

# **MINUTES OF THE PATERSON BOARD OF EDUCATION BOARD RETREAT**

March 27, 2019 – 6:10 p.m.  
Administrative Offices

Presiding: Comm. Oshin Castillo, President

Present:

Ms. Eileen Shafer, Superintendent of Schools  
Ms. Susana Peron, Deputy Superintendent

\*Comm. Emanuel Capers  
\*Comm. Jonathan Hodges  
\*Comm. Manuel Martinez  
Comm. Eddy Olivares

Comm. Joel Ramirez  
Comm. Nakima Redmon, Vice President  
Comm. Robinson Rondon  
Comm. Kenneth Simmons

The Salute to the Flag was led by Comm. Castillo.

Comm. Ramirez read the Open Public Meetings Act:

The New Jersey Open Public Meetings Act was enacted to insure the right of the public to have advance notice of, and to attend the meetings of the Paterson Public School District, as well as other public bodies at which any business affecting the interest of the public is discussed or acted upon.

In accordance with the provisions of this law, the Paterson Public School District has caused notice of this meeting:

**Board Retreat  
March 27, 2019 at 5:30 p.m.  
Administrative Offices  
90 Delaware Avenue  
Paterson, New Jersey**

to be published by having the date, time and place posted in the office of the City Clerk of the City of Paterson, at the entrance of the Paterson Public School offices, on the district's website, and by sending notice of the meeting to the Arab Voice, El Diario, the Italian Voice, the North Jersey Herald & News, and The Record.

Comm. Castillo: Why don't we begin with the Superintendent's Update and then we'll take a little trip over to the other Executive Room.

## **SUPERINTENDENT UPDATE**

Ms. Shafer: I gave you the strategic plan update. We had our first meeting on March 14. It was at Eastside High School. We had childcare and dinner. We had over 100 community members, parents, and teachers attend. New Jersey School Board's Kathy Helewa and Charlene Peterson are the two consultants who are helping us with the strategic plan. I included in your packet the State of the District Address, which are our strengths and weaknesses. I presented that at the first meeting and that was pretty

much the springboard of what the community, parents, and those that were there discussed with the New Jersey School Boards. New Jersey School Boards also did their 3D Strategic Planning PowerPoint. They went through the process so that everyone that was present would understand the process. I also included the agenda and the committee work from the first meeting, March 14. Our next meeting, and you're all welcome to join us, is April 9 at John F. Kennedy High School at 6:00 p.m. The third meeting is May 6 at International at 6:00 p.m. Everything is attached for your review. If you want to see the process in motion, I would come to the April 9 meeting at Kennedy. Are there any questions?

Comm. Castillo: It's April 9<sup>th</sup>, right?

Ms. Shafer: Yes.

Comm. Castillo: What time?

\*Comm. Capers enters the meeting at 6:15 p.m.

Ms. Shafer: 6:00 p.m. I also gave you my testimony. I testified last Wednesday at NJIT and again today at the Assembly. A couple of Board members came. I want to thank you for being there. We also brought today over 100 teachers and parents. We had four buses that went down. Benjie Wimberly was part of the Assembly. We had teachers speak, I spoke, the Board President spoke, and a parent spoke. Everyone did a really good job in getting our point across about being underfunded and not being able to make the cuts that are in the budget this year. I reiterated to them that over the past eight years with the previous administration in Trenton we cut 526 staff members. If you add the 232 this year, you're up to 758. We can't sustain this. It's not a thorough and efficient education for our kids. It's a disservice to our students and our community. Everything that we have been planning and doing has been increasing student achievement, which is a big component of the two-year transition plan. Yet, they're going to take away all of the supports, programming, and staff, but still hold us accountable for that two-year transition plan. Those were some of the highlights, but I gave you the testimony that you can read. I am hopeful after today as I was watching the Assembly folks listen. They were a little surprised that our children didn't have art and music. They were surprised that we would be cutting 758 positions. They were surprised that we don't have science labs that are operational and a lot of our buildings are over 100 years old. You can see as we talked about different things, people seemed to be a little surprised that was the case. Again, thank the Board members for coming and stay tuned. We're going to continue to stick together and fight for what's right for our children. In addition to that, I also gave you a flyer about our ESIP program. On Friday at 10:00 at School No. 9 they are rolling out the solar project. That's at 10:00 on Friday. That's our update of where we are. Are there any questions?

