

SCHOOL DISTRICT OF SOUTH ORANGE AND MAPLEWOOD, NEW JERSEY
525 Academy Street, Maplewood, NJ 07040

Peter P. Horoschak, Ed.D.
Superintendent

973-762-5600 X 1821
FAX: 973-378-9464

MEMORANDUM

TO: Board of Education Members

FM: Peter P. Horoschak

DT: 6 February 2006

RE: BUDGET ANALYSIS #4 – Cost of Athletics/Extra-Curriculars

This analysis, along with other analyses produced in response to the Board's request for information, build on similar budget analyses produced in prior years. All analyses may be found on the district's website: <http://www.somdsd.k12.nj.us/finance/AllYearsRpts.htm>.

This analysis of athletic, co-curricular and extra-curricular activities is being provided to satisfy your request for supplemental information that may be needed to compile the school district's budget for 2006-07. A separate memo analyzes the stipends and differentials included in the agreement between the South Orange Maplewood Board of Education and the South Orange Maplewood Education Association. A third analysis will explore additional funding of the athletic and student activities programs including donated funds, team fundraising, and individual expenses borne by the participants.

It should be noted that the stipend rates reported in these documents are taken from the agreement between the South Orange Maplewood Board of Education and the South Orange Maplewood Education Association for the school years 2002-2005. The agreement for 2006-2009 has not been settled as of the time of this analysis and stipends may change as a result of this agreement.

Identification of Need

Athletic, co-curricular and extra-curricular activity programs are an essential part of the texture of a school. The extent of student involvement in activities contributes positively to school culture and is often a measure of school climate; that is, activities provide the students with opportunities to excel outside of the classroom, be involved in school functions, establish and develop relationships with their peers, expand their individual interests, and learn to work and succeed in a group/team environment. Student activity programs greatly support the district's interpersonal relationship goal. Many problems can be averted by energizing programs and broadening participation. Good student activity programs do not happen by accident. They grow out of staff, student and community creativity, commitment and sensitivity to student needs. As architects of these programs, we must keep basic design features in mind, including, but not limited to:

- Develops leadership
- Is inclusive
- Stresses learning
- Enhances self-image
- Promotes health
- Fosters a safe school environment
- Reinforces ethical behavior, and
- Builds pride

To succeed in reaching the greatest number of students, the programs must strike a balance between:

- Athletic
- Artistic
- Career related and service organizations
- Small group and large group activities
- Competitive and cooperative activities for both males and females for all grade levels

Such a balance can only occur if students join in. To boost participation, there are a number of significant measures and strategies that must be taken. One of the critical responsibilities of the activity program is to provide qualified and energetic adult leaders. Whenever possible, coaches and advisors should come from the ranks of the regular teaching staff. Ideally, when student activities function best there is an expectation that every staff member will provide leadership for one or more extra-curricular activities. A well-rounded student activity program takes time, effort and a financial commitment on behalf of the school district and its entire staff. The payoff is better behavior and better feelings within the school and the community.

The district provides supervision in the form of coaches for the athletic programs, as well as transportation, equipment, funds for officials, fees and other related expenses. The district provides supervision in the form of club/activity advisors for the co-curricular and extra-curricular activities.

The stipends paid for this supervision at CHS are as follows:

CHS Cost of Supervision for Athletics, Co- & Extra-Curricular Activities			
Athletic Stipends 2005-06		Co- & Extra-Curricular Stipends 2005-06	
Baseball V	\$4,986	Academic Challenge	\$2,447
Baseball AV	\$3,551	Assembly	\$2,367
Baseball 9	\$2,849	Astronomy	\$2,776
Basketball BV	\$5,992	Brass Ensemble	\$2,856
Basketball ABV	\$4,263	Channel 35	\$5,457
Basketball GV	\$5,992	Chess	\$2,776
Basketball AGV	\$4,263	Choral	\$2,776
Basketball B9	\$2,849	GAIA	\$2,776
Basketball G9	\$2,849	Columbian Publ.	\$2,776
Cheerleading	\$2,849	FBLA	\$2,776
Color Guard	\$2,849	Guildscript	\$2,776
Cross Country BV	\$4,263	Jazz Ensemble	\$2,776
Cross Country GV	\$4,263	Junior States of America	\$2,367
Fencing B	\$3,551	Key Club	\$2,367
Fencing G	\$3,551	Marching Band P/T	\$4,148
Field Hockey V	\$4,986	Marching Band Assistant	\$2,367
Field Hockey AV	\$3,551	MLKA	\$2,776
Field Hockey 9	\$2,849	Math Computer Lab	\$1,906
Football V	\$7,615	Math Computer Lab	\$1,906
Football AV (6 coaches)	\$29,916	Math Computer Lab	\$1,906
Gymnastics GV	\$4,263	Math Computer Lab	\$1,906
Indoor Track BV	\$4,263	Math Team	\$2,776
Indoor Track GV	\$4,263	Mock Trial	\$2,367
Lacrosse BV	\$4,986	Music Director	\$5,457
Lacrosse BAV	\$3,551	Newspaper	\$5,457
Lacrosse B9	\$2,849	Orchestra	\$2,776
Lacrosse GV	\$4,986	Parnassian	\$3,446

LacrosseGAV	\$3,551	Public Announcements	\$2,367
Lacrosse G9	\$2,849	Quiz Bowl	\$2,776
Outdoor Track BV	\$4,986	Set Construction	\$2,367
Outdoor Track GV	\$4,986	Set Painting	\$2,367
Outdoor Track ABV	\$3,551	Science Team	\$2,776
Outdoor Track AGV	\$3,551	Stage Crew Director	\$4,871
Soccer BV	\$4,986	Yearbook	\$5,457
Soccer ABV	\$3,551	Freshman Class Advisor	\$2,776
Soccer ABV	\$3,551	Sophomore Class Advisor	\$3,446
Soccer GV	\$4,986	Junior Class Advisor	\$3,446
Soccer AGV	\$3,551	Senior Class Advisor	\$4,148
Softball V	\$4,986	Student Council	\$4,871
Softball AV	\$3,551	NJNER	\$1,651
Softball AV	\$3,551		
Swimming BV	\$4,263		
Swimming GV	\$4,263		
Tennis BV	\$4,263		
Tennis GV	\$4,263		
Volleyball V	\$4,263		
Volleyball AV	\$3,551		
Wrestling V	\$6,002		
Wrestling AV	\$4,263		
TOTAL PAID IN 2005-06	228,316	TOTAL PAID IN 2005-06	122,582

**Please Note: The above stipends reflect those listed in the 2002-2005 Agreement between the SOMBOE and SOMEA (the "Agreement").*

At CHS, approximately 1,205 students participate in athletics at a cost of \$189 per student (the cost paid for stipends divided by the number of students participating in athletics). At CHS, approximately 1,138 students who participate in co-curricular and extra-curricular activities at a cost of \$108 per student (the cost paid for stipends divided by the number of students participating in co & extra curricular activities).

The above stipends are the amounts that will be paid in the 2005-06 school year per the Agreement. The following positions, although listed in the agreement, are not being paid at CHS since the programs are not active for the 2005-06 school year.

Athletics (Stipends NOT paid in 2005-06):

Bowling	\$2,849
Golf	\$3,551
Gymnastics BV	\$4,263
Gymnastics B9	\$2,849
Outdoor Track 9	\$2,849
Tennis B9	\$2,849
Tennis G9	\$2,849
Wrestling 9	\$2,849

Co-Curricular & Extra-Curricular (Stipends NOT paid in 2005-06):

Athletic Bus	\$4,871
Intramurals F/T	\$3,855
Intramurals P/T	\$2,671
Flag	\$2,776
Minority Ach Team	\$2,699
Production	\$3,935
Student Activities	\$4,148
RCCP	\$1,651

The total costs that the district incurs for athletics at CHS, including transportation, equipment, funds for officials, fees and other related expenses, are listed below. Also included is the cost per student for each athletic program at CHS.

