

Understanding Title IX:
New Regulations and
Responsibilities

Ryan G. Smith Angela F. Kutzfara

February 1, 2021



Title IX

- Title IX of the Education Amendments of 1972 (20 U.S.C. §1681(a)):
 - No person in the United States shall, on the basis of sex, be excluded from the participation in, be denied the benefits of, or be subjected to discrimination under any education program or activity receiving Federal financial assistance
- Requires schools to take appropriate steps to address sex discrimination, including sexual harassment
 - Respond promptly and in a manner that is not deliberately indifferent



Title IX - Recent History

- 2011 and 2014 Dear Colleague Letters served as guidance
- 2017 Trump Administration resends previous guidance and issues new guidance re: addressing sexual misconduct
- 2018 Department of Education proposes new Title
 IX Regulations
- May 6, 2020 new Title IX Regulations are finalized.
 - Most significant changes to Title IX in several years
- August 14, 2020 new regulations go into effect





TULE IX REGULATIONS

General Overview and Title IX Team

Sexual Harassment Definition

- Includes three types of misconduct on the basis of sex:
 - (1) Quid Pro Quo harassment by an employee i.e. conditioning an educational benefit or service upon participation in unwelcome sexual conduct
 - (2) Unwelcome conduct that a <u>reasonable person</u> would find <u>so severe</u>, <u>pervasive</u>, <u>and objectively offensive</u> that it effectively denies a person equal access to the District's education program or activity;
 - (3) Sexual assault, dating violence, domestic violence, or stalking

School District Obligations: Overview

- Required to respond whenever an employee has actual knowledge of sexual harassment or allegations of sexual harassment
 - Applies to ANY employee
 - Actual knowledge is when an employee "has notice of sexual harassment or allegations of sexual harassment."
- Important terms:
 - Complanant = alleged victim, regardless of who reports the conduct
 - Respondent = alleged perpetrator

Actual Notice, Examples

- An employee observes or witnesses sexual harassment
- An employee is told that sexual harassment occurred by the complainant, the complainant's parents, or another third party
- An employee receives a voicemail, email or any other written or verbal communication alleging sexual harassment has occurred.

Reporting: Who and How?

- Any person may report sexual harasement under Title IX including:
 - The complainant student
 - Employee
 - The complainant's parent or guardian
 - A third party
- Reports can be made in-person or via mail, email or telephone to the Title IX Coordinator
- Reports can be made at any time



Title IX Team

- Key players:
 - Title Coordinator(s)
 - Investigator
 - Decision-Maker
 - Informal Resolution Facilitators
 - Appeal Designe

Appointment of multiple individuals

Title IX Team

Position	Scope of Responsibility	Notes
Title IX Coordinator	Responsible for handling initial report, meeting with complainant, initiating formal complaints implementing supportive measures as necessary, general oversight of policy and grievance process to ensure compliance.	Recommend appointing two Title ix Coordinators, preferably one male and one female, if possible.
Investigator	Investigates, gathers evidence, and drafts investigation report.	Recommend someone other than Title IX Coordinator, if possible.
Decision Maker	Evaluates evidence leviews investigation report and related responses/questions, issues a written determination regarding responsibility.	Cannot be the Title IX Coordinator or Investigator.
Appeal Designee	Responsible for issuing written determination on an appeal, if any.	Cannot be the Title IX Coordinator, Investigator, or Decision Maker.



Title IX Team

- All players must be trained on:
 - The definition of sexual harassman
 - Scope of the District's education program or activity
 - How to conduct an investigation and grievance process, including appeals and informal resolution processes
 - How to serve impartially avoid prejudgment of the facts at issue, conflicts of interest, and bias

Title IX Coordinator

- At least one employee must serve as the Fitte YX
 Coordinator, who ensures compliance with
 regulations and receives complaints
- Must publish contact information for the Title IX Coordinator(s): name/title, office address, email address, and telephone number
 - District website
 - Studen/Employee Handbooks
 - Email to employees/unions
 - Notify parents/guardians



Duties of Title IX Coordinator

- Compliance with Title IX and District policy
- Receives reports or formal complaints of sex discrimination/harassment and coordinates response to same
- Identifies and implements supportive measures, as necessary
- Coordinates assignment of persons to fulfill Title IX roles
- Record keeping
- Training