Comm. Castillo: Let's go over to the other conference room so we can go through the process. We'll have Ms. Rand and Ms. Lee explain it to us a little better. We're going to have some Board restoration.

\*Comm. Hodges and Comm. Martinez enter the meeting at 6:20 p.m.

## **RESTORATIVE CIRCLE**

The Board went into a Restorative Circle in Conference Room C, conducted by Ms. Rosie Grant, at 6:25 p.m.

The Board reconvened in the Executive Conference Room at 8:00 p.m.

## **BILINGUAL EDUCATION**

Ms. Peron: You have a copy of my PowerPoint. Then you have two other handouts. You can't really read the program types, so I made a copy for you as a handout. It's the one with all the little lines. Elementary school is on one side and high school is on the other. The stapled document is the guideline from NJDOE about the different types of programs. When I talk about the different types of programs, instead of explaining them to you, I provided this so you can read it.

Comm. Castillo: I just want to cut in as we're all settling in. My watch died. I don't even know what time it is.

Ms. Peron: It's 8:00 o'clock.

Comm. Castillo: I know some of us have been up extra early and we had the bilingual and the High School Review. A suggestion is that we just do the bilingual and schedule another retreat so that we can be effective to go and speak about the High School Review. We also have a few other subjects that the Superintendent wanted to pack everything onto for tonight. We were able to make a few changes. I wanted to know if it was okay with everyone for us to just go through this, call it quits tonight, and then schedule another retreat where we can really dive into the high school, data assessment, and there was something else...

Ms. Peron: And progress towards the district goals.

Comm. Hodges: Is this part of the strategic planning program? That should be facilitated in a very particular way.

Comm. Castillo: Correct, and Madam Superintendent let me know if I'm wrong. She gave us an update on the strategic planning and what she has done. Then we would have to go in and have a conversation because you have two...

Ms. Shafer: There are two more meetings, April 9 and another one in May.

Comm. Hodges: We need to have a longer conversation about strategic planning and how it works. We're supposed to be putting together ideas in conjunction with the community.

Ms. Shafer: That happened at the first meeting. School Boards ran it and I went through a whole State of the District Address. It's a PowerPoint that's attached in your packet. Then the School Boards went into their first meeting with the community with over 100 parents and community members there. That was the first meeting. The second meeting, and everyone is welcome to come and participate, is where they now move into other areas. And then she has a third meeting where they do some more work. So there's a lot of committee work going on in these three meetings and the Board is more than welcome to be there.

Comm. Hodges: The Board has an obligation to be more than just welcome. It has an obligation to do part of that work and I don't see that happening, which is my concern. The Board needs to be at the forefront of this because it's their strategic plan, not yours.

Ms. Shafer: Not mine? I just put together...

Comm. Hodges: The reason why I'm saying that is because the Board is not ??? of its' responsibilities.

Ms. Shafer: You are more than welcome to come to the meetings and you have the dates now.

\*Comm. Capers leaves the meeting at 8:03 p.m.

Comm. Castillo: The idea is to center a retreat around this so we can actually dive into what's going on that's better than 8:00 p.m. We have two big topics – that one and the High School Review. If you see that binder, it's insane so it's definitely going to take us longer to have that conversation. So if it's okay with everyone we can proceed. Cheryl, tomorrow we'll set some dates up for the Board so we can pick another date to go over the other things. Thank you.

