

MANCHESTER-SHORTSVILLE CENTRAL SCHOOL DISTRICT
1506 Route 21, Shortsville, NY 14548
Board of Education

Regular Session

April 12, 2023

6:30 PM

Members Present:

Barbara Gardner, President
Heather Bachman, Vice President
Lisa Lombardi
Matt Schaertl
James Simmons
Scott Van Aken
Amy Walton

Others Present:

Charlene Dehn, Superintendent
Kimberly Brown, Board Clerk

Members Absent:

None

CALL TO ORDER:

The scheduled monthly meeting of the Manchester-Shortsville Central School District Board of Education was called to order on April 12, 2023, in the elementary school cafeteria at approximately 6:30 p.m. by President Gardner.

Amendment of agenda:

I. EXECUTIVE SESSION:

Moved by Lisa Lombardi, seconded by Amy Walton, and carried unanimously: RESOLVED, that the Board hereby enter Executive Session in accordance to the open meeting law at 6:31 p.m. to discuss:

Personnel

President Gardner moved the Board back into public session at 7:01 p.m.

II. PUBLIC COMMENT:

None

III. PRESENTATIONS:

Character Strong, SEL/Mental Health/MTSS Update – Building Principals

SRO Update – Deputy Potter

IV. OLD BUSINESS:

Budget Presentation Highlights
Tim Burns, School Business Administrator

V. NEW BUSINESS:

Budget

A motion by Lisa Lombardi, seconded by Heather Bachman, and unanimously approved: RESOLVED, that the Board hereby accepts the recommendation of the Superintendent to adopt the proposed 2023-2024 Budget with expenditures of \$22,332,392 and place before the voters on May 16, 2023.

Contingent Budget

A motion by Scott Van Aken, seconded by James Simmons, and unanimously approved: RESOLVED, that the Board hereby accepts the recommendation of the Superintendent to present a contingent budget of \$22,176,858, which is \$155,534 less than the proposed budget to be voted on May 16, 2023.

Property Tax Report Card

A motion by Heather Bachman, seconded by Lisa Lombardi, and unanimously approved: RESOLVED, that the Board hereby accepts the recommendation of the Superintendent to approve the Property Tax Report Card.

Bus Proposition

A motion by James Simmons, seconded by Scott Van Aken, and unanimously approved: RESOLVED, that the Board hereby accepts the recommendation of the Superintendent to authorize the release of funds from the Bus Reserve for the payment of two (2) new full-size diesel buses not to exceed \$359,000 during the school year 2023-2024, upon voter approval on May 16, 2023.

Establish Capital Reserve

A motion by James Simmons, seconded by Lisa Lombardi, and unanimously approved: RESOLVED, that the Board hereby accepts the recommendation of the Superintendent to authorized and directed to establish a reserve fund pursuant to Education Law Section 3651 to be known as the "Capital Reserve Fund", for the purpose of financing, in whole or in part, additions, alterations, renovations, or other improvements to (i) said School District's buildings and facilities, including the acquisition and installation of machinery, equipment, apparatus, or furnishings required for the purposes of such buildings and facilities, and (ii) playgrounds, athletic fields, recreation areas, parking areas, roadways, sidewalks, and other site improvements connected to such buildings and facilities, with the ultimate amount of such reserve fund not to exceed Eight Million Dollars (\$8,000,000) plus any accrued earnings on amounts deposited in such reserve fund, the probable existence of said reserve fund being ten (10) years, but said reserve fund to continue in existence for its stated purpose until liquidated in accordance with Education Law, and the source from which funds shall be obtained for said reserve fund being: (a) current and future unappropriated fund balances from the General Fund of the School District, as directed by the Board of Education, (b) any other appropriations authorized by the voters from time to time, (c) fund balances transferred from other reserve funds of the School District, as may be authorized by the Board of Education or the voters from time to time in accordance with applicable State law, and (d) state aid, as directed by the Board of Education from time to time.

VI. APPROVAL OF MINUTES:

A motion by Heather Bachman, seconded by James Simmons, and unanimously approved: RESOLVED, that the minutes of the March 8, 2023, Board of Education regular meeting be approved as presented.

A motion by Lisa Lombardi, seconded by Amy Walton, and unanimously approved: RESOLVED, that the minutes of the March 22, 2023, Board of Education work session meeting be approved as presented.

VII. PERSONNEL REPORT:

Resignation

It was moved by Lisa Lombardi, seconded by Heather Bachman, and unanimously approved: RESOLVED, that upon the recommendation of the Superintendent, to accept with regret the resignation of **Renee Baker**, Cleaner, effective, March 21, 2023.