Investigator

- Must be trained per Title IX
- District employee, legal counsel of the third party
- Cannot have a conflict of interest or other prohibited bias
- Cannot be part of the decision-making process
- Oversees the prompt, thorough gathering of all facts and evidence in connection with a formal complaint



Decision Maker

- CANNOT be the Title IX Coordinator or the investigator
- Responsible for reviewing the investigative report"
- Responsible for exafting a "written determination regarding responsibility"
- Preponderance of evidence standard
- Must be free from bias and conflicts of interest



Informal Resolution Facilitator

- Serves as a mediator and oversees the informal resolution process, if voluntarily agreed to by both parties
 - Note: informal resolution not available for allegations that an employee sexually harassed a student

Must be impartial, unbiased and free from conflic

Appeal Designee

- Cannot be the Title IX Coordinator, investigator or Decision-Maker
- Free of any conflict of interest
- Reviews the appeal, written statements in response to the appeal, and the underlying record in rendering a written decision



Initial Response

- All reports of sexual harassment should be forwarded to Title IX Coordinator
- Upon receipt, Title IX Coordinator nust contact
 Complainant as soon as reasonably possible to discuss:
 - Potential supportive measures, with or without filing a formal complaint, and must consider Complainant's wishes regarding supportive measures
 - Explain process for filing formal complaint
- Evaluate heshold questions under Title IX
- "Formal Complaint" document containing allegations of sexual harassment and requesting investigation



Supportive Measures

- Non-disciplinary, non-punitive individualized services offered as appropriate, as reasonable available, without fee or charge to the parties, with or without filing a formal complaint
- Designed to restore or preserve equal access to education, protect safety, or deter sexual harassment without unreasonably burdening the other party
 - Counseling, extensions of deadlines, modifications of work or class schedules, restrictions on contact between individuals
- Confidential to the extent it will not impair the District's ability to provide supportive measures.

Supportive Measures

- Must document and record actions taken in response to report of sexual harassment including:
 - Supportive measures provided, if any;
 - Explanation as to why the Dietric's response was not deliberately indifferent;
 - That the District took measures designed to restore or preserve equal access to the District's education program or activity; and
 - If no supportive measures were offered, explanation as to why that was not clearly unreasonable based on the circumstances
- Seven (7) year retention period for the above records

Emergency Removals

- Regulations permit removing a respondent student from the education program or activity on an emergency basis if:
 - The District undertakes an individualized safety and risk analysis;
 and
 - As a result of that analysis, the District determines that an immediate threat to the physical health or safety of any students or other individuals arising from allegations of sexual harassment justifies removal; and
 - District provides respondent with notice and an opportunity to challenge the decision immediately following the removal.
- Must comply with the IDEA and any applicable IEP or 504 plan
- Not considered "disciplinary"
- Respondent employees may be placed on administrative leave

Formal Complaint

- A formal complaint is a document filed by a complainant (or parent/guardian acting on behalf of a complainant) or signed by the Title IX Coordinator
- A formal complaint trigger the grievance process
 - Note: Complainant's participation in education program or activity at time of filing
- Once filed, must complete grievance process before imposing disciplinary action
- When should the Title IX Coordinator consider filing a formal complaint?
 - Must balance against the Complainant's wishes



Formal Complaint & Response

- If formal complaint is filed, the District must evaluate whether it falls within the scope of Title IX;
 - Did the reported incident occur against a person in the United States?
 - Did the reported incident occur in the context of an "education program or activity"
 - Is the Complainant participating or attempting to participate in the District's education program or activity at the time of filing?
 - Does the alleged conduct constitute sexual harassment as defined by Title IX?

"Education Program or Activity"

- "Includes "locations, events, or circumstances over which the [school district] exercised <u>substantial</u>
 <u>control</u> over both the respondent and the context in which the sexual harassment occurs"
- On or off campus is not dispositive but should be considered when evaluating whether "substantial control" exists
- Potential basis for dismissal?

