther King was there comes a time when your silence is betrayal. While I can appreciate the fight my local union organization leaders are demonstrating today, I'm confused and wonder where is that fight for learning and working conditions. It is not acceptable when management or labor leadership ignore members. We pay good money for our dues. We should not be ignored, ever. All members need to know that. I paid a little attention to what you were saying today, Comm. Capers. The equity audit for elementary schools is unacceptable. That was required last year in 2017-2018. You're in violation of the federal law. You know it. The suspension center is just another demonstration of your practices of segregation. Unacceptable! Elizabeth, I want you to know that I love you so much. I don't know how you do it, but I want to give praises to you tonight, sister. I love you.

Mr. Michael Taylor: Good evening. My name is Michael Taylor, International High School Parent of the Year. I represent the National Independent Black Parent Association. I first initially came to the Board meetings three years ago pertaining to the HIB situation when my daughter was getting bullied. I want to address the bullying situation saying to the district that you're mishandling HIB situations. I want you to stop sending parents bogus HIB finding letters saying that Ms. Shafer and the Board of Education reviews and investigates HIB situations when you don't. An example that you don't review the HIB situations is last month at the December meeting 11 parents spoke about bullying issues. If a parent has to come to the microphone that means a bullying issue hasn't been handled. If you don't find that a student is being bullied and if it's a conflict, parents want a resolution. I know that for a fact because I came to the Superintendent's forum meeting and I spoke with the parents. You are neglecting the children. I'm saying this on behalf of the child Samara. God bless the family. Rest in

peace, Samara. I hope you take this seriously because our kids are dying. Our kids shouldn't have to be forced to go to school because you're actually lying to them, Ms. Shafer and the rest of you. You know you are. T.J. Best is not doing his job. I've seen a child come to the microphone at the June meeting crying her heart out. You all heard her. I'm going to hold you accountable. You have to stop sending those messages out. However many kids have been bullied, that's how many times you have been deceiving the children of Paterson. The children of Paterson deserve better. You're lying to them. Every time you send an HIB finding letter out, you're lying to them. It must stop today. Our children deserve better than what you're doing.

Ms. Kimbilee Jonas: Good evening. My name is Kimbilee Jonas and I'm here representing the community as well as concerned family members in the community. I have two things that I would like to share, piggybacking off the bullying situation. I have three nieces and nephews that currently attend School No. 30, where we lost a student. I reached out to the district via email and phone looking into what's the bullying policy. I wanted to get some information so that my niece and nephews are not the next ones being bullied. I've yet to receive a response from Mr. Best, from anybody actually, about the bullying. They gave me a pamphlet and that was it. I have nieces and nephews at the school and then I was further informed when I was trying to be a part of the PTO that I'm not allowed to be part of the PTO or the action team because I'm not the legal guardian of my nieces and nephews. That's really problematic being that we're now under local control and we're saying we want to be transparent and we want the community to be involved and engaged. Yet you bar community members like myself, stakeholders in the community. I'm a product of the Paterson Public School System. It's not like it's a whole bunch of people in the PTO from the community. You have parents and guardians and people that are concerned, because it does take a village to raise our children, and then you're barring us from attending these meetings. Furthermore, there's a meeting that was brought to my attention called ESSA, Every Student Succeeds Act, and it's to ensure that every student succeeds. I attended this meeting. They tried to bar myself and several other parents from attending this meeting by Ms. Marguerite Sullivan who is the director of the ESSA program. She was saying that we can't come if we're not a parent. This is supposed to be for the community. Again, community engagement, I reached out to community engagement several times. I got the runaround. One person did respond to my email and that was Ms. Susana. She responded and said that she doesn't have the date for the next ESSA meeting because the meeting that we were eventually able to attend after we stood out there and we were barred for about 20 minutes, we were able to attend that meeting. They agreed in the meeting that we would inform the community and the parents so that they could attend these meetings and be at the table when these discussions are being made so that every child can indeed succeed. Yet, I'm still waiting on a date. We're still waiting on a date. A lot of our parents have several jobs trying to make ends meet. They need to know in advance so they can make proper accommodations to attend the meetings. You can't just put it on them at the last minute. You have to give them time. Just like you all have time to plan your meetings and put it on your calendar, you should give our parents and those in this community that same respect and time so that they can be at these meetings and be at the table. Also, when they're calling and emailing you should respond. This whole dismissing the parents and not responding, if it's not on paper, it didn't happen. If we're really trying to have a better Paterson and it's about our children, then we need to really be more transparent and stop lying to the community and stop barring the community, especially those members of the community that are wanting to partner with you to help our children succeed so that every child can indeed succeed in the City of Paterson. Thank you.

