

**MINUTES OF THE PATERSON BOARD OF EDUCATION
PUBLIC HEARING AND ADOPTION OF THE
2019-2020 SCHOOL DISTRICT BUDGET**

May 7, 2019 – 6:38 p.m.
Administrative Offices

Presiding: Comm. Oshin Castillo, President

Present:

Ms. Eileen F. Shafer, Superintendent of Schools
Ms. Susana Peron, Deputy Superintendent
Robert Murray, Esq., General Counsel

Comm. Emanuel Capers
Comm. Jonathan Hodges
Comm. Manuel Martinez
Comm. Eddy Olivares

Comm. Joel Ramirez
Comm. Nakima Redmon, Vice President
Comm. Robinson Rondon
Comm. Kenneth Simmons

The Salute to the Flag was led by Comm. Castillo.

Comm. Rondon read the Open Public Meetings Act:

The New Jersey Open Public Meetings Act was enacted to insure the right of the public to have advance notice of, and to attend the meetings of the Paterson Public School District, as well as other public bodies at which any business affecting the interest of the public is discussed or acted upon.

In accordance with the provisions of this law, the Paterson Public School District has caused notice of this meeting:

**Special Meeting
May 7, 2019 at 6:30 p.m.
Administrative Offices
90 Delaware Avenue
Paterson, New Jersey**

to be published by having the date, time and place posted in the office of the City Clerk of the City of Paterson, at the entrance of the Paterson Public School offices, on the district's website, and by sending notice of the meeting to the Arab Voice, El Diario, the Italian Voice, the North Jersey Herald & News, and The Record.

Comm. Castillo: Good evening. I want to welcome you all to the May 7 Special meeting.

Ms. Shafer: Before I ask our Business Administrator to come up, I would like to make a few comments for the Board and the community. We started our budget process in October 2018. Over 25 individual meetings were held, including public forums, throughout the city. As you all know, we do not have enough money for the 2019-2020 budget and had to make some hard decisions around cuts, including programs, district priorities, and last but certainly most important, staff and vacancies. I assure you that

this budget under my leadership will continue to be student-focused based on the resources that we have despite the lack of funding necessary to do all we would like to do for our students and the community. We have followed the mandated budget process. The Board has made well-informed decisions and has gotten the job done. A balanced budget is required as a top priority by the State to receive local control as referenced in our two-year transition plan. I commend district staff for making hard decisions and working within the confines of limited resources, but still keep the focus on the children. I am hopeful that the legislature representing the people of New Jersey will do right by Paterson as they review our comments at budget hearings. There were parents and students, Board members, as well as myself who spoke at the Senate and Assembly hearings. I'm encouraging the Board tonight to vote to adopt a balanced budget as an elected official so we can continue our journey to local control for our 29,000 children and their families. Thank you. At this time, I'm going to ask Mr. Richard Matthews, our Business Administrator, to come forward and give us a presentation on the budget.

PRESENTATION OF THE 2019-2020 SCHOOL DISTRICT BUDGET

Mr. Richard Matthews: Thank you Madam President and the Board members. Before I get into the presentation, I just want to be thankful for the team that I've had supporting me throughout this whole process. I want to give a thank you to Ms. June Gray, who is the Assistant to the Business Administrator. I want to give a thank you to Ms. Katori Walton, Ms. Kenya Fulgencio, and our Budget Coordinator Ms. Linda Herald. As Ms. Shafer said, tonight we're here to present you with a 2019-2020 balanced budget for the Paterson Public Schools. We're primarily charged with two things – to give our students a thorough and efficient education and to present a balanced budget to our Executive County Superintendent tomorrow. We want to give thanks to all the Board members who spent countless hours volunteering their time for the students of Paterson Public Schools and for our community. We see you day-to-day at committee meetings and at the Board members. To know that you guys do this stuff at no charge and for the betterment of the kids of Paterson you are to be commended. We really appreciate what you guys do. Our mission in Paterson Public Schools is to prepare each student for success in whatever college, university or vocation they choose. Our vision is to be the leader in educating New Jersey young throughout all America, not just in New Jersey or Paterson. Next, you'll see the Superintendent's budget priorities. Our Superintendent is really driving hard to increase our testing scores and graduation rates. These are the priorities that made it into the budget. We started out the year with \$52 million in our original budget and we finally ended up at \$2.85 million. Some of the items that made it into the budget you'll see there are additional child study teams, preschool, bilingual team, the P-Tech grant for \$120,000, curriculum money for \$15,000, equity audit for the elementary schools, school buses for \$135,000, planetarium for \$200,000, Full Service for \$255,000. We've had a grant writer for the past couple of years that has helped us increase our revenues. Increased enrollment for AP classes and also for special education and compensatory time we've got \$720,000. For our Saturday program we have \$300,000. Initially she had a number of \$52 million and we landed at less than \$3 million after we went through all we had to go through to get the budget balanced. As Ms. Shafer said, we started this budget process in October as a team. We've had meetings across all disciplines. We've met with all department heads. We met with all the principals. We went back to principals and secretaries and it was a totally inclusive budget process. We had fiscal meetings. We had community forums throughout the City of Paterson. We made sure we had community forums that touched all the wards so people in Paterson could have a stake in the budget process and offer their feedback to the budget team so we can take it back to either our fiscal committee, to the entire Board, or to cabinet. That happened