Ms. Peron: Let me just tell you that the PowerPoint is two-sided so that I saved some paper so you'll have to flip it to follow it. I'm going to do my best. It is a lot of information and it's detailed. At times, I may go fast but you can stop me. We all know what Bilingual Education is. You know it is guided through the Civil Rights Act and it is also in administrative code in New Jersey. It defines what programs should be of assistance for our schools with English Language Learners, and it's divided into three groups. Some districts have small ELL (English Language Learners). Just think – you're an English Language Learner because you don't speak the language. There are small ELL populations so then they've come up with alternatives to fulltime programs. I'll talk to you a little bit about that, and then I'll talk about fulltime programs. By law, if a population of 20 or more students in any single language group is present in the district, we are required to provide a fulltime bilingual program for ELLs in that language group. What happens is sometimes we have 20 kids that are of the same language group and we might not have a teacher who speaks that language. So the way we get around that, and it's written in code and sanctioned by New Jersey, is that the district asks for a waiver. We have to put in a waiver and explain our situation, whether it's a hard to fill position or whether we have no one that's certified or whether we don't have the facilities. Different items go into that waiver, but every year we do submit waivers because there are things that we cannot do in the district. The types of programs, and you have this in your packet, for small populations you would have English Language Services or English as a Second Language, ESL. You'll notice it has an asterisk because all of these programs, whether they're alternative or fulltime or small, have ESL always. In ESL, English as a Second Language, the teacher doesn't speak the native language sometimes. That teacher can be an English teacher. You can go to school, become a teacher, and get a certification to teach ESL. It's an endorsement and a certificate and you use the English language as a means of instruction all the time. ESL teachers have different strategies to communicate to the students. They'll use what we call TPR, Total Physical Response. They use a lot of visual queues and they scaffold the learning to where they child is. They use meaningful queues in their instruction so that the child is learning. This is the handout that you have because I'm known to do these charts and they're very, very small. So you do have the chart and it is kind of small, but it's a little bit better. What I did for you was I outlined the different types of programs throughout the district. Here's our Arabic language. Here are our elementary schools. These are the different types of programs that the Arabic speakers in the district have. They have high intensity ESL and they have a bilingual part-time. A bilingual part-time is when they have a teacher who speaks Arabic but she pulls them out of the class or goes into the class and gives them content area learning, English language arts or math. She provides that to them part-time. She can't do it all the time

because there are more kids and not enough teachers. Those children also receive ESL all the time. Here are all the different bilingual programs that we offer for our Bengali speakers and here are the different schools that the Bengali speakers are in. You can follow the chart by language, by school, and by program. Here are the Spanish speakers and here is every elementary school that has a child that speaks Spanish in it. As you can see, we have tutorial, sheltered instruction, fulltime bilingual, high intensity ESL, and bilingual resource. All these kids get something different because it's by number, it's by grade level, it's by the teacher that's available, and everybody receives ESL. We do have a bilingual part-time Turkish program at School No. 9. So School No. 9 has Arabic, Bengali, Spanish, Turkish, and other. There are some other languages and I'll talk to you about what some of those languages in our district are. Here are the programs continued in the elementary and then in the high school. As you can see, in the high school we have Arabic at the different academies. We have Bengali almost in all of our high schools. We have Spanish in all our high schools. There are no Turkish and no other languages spoken that need assistance in bilingual education. You can refer back to this chart when I talk to you about the funding in each school so we can get a feel for what it is. What I tried to do was a synopsis of that entire chart for you so you could summarize it better visually the types of programs throughout the district. For our Spanish speakers, these are all the programs. We have a total of 61 programs. In Arabic, we have a total of 6 programs. In Turkish, we have a total of 2 programs. In Bengali, we have a total of 11 programs. For other languages, we have a total of 8 programs. In the high school, you can see that we have 33 Arabic, Bengali, and Spanish high intensity programs. Our majority of programs are in Spanish because we have most of the speakers in Spanish, but you will see that we have Bengali, Arabic and Turkish. That's what the chart on the other side says. You asked what the primary languages are of our ELL students so we put together all the different languages that we have in the district. I'll show you another slide that says districtwide we have 43 different languages represented. In our ELL population we have 24 different languages represented. These are all the different languages that we have and we collect this data through registration when kids come in with their families. We survey them. We ask what primary language is spoken at home and there's a form they have to fill out. Sometimes someone like me would say my primary language at home when I was a kid was Spanish, but now my primary language is English but I speak Spanish and I speak 50/50 at home. Parents go through that but then we ask what they speak the majority of the time. When you speak to your child, what language do you speak to your child in? Are you speaking to them in Turkish? Do you give them the directions to follow in Turkish? Do you read to them? Do they hear Turkish? Then they fill it out and sign it and that's when we identify a kid as an ELL and we test them and go through the process. All of them are represented here – every school and every language. I did a synopsis for you, like I said. 14,000 of our kids in the district, of the approximate 28,000, have a different language going on in their life. Forty-three different languages are represented in the district. Of the English Language Learners, the kids that are in bilingual programs, we have almost 5,000 now. I gave you a report in January that said we had 4,800 and now we have 4,995. They represent 24 languages and here we broke it down. So we have 282 children who speak Arabic, 341 who speak Bengali, 4,273 who speak Spanish, and 78 speak other languages. Here are the totals so you can see. I actually talked to MIS this week and I asked for the most current numbers that we have for ELL and it's up to 4,995. In January we had 110 less kids. So it's there. You asked what our ELL ethnicities look like so we broke it down by schools as well and you can see. This ethnicity comes from these parents reporting this. So I'm not looking at you and telling you what I think your ethnic background is. They are actually reporting it to us. Some people define their ethnicity differently. Multiracial is something that's coming up now more and more, and they identify with that ethnicity. You have that information here by school. You asked what