Comm. Castillo: It's our custom to answer right after all of the speakers. Just bear with me a few more minutes.

Mr. Sahil Shah: I'm Sahil Shah. I've been in the district for 10 years, three years as a substitute teacher, one and a half years as a practicum student, and five years working as a special education teacher. When I first started here my son was born shortly after. When he was born, he needed a surgery. It was a very important necessary surgery. The way my wife is, we wanted the best of the best. We didn't want to get some second-rate doctor. We needed a doctor who knew what he was talking about. We found a doctor who was a Harvard graduate who specialized in infant and pediatric surgery. He knew exactly what to do. He was specialized in this area. We had no problem with the insurance. We had no problem with anything. A couple of years later my wife got pregnant again. She was in a high-risk pregnancy. We had to see three different doctors that specialized in high-risk pregnancies. They specialized in preeclampsia. They specialized in C-sections and all of that. Again, we had no problem. Now here we are with this new insurance company and my wife, who is having some difficulties, we go to the gynecologist and he says, "I'm sorry, ma'am. It looks like the insurance is cut off to a certain point." We call the insurance companies. We don't know what in the world they're talking about. They transfer us from one office to another office. They act like they don't know what they're talking about. I'm going to speak to a lot of the men here because a lot of the men just like me have wives at home. If they're like me, we love our wives and children very much. My two boys are everything for me. My wife is everything for me. I do not want to see my wife suffer with health problems. I don't want to see my son go through another surgery and have to find a second-rate doctor because the doctor cannot accept our insurance. I don't want to kill my younger baby because the doctor says we have to go to some second-rate doctor who has no knowledge about this area. I went through that and the doctor said he's not an expert in this. Change it, please.

It was moved by Comm. Redmon, seconded by Comm. Ramirez that the Public Comments portion of the meeting be closed. On roll call all members voted in the affirmative. The motion carried.

Ms. Shafer: On the School No. 27 bullying, I was going back and forth over the weekend with Sandra Diodonet, the Assistant Superintendent. Ms. Diodonet, if you would just meet with Erica so she's up to date with what is going on at School No. 27 since she does have permission to talk about it from the parent. As far as cleaning up vomit, this is the first time that I'm hearing about it. We will certainly look into that. As far as the suspension center, let me just explain what that's about. I don't believe in out-of-school-suspension because we send children home anywhere from five to ten days. They're playing games, sleeping, watching television, and out on the street. I'm trying to get them not to be going home but to be in a center receiving counseling, socioemotional and mental health training, group counseling, as well as their academics. That's what the out-of-school-suspension hub is all about. This is the planning year and we will have more information forthcoming. In addition to that, I continue to work with parents. I call parents back. I email them back. I meet with them. I will continue to do that. Thank you, Madam President.

RESOLUTIONS FOR A VOTE:

Resolution No. 1

Whereas, the Paterson Public School District approves the payment of bills and claims dated January 22, 2019, beginning with check number 214699 and ending with check

number 215076, and direct deposit number 287 and ending with 299, in the amount of \$9,086,493.18;

Be It Resolved, that each claim or demand has been fully itemized, verified and has been duly audited as required by law in accordance with N.J.S.A. 18A:19-2.

It was moved by Comm. Redmon, seconded by Comm. Ramirez that Resolution No. 1 be adopted. On roll call all members voted in the affirmative. The motion carried.

Paterson Board of Education Standing Abstentions

Comm. Capers

- Self
- 4th and Inches
- Westside Park Group
- Florio Management Company (ACES Program receives donations)

Comm. Castillo

- Self
- Passaic County
- Scholastic/Jordan (Transportation)

Comm. Hodges

- Self
- Jumpstart
- City of Paterson

Comm. Martinez

- Self
- New Jersey Community Development Corporation (NJCDC)

Comm. Ramirez

- Self
- Berkeley College

Comm. Redmon

- Self
- Historic Preservation of the City of Paterson
- County of Passaic

Comm. Simmons

- Self
- Family

Ms. Jonas: When is the ESSA meeting being scheduled?