during the course of the year. Just note that these are some of the dates. It doesn't include all the meetings that we had, but it's a very inclusive calendar. It was very transparent, which we feel is very important towards us having the kind of credibility that we had during the budgeting process. To touch on some of the things happening in the budget process, back in October the budget team started making projections in terms of revenues and expenditures for the 2019 school year. All stakeholders were involved and we wanted to make sure that people put together the budget in a fashion that is stated in our two-year transition plan. You have to have priorities in your budget. This can't be a wish list. We have to make sure that everybody that's involved with putting together the budget that we're meeting with these people face-to-face, like the department heads and the principals. We met with everybody face-to-face and everybody who had a budget in the 2019-2020 year. We even circled back to all the department heads and made sure that everyone signed off on their budget. We have to make sure that our budget that gets adopted today is something that we manage very well for next year. The bottom line in the budget is that our expenditures can't exceed our revenues. Our budget was presented to the Board on March 19. It was a preliminary budget. Tonight, we're submitting a budget for final adoption. The budget was sent to the Executive County Superintendent on March 20 and approved on April 18. Fund 10/11 is your operating day-to-day budget. Then you have things like Fund 12, which is for capital equipment that's also funded by the general operating budget. It's also for equipment purchases and facilities acquisition. We also have Fund 20, which is a special revenue account. These monies are earmarked and restricted to certain expenditures like Title 1 and IDEA. The amount for the grant fund changes year to year. You have Fund 30 and Fund 40, which is your debt service. There's another fund there called Fund 6, which is our food service. They're actually a profit center and they contribute to our general fund every year. For 2018-2019 and 2019-2020 that contribution will be \$1.5 million. Some of the budgetary terms - you hear about your local source of revenue is your tax levy. Tax levy is revenue that's raised through property tax to support the local budget. If this budget were to pass tonight, our tax levy would be \$47 million, which still puts us about \$40 million behind our local fair share. Paterson's local fair share, according to the State, should be about \$90 million. You also have what's called budgeted fund balance. This is surplus money that's from prior year budgets that falls out. It's also unused appropriations. For instance, in 2018-2019 anything that's appropriated that's not being used will fall into what's called our budgeted fund balance. You have capital reserve, which we use for major projects. We have this new law on the books that I think you guys should be aware of. It talks about how schools are going to be funded over the seven years. Paterson is one of those schools. We're hopeful that over the next seven years we will get back to full funding. That law is called S-2. There's also aid that's used for special education kids for the services that are provided. We talk about our structural deficit in different meetings and I will repeat that we're in a structural deficit and this is something that didn't happen overnight. It's been over a period of time. The way to get out of it is not through one-time revenues. It's not through one-time cuts. As our Commissioner of Education said last week, it's a growth mindset. We have to have savings baked into our budget. We have to make sure that we tax ourselves correctly so that we have the revenues that we need year to year and that we get the compounding effect of increased tax revenues year over year. Paterson was first introduced to the fiscal cliff years ago. This is something that we're going to have to battle through and work together and partner with the Board and the community to make sure that we eventually get through this and come out as a healthy school district. This slide speaks to our revenues. When we're talking about the budget those expenses have to balance. For the 2019-2020 budget our total revenues are \$516 million. In the top section you see we're budgeting \$47 million for tax levy. That's an increase from last year of almost \$6 million. You have your tuition line which has stayed flat. Last year we had a one-time revenue of \$12

million. We don't get that revenue this year. We have to pay that. It's in our appropriations for 2019 and beyond. You see on the state aid line there our aid for 2019-2020 is \$439 million. Basically, 85% of our revenue is coming from the State. We're highly leveraged on State aid. We have to find ways to reduce the number through being creative in our revenues, getting our tax base up, and other ways that we can increase our revenues. For 2019-2020 you see a budgeted fund balance of \$11.4 million. That's a combination of prior year fund balance that we're bringing over and also the excess surplus from last year's budget of \$7.7 million. Last year we ended the year with \$7.7 million on a positive. We pulled in another \$3 million in budgeted fund balance. We have \$11.4 million to help us close the gap. We hope in future years to have more money in budgeted fund balance to be able to help close any gaps that we have in future years. Also, I have to make a comment to Deputy Superintendent Peron for her group in sharing input to put together this balanced budget. They made a contribution of \$2 million to our budget. We really appreciate that. As far as revenues, we have \$516,575, 234. This is just a pie chart of that same previous slide. As you see, all the red is the State aid. Then you see the yellow, which is the City of Paterson. As far as our local share, we're at 9.18%. We have to boost that number up so we're not as leveraged against State aid. Moving on to appropriations, \$516 million is our number for the year. I'm going to go through these lines in other slides that give you more of a breakdown in terms of where money is going. I think it's an easier read. I tried to mirror the advertised budget that you guys get in the newspaper to help you along in terms of understanding not just the revenues but also the appropriations and what percent of all these different lines contribute to the budget. This is a pie chart of that slide. Breaking down some of those lines in the budget, under special services you have salaries and program expenses. This is 6.25% of our 2019 budget. Total costs for 2019-2020 is \$32,287,198. The actual increase year over year is \$6 million, a total of 25% increase from 2018-2019 to 2019-2020. How do we close the gap? This is part of how we had to close the gap. This number here is how we were able to cut our appropriations. You see that it was pretty tough. Student transportation is 3.51% of our 2019-2020 budget. As you can see, that number went down by \$1 million but it's not because there were any true cuts. It was more efficiencies and getting better pricing on competitive bidding. Some of our routes were restructured. This is really a gain in efficiencies. It's not an actual cut in the budget, but it does help us be able to do some things in other parts of our budget. We really appreciate the work that Lisa Vainieri is doing in terms of managing student transportation. Next, you have central services. This is 1.6% of our budget. This is administrative and staff salaries, purchase services, budget software, supplies, and miscellaneous expenses. You see that number is up by \$2.7 million. Why is that number up so high? We have a lot of costs in that number. There are lease purchases that we did over last year regarding the computers, the \$1.1 million. We had the \$12 million we have to pay back over the next five years. That's in that number. That's why you see that appropriation go up by \$2.7 million. That's all in the budget for 2019-2020. We have a lot of old buildings over 100 years old. That's 7% of our budget. This has been a slight increase in that line item. This is salaries, staff, our cleaning contracts, Pritchard, maintenance services, professional technical services, a lot of our contracts with our vendors whether it's paving or glaziers. Our sewer bill, water bill, and trash removal are \$36,694,646, which is an increase of 3% year over year. Next up is our technology budget. This budget has been pretty consistent over the last couple of years. It's a very small part of our budget, less than 1%. You can see that number is at \$3 million over the year and they typically land around what they budgeted. It's up this year \$46,000, a small increase of 1%. Next up is employee benefits. It does not include health benefits. This is really just FICA, unemployment, workers compensation, tuition reimbursement, and compensated absences. That number is \$35 million, which is a pretty significant increase year over year. We're on to the charter schools. Our total number for the year is \$53 million. This is 12% of our

budget. This line item supports 4,618 students that attend 11 charter schools. As you can see and as you've heard previously, this number has been increased by \$9.4 million or 15%. Capital outlay is less than 1% of our budget. This is money that's in our budget for 2019-2020 and these are some of the projects that we're going to be doing – building envelopes, roof, windows, and outer perimeters. We have numerous schools that need new auditorium seats. We budgeted some money in that. One of the things that we're trying to do differently this year is that we may have 15-20 schools that may need auditorium seats. Instead of doing nothing, we have to start chipping away. This year we knocked out a couple of schools. Next year we knock out some more schools. Safety and security is also an issue. We have some entry door systems that we're going to budget for in 2019-2020. We have a lot of flooring issues. Plumbing and fencing is a major topic of conversation in the district. We have vehicles hitting our fences and we're constantly repairing and fixing fencing in the district. This is PCTI and charter school costs for the year. The total number for 2019-2020 is now \$83 million. Last year we were at \$73 million. That's a \$10 million increase to our 2019 budget. That is to serve the kids at the charter schools and PCTI. I'm going to go to another sheet that I think makes everything a lot clearer. For 2019-2010 we're asking for the Board to consider our tax increase of \$16.29. The school tax rate is .82. The annual increase on a home assessed at \$195,000 is \$195.45. The percent increase is 14%. That's the presentation.