our teacher demographics were so we broke it down and these are the bilingual teachers that teach the ELLs. Here are all the teacher titles that we have in the district and you'll see that we have ESL and I included teacher of world language. World language is a type of program, but you don't have to be an ELL student in high school. You have to take two years of world language as a graduation requirement and colleges look at that too. So you have to have two years of a foreign language. We have Spanish, Arabic... We used to have French but French is dying out as a world language. In Paterson I have to say we have one teacher left. We used to have a bigger French program, but it has diminished. And we have Mandarin as a world language as well. The 46 world language teachers are included in this total, which is 271, but I left them out from here because here I'm only looking at the ELL teachers. I've broken down by demographics and by language spoken how many teachers we have that speak Arabic and English, and that teach Arabic and English. Some of these Arabic teachers teach ESL as a class too. Here are their salaries in total. This is what we're spending on Bengali teachers. We have a Bengali teacher that teaches ESL here. She is an ESL teacher so that's her salary. We're spending \$7 million on ESL teachers. We have \$4 million for Spanish. You can total this and this because these are Spanish and English teachers as well. It's about \$7.1 million. We have a grand total of \$15.9 million that we're paying out to teachers right now and I've broken it down so that you can see that the majority of the money is being spent on the Spanish teachers teaching Spanish because the majority of children are Spanish speakers. How do we identify our students? I talked to you a little bit about this in other meetings. When they come in to register we look at the different multiple measures of how we identify English Language Learners. We screen them with a home language survey. And then we have to keep probing. How much Spanish do they speak? Do they understand any English? So we test them with a screener that places them with an oral language proficiency level and then we look at student records, years in the country, and all of those things. Then we will look at all of that information, decipher some of this (previous academic performance, teacher referrals and recommendations, etc.), and we place them into a bilingual program. We have different types of special programs that we have in bilingual education because, as I said to you, we have all the programs in here and they are spelled out and you can see what each of them do, but then we have some special programs in bilingual education which are a part of bilingual education as well in other districts. We have a dual language program at EWK. We started in Pre-K and we are up to third grade this year and moving into fourth grade. There is a registration process. There is an application process. Parents have to interview and come to the meeting, and I will talk to you a little bit about them. Here are all the different programs. You may have heard of the ACES program. We have about 17 students in ACES, which is really for overaged elementary kids that don't quite fit in an eighth grade at an elementary school. They look more like a high schooler, but they are overaged and really not at the high school level. They're like 15 but at the seventh grade level. Those are the kids that we're kind of targeting to be in the Newcomers program because they're in that position. They've been in their country and came over at 16, but they have a sixth grade education level. So they can't go into ninth grade, but they can't go into eighth grade because they won't fit in. They're going to feel socially awkward and they're going to look older. So we have some of those students at GOPA at Eastside. We have three magnet schools and I'll talk to you about what magnet schools are. This is the information about Newcomers. The Newcomers program is a strategy. It's a different type of instruction and a different place. It is a place for students who come to this country with interrupted education. They may have been in their country and they may not have gone to school. I'm not just talking about Latin countries for Hispanic countries. I'm talking about Syria too. We have students that are from war-torn countries and they didn't go to school because they couldn't because their country was at war. They have interrupted education and this is a place where it's an