Written Notice of Allegations

- After formal complaint is received, Title IX Coordinator must provide notice to ALL parties of:
 - The District's grievance process, including any informal resolution process
 - The allegations potentially constituting sexual harassment –
 "sufficient details" and "sufficient time" requirements
 - Respondent is presumed not responsible and determination will be made at conclusion of grievance process
 - Parties are entitled to advisor of their choice
 - Parties may request to inspect and review evidence
 - Any provision in the District's Code of Conduct that prohibits knowingly making false statements or knowingly submitting false information during the grievance process

Additional Obligations Upon Receipt of Formal Complaint

- Title IX Coordinator must contact Complainant to discuss/offer supportive measures
 - May contact Respondent regarding same
- If not involved in preparing the formal complaint,
 Title IX Coordinater must contact and discuss allegations with Complainant
 - If amendment is appropriate, must notify parties
- If formal complaint sufficient to sustain a finding of sexual harassment, proceed to designate investigator and decision-maker

Informal Resolution Process

- Only AFTER a formal complaint has been filed, District may offer optional informal resolution
- Both parties must give voluntary, informed written consent to participate
- Investigation placed on hold
- Written notice requirements
- A party can decide at any time before final determination to no longer proceed with informal resolution process, and resume grievance process
- Informal resolution NOT available for sexual harassment claims by employees against students
- Cannot require waiver of formal investigation as condition of IRP
- Process must be managed by an Informal Resolution Facilitator who must be trained, unbiased and impartial.
- 30 days



Purpose of Investigations

- Gather relevant facts and relevant evidence
 - What happened?
 - What were the circumstances?
 - Who was involved?
 - Who, what, where, when why and how?
- Investigation is used to determine whether sexual harassment occursed in violation of Title IX, and to provide basis for determination on responsibility
- Burden to gather evidence and proof rests on the District not the parties.
- Failure to carry out adequate investigation may lead to potential liability



Designating Investigator

- Investigator must be Title IX trained
- Investigator must gather and objectively evaluate all relevant evidence, without prejudencent of facts
 - Complainant's sexual predisposition/prior sexual behavior
- Investigator must be free from conflicts of interest or bias against either party
 - Assess relationship, if any, between the parties and the investigator—will objectivity be compromised?
 - Is there any potential bias, or the appearance of bias?
 - Does investigator have interest in the outcome?
 - Cannot be part of the decision-making process



Investigation Process

- Must provide an equal opportunity for both parties to present witnesses and evidence
 - Follow up on all identified witnesses who may have relevant evidence
- Must allow the parties to have an advisor of their choosing present at any interviews or meetings
- Must provide advance written notice of any meetings or interviews so that the party has sufficient time to prepare



Conducting Interviews

- Listen objectively and without personal bias
- Focus on facts and relevant details
- Use open-ended questions
 - "What happened?" versus "Isn't it true that _____?"
- Ask follow-up questions to get a complete understanding of the relevant facts and information
- Avoid premature conclusions / credibility
- Note-taking



Conducting Interviews - Errors to Avoid

- Failure to interview all witnesses with relevant information
- Unreasonable delays
- Failure to listen and engage during interviews
- Hasty interviews
- Advisor participation
- Silence cell phones and put them away

Potential Dismissal of Complaint

- The investigation may lead to information that requires dismissal
 - Events occurred outside of U.S.
 - Conduct did not occur in education program of activity
 - Conduct does not constitute Title | Sexual harassment
- May also lead to information that permits dismissal:
 - In writing, Complainan with a his or her formal complaint
 - Respondent is no longer enrolled in or employed by the school district
 - Specific circumstances prevent the school district from gathering evidence sufficient to reach a determination
- Must provide parties written notice of a dismissal (mandatory or discretionary) and reasons for dismissal
- *NOTE: District may need to address under other policies or Code of Conduct*

Investigative Report

- Before completing report, Title IX Coordinator must:
 - Send to each party (including advisors, if any) all evidence directly related to the allegations, electronically or hard copy
 - Provide the parties 19 days to submit a written response
- Investigator must consider any written responses before completing his/her investigative report

Investigative Report

- Required contents of investigative report:
 - Fairly summarize relevant evidence directly related to the allegations
 - Identify allegations potentially constituting sixual harassment
 - Describe all procedural steps from receive of formal complaint
 - Address witness credibility issues, if any
- Once completed, investigative report must be sent to Title IX Coordinator, who then sends it to each party (and advisors, if any) and the decision-maker, and notifies the parties in writing that they have 10 days to:
 - Submit written response to the report
 - Sabrak written, relevant questions that the party wants asked of any party or witness
 - Submit response or questions to the decision-maker, with his/her contact information