Comm. Capers: Thank you for your presentation. On the tax impact, the city raised the sewer tax, right?

Mr. Matthews: Yes.

Comm. Capers: How much does that impact the taxpayer?

Mr. Matthews: We don't have those numbers.

Comm. Capers: Do you know what percent it was?

Mr. Matthews: They did it three months ago.

Comm. Capers: How much? If we add the monthly increase of \$16.29 with what the city is doing – and I don't know what the county is doing – it's going to be over \$20. I just wanted to know that number.

Comm. Redmon: To refer back to Comm. Capers' question with regards to the 14% cap that we're using, you have to remember that as a Board we have not increased taxes but four times over 20 years. In order for us to do our due diligence as a Board, we used our 14% tax bank cap. We're allowed to do that. We have to take into consideration that last year we did not do the 2% increase. It's only \$13.95 to each taxpayer in the City of Paterson for the school tax for the year.

Mr. Matthews: If I can just add, the thing that's really hurting us is that we're losing a whole compounding effect for the last years we haven't raised taxes. Had we raised taxes all those years our tax levy would be \$50 million. Next year, on a tax levy of \$47 million, and if it continues to go the way it's going, it will be minimal in terms of the impact on closing the gap. We need this revenue every year going forward. We have to increase it. I know it's painful to the taxpayer. I realize that. I have to ask that we consider the increase that we're presenting in the budget submitted today.

Comm. Simmons: For far too long this body has not raised taxes simply because of what the city was doing. The city has raised taxes every year. We've been kicking the can down the road and here we are. I firmly believe that it is incumbent upon every community to educate its children and we have to pay our fair share. Realistically, our tax levy number should be closer to \$100 million. We're not receiving that because we don't tax because of what the city is doing. We have to be concerned with what's best for our children and what we are supposed to be doing. If we had not been kicking the can down the road, we probably wouldn't be in the position we're in, or we'd be not as worse off as we are right now. I do agree that going forward we have to raise taxes every year. We haven't done it. If we constantly say we have to provide a proficient education, then we have to start to be responsible.

Comm. Capers: I'm a taxpayer as well, so I would be affected by this tax hike. We're affected by the city's tax hike already. With this tax impact, are we still doing the 200 layoffs?

Mr. Matthews: Yes. Everything here is all based on presenting a balanced budget. This is the tax rate that we're asking for.

Comm. Capers: Would the classrooms still be overcrowded?

Comm. Castillo: They will be more overcrowded.

Mr. Matthews: Yes.

Comm. Capers: We're really not presenting a budget that represents educating our children. We're just not.

Mr. Matthews: Based on the resources that are allocated to us, this is a thorough and efficient education. This is the floor of what we have to give to our kids for a thorough and efficient education. It's not the standard that we want to live at, but based on the resources that have been allocated to us...

Comm. Hodges: I disagree with what you just said about a thorough and efficient education. That's not defined by the resources that are given us. That's defined by the educational needs of our children. To limit it to what we're receiving runs contrary to what the Supreme Court said. We're supposed to be receiving funds that provide a thorough and efficient education, which we are not. I would suggest to you that the better way to think of it is what are the educational needs of our children and are they being met by this budget. Clearly they are not and that's a concern. What we have to do because of external pressures is something else. To say that we are receiving by the funding that we receive a thorough and efficient education is just wrong.

Comm. Martinez: There's another layer to what we're discussing, another reality, and I like the phrase that you used, Dr. Hodges, external pressures. As the governing body of this district it is our responsibility to approve a balanced budget. That's what we're faced with here tonight. Does it meet all the regulations and the hopes and dreams of a thorough and efficient education? No. But the deeper reality is that if we don't pass the budget there are ramifications and consequences that will be lowered on us as a district. We've been working towards local control. This is local control. Either we make these decisions right now or the State will come in and they will make the decisions for us. If we don't make these decisions, I can assure you that the decisions that the State will make on our behalf will be far worse than anything that we're facing

right now. Let's just keep this in mind. This is our responsibility. This is what we wanted. This is what we have.

Comm. Capers: Is there anything else this Board can do in terms of making any types of cuts or changes to take the tax levy off?

Mr. Matthews: The thing we have to consider is that it's not just making cuts. It's also revenue. It's a combination. To be fiscally sound we have to drive revenues and cut expenses. It's both. It's not just one. We can make cuts, but we also have to drive revenues. This is a way to drive revenues going forward. We have to look at both, increasing revenues and driving your costs down. At the last meeting we talked about starting our budget process for 2020-2021 now. We're trying to create opportunities going forward that will put savings into our budget. We're meeting with all our contractors now to even give us a better price in the 2020 budget. There are some savings embedded, but they're very small right now. It's revenues and expenses, not just cuts.

Comm. Capers: I don't want to open up this can of worms, but what's the cost savings if we privatize our aides?

Mr. Matthews: It's a couple of different numbers that I have to look at. I don't have it off the top of my head.

Comm. Capers: What's the total number if we look at all? Was it close to \$11 million?

Mr. Matthews: It was around that number.

Comm. Capers: If the Board takes this into consideration, we can take away the tax levy because we have the \$11 million in savings.

Mr. Matthews: We're still going to lose the compounding effect. If we were to take away \$8 million of cuts, then we still now are at \$41 million.

Comm. Capers: You lost me. Can you repeat?

Mr. Matthews: If you want to cut \$5 million to be able to not have the tax levy this year, right now our tax levy is \$41 million and we want to go to \$47 million. Next year we come around and we have to close the gap or balance the budget, now we're trying to do it on a \$41 million levy instead of a \$47 million levy. You're going to have to raise taxes 25%. The gap is going to keep coming every year. Next year salaries and benefits are going to be \$12 million. Charter schools are going to go up \$14 million. All the cost drivers we went through this past year are going to still go up next year the same thing.

Comm. Capers: Is State aid going to decrease?

Mr. Matthews: It could go up and we're still going to have a gap of over \$40 million. That's not going to stop.