intervention program really. Teachers need to accelerate learning and do it through a modified instructional way. So, kids are going into the fourth grade because of their age, but really they're at a second grade level. Some of our kids can't even hold a pencil. They don't know what the letters of the alphabet are. I'm talking about Newcomers because right now we're servicing the Spanish kids, but we need to service our other language learners too that come as Newcomers and we need to teach them. They all receive English as a Second Language because the goal of Newcomers is not to keep them at Newcomers. It's to acclimate them to this country, to teach them English, and let them learn at an accelerated pace. If we would walk into the classroom we would tell the teacher you're not on Unit II. This is the second marking period so you have to be on Unit II. This teacher might be on Unit I because she has to pace the curriculum a little bit slower. We don't want to water down the curriculum, but present it to them differently. You can see that we started in 2017-2018 with 217 students from fourth grade to eighth grade. Of those 217 students, 130 of them left Newcomers and they may have gone back to their home school. They may have stayed in the bilingual program, but they're not in Newcomers now because they're up to par academically. Here are our numbers for 2018-2019. We went a little further down into the third grade and we added the third grade at School 15. We have the lower grades at School 15 and we have the middle grades at NRC. We started with 244 and it's yet to be determined how many exit because we'll exit them at the end of the year in June. You can see the exits here. We started Newcomers in 2012-2013. We started with 214 and 116 of them exited the program. They get high intensity English. We don't keep them there. We cuddle them, we nurture them, and we give them social support so that they can adapt. We help the families too because the families come and they're not quite sure how an American school system is, the ins and outs of it. So we help families too. We have a guidance counselor at Newcomers because we want to lead these kids into college and we want to get them into careers as well. I just wanted to show you the things we do at Newcomers. We sing. It's like a traditional school. We have language arts, math, physical education, instructional technology, music, art, and developmental ESL, which is a 90-minute high intensity English only class. Here are our magnet schools. What we thought to do was to pool our resources because when you offer fulltime bilingual programs you need to have native instruction and you need to have those teachers. They were scattered one here, one there, and one there, etc. so all the kids weren't getting the services that they needed. So we thought why not create magnet schools where we can pool the resources and get the kids into a native instruction classroom with high intensity ESL. We created one at School 8 and these are what we call our feeder schools. When kids from School 2 enter School 2 and they have a very low proficiency level in English and speak Spanish or another language we test them. We have the teacher recommendations. There is a whole process that we go through and then we send them to School 8. We have transportation for these kids, but it's not door-to-door. It's a shuttle bus that takes them to School 8. Some of them don't have to be bussed because they do live close so that's what we've tried to do. We have School 21. We started with School 8 and School 21 and now we have School 16. Those are our three magnet schools. I talked to you about the dual language program and what we do there. We actually have native English speakers and we have native Spanish speakers, and they partner in the classrooms. So you get instruction in Spanish and you get instruction in English, but you don't stop. You continue learning content. Today, we may be learning about the solar system and we don't go back and learn it all over again. The next day you continue learning about the solar system in Spanish. The goal of that is to have the native English speakers speak Spanish and the native Spanish speakers speak English. It's amazing to see these kids speaking Spanish and vice versa. This is ACES, Academics Community and English Skills. It's an entry classroom for overaged elementary education students. These are our budget allocations. I put in the monies that we spent 2017-2018, 2018-2019, and what we