Decision-Making Process

- Decision-maker reviews investigative report and any written responses, and handles any questions
- Decision-maker may exclude irrelevant questions but must explain any such decisions
- Cannot make credibility determinations based on status as complaint, respondent or witness
- Respondent must be presumed not responsible until determination regarding responsibility is made
- Preponderance of evidence standard
- Decision-maker issues written determination within 15 business days after close of period for last round of follow-up questions

Written Determination re: Responsibility

- Required contents:
 - Identification of the allegations potentially constituting sexual harassment
 - Description of procedural steps
 - Findings of fact supporting the determination
 - Conclusions regarding application of Code of Conduct or other policies to the facts
 - Statement of, and rationale for the result as to each allegation, including:
 - Whether or not Respondent is responsible for sexual harassment
 - Disciplinary senctions or remedies to be imposed or recommended
 - Any other remedies designed to restore/preserve equal access to District's education program or activity
 - Procedures/grounds to appeal
- Written determination is provided simultaneously to the parties, Title IX Coordinator and Superintendent

Appeals

- Either party may appeal a determination (or dismissal) on the following grounds:
 - Procedural irregularity that affected he outcome of the matter;
 - New evidence that was not reasonably available at the time the determination regarding responsibility or dismissal was made, that could affect the outcome of the matter;
 - The Title IX Coordinator, investigator(s), or decision maker(s) had a conflict of interest or bias for or against complainants or respondents generally or the individual complainant or respondent that affected the outcome of the matter.

Appeals

- 7 days to file appeal, in writing, to Title IX Coordinator
- Title IX Coordinator notifies all parties in writing of the appeal and related deadlines, as well as the individual who will decide the appeal
- 7 days to submit written response to the appeal to the Title IX Coordinator and appeal designee
- Appeal designee considers the record and information submitted on appeal
- Written decision by appeal designee
 - Issued within 10 business says after deadline for responses
 - Describe result of appeal and rationale
 - Grant or deny appleal, in whole or in part, or refer appealed issue back to grievance process if apprepriate
 - Written decision provided simultaneously to both parties and Title IX Coordinator
- Determination regarding responsibility becomes final upon issuance of appeal decision, or upon expiration of deadline to appeal



Timeframe of Grievance Process

- Regulations require "reasonably prompt timeframes for conclusion of the grievance process"
- 90 calendar days
- Potential delays or extensions of time
 - "Good cause"
- Any deadine that is extended must be communicated in writing to the parties with the reason for the extension

Retaliation Prohibited

- Retaliation against any person for exercising their rights under Title IX is prohibited.
- Applies to acts against complainants, witnesses, or any other individual involved with reporting allegations or participating in the investigation that interfere with Ttle IX rights or privileges
- Cannot discipline an individual for conduct that arises out of the same facts or circumstances as the alleged sexual harassment as a means of interfering with Title IX rights
- BUT, not retaliatory to discipline for submitting materially false statements or information in bad faith during the course of the grievance process
- Confidentiality









Ryan G. Smith Partner

T:716.842.2800 F: 716.845.6700 rsmith@websterszanyi.com

Practice Areas:

Labor & Employment (Management)
Education
Employment Litigation
Civil Rights

Education

State University of New York at Buffalo Law School, J.D. Union College, B.A.

Admitted to Practice

Ne w York State L.s. District Court, Western District of New York Second Circuit Court of Appeals

Professional Associations

Defense Research Institute
Erie County Bar Association
National School Boards Association Council of School Attorneys
New York State Association of Management Advocates for School Labor Affairs
New York State Association of School Attorneys
New York State Public Employer Relations Association
New York State School Boards Association







Angela F. Kutzfara Associate

Tel: 716.842.2800 Fax: 716.845.6709

Email: akutzfara@vebsters zanyi con

Practice Areas:

Education
Special Education
Labor & Employment (Management)
Employment Litigation
Education

Education

Duquesne University School of Law, J.D. Washington & Jerserson College, B.A. in Economics Admitted to Practice

admitted to Practice

New York State Commonwealth of Pennsylvania District Court, Western District of Pennsylvania Professional Associations

Professional Associations

Erie County Bar Association Genesee County Bar Association