Comm. Redmon: Comm. Capers, we went through this process for almost six months now. What you voted on three meetings ago was the preliminary budget, which was already approved by our County Superintendent. Whatever is presented tonight, these are the final numbers that we agreed on as a Board when we voted on it. There will be no changing. Unfortunately, we all do agree that our children are not going to get the

greatest education based on the money that is being presented in front of us. But at this moment we have to make sure that the 27 years that we fought to get local control is not going in jeopardy. We understand that we don't have the resources that we need to provide a thorough and efficient education. Do you think I like this budget? No. But I know as a responsible elected official what I'm supposed to do is to pass this budget. I did all my due diligence. I asked everywhere that we can cut. Do I think we should get rid of 200 teachers? No. We know once we get rid of 200 teachers that means we're doubling our class sizes and that means our students don't have a fair chance. But my hands are tied as an elected official. Do I agree with you sitting here wholeheartedly that we go down everything? Yes. Do I understand the process? Yes. Do I think that as taxpayers we want to pay more? No, but we have to. Sometimes we have to be responsible in order to give our kids a fair shot.

Comm. Castillo: Of course, I have not agreed and will not agree with this budget. But we also have to understand the position that we're in and the work that past Board members as well as the community and staff have done to make sure we go into local control. 230 positions is not a good call. 120 teachers, vice principals, supervisors, and larger classroom sizes is not a thorough and efficient education by any means or by any stretch of the imagination, but this is where we are. Unfortunately, it's something we have to pass and we have to move forward. I don't think any of us on this dais like the idea. I don't think it's something we want to do. In comparison to other cities that pay a higher share it's something that we are going to have to end up doing. If we don't do it, the State is going to come in and do it themselves. That's our option – either we keep local control and accept this budget, or we get rid of local control and still get a tax increase. Our options are very limited. I support the recommendation of the Superintendent. Obviously, I'm not happy about it, but I think we need to move forward in that.

Ms. Shafer: I just want to be clear about one thing. As you look at staff reductions, this is the number that we needed to balance the budget once we complete the entire process. That means that individuals bump into other positions and you may have a higher salary at that point. We have 24 vice principals and 29 supervisors. When they bounce back into a teaching position and their salary goes up, it may mean adding additional cuts. We still have to come up with the \$22 million. I just want everybody to understand that. These were the numbers we went into, but as we move forward and finalize it by May 15 those numbers are gradually changing. I just want everyone to know that and not for us to misrepresent that. Those numbers will probably go up because you have to find the person's last tenured position, put them in that position, and it could mean a higher salary.

PUBLIC HEARING ON THE 2019-2020 SCHOOL DISTRICT BUDGET

It was moved by Comm. Simmons, seconded by Comm. Redmon that the Public Comments portion of the meeting be opened. On roll call all members voted in the affirmative. The motion carried.

Comm. Castillo: For all of you visiting this evening, we usually allow three minutes just to be mindful of everyone else's time.

Ms. Rosie Grant: Good evening. I want to start by saying thank you to Ms. Shafer and her staff for the opportunities for community input and community involvement in the development of the budget. To the Board, I understand the need to pass a balanced budget and I also clearly see that it does not meet our students' needs. I don't think anyone can deny that we are not meeting our students' needs. State control had no

effect on our budget dollar-wise. It didn't bring more. It didn't give less. Local control has no effect on our budget dollar-wise. The discussion I'm hearing is apparently a threat that not passing the budget would affect our return to local control process, which is unfortunate because the law clearly states if you meet QSAC you get local control. Something is going on here that's outside of the law if in fact that threat is what's happening. For the record, we're losing from the budget information that we got during the process classroom teachers, art teachers, music teachers, media specialists, nurses, supervisors, 232 positions. That's a lot. I don't know who finally gets cut, but that's a lot of cuts. We cannot do that without affecting the quality of the program that we are offering to our kids in the Paterson Public School District. Already we know from the equity audit that we did with the National Journey for Justice Alliance that our surrounding suburbs offer three AP courses for every one we offer in Paterson. I don't know how we maintain that. I know we have a special grant. How do we maintain it and how do we do better? We already don't have enough given the budget cut. It does not provide a thorough and efficient education as mandated by the New Jersey Constitution. It does not meet the court mandate to fully fund the former Abbot districts. I know the Governor is trying to get us there in seven years, but four years ago the court said fully fund Abbott districts. I want to encourage you. You do what you have to do tonight, but I want to encourage you to never give up the fight for more dollars so that we can meet our students' needs. We'll continue to lose kids if we don't. I've heard discussion about losing kids to charter schools and to Tech. What about the kids we're losing to the streets or to the prison system or to the grave? We will continue to lose kids if we don't give them the education that they all need and deserve. It's unfortunate that the discussion here tonight has to be driven by cost. Please let the data and our children's needs drive your discussion and your decision-making. Thank you.

Mr. John McEntee: Hi everyone. John McEntee, Paterson Education Association. I want to first start by talking about the demeanor in our school right now. Today I was at School No. 2. We have four school visits this week and we typically go and just meet with the staff and see what we can do to help. Sometimes they just talk about their day. I can tell you that the demeanor today, knowing that May 15 is coming, was not good. It was a very quiet staff lounge. A lot of questions came up about what happens after May 15. Myself, Charles, and Mr. Wolferman tried to bring good news during teacher appreciation week when this is all happening. Unfortunately, this is just the time of year the statute mandates we do it. If that's the feeling of the teachers in the staff lounge, imagine the kindergartener or fourth grader. Kids are very perceptive and they will know on May 15 that their teacher had a bad day. Some of you weren't here in 2010, but there were over 900 during that particular time. It was a very tumultuous time in the Paterson schools. I was in the classroom myself and there were people crying. Imagine walking back to your classroom getting one of those white envelopes with a pink slip inside. We have to also think about our kids. They're going through this with our teachers. They're going to soon find out that the teacher won't be back. I know that it's not a popular topic, but I want to hammer it. Charter schools - charter schools are stealing from our budget and they're taking \$9 million. That's a big chunk of money. Think about what we can do with \$9 million. I wonder how many jobs, smartboards, or electronic devices we can put in there. I'm not scared to say it. Something has to be done with these charter schools. They've got to fix this problem. It's going to keep going on and on. It leads me to my final point. We're merging two schools, Silk City Academy and Great Falls Academy. I'm just wondering what's going to happen with that extra building? Is that going to go to a charter school? If we're selling that, which I don't know, is that going to go to another school that's going to come down here and steal more money from the budget? I have a lot of friends in Jersey City who are teachers and union leaders. Their school board of education is suing the State for being underfunded by \$120 million. I would stand with anyone on that Board or anyone

who works in this school system to sue and join whatever is going on. I think in Paterson we ought to be leading that fight. We ought to be suing anybody who's stealing from our kids. If our schools have been underfunded hundreds of millions of dollars it's time to hit back. Sometimes you have to do it in the courtroom. I hope that the School Board through your deliberations tonight and beyond strongly considers doing what Jersey City did. Let's sue the State. We've got nothing to lose. We're going to keep losing. I listen to Mr. Matthews talk about those streams of revenue. There are only so many ways you can fix it. You can't tax your way out of it either. We need to make sure that we bond together and do something. The last time I was here we were talking about doing a one-day strike. We came to some pretty good ideas on how to fix that. We went down there and we demanded more money. Schools like Trenton and Toms River are out there looking for that same dollar. We've got to get more engaged in this fight. Let's contact the people in Jersey City and let's do it. Thank you.