propose to spend 2019-2020. We have a bilingual department here at central office and they have a small budget, as you can see. It covers contractual travel stipends for supervisors and directors that we are obligated to pay because it's in their contract. Districtwide instructional supplies are like other language dictionaries that we give to the kids as a tool in the classroom, as well as other resources that they may need to provide professional development and things like that. Here in the schools these are the budgets from the schools. This year, \$16.4 million went into bilingual teacher salaries, ESL aid salaries, supplies, textbooks, ESL teachers, and other instructional supplies. I wish I could have broken this down for you and said we bought 500 books for Bengali students and 500 books for Spanish students, but we don't break down the budget like that. We break it down by programs. But you can get an idea when you go back to the schools and you see what types of speakers and programs they have in each school. Here it is by school so you just have to cross reference those two and that's why I gave you the handout. You can easily cross reference that at School 1 we spent \$76,000 on bilingual teacher salary. We have one bilingual teacher there that teaches ESL. Here is School 8, our magnet school, where we have a lot of kids so this is what we're spending on salaries there for our Spanish bilingual program. At School 5, we have a combination of Bengali and Spanish. Here is what we're spending on salaries, \$821,000. Here you have it broken down for all the schools. You'll see that some of these say bilingual, some of these say teacher, and some of these say ESL because the principals are the ones who are filling out those subcategories but the account line, which I didn't add for you, has a code that says bilingual. The three numbers stand for bilingual. SPED is 655, bilingual is 830, and world language is 670, and so all the account lines are by code. That's the total for all the schools this year. In salaries, in textbooks, and in other instructional supplies... Newcomers is in New Roberto Clemente, so I asked the business office if they could break it down for me and they didn't code it that way so they gave me the overall number. That's all local funding, the money we have allocated now as the award that we get from the State. On top of that, we use federal funds. Staffing in Title I and Title III, Title III is designated for immigrant and bilingual programs. Title I can go for both and Title I does other things as well. I showed you that we have five school based supervisors that are working in the bilingual program. We have an Arabic speaking supervisor and the others are Spanish speaking for the bilingual programs. We had three bilingual parent coordinators. One is Bengali and the other two speak Spanish. Here is some other staffing we take out of Title III. In the summer we had a bilingual student magnet program only for the bilingual and we spent \$52,000 on them. This is not the only money we spent. This is the money that came out of Title because we also have money from local funds that we used. And then some money came out of our Saturday program. We allocate Title monies in each and every school. All of our schools are Title schools and so from Title money we put money into Whole School Reform, which goes into each and every budget. That's the contribution to Whole School Reform and then in Achieve 3000 we pay for the licenses for the bilingual programs. Money went into professional development. We purchased laptops for immigrant students because we took it out of Title III. We actually have an endorsement program. We have an agreement with William Paterson and what we're trying to do, because bilingual and ESL endorsements are hard to come by, is we're actually offering our own teachers here that work for us to go to school. William Paterson actually comes here and they teach those classes and they teach those certification programs. We pay for them and then we have a sidebar agreement for them that says we paid for your certification so you have to be here at least another three years after you finish your program. If they leave, they have to pay back the money and we've gone after them for the money and they have paid back if they didn't stay and follow the agreement. So another \$2.5 million out of federal funds goes to bilingual programming. This is the 2019-2020 proposed budget with the salaries of teachers, instructional supplies and other things. The proposed budget for



this year goes up to \$17.4 million. In our curriculum, I'm really happy to say that we have really covered all the aspects of curriculum. Bilingual education and SPED education is something that we have a framework for ESL so all of our ESL teachers follow the same type of lesson planning, the standards for New Jersey Student Learning, and we incorporate that into every single curricula that we have written. We have a sample pacing guide for ESL teachers. We look at the WIDA proficiency. I don't know if you've heard of the ACCESS testing. It's like the standardized test for bilingual children, even though they have to take the PARCC. They're not exempt from the PARCC. The only students that are exempt from the PARCC are if they come into the district less than a year before PARCC testing happens so they're exempt for one year, in ELA but not math. They all take the WIDA proficiency. We're ranked by the State. We have to meet certain benchmarks and these are the different levels of speakers that they rank the kids as. You're entering, beginning, developing, expanding, bridging, and reaching. Classes and content areas look different depending on where you are and what level you're at. In our curriculum, we have all the supports for the teachers. General education teachers have Spanish speakers or kids that have exited the bilingual program. We call them FLES. They just recently exited the bilingual language program so we keep watch of them and they still need some extra support. We give the teachers recommendations on what the environment should look like and what sensory and visual and interactive supports they have. If you're a dominant English speaker and you just exited the bilingual program, I'm going to group those types of kids together so that they can learn from each other and help each other during class. Then we have verbal and textual supports as well. So you label things in Spanish or Arabic and you use the two languages to label the room. We added this since last year – cultural relevant curriculum – so that we have to talk about prejudice reduction, knowledge construction, and pedagogy around culture. Culture is very, very different and it differs from ethnic background to ethnic background, and languages too. We talk to our teachers about that – building equity in the classroom. Here's a sample guide. We always have ESL levels here in the content area, and we have strategies. I want to say we have this too for special education. We have strategies. Here's the regular curriculum. You have ELL kids in your room so do this a little bit different and change your instruction to meet their needs as well. That's a math guide. Here is all the different professional development that we have offered and we continue to offer our instructional staff. How to differentiate instruction? How to build vocabulary in the classroom? Our ESL curriculum is fairly new so they have to be professionally development to administer the test and then there are different types of professional development. Does anyone have any questions? Do you want me to go back and clarify anything for you?