Ms. Shafer: We'll get the schedule out. I don't know offhand, but I'll talk to Ms. Sullivan and we'll get it on our website.

Ms. Jonas: You said you respond to emails. I sent an email to you and Ms. Sullivan and I didn't get a response.

Ms. Shafer: I did forward it and I'm going to go back and find out who I forwarded it to and follow up with them.

Ms. Jonas: But you didn't respond to me. You said you respond to parents in the community.

Ms. Shafer: I do. I didn't have the information. I don't run the ESSA meetings. I forwarded it on.

Ms. Jonas: This was in December.

Ms. Shafer: We'll get it to you.

Resolution No. 2

WHEREAS, on March 15, 2007, the State of New Jersey adopted P.L.2007, c.53, *An Act Concerning School District Accountability*, also known as Assembly Bill 5 (A5), and

WHEREAS, Bill A5, N.J.S.A. 18A:11-12(3)f, requires that conferences/workshops have prior approval by a majority of the full voting membership of the board of education, and

WHEREAS, pursuant to N.J.S.A. 18A:11-12(2)s, an employee or member of the board of education who travels in violation of the school district's policy or this section shall be required to reimburse the school district in an amount equal to three times the cost associated with attending the event, now therefore

BE IT RESOLVED, that the Board of Education approves attendance of conferences/workshops for the dates and amounts listed for staff members and/or Board members on the attached and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that final authorization for attendance at conferences/workshops will be confirmed at the time a purchase order is issued.

STAFF MEMBER	CONFERENCE	DATE	AMOUNT
Lance Gaines	CE Union	March 1, 2019	\$95.00 (registration)
Purchasing Agent/Purchasing Department	Saddle Brook, NJ		
Sobeida Escorcía	National Association of Bilingual Education	March 6-10, 2019	\$2,438.52 (registration, transportation, lodging, meals)
Teacher/BTMF @ JFK	Lake Buena Vista, FL		
Jorge V. Osoria	National Association of Bilingual Education	March 6-10, 2019	\$2,438.52 (registration, transportation, lodging, meals)
Principal/BTMF @ JFK	Lake Buena Vista, FL		
Any Vargas	National Association of Bilingual Education	March 6-10, 2019	\$2,438.52 (registration, transportation, lodging, meals)
Teacher/BTMF @ JFK	Lake Buena Vista, FL		

Susette Chavez	University of Puerto Rico Job Fair	March 11-15, 2019	\$2,180.00 (registration, transportation, lodging, meals)
Supervisor/Human Capital Services	San Juan, Puerto Rico		
Karen Dever	University of Puerto Rico Job Fair	March 11-15, 2019	\$2,180.00 (registration, transportation, lodging, meals)
Director/Human Capital Services	San Juan, Puerto Rico		
Sandra Diodonet	University of Puerto Rico Job Fair	March 11-15, 2019	\$2,484.78 (registration, transportation, lodging, meals)
Assistant Superintendent	San Juan, Puerto Rico		
Lourdes Garcia	University of Puerto Rico Job Fair	March 11-15, 2019	\$2,180.00 (registration, transportation, lodging, meals)
Director/Bilingual & ESL	San Juan, Puerto Rico		
Licerda Munoz	University of Puerto Rico Job Fair	March 11-15, 2019	\$2,180.00 (registration, transportation, lodging, meals)
Staff Recruiter/Human Capital Services	San Juan, Puerto Rico		
Susana Peron	University of Puerto Rico Job Fair	March 11-15, 2019	\$2,484.78 (registration, transportation, lodging, meals)
Deputy Superintendent	San Juan, Puerto Rico		
Eric Crespo	Tri-State Project Based Learning Summit 2019	March 12, 2019	\$183.76 (registration, transportation)
Associate Chief Academic Officer	New Brunswick, NJ		
Mary Castillo	Infinite Campus Interchange NYC 2019	March 19-20, 2019	\$449.00 (registration)
Data Management Specialist/MIS	New York, NY		
Maudellyn Kimbrough	Infinite Campus Interchange NYC 2019	March 19-20, 2019	\$615.04 (registration, transportation)
Director/MIS	New York, NY		
Lenny Moore	Infinite Campus Interchange NYC 2019	March 19-20, 2019	\$449.00 (registration)
Deputy Director/MIS	New York, NY		
Frank Pajuelo	Infinite Campus Interchange NYC 2019	March 19-20, 2019	\$449.00 (registration)
Data Management Specialist/MIS	New York, NY		
Emanuel Capers	2019 NSBA Annual Conference	March 30 – April 1, 2019	\$2,969.50 (registration, transportation, lodging, meals)
Board Member	Philadelphia, PA		