Leave

It was moved by Lisa Lombardi, seconded by James Simmons, and unanimously approved: RESOLVED, that the Board hereby accepts the recommendation of the Superintendent, to grant a FMLA to **Melissa Smith**, Teacher, beginning on or about May 23, 2023, and ending on or about June 23, 2023.

It was moved by Lisa Lombardi, seconded by Heather Bachman, and unanimously approved: RESOLVED, that the Board hereby accepts the recommendation of the Superintendent, to make appointments as per the consensus agenda.

APPOINTMENTS/DAILY SUBSTITUTES:

Danielle Pietropaolo - Canandaigua	Appointment as a Daily Substitute Teacher, K-12 for the 2022-2023 school year. Certification: Childhood Ed 1-6& SWD 1-6 (Emergency COVID-19 certification)
Samantha Sheldon - Shortsville	Appointment as a Daily Substitute Teacher, K-12 for the 2022-2023 school year. Certification: None

APPOINTMENTS/NON-INSTRUCTIONAL:

Karen Roncone - Shortsville	Appointment as a Substitute School Bus Monitor – for the 2022-2023 school year, effective, March 8, 2023 - \$14.50/hr.
Karen Roncone - Shortsville	Appointment as a Substitute Food Service Helper – for the 2022-2023 school year, effective, March 8, 2023 - \$14.50/hr.
Karen Roncone - Shortsville	Appointment as a Substitute Teacher Aide – for the 2022-2023 school year, effective, March 8, 2023 - \$14.50/hr.
Alan Schutt - Canandaigua	Appointment as a Cleaner – for the 2022-2023 school year, effective, March 31, 2023 - \$14.75/hr.
Karen Madera Peggy Beers	Chief Inspector of Election - \$15.00/hr Election Worker for the 2023-2024 budget vote - \$15.00/hr

VIII. COMMITTEE ON SPECIAL EDUCATION/PRE-SCHOOL SPECIAL EDUCATION:

It was moved by Amy Walton, seconded by Scott Van Aken, and unanimously approved: RESOLVED, that the Board hereby accepts the recommendation of the Superintendent to approve the CSE and CPSE recommendations.

IX. REPORTS AND CORRESPONDENCE:

Superintendent Dehn commented on the following topics:

Congratulations: Congratulations to the cast, crew, and all our wonderful volunteers for the outstanding production of Cinderella. Even with some weather-related practice cancellations, they put on a tremendous show! Thank you to our music department, our talented students, dedicated volunteers, and to the entire cast and crew for such a fantastically entertaining production. It was a lot of fun to watch.

Class of 2023 Valedictorian and Salutatorian:

Abigail (Abby) Lepel is the Valedictorian of Red Jacket's class of 2023 who finished seven semesters of study with the highest cumulative GPA. During her time at RJ, Abby has been enrolled in FLCC's Early Scholars Program and has taken multiple AP classes. She is a member of National Honor Society, plays three Varsity sports, and is active in RJ's music program. Abby has earned awards for: Wells College 21st Leadership, St. Michael's College Book, Social Studies Excellence, RIT Creativity and Innovation, and Distinguished Scholars.

After graduation from Red Jacket, Abby is hoping to be chosen for an internship at a local firm in Rochester before she heads off to a five-year degree program for her Bachelors of Architecture. She is aiming to work for an architecture firm while she pursues her Masters.

Ethan Schaertl is the Salutatorian of Red Jacket's Class of 2023 who finished seven semesters of study with the second highest cumulative GPA. Ethan is the son of Eric and Donna Schaertl. While at Red Jacket, Ethan has taken multiple AP classes and is a member of National Honor Society. He serves as Student Council President, participates in three Varsity sports, and is a member of Concert Band. He has also been recognized for multiple awards: American Legion Boys State, Distinguished Scholar, Philip N. Bredesen Leadership, Math Outstanding Student, RIT Computing and Scholarship Program, RPI Math and Science, Red Jacket Rotary Award for Character, RIT Creativity and Innovation, and Spanish IV Excellence. After high school, Ethan will be attending FLCC and then transfer to RIT to major in Civil Engineering.

April is National Autism Awareness Month: It is estimated that 1 in 68 children in the United States is diagnosed with Autism or Autism Spectrum Disorder. Symptoms are usually noticed by parents within the child's first three years of age. Approximately one third of people with autism remain nonverbal and it is estimated that one third has an intellectual disability. Social interactions, verbal and nonverbal communication, limited interest in activities, a need for routine all may be characteristics of a person with autism. People with autism have unique strengths and differences. The month of April is nationally recognized as Autism Awareness month. The color blue is the designated color for autism awareness. Each year our schools promote Autism Awareness to celebrate the unique characteristics that make each of us special and important.