CHS Athletic Program Costs 2005-06

Athletic Programs	Students	Head Coaches	Asst. Coaches	Coaches Salaries	Trans.	Officials Fees Etc	Equip.	Total Cost	Cost Per Student
Baseball BV, ABV & 9	50	1	2	11386	8400	4895	1600	26281	526
Basketball BV, ABV & 9	38	1	2	13104	8800	9500	1200	32604	858
Basketball GV, AGV & 9	47	1	2	13104	8200	7000	1200	29504	628
Cheerleading	40	1	1	2849	3500	0	1000	7349	184
Color Guard	23	1	0	2849	0	0	0	2849	124
Cross Country BV	21	1	0	4263	2975	600	500	8338	397
Cross Country GV	25	1	0	4263	2975	600	500	8338	334
Fencing BV	60	1	0	3551	3400	1500	1500	9951	166
Fencing GV	66	1	0	3551	3400	820	1500	9271	140
Field Hockey V, AV & 9	58	1	2	11386	5950	3780	1700	22816	393
Football V & AV	70	1	6	37531	6550	7200	13440	64721	925
Gymnastics GV	20	1	0	4263	2450	775	1000	8488	424
Indoor Track BV	65	1	0	4263	4000	3082	500	11845	182
Indoor Track GV	61	1	0	4263	4000	3082	500	11845	194
Lacrosse BV, ABV & 9	57	1	3	11386	11200	5434	1800	29820	523
Lacrosse GV, AGV & 9	66	1	3	11386	7350	5435	1800	25971	394
Outdoor Track BV, ABV	65	1	1	8537	5600	1698	1500	17335	267
Outdoor Track GV, AGV	67	1	1	8537	5600	1698	1500	17335	259
Soccer BV & ABV	68	1	2	12088	7000	5430	1800	26318	387
Soccer GV, JV	50	1	1	8537	3850	3320	1800	17507	350
Softball V, AV (2)	50	1	2	12088	7350	5005	1500	25943	519
Swimming BV	14	1	0	4263	1200	867	1000	7330	524
Swimming GV	23	1	0	4263	1400	867	1200	7730	336
Tennis BV	22	1	0	4263	3500	94	1200	9057	412
Tennis GV	18	1	0	4263	4200	90	1200	9753	542
Volleyball V, AV	42	1	1	7814	3850	3235	1200	16099	383
Wrestling V & AV	35	1	1	10265	3850	3605	1800	19520	558
Total	1221	27	30	228316	130550	79612	45440	483918	396

The total costs that the district incurs for co-curricular and extra-curricular activities at CHS are listed below. Also included is the cost per student for each co-curricular and extra-curricular activity at CHS.

CHS Co & Extra Curricular Program Costs 2005-06

Co & Extra Curricular Programs	Students	Support Salaries	Other Costs	Total Cost	Cost per Student
Academic Challenge	15	\$2,447		\$2,447	\$163
Assembly	0	\$2,367		\$2,367	\$0
Astronomy	30	\$2,776		\$2,776	\$93
Brass Ensemble	26	\$2,856		\$2,856	\$110
Channel 35	40	\$5,457		\$5,457	\$136
Chess	20	\$2,776		\$2,776	\$139
Choral	60	\$2,776		\$2,776	\$46
Columbian Publication	23	\$2,776		\$2,776	\$121
FBLA	25	\$2,776		\$2,776	\$111
Freshman Class Adv	4	\$2,776		\$2,776	\$694
GAIA	25	\$2,776		\$2,776	\$111
Guild script	25	\$2,776		\$2,776	\$111
Jazz Ensemble	19	\$2,776		\$2,776	\$146
Jr States of America	15	\$2,367		\$2,367	\$158
Junior Class Adv	17	\$3,446		\$3,446	\$203
Key Club	40	\$2,367		\$2,367	\$59
Marching Band P/T	64	\$6,515		\$6,515	\$102
Math Computer Lab	0	\$7,624		\$7,624	\$0
Math Team	21	\$2,776		\$2,776	\$132
MLKA	130	\$2,776		\$2,776	\$21
Mock Trial	20	\$2,367		\$2,367	\$118
Music Director	100	\$5,457		\$5,457	\$55
Newspaper	76	\$5,457		\$5,457	\$72
NJNER	0	\$1,651		\$1,651	\$0
Orchestra	17	\$2,776		\$2,776	\$163
Parnassian	50	\$3,446		\$3,446	\$69
Public Announcements	35	\$2,367		\$2,367	\$68
Quiz Bowl	12	\$2,776		\$2,776	\$231
Science Team	8	\$2,776		\$2,776	\$347
Senior Class Adv	45	\$4,148		\$4,148	\$92
Set Construction	50	\$2,367		\$2,367	\$47
Set Painting	21	\$2,367		\$2,367	\$113
Sophomore Class Adv	12	\$3,446		\$3,446	\$287
Stage Crew Dir	50	\$4,871		\$4,871	\$97
Student Council	28	\$4,871		\$4,871	\$174
Yearbook	15	\$5,457		\$5,457	\$364
Total	1138	\$122,582	\$0	\$122,582	\$108