Mr. Charles Ferrer: Good evening. Charles Ferrer. I was at my son's PT office this afternoon and all the people who were sitting next to me were all educators from Clifton, West Milford, and Passaic Valley. The one from Passaic Valley was saying that their student population is reducing to the point that this person has been there 14 years and may be out of a job because they're thinking about regionalizing it or doing something different. It all boils down to the one thing that we've known since the State took this district over. An assemblyperson down in Trenton said they can't understand how the State that took an oath to enforce and uphold the laws of the State of New Jersey has failed, not just the children of Paterson, but the children of this entire state. No budget has been fully funded in some time. When we talk about it's our job to pass a balanced budget, a balanced budget to what? When we were under State control, we didn't want to sue them because we were worried about Dr. Evans, Dr. Duroy, Dr. Glascoe, and Dr. Wilson losing their jobs. Now we're under local control and we're still worrying about what the State will do to us if we don't pass the budget. What more can they do to us? What can they do to us that they haven't already done? We're already 32 in a classroom now. We're going to be at 40. I've been there before. I understand it, but it's a different generation of students. Parents, you need to understand this. You are the only people that can fight the State on their own mandate. Their mandate from third grade or fourth grade is 24 children in a classroom. When it's special education, it's less. I can file a grievance and it dies at Level 2. You parents can take it all the way to the Supreme Court. The only way that we're going to get this right is the parents of the children of this town have to begin to fight. I agree. We've talked about suing before. What's it going to hurt? A few days? A few hours? Maybe they're looking for a fight. I've won a lot of battles. We just won one in court today where a judge ruled in our favor. What are we afraid of going before a judge for? Is it going to hurt? Is it going to do anything different? The thought of privatizing anybody is something that I will never support. We might as well just tell parents to home school their children. There's no need for a school budget. Are we going to that? Are we serious? We need to make this state do what they're supposed to do according to the law. The only person that can do that is a judge. Stop being afraid!

It was moved by Comm. Redmon, seconded by Comm. Simmons that the Public Comments portion of the meeting be closed. On roll call all members voted in the affirmative. The motion carried.

Comm. Castillo: Just to clarify on the budget, on page 14 of our transition plan it does state that we do have to submit a balanced budget. It says, "consequences for not meeting the expectations of the full transition plan states there are certain events that may occur either through action or interaction that are inevitably fundamental to changes. Failure of the Board to pass a balanced budget in compliance with State

requirements would indicate clearly that the district has not developed the capacity necessary to fulfill the responsibilities to the children and families of Paterson. In such instance, the State may take any action authorized by the statute and regulation, including full State intervention pursuant to the article number.” That's what we're battling right now. Can we just take a five-minute pause and then we'll come into a vote?

It was moved by Comm. Simmons, seconded by Comm. Redmon that the Board takes a recess. On roll call all members voted in the affirmative. The motion carried.

The Board took recess at 7:33 p.m.

The Board reconvened the meeting at 7:43 p.m.

RESOLUTIONS FOR A VOTE:

Resolution No. 1

WHEREAS, the Superintendent of Schools forwarded Paterson Public Schools' preliminary 2019-2020 budget to the Passaic County Executive County Superintendent of Schools for review and approval on March 21, 2019; and

WHEREAS, the 2019-2020 budget for the Paterson Public School District was prepared consistent with the New Jersey Quality Single Accountability Continuum (NJQSAC) focusing on quality performance indicators in all five areas of school district effectiveness: Operations Management, Instruction and Program, Fiscal Management, Personnel and Governance; and

WHEREAS, the 2019-2020 budget was prepared consistent with the district's revised Fiscal Policy 6220 addressing budget preparation, with primary consideration given to educational priorities identified by the Board and Ms. Eileen Shafer, Superintendent of Schools, and;

WHEREAS, that the Board of Education adopt the 2019-2020, budget submitted by Ms. Eileen Shafer, Superintendent of Schools, which budget reflects 2% increase in the local tax levy and use of additional SDA funds available for 2019-2020 to support the general fund as reflected herein;

	2018-19	1-Feb YTD	2019-20
	<u>Pre-Budget</u>	<u>Actuals</u>	<u>Budget</u>
Maximum Travel	\$199,970	\$71,271	\$291,954

WHEREAS, that Board of Education approved the 2019-2020 School Year budget on May 7, 2019, at a special meeting in the amount of \$609,939,589; and

WHEREAS, the budget submitted by the Paterson Public Schools and approved for advertising by the Passaic County Office of Education for the 2019-2020 School Year consisted of the following, with revenues and appropriations balanced:

	<u>Budgeted</u>	<u>Local Tax Levy included</u>
General Fund Revenue		
Local Sources	\$ 57,634,472	\$ 47,445,757
State Aid	446,131,222	0
Federal Sources	1,319,815	0
Fund Balance	3,027,271	0
Excess Surplus	<u>8,462,454</u>	<u>0</u>
Total General Fund	\$ <u>516,575,234</u>	\$ <u>47,445,757</u>
Special Revenue Fund (net of operating budget transfers)		<u>Local Tax Levy included</u>
State Aid	\$ 58,193,306	
Federal Aid	32,318,044	0
Transfer from Operation Fund		
Pre-K Special Education	<u>1,547,385</u>	<u>0</u>
Total Special Revenue Fund	\$ <u>92,058,735</u>	\$ <u>0</u>
Debt Service		
Local Sources	\$ 506,479	\$ 506,479
State Aid	799,121	
Budgeted Fund Balance	<u>20</u>	
Total Debt Service	\$ <u>1,305,620</u>	\$ <u>506,479</u>
<u>Gross Budget</u>	\$ <u>609,939,589</u>	\$ <u>47,952,236</u>

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Superintendent of Schools hereby fixes and determines that the amended amount of money necessary to be appropriated for the use of the public schools for the 2019-2020 School Year is \$609,939,589 (six hundred nine million, nine hundred thirty-nine thousand, five hundred eighty-nine dollars) of which \$47,445,757 (forty-seven million, four hundred forty-five thousand, seven hundred and fifty-seven dollars) is the General Fund local tax levy; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Superintendent of Schools shall hereby forward to the Passaic County Office of Education the budget statement, budget statement certification, form A4F (Certification and Report of School Taxes, 2019-2020 School Year) and supporting documentation as required by statute and code; and

NOW THEREFORE BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Paterson Board of Education approves the 2019-2020 budget submitted by Ms. Eileen Shafer, Superintendent of Schools, which represents a balanced 2019-2020 budget, with an adequate amount of funds to provide for a thorough and efficient education.