Jonathan Hodges	2019 NSBA Annual Conference	March 30 – April 1, 2019	\$2,849.37 (registration, transportation, lodging, meals)
Board Member	Philadelphia, PA		
Nakima Redmon	2019 NSBA Annual Conference	March 30 – April 1, 2019	\$3,051.36 (registration, transportation, lodging, meals)
Board Vice President	Philadelphia, PA		
Teresa Afonso	Employee Safety and Safety Course – Rutgers	April 6, 13 & 27, 2019 May 4, 11 & 18, 2019	\$670.00 (registration)
Supervisor/Transportation	New Brunswick, NJ		

TOTAL CONFERENCES: 19
TOTAL AMOUNT: \$32,786.15

It was moved by Comm. Redmon, seconded by Comm. Martinez that Resolution No. 2 be adopted. On roll call all members voted as follows:

Comm. Capers: Yes, but I abstain on my name.

Comm. Martinez: Yes.

Comm. Olivares: Yes, but I abstain on my name.

Comm. Ramirez: Yes, and I abstain from anything that has to do with my name.

Comm. Redmon: Yes, and I abstain from anything having to do with my name.

Comm. Rondon: Yes, but I abstain from anything that has to do with my name.

Comm. Simmons: Yes, abstaining from anything that has to do with my name.

Comm. Castillo: Yes.

The motion carried.

Paterson Board of Education Standing Abstentions

Comm. Capers

- Self
- 4th and Inches
- Westside Park Group
- Florio Management Company (ACES Program receives donations)

Comm. Castillo

- Self
- Passaic County
- Scholastic/Jordan (Transportation)

Comm. Hodges

- Self
- Jumpstart

- City of Paterson

Comm. Martinez

- Self
- New Jersey Community Development Corporation (NJCDC)

Comm. Ramirez

- Self
- Berkeley College

Comm. Redmon

- Self
- Historic Preservation of the City of Paterson
- County of Passaic

Comm. Simmons

- Self
- Family

Resolution No. 3

Whereas, the Board of Education and the State District Superintendent support N.J.S.A. 18A:37 – et. Seq. by prohibiting acts of harassment, intimidation, or bullying of our students grades Pre-K thru 12. A safe and caring environment in school is necessary for pupils to learn and achieve high academic standards, and

Whereas, Harassment, Intimidation, or Bullying (HIB) means any gesture, any written, verbal or physical act, or any electronic communication, as defined in N.J.S.A. 18A:37-14, whether it be a single incident or a series of incidents, and

Whereas, the law requires a thorough and complete investigation to be conducted for each report of an alleged incident of harassment, intimidation or bullying, and

Whereas, the chief school administrator shall report the results of each investigation to the board of education no later than the date of the regularly scheduled board of education meeting following the completion of the investigation, and

Whereas, the chief school administrator's report also shall include information on any consequences imposed under the student code of conduct, intervention services provided, counseling ordered, training established or other action taken or recommended by the chief school administrator, and

Whereas, at the regularly scheduled board of education meeting following its receipt of the report or following a hearing in executive session, the board shall issue a decision, in writing, to affirm, reject, or modify the chief school administrator's decision,

Now Therefore, Be It Resolved, that the Board of Education has reviewed the HIB investigations for the month of December 2018 in which there were a total of 38 investigations reported, 24 being confirmed bullying incidents requiring consequences, and

Be It Further Resolved, that the Board of Education affirms the chief school administrator's decision in accordance with the law.

It was moved by Comm. Redmon, seconded by Comm. Simmons that Resolution No. 3 be adopted. On roll call all members voted in the affirmative. The motion carried.