The stipends paid for supervision at Maplewood Middle and South Orange Middle Schools are as follows:

**Cost of Supervision for Co-Curricular & Extra-Curricular Activities
at MMS & SOMS**

Stipends 2005-06

Choral	\$2,776
Intramurals	\$2,671
Intramurals	\$2,671
Intramurals	\$2,671
MLKA	\$2,367
Musical Drama	\$5,457
Orchestra	\$2,776
Production	\$4,148
Scenery Construction	\$2,367
Scenery Design	\$2,367
Student Council	\$2,367
Yearbook	\$2,367
Total Paid in 2005-06	\$35,005.00

The stipends listed above are amounts that will be paid in the 2005-06 school year at both Maplewood Middle School and South Orange Middle School per the Agreement. The Coor/TCH-Gifted Club stipend, although listed in the Agreement, is not being paid at either middle school since the program is not active for the 2005-06 school year.

The district expenditures for the activities at the two middle schools are minor. They have been provided as a point of reference and have been excluded from this overall cost analysis.

Alternative Approaches

The following alternatives are presented for consideration by the district's administration:

Option 1: Eliminate athletic, co-curricular and extra-curricular activities

The district can eliminate all athletic, co-curricular and extra-curricular activities at Columbia High School and save approximately \$600,000 per year. Elimination of the programs at the middle schools would save approximately \$65,000 per year.

Option 2: Charge a Participation Fee (Individual charge for participation in each/every athletic and/or co-curricular and extra-curricular activity)

The district can consider the adoption of a policy of charging students at CHS a "participation fee" for each athletic, co-curricular and extra-curricular activity in which they choose to participate. The student would be required to pay the "cost per student" amount for each activity in which they are involved. The district can opt to set the participation fee at 100% in order to recover all of the district's costs (approximately \$600,000). The district can also opt to set the participation fee at 50% in order to recover half of the district's costs (approximately \$300,000).

Impact

This option will greatly affect the students who are involved in more than one activity. These students would be burdened with a greater expense depending on the number of activities in which they choose to participate. This option would require the incorporation of an extensive system of record keeping and management. Additionally, this consideration creates an inherent inequity in the cost of participation in interscholastic and co-curricular and/or extra-curricular activities. Further consideration can be given to the establishment of a hybrid model whereby a separate fee can be assessed for athletics versus student activities.

Option 3: Charge an Activity Fee (One-time charge for participation in any/all athletics and/or co-curricular and extra-curricular activities)

The district can adopt the policy of charging an "activity fee" to each student who wants to participate in any athletic and/or co-curricular activity. A version of this activity fee policy would be that the district would charge each student at CHS an activity fee of \$200.00. Once the student pays the \$200.00 fee, the student can participate in one activity or multiple activities for the single fee. The district would collect approximately \$240,000 in activity fees at CHS per year that would offset some of the district's expenses (details of the calculation are shown in the *Impact* section of this option). This plan can be perceived as an inequity for the students who are involved in only one activity or as an incentive for a student to participate in multiple activities.