Comm. Martinez: This is a lot of information.

Ms. Peron: It is, but I really wanted to... The purpose of my presentation was to give you a feeling for what bilingual education looks like in Paterson, and to let you know that some misinformation may have come from the information that I provided in January when you wanted to know what resources and why the different amounts were given to the different programs. I really wanted to clarify that because honestly we never look at a child with a price tag. We want to give them everything we can. Unfortunately, resources are available for some kids and not for others. I have to say that Spanish is all over the world and so resources are very easy to find. Our reading program comes in Spanish and it's authentic Spanish. We purchased the reading program K-5 in English and we purchased it in Spanish. We spent millions of dollars on Spanish too for our Spanish kids. I wish I could say that for our Bengali, Turkish and Arabic kids. The hardest materials to find are the Bengali materials. They don't have a lot of written materials. They don't bring over a lot of resources. So we've been really working with

that population and that community to try to develop curriculum and to try to have them translate things for us so that we can have materials in the classroom. We have libraries in Arabic and libraries in Turkish through Scholastics because we've been talking to companies and saying to them that we have to make these resources for our other children and they have really been working. I'm proud to say that there are classroom libraries at School 9 and School 5 in Arabic and Turkish. I just really wanted to make that clear and I wanted to show you that the differences vary because of the number of students. The differences vary because of the frequency of where the students are concentrated in the community. I hope I did that. I hope I met the purpose. As I've said, you can look at the budgets and the different schools and you can kind of get a feel for the money that we spend. I wish it were that simple to divide the budget into different components, but it really isn't. That's it.

Comm. Castillo: Are there any questions? Thank you, Ms. Peron. This was extremely thorough and information that we needed because where we are it's difficult to educate all of our kids to begin with and the bilingual department has been doing an amazing job considering all the different languages spoken and the amount of students coming in. Just to update, Cheryl is going to help me to reach out tomorrow so we can set up some dates. Can we call all the Board members by Tuesday? That way we can get a date for the next retreat where we'll talk about the High School Review, the Data Assessment, and the Strategic Planning.

Comm. Hodges: That was my question. I didn't see the data review on here.

Comm. Castillo: Originally, it was on but since we took some time for our Circle we already knew we were going to have to set up a new date, another retreat date. The Superintendent, Mr. Crespo and Ms. Tsimpedes were ready to give that out today, but we made the change last minute because we knew the time wasn't going to suffice. That's why we want to set up another retreat and hopefully we'll give ourselves a little more time to do the High School Review as well.

Comm. Hodges: Let me suggest to you that the actual strategic planning involves quite a bit of time.

Comm. Castillo: Correct. We might actually need two – one for the other two and one for that.

Comm. Hodges: Yes, because that's not... I was concerned when I heard it was on tonight's schedule because there's no way in the world you can do a decent job in that short amount of time.

Comm. Castillo: I agree.

## **PUBLIC COMMENTS**

**It was moved by Comm. Ramirez, seconded by Comm. Redmon that the Public Comments portion of the meeting be opened. On roll call all members voted in the affirmative. The motion carried.**

No speakers.

**It was moved by Comm. Martinez, seconded by Comm. Hodges that the Public Comments portion of the meeting be closed. On roll call all members voted in the affirmative. The motion carried.**

## **ADJOURNMENT**

**It was moved by Comm. Redmon, seconded by Comm. Martinez that the meeting be adjourned. On roll call all members voted in the affirmative. The motion carried.**

The meeting was adjourned at 8:46 p.m.