**Paterson Board of Education
Standing Abstentions**

Comm. Capers

- Self
- 4th and Inches
- Westside Park Group
- Florio Management Company (ACES Program receives donations)

Comm. Castillo

- Self
- Passaic County
- Scholastic/Jordan (Transportation)

Comm. Hodges

- Self
- Jumpstart
- City of Paterson

Comm. Martinez

- Self
- New Jersey Community Development Corporation (NJCDC)

Comm. Ramirez

- Self
- Berkeley College

Comm. Redmon

- Self
- Historic Preservation of the City of Paterson
- County of Passaic

Comm. Simmons

- Self
- Family

Resolution No. 4

WHEREAS, pursuant to N.J.S.A. 18A:7A-49 and N.J.A.C 6A:30-7.2 through 7.4, the New Jersey Department of Education has collaborated with the Paterson Public School District to develop a plan that will fully transition the District to local oversight by the Board of Education, and

WHEREAS, as part of the transition, the Board as well as District leadership must complete ethics training as stated in the plan, and

WHEREAS, the Superintendent of Schools has scheduled a special meeting the purpose of the Board and senior leadership to receive professional development in the areas of ethics training, and

WHEREAS, Dr. Kenneth D. King, educational consultant, has been invited to present at the meeting, to review the laws, regulations and expectations on established ethical standards, now

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the Paterson Public School District approves entering into a consultant agreement with Dr. Kenneth D. King to provide professional development in the area of ethics for Board members and district leadership, during the 2018-2019 school year, at an amount not to exceed \$2,500.00.

It was moved by Comm. Redmon, seconded by Comm. Simmons that Resolution No. 4 be adopted. On roll call all members voted in the affirmative. The motion carried.

Paterson Board of Education Standing Abstentions

Comm. Capers

- Self
- 4th and Inches
- Westside Park Group
- Florio Management Company (ACES Program receives donations)

Comm. Castillo

- Self
- Passaic County
- Scholastic/Jordan (Transportation)

Comm. Hodges

- Self
- Jumpstart
- City of Paterson

Comm. Martinez

- Self
- New Jersey Community Development Corporation (NJCDC)

Comm. Ramirez

- Self
- Berkeley College

Comm. Redmon

- Self
- Historic Preservation of the City of Paterson
- County of Passaic

Comm. Simmons

- Self
- Family

Resolution No. 5

The National Winter Activity Center/Elev8/DEVELOP

Whereas, The Paterson Public Schools Strategic Plan, District Priority III: Family and Community Engagement Goal 4- Partnership with Community Organizations, Agencies and Institutions. This partnership will contribute to building a partnership with community organization, and;

Whereas, The National Winter Activity Center or “The Center”, is the nation’s first youth-only 501(c)(3) nonprofit facility dedicated to improving the lives of youth through winter activity.

Whereas, the Center’s winter activity program, offers youth the opportunities to master Alpine, Nordic skiing and snowboarding skills and shape their development as young men and women. Elev8/LEARN introduces winter activity in its various forms serving youth organizations across the nation;

Whereas, Elev8/DEVELOP introduces young skiers to a race program, all mountain skiing and builds on skiing fundamentals; while Elev8/COMPETE continues competition development of athletes in a comprehensive environment at The Center.

Whereas, The Elev8Program, has been recognized as progressive and innovative with competition programs that are concerned and attentive to the health and welfare of the athletes by receiving Podium Club Certification at the Bronze Level by U.S. Ski & Snowboard.

Whereas, the Paterson Public Schools, supports and encourages that Schools 12, 28, Edward Kilpatrick, New Roberto Clemente, Roberto Clemente and Urban Leadership Academy partner with organizations like the National Winter Activity Center as a way to improve student achievement. And;

Whereas, the National Winter Activity Center has invited 549 participants from the aforementioned schools to participate in their winter program from February 2019-June 28, 2019.

Therefore Be It Resolved, that the Paterson School District approves this donation/partnership of services from National Winter Activity Center as an educational opportunity where student contribution shall be \$25 per participant at a total cost not to exceed \$13,725 for 549 participants.

It was moved by Comm. Redmon, seconded by Comm. Simmons that Resolution No. 5 be adopted. On roll call all members voted in the affirmative. The motion carried.