NOW THEREFORE BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that this resolution shall take effect immediately upon its adoption.

It was moved by Comm. Redmon, seconded by Comm. Simmons that Resolution No. 1 be adopted. On roll call all members voted as follows:

Comm. Capers: No.

Comm. Hodges: No.

Comm. Martinez: Yes.

Comm. Olivares: No.

Comm. Ramirez: No.

Comm. Redmon: Yes.

Comm. Rondon: No.

Comm. Simmons: Yes.

Comm. Castillo: Yes.

The motion did not carry.

Paterson Board of Education Standing Abstentions

Comm. Capers

- Self
- 4th and Inches
- Westside Park Group
- Florio Management Company (ACES Program receives donations)

Comm. Castillo

- Self
- Passaic County
- Scholastic/Jordan (Transportation)

Comm. Hodges

- Self
- Jumpstart
- City of Paterson

Comm. Martinez

- Self
- New Jersey Community Development Corporation (NJCDC)

Comm. Olivares

- Self

Comm. Ramirez

- Self
- Berkeley College

Comm. Redmon

- Self
- Historic Preservation of the City of Paterson
- County of Passaic

Comm. Rondon

- Self

Comm. Simmons

- Self

- Family

Comm. Castillo: Before I move on, I do want to make sure everyone understands the ramifications of this vote. Singlehandedly we could have just given up local control from what it says in the transition plan that we all voted for. We all voted for a transition plan that stipulates that we would pass a balanced budget. I just want to make the acknowledgment and for everyone to understand where we are and give the opportunity for anyone who wants to change their vote if it may be.

Resolution No. 2

Whereas, the Paterson Public School District has determined that it is necessary to secure the services of a consultant to conduct special investigations and such other related matters as may be assigned by the District Superintendent; and

Whereas, Susan A. Corrado of Passaic Valley Investigations (PVI), LLC, has demonstrated expertise in such matters; and

Whereas, quotes were obtained for said services from Appruzzese, McDermott, Mastro & Murphy, P.C. \$160.00, Scrainci, Hollenbeck, LLC, \$160.00 and Passaic Valley Investigations, LLC \$150.00.

Whereas, PVI submitted the quote most advantageous to the District; and

Whereas, the District Superintendent has authority to award a contract for professional services and to enter in a contractual relationship on behalf of the District; and

Whereas, the Paterson Board of Education has previously approved to retain the services of Susan A. Corrado of Passaic Valley Investigation (Board Adoption Date: 12-19-18/G-3) to conduct special investigations;

Whereas, her continued services are necessary to complete open investigations and other remaining matters as required by the Superintendent of Schools;

Be It Resolved, that the District Superintendent of the Paterson Public School District hereby recommends the retention of Susan A. Corrado of Passaic Valley Investigation for special investigations and related matters, for the remainder of the 2018/2019 School Year, at the hourly rate of One Hundred and Fifty Dollars (\$150.00) per hour plus traveling expenses pursuant to board policy for services rendered, at an amount not to exceed Twenty Five Thousand Dollars (\$25,000.00).

NOT TO EXCEED \$25,000.00

It was moved by Comm. Simmons, seconded by Comm. Martinez that Resolution No. 2 be adopted. On roll call all members voted in the affirmative. The motion carried.

Paterson Board of Education Standing Abstentions

Comm. Capers

- Self
- 4th and Inches
- Westside Park Group

- Florio Management Company (ACES Program receives donations)

Comm. Castillo

- Self
- Passaic County
- Scholastic/Jordan (Transportation)

Comm. Hodges

- Self
- Jumpstart
- City of Paterson

Comm. Martinez

- Self
- New Jersey Community Development Corporation (NJCDC)

Comm. Olivares

- Self

Comm. Ramirez

- Self
- Berkeley College

Comm. Redmon

- Self
- Historic Preservation of the City of Paterson
- County of Passaic

Comm. Rondon

- Self

Comm. Simmons

- Self
- Family

Resolution No. 3

Whereas, the Paterson Public School District's Strategic Plan Priority III: is creating and maintaining healthy school cultures by goal 3: expanding partnerships with community organizations, agencies and institutions;

Whereas, Silk City Arts is a newly organized grassroots nonprofit organization formed for the purpose of cultivating the many artistic talents found in the greater Paterson, New Jersey area. It is their mission to establish a supportive community that can help nurture the growing arts community in Paterson, "The Silk City," and assist emerging artists with finding their voice.

Whereas, the Silk City Arts Wheelchair Basketball Benefit Game is a fundraising opportunity for Silk City Arts to eventually be able to sponsor and host an annual Silk City Arts Expo event at the Great Falls. Additionally, part of the proceeds will go to the Wheelchair Sports Federation who advocates adaptive awareness in the communities. Talented wheelchair basketball athletes will be featured inclusive of Silk City Arts Committee member and cartoonist, Jimmy Jeffreys.

Whereas, The Wheelchair Sports Federation is a national non-profit that provides opportunities for the disabled wheelchair-bound youth and adults to play sports. The Wheelchair Sports Federation supports teams like the Bulova Nets wheelchair basketball team with benefit games throughout the country. The Bulova Nets will be featured in the event to help spread adaptive sport awareness to the city of Paterson.

Whereas, The Wheelchair Basketball Benefit Game event is a collaborative effort between two organizations, the Silk City Arts and the Wheelchair Sports Federation. Sponsors are AT&T, United Healthcare, NC Carpeting, NextWave Web Printing (Paterson) and Silk City Platters (Paterson).

Whereas, through their participation in this event, the district aligns to the NJDOE's Core Component of Project UNIFY which is to provide inclusive sports for students with and without intellectual disabilities opportunities to participate in sports activities.

Therefore Be It Resolved that the Paterson Board of Education approves that the Silk City Arts Wheelchair Basketball Benefit Game occur on May 25, 2019 from 1-5 PM at Dr. Hani Awadallah Elementary gymnasium.

It was moved by Comm. Simmons, seconded by Comm. Ramirez that Resolution No. 3 be adopted. On roll call all members voted in the affirmative. The motion carried.