Another variation of the activity fee policy would be to charge an activity fee of \$300.00 per student to a student who wants to be involved in an athletic program or an athletic program in conjunction with a co-curricular and/or extra-curricular activity. An activity fee of \$200.00 per student would be charged to a student who wants to be involved in co-curricular and extra-curricular activities and not in athletics. This option would require extensive record keeping and management and will not be part of this analysis.

Impact

If the district adopts the activity fee concept of charging \$200.00 per student at Columbia High School, the policy would assist in offsetting the district's costs for the activities. The fee must be paid by a student who wants to participate in an athletic or co-curricular activity. The fee, as previously stated, is per student and is a once a year charge, and the students who pay the fee can participate in multiple activities. If the student does not wish to participate in any activities, the fee does not have to be paid. Any student who is eligible for a "free or reduced price meal" would be exempt from paying the activity fee. (This exemption would apply to both the participation fee concept and the activity fee concept.) The activity fee, once paid, would be non-refundable.

The district would be able to collect approximately \$240,000 in activity fees at Columbia High School, which could reduce the 2006-07 budget. This amount is calculated as follows:

Students at CHS	2,008
Students Participating in Activities/Athletics	1,500
Percentage of students eligible for free or reduced meals	19%
Students that would be required to pay the activity fee	1,215*
Fee per Student	\$200
Total Collected for Activity Fees	\$243,000

** this number reflects a 19% reduction in the number of students as a result of 285 free or reduced lunch students who would be exempt*

In-House Counsel was unable to find a ruling that prevents the district from adopting a policy to charge an activity fee. The Essex County Business Administrator has announced that he is not aware of any law or legal reason preventing the adoption of an activity fee policy. The Glen Ridge School District has adopted an activity fee for its high school and charges \$200 for each student who wants to participate in any athletic, co-curricular and extra-curricular activities. The policy of charging an activity fee has also been adopted by the Ridgewood and the Haddonfield school districts.

Option 4: Eliminate Freshman Teams – Only Offer Varsity and Sub-Varsity Teams

The district can eliminate all freshman teams and offer sports only at a varsity and sub-varsity level, resulting in savings of coaches' salaries of \$34,000, transportation of \$23,000 and fees of \$13,000, for annual savings of approximately \$70,000 per year. This will impact the following freshmen sports teams: Baseball, Boys Basketball, Girls Basketball, Field Hockey, Football, Boys Lacrosse, Girls Lacrosse, Boys Soccer and Softball.

Impact

The district will have freshmen and sophomores on the sub-varsity teams, and the juniors and seniors will be on the varsity teams. The teams are segregated in this manner so freshmen are not competing against juniors. This will require the district to find other districts that group their teams in the same manner so schedules can be devised for the sub-varsity teams. This approach will also result in fewer students being able to participate in these sports. Since the number of teams will be reduced, the number of students who can participate in these nine teams will also be reduced.

Option 5: Explore alternate means of funding

It is recommended that an investigation of a variety of ideas, plans and solutions to find extra funding to subsidize the Board's funding of athletics and co-curricular and extra-curricular activities be conducted (e.g., corporate or local business sponsorships; field signs/billboards; team shirts).

A separate analysis is being conducted to determine the amount of fundraising already being done to support athletics and activities outside of the Board's funding. Many teams have portions of their activities, including coaching positions, supported by donated or privately raised funds. The analysis will also explore existing costs to individual students for participation in specific athletics or activities.

Conclusion

Elimination or a substantial reduction in the athletic, co-curricular and extra-curricular activity programs would result in superficial cost savings. The real cost of reduction would be overwhelming, in that, our community demands a comprehensive educational program (inclusive of a high quality academic offering and broad-based social and extra-curricular student involvement). The Board of Education and the administration would be better served by investigating creative ways and means to subsidize the high costs of a comprehensive student activities program. The design and application of alternative funding sources must be administered in a fair, equitable, and consistent fashion. This type of program would necessitate an in-depth review of relevant Board of Education policies and regulations.

JC/CS/PPH/sas