Paterson Board of Education Standing Abstentions

Comm. Capers

- Self
- 4th and Inches
- Westside Park Group
- Florio Management Company (ACES Program receives donations)

Comm. Castillo

- Self
- Passaic County
- Scholastic/Jordan (Transportation)

Comm. Hodges

- Self
- Jumpstart
- City of Paterson

Comm. Martinez

- Self
- New Jersey Community Development Corporation (NJCDC)

Comm. Ramirez

- Self
- Berkeley College

Comm. Redmon

- Self
- Historic Preservation of the City of Paterson
- County of Passaic

Comm. Simmons

- Self
- Family

Resolution No. 6

Whereas, the District's Brighter Futures Strategic Plan's Priority II: Safe, Caring and Orderly Schools; Goal 7: Facilities are clean and safe and meet 21st Century learning standards will be supported by the acceptance of a generous donation of office furniture from Coldwell Bank, located at 410 Valley Road, Wayne, New Jersey, and

Whereas, the donation of furniture will be used throughout the district, where necessary, and

Whereas, accepting this donation will contribute to the enhancement of the culture and climate, and

Therefore, Be It Resolved, that the Paterson Public School District Board of Education acknowledges and accepts the generous donation of furniture from Coldwell Bank, located at 410 Valley Road, Wayne, New Jersey.

It was moved by Comm. Martinez, seconded by Comm. Simmons that Resolution No. 6 be adopted. On roll call all members voted in the affirmative. The motion carried.

Paterson Board of Education Standing Abstentions

Comm. Capers

- Self
- 4th and Inches
- Westside Park Group
- Florio Management Company (ACES Program receives donations)

Comm. Castillo

- Self
- Passaic County
- Scholastic/Jordan (Transportation)

Comm. Hodges

- Self
- Jumpstart
- City of Paterson

Comm. Martinez

- Self
- New Jersey Community Development Corporation (NJCDC)

Comm. Ramirez

- Self
- Berkeley College

Comm. Redmon

- Self
- Historic Preservation of the City of Paterson
- County of Passaic

Comm. Simmons

- Self
- Family

Resolution No. 7

WHEREAS, the intention of the New Jersey Quality Single Accountability Continuum (NJQSAC) is to assure compliance with the statutes and regulations that govern schools and districts in New Jersey and to lead the school community into reflection on the performance of its students and revisions of its practices, and

WHEREAS, the vision and mission of the Paterson Public School District is to be a leader in educating New Jersey's urban youth, and to prepare each student to be successful in the institution of higher education of their choosing and in their chosen career, and

WHEREAS, in accordance with NJQSAC, the board's annual review of the Chief School Administrator is based on the adoption of goals and performance measurement that reflect that highest priority is given to student achievement and attention to subgroup achievement, and

WHEREAS, the Board of Education approved five (5) major District Goals at the November 7, 2018, meeting, and

WHEREAS, the Superintendent would like to include the completion of the 2019-2024 Five Year Strategic Plan as an additional goal, and

WHEREAS, the six (6) major District Goals formulated in collaboration with the Board of Education will be:

Goal 1: Maintain increased enrollment, achievement & teacher capacity in Advanced

- Placement (AP) courses (Increases: Enrollment by 25%, increase the course offering by 30% and students achieving a qualifying score of 3 or greater by 25%)
- Goal 2: Increase by 8.5% the number of students meeting the performance indicator in English Language Arts (ELA) and Mathematics in New Jersey Student Learning Assessment (PARCC)
- Goal 3: To ensure ADA compliance (elevators) at JFK Complex and ensure accessibility and safety for students, staff and the community
- Goal 4: Increase student high school graduation rate by 2% for the 2018-2019 school year. Decrease the number of students graduating via the Portfolio Process by 5%
- Goal 5: To monitor the environment within the MDF at Eastside High School to avoid interruption or malfunction of the service
- Goal 6: The Five Year Strategic Plan will be completed, Board approved and ready for implementation July 1, 2019

NOW THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the Board of Education adopts the amended District Goals for the 2018-2019 school year which include goals/strategies, the person(s) accountable to complete the goal, and indicators of success in completing the goals as outlined in the attached charts.

It was moved by Comm. Redmon, seconded by Comm. Olivares that Resolution No. 7 be adopted.

Comm. Capers: Which goals and strategies are they?

Comm. Castillo: Ms. Shafer is adding one on.

Ms. Shafer: I added the five-year strategic plan.

Comm. Capers: Okay. Thank you.

On roll call all members voted in the affirmative. The motion carried.