Paterson Board of Education Standing Abstentions

Comm. Capers

- Self
- 4th and Inches
- Westside Park Group
- Florio Management Company (ACES Program receives donations)

Comm. Castillo

- Self
- Passaic County
- Scholastic/Jordan (Transportation)

Comm. Hodges

- Self
- Jumpstart
- City of Paterson

Comm. Martinez

- Self
- New Jersey Community Development Corporation (NJCDC)

Comm. Olivares

- Self

Comm. Ramirez

- Self
- Berkeley College

Comm. Redmon

- Self
- Historic Preservation of the City of Paterson
- County of Passaic

Comm. Rondon

- Self

Comm. Simmons

- Self
- Family

OTHER BUSINESS

Comm. Castillo: Before we adjourn, since we are where we are, I would like to know what the next process would be. Madam Superintendent, I know that we do have two of the highly skilled professionals. I don't know if they're still here. I would put it on them to notify us at some point of what proceeds after here.

Ms. Shafer: The next steps would be for me to contact the Commissioner tomorrow and tell him that we didn't adopt a balanced budget. I don't know if T.J. or Dr. Cohen are here. Maybe they can come up and tell us what the next steps might be if you have any additional information. I will also be contacting the County.

Mr. Theodore Best: Good evening everyone. According to the transition plan that was approved by the State Department of Education and the Paterson Board of Education there were several items that were noted that would be grounds for immediate State intervention. One of those grounds was the failure to pass a balanced budget. I sent out a memo earlier today. Hopefully all of the Board members were in receipt of it. It was essentially warning that if there's not a balanced budget passed the State of New Jersey does have the authority and the ability to immediately recaptured State intervention. What that means could be several things. One of the things could be the immediate termination of the District Superintendent, the appointment of a new State Superintendent, and the County Superintendent will then move forward with implementing a balanced budget.

Comm. Castillo: I know you can't assure, but apart from everything else it could possibly mean no future funds this year for Paterson if we were to ask that usually comes in the summer. That would mean that's possibly taken off the table.

Mr. Best: That's a possibility. I also want to add that the Business Administrator in his presentation talked about Paterson's contribution in terms of their fair share towards the total budget. As it stands right now, Paterson is operating at about 47% of what they should be contributing, meaning the local municipal government in terms of taxes towards the school district. In your budget, which was extremely aggressive, there was a 14% tax increase. That tax increase can actually go up even more if it were left in the hands of someone else to balance the budget. In addition moving forward, additional budgets can also be impacted well beyond a 2% tax increase if it were left to someone else.

Comm. Capers: Thank you for letting us know that. Let's talk about some positives. They heard from our Superintendent, Board President, community, teachers' union and other community advocates. Can intervention mean they can finally fully fund our district?

Mr. Best: There's currently a plan in place to bring all of the districts to 100% from the State of New Jersey. That's a piece of legislation that was passed last year. It's a seven-year plan. We're in the first year of that plan. It maps out an increase of State aid moving forward over the course of the next six years, including this year as well, which is why Paterson did see an increase. That percentage will go up each and every year. In addition to that, I do want to add even though the State is currently at 88% adequacy the local municipal tax levy is only at 47% adequacy. Even if the State after seven years brings its budget up to 100%, unless you take very aggressive actions the district will always be underfunded until the local tax levy rises in order to meet adequacy.

Comm. Capers: Thank you.

Comm. Hodges: The State currently owes us \$125 million. That's what they owe, which is more than what we owe in our local funding. The concern that I have is that their neglect continues to put us in a shortfall. They were in control for 25 years, at least, and did not raise taxes once until we came to the table in terms of control. If it was their concern that we had not done what we were supposed to do, they were fully empowered to do that and to give that demonstration. That did not happen. The concern that I have is that we are in fact a distressed city, which they recognize by supplementing the municipal budget on a regular basis. They do realize the tax burden of this city is enormous. While I recognize that we do have a responsibility to do what we can to fund locally, the cumulative burden on the community is extraordinary. That's a problem. The State eliminated the estate tax. They cut the millionaire's tax. They cut the corporate tax. This cumulatively reduced the funding which needed to go to other projects and concerns like education. Now they're asking us to provide a less than thorough and efficient education at the threat of loss of local control. I think the response that this district has given is the only one that we could give. While I do understand that we do have a responsibility to provide a balanced budget, the higher concern is providing a thorough and efficient education and that has not been met.

Comm. Castillo: I don't agree. I don't think it's a threat. It's something we all agreed to at one point. When local control came in last year, when the transition plan was established, when everything was put together, when we went to the various community forums, when we spoke to various members, when we read the transition plan multiple times it was included in that. As I've stated, I'm not one to agree with the budget, but I also find that there are other means. Unfortunately, this is where we are. Though I don't agree with the State, it's also not news. It's something that we all knew was going to happen for the last few months. We've been talking about this budget for over six months. We knew that moving into local control taxes were going to be raised. We knew that. We spoke to the community about that. We knew that the percentage we were paying wasn't high enough. It's not a surprise to anyone that we're here and this is what our budget looks like. I just want to make sure that's very clear.

Comm. Martinez: Over 20 years ago when the State came in and took local control of this district, I don't think anyone can argue with the amount of damage that has been inflicted on our community and children. The Board members at this dais right now and the Board members who sat here for the last couple of decades worked to get to this point because we were not in agreement with the way the State was managing our district. They underfunded us. They cut everything that they could possibly cut. They did injustices and disservices to our scholars that are going to be felt for decades to come. We worked to get out from under that local control and we just gave it right back to them. We just proved them right. The whole notion was that we couldn't govern

ourselves. We weren't fit to do the job ourselves. We just proved them right. We got right to the goal line. Before we got the ball over, we gave it right back to them and said, "Okay State. You take another shot at it." After the last 20 years of them showing us that they couldn't do the job well. It was our opportunity to take over and prove that we could and we just squandered it, potentially. We cut our noises off to spite our faces, threw the baby out with the bathwater, and any other cliché that you can possibly think of.

Comm. Ramirez: 27 years of State control and they failed us. They give us local control and they continue to fail us. I have no doubt in my mind that our Superintendent is really trying to do her job, even though sometimes I think there are external factors that try to shackle her and not allow her to do what's right for this district. The taxpayers are overtaxed. Mr. Ferrer and Mr. McEntee are right. What are we afraid of? I think we need to start putting our adult pants on and use the court system to our advantage. We have one of the best counsels any School Board can ask for with Mr. Murray. I think we need to get on the phone and play politics as well. Call the State Senate President. Call the Governor. If he's not listening, I think we need to meet with the other side of the aisle. I know what my responsibilities are when I took that oath of office. I know that when you run a business, and this has to run as a business, you have to make tough decisions. As much as I'd like to stick to what I say I'm going to stick to, I just can't allow the State who has failed us to come back and snatch from us a Superintendent that I believe is trying to do what's right for this district. With that being said, I want to rescind my no vote and change it to a yes.

Comm. Castillo: Mr. Murray, to clarify, would we need to do another motion or a motion of consideration?

Mr. Murray: A motion for reconsideration, which could be made only by a person who voted no. If a person voted no, he makes the motion for reconsideration, anyone can second, and then you can vote it.