Paterson Board of Education Standing Abstentions

Comm. Capers

- Self
- 4th and Inches
- Westside Park Group
- Florio Management Company (ACES Program receives donations)

Comm. Castillo

- Self
- Passaic County
- Scholastic/Jordan (Transportation)

Comm. Hodges

- Self
- Jumpstart
- City of Paterson

Comm. Martinez

- Self
- New Jersey Community Development Corporation (NJCDC)

Comm. Ramirez

- Self
- Berkeley College

Comm. Redmon

- Self
- Historic Preservation of the City of Paterson
- County of Passaic

Comm. Simmons

- Self
- Family

Resolution No. 8

Whereas, The State District Superintendent recommends the appointment, salary adjustments, transfers, leave of absence approvals, dismissals contract renewals of tenured and non-tenured employees which supports the Brighter Futures Strategies Plan for 2009-2014 which amongst its strategies goals is Priority I-Effective Academic Programs- Goal 1 – Increase Student Achievement; and

Whereas, the advisory Board of the Paterson Public School District has reviewed the recommendation of the State District Superintendent; and

Whereas, the advisory Board of the Paterson Board of Education has made comments as appropriate; and

Whereas, the advisory Board of Paterson Board of Education communicated its expectations that such recommendations are made on a timely basis and include the proposed appointment, transfer, removal or renewal of tenured and non-tenured, certificated and non-certificated personnel in compliance with contractual and/or statutory requirements; NOW,

Therefore, Be it Resolved, the advisory Board of the Paterson Board of Education acknowledges reviewing and making comments based on the personnel recommendations of the State District Superintendent adopted in the January 22, 2019 Board meeting.

It was moved by Comm. Redmon, seconded by Comm. Martinez that Resolution No. 8 be adopted. On roll call all members voted in the affirmative. The motion carried.

Paterson Board of Education Standing Abstentions

Comm. Capers

- Self
- 4th and Inches
- Westside Park Group
- Florio Management Company (ACES Program receives donations)

Comm. Castillo

- Self
- Passaic County

- Scholastic/Jordan (Transportation)

Comm. Hodges

- Self
- Jumpstart
- City of Paterson

Comm. Martinez

- Self
- New Jersey Community Development Corporation (NJCDC)

Comm. Ramirez

- Self
- Berkeley College

Comm. Redmon

- Self
- Historic Preservation of the City of Paterson
- County of Passaic

Comm. Simmons

- Self
- Family

Resolution No. 9

Whereas, the Paterson Public School District's Strategic Plan Priority III: is creating and maintaining healthy school cultures by goal 3: expanding partnerships with community organizations, agencies and institutions;

Whereas, the Paterson Public School District is in favor of developing and supporting relationships with the Girl Scouts of Northern New Jersey; and

Whereas, the District supports that PANTHER students partake in the Career Girl Networking Forum. The goal of the Forum is to expose girls to a broad spectrum of careers by developing networking, communication and interviewing skills. Thirty (30) girls will partake in a speed networking process with thirty (30) professional women who include but are not limited to doctors, lawyers, forensic scientist, computer experts, and nurses.

Therefore Be It Resolved, that the Paterson Board of Education will allow that the Career Girl Networking Forum occur at PANTHER Academy on Thursday, January 31, 2019 at no cost to the District.

It was moved by Comm. Redmon, seconded by Comm. Capers that Resolution No. 9 be adopted. On roll call all members voted in the affirmative. The motion carried.

Paterson Board of Education Standing Abstentions

Comm. Capers

- Self
- 4th and Inches

- Westside Park Group
- Florio Management Company (ACES Program receives donations)

Comm. Castillo

- Self
- Passaic County
- Scholastic/Jordan (Transportation)

Comm. Hodges

- Self
- Jumpstart
- City of Paterson

Comm. Martinez

- Self
- New Jersey Community Development Corporation (NJCDC)

Comm. Ramirez

- Self
- Berkeley College

Comm. Redmon

- Self
- Historic Preservation of the City of Paterson
- County of Passaic

Comm. Simmons

- Self
- Family

OTHER BUSINESS

It was moved by Comm. Ramirez, seconded by Comm. Simmons that the Board goes into executive session to discuss:

1. Garcia v. Paterson

On roll call all members voted in the affirmative. The motion carried.

The Board went into executive session at 8:15 p.m.

The Board reconvened the meeting at 8:33 p.m.

It was moved by Comm. Redmon, seconded by Comm. Martinez that the meeting be adjourned. On roll call all members voted in the affirmative. The motion carried.

The meeting was adjourned at 8:34 p.m.