It was moved by Comm. Ramirez, seconded by Comm. Redmon that Resolution No. 1 be reconsidered. On roll call all members voted as follows:

Comm. Capers: No.

Comm. Hodges: No.

Comm. Martinez: Yes.

Comm. Olivares: No.

Comm. Ramirez: Yes.

Comm. Redmon: Yes.

Comm. Rondon: No.

Comm. Simmons: Yes.

Comm. Castillo: Yes.

The motion carried.

Resolution No. 1

WHEREAS, the Superintendent of Schools forwarded Paterson Public Schools' preliminary 2019-2020 budget to the Passaic County Executive County Superintendent of Schools for review and approval on March 21, 2019; and

WHEREAS, the 2019-2020 budget for the Paterson Public School District was prepared consistent with the New Jersey Quality Single Accountability Continuum (NJQSAC) focusing on quality performance indicators in all five areas of school district effectiveness: Operations Management, Instruction and Program, Fiscal Management, Personnel and Governance; and

WHEREAS, the 2019-2020 budget was prepared consistent with the district's revised Fiscal Policy 6220 addressing budget preparation, with primary consideration given to educational priorities identified by the Board and Ms. Eileen Shafer, Superintendent of Schools, and;

WHEREAS, that the Board of Education adopt the 2019-2020, budget submitted by Ms. Eileen Shafer, Superintendent of Schools, which budget reflects 2% increase in the local tax levy and use of additional SDA funds available for 2019-2020 to support the general fund as reflected herein;

	2018-19	1-Feb YTD	2019-20
	<u>Pre-Budget</u>	<u>Actuals</u>	<u>Budget</u>
Maximum Travel	\$199,970	\$71,271	\$291,954

WHEREAS, that Board of Education approved the 2019-2020 School Year budget on May 7, 2019, at a special meeting in the amount of \$609,939,589; and

WHEREAS, the budget submitted by the Paterson Public Schools and approved for advertising by the Passaic County Office of Education for the 2019-2020 School Year consisted of the following, with revenues and appropriations balanced:

	<u>Budgeted</u>	<u>Local Tax Levy included</u>
General Fund Revenue		
Local Sources	\$ 57,634,472	\$ 47,445,757
State Aid	446,131,222	0
Federal Sources	1,319,815	0
Fund Balance	3,027,271	0
Excess Surplus	<u>8,462,454</u>	<u>0</u>
Total General Fund	\$ <u>516,575,234</u>	\$ <u>47,445,757</u>
Special Revenue Fund (net of operating budget transfers)		<u>Local Tax Levy included</u>
State Aid	\$ 58,193,306	
Federal Aid	32,318,044	0
Transfer from Operation Fund		
Pre-K Special Education	<u>1,547,385</u>	<u>0</u>
Total Special Revenue Fund	\$ <u>92,058,735</u>	\$ <u>0</u>

Debt Service		
Local Sources	\$ 506,479	\$ 506,479
State Aid	799,121	
Budgeted Fund Balance	<u>20</u>	
Total Debt Service	\$ <u>1,305,620</u>	\$ <u>506,479</u>
 <u>Gross Budget</u>	 \$ <u>609,939,589</u>	 \$ <u>47,952,236</u>

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Superintendent of Schools hereby fixes and determines that the amended amount of money necessary to be appropriated for the use of the public schools for the 2019-2020 School Year is \$609,939,589 (six hundred nine million, nine hundred thirty-nine thousand, five hundred eighty-nine dollars) of which \$47,445,757 (forty-seven million, four hundred forty-five thousand, seven hundred and fifty-seven dollars) is the General Fund local tax levy; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Superintendent of Schools shall hereby forward to the Passaic County Office of Education the budget statement, budget statement certification, form A4F (Certification and Report of School Taxes, 2019-2020 School Year) and supporting documentation as required by statute and code; and

NOW THEREFORE BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Paterson Board of Education approves the 2019-2020 budget submitted by Ms. Eileen Shafer, Superintendent of Schools, which represents a balanced 2019-2020 budget, with an adequate amount of funds to provide for a thorough and efficient education.

NOW THEREFORE BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that this resolution shall take effect immediately upon its adoption.

It was moved by Comm. Redmon, seconded by Comm. Simmons that Resolution No. 1 be adopted. On roll call all members voted as follows:

Comm. Capers: No.

Comm. Hodges: No.

Comm. Martinez: Yes.

Comm. Olivares: No.

Comm. Ramirez: Yes.

Comm. Redmon: Yes.

Comm. Rondon: No.

Comm. Simmons: Yes.

Comm. Castillo: Yes.

The motion carried.

Paterson Board of Education Standing Abstentions

Comm. Capers

- Self
- 4th and Inches
- Westside Park Group
- Florio Management Company (ACES Program receives donations)

Comm. Castillo

- Self
- Passaic County
- Scholastic/Jordan (Transportation)

Comm. Hodges

- Self
- Jumpstart
- City of Paterson

Comm. Martinez

- Self
- New Jersey Community Development Corporation (NJCDC)

Comm. Olivares

- Self

Comm. Ramirez

- Self
- Berkeley College

Comm. Redmon

- Self
- Historic Preservation of the City of Paterson
- County of Passaic

Comm. Rondon

- Self

Comm. Simmons

- Self
- Family

Ms. Erika Santiago: My name is Erika Santiago. As everybody knows, I've gone to Trenton. I've gone to Newark. I've also publicly stated that I'm on Ms. Shafer's side. I understand why they're doing what they have to do with the budget, because the State is trying our hands. But I want to let Ms. Shafer know everyone here and at home who's listening if they were to take on Ms. Shafer whoever comes here will have a lot to deal with. I don't get beat by my husband, so I'm not going to be treated like some battered wife that is going to take what's given to her lying down. It is not going to happen. Just because the State thinks they won this little battle they have no idea of the war that is coming for them. I've gone through a lot with my daughter in middle school because of budget cuts. Ms. Shafer knows all about it and whoever wants to hear about it they can ask. I am not going to have her go through more in high school. That is my child. I have another one on the way into Paterson Public Schools and I'm not going to take this

anymore. It is time for us to stop talking and start walking about it. I have no problem if the Board can't sue. I will sue them and I will put anyone in the petition along with me including Raquel. Here comes the hurricane.

Ms. Raquel Soto: Ms. Shafer, I'm 100% behind you. If we have to file a petition together, I will sally up the wagon of my parents and I am behind you 125%. Thank you.

It was moved by Comm. Redmon, seconded by Comm. Martinez that the meeting be adjourned. On roll call all members voted in the affirmative. The motion carried.

The meeting was adjourned at 8:02 p.m.