First Responders Tax Exemption Follow-Up: Our school attorneys are in agreement that a school district should not place the First Responder's exemption on the ballot in May. The statute requires the School Board to approve a resolution authorizing the exemption after a public hearing. By placing this issue on the ballot for voter approval, it would be

considered an advisory proposition. It is only “advisory” because the School Board must still act via resolution to authorize the exemption.

The Commissioner has consistently and very strongly advised against such propositions. In large part because they give the voters the impression of having the ability to make decisions they cannot. More importantly, the School Board will still need to act. The School Board cannot delegate its decision-making authority on this issue to the voters. The public hearing, which had to occur in March, is the forum in which the Board can hear from the public and factor such information into its decision. This will need to be explored next school year.

Follow-up Regarding Matt Schaertl’s Document: The day before the Board of Education’s July reorganizational meeting, one of our Board members, Matt Schaertl, emailed me and the Board of Education a 10-page document of items that he would like discussed and addressed. At the reorganizational meeting on July 13, 2022, Matt referenced the document he sent and indicated that he did not receive a response. A brief discussion occurred and Board members indicated that addressing all of the items in the document would take some time as the list he provided is extensive. It was also explained that the Board has regular responsibilities to address and business to conduct at the monthly meetings. Additionally, in August, I responded to one of Matt’s emails and again said, “Barb, Heather, and I have discussed the 10-page email you sent to the Board and we plan to work items into future Board meetings.” And, this is exactly what we have been doing.

Throughout the year, we have been addressing relevant items on Matt’s list. During the October 12, 2023 Board meeting, I addressed a few of the items on Matt’s list and once again explained that we are addressing the items when they make sense to address them. For example, capital project or budget related questions were answered during the capital project and budget presentations. There are also items that I answered even though they may not be in the Board’s realm of responsibilities. In these cases, the reason I provided a response was to correct the incorrect, false, or misleading information that was provided in Matt’s list or to advocate on behalf of our staff and students.

Matt requested a response regarding the following information he provided to the Board of Education and myself in his document:

The Shortsville band won first place at the World’s Fair in NYC. The following year, they did it again. There was a time when every student was given the ability to choose any instrument they wanted to play. Everyone was in the band. Studies have shown that learning a musical instrument in childhood increases cognitive and reasoning skills. A few years ago, the school band instructor and I looked at what it would cost to provide an instrument to every 4th, 5th and 6th grader. The cost was roughly \$35,000 as I recall and that was based on preferred instruments where flutes were \$300. Flutes can be purchased for \$90 on the internet (cheaper than renting). There were some discussions about what would be best for “a band” and what happens in 7th grade. The band isn’t the goal, and if they stop in 7th grade, that’s OK. It’s the brain development I am interested in and the impact on the academics. If they want to continue onwards, fantastic. If they want to do it occasionally as an escape from reality or emotional release, great.

Response: We have not been able to find any evidence that the Shortsville Band attended, participated in, or won first place during the 1939 or 1940 World’s Fairs that were held in NYC.

All students have the opportunity to play an instrument and join the band. When cost is an issue for families, the school loans out the instruments we have. We always try to accommodate the needs of our students. Our band director works with the business administrator to budget for purchases requested within the department, including any requests they may make to purchase instruments.

A few years ago, Matt reached out to the school and offered to pay for instruments for all our students in 4th, 5th and 6th grade. The cost was roughly \$35,000. The caveat was that Matt wanted the District to require that all the students play an instrument. Even if Matt generously donated the funds, there was not a viable plan to sustain this cost over time. While there is research to support the benefits of playing an instrument, parents should make this decision with and for their children, not a community member, Board member, or Superintendent.

Since we are heading into the final months of school, we thought it was appropriate to address Matt’s questions and opinions on summer school.

Summer school

- *Why are we not duplicating what other schools have done (Waterloo), where all 4 hours of school are in the AM M-Th in lieu of our schedule of T-F 2 hours in the morning and 2 hours in the afternoon? This allows staff and families to enjoy more of the summer while spending the same amount of time in class?*
- *This eliminates the afternoon bus runs saving us money and reducing maintenance.*

- *Less of distraction for summer cleaners*
- *Eliminates the "hot classroom" issue*
- *We told the public that the library is being used for summer school and was part of the issue with the community library. How are we fitting all of these students and different grades in the library?*
- *If A/C is required to teach, should we have remote school learning on high heat index days similar to snow days?*

Response: Summer school is coordinated regionally through BOCES. Summer Learning Clinic is held in our school. The Summer Learning Clinic schedules have been determined by our teachers and their availability, along with consideration for their student's needs. Our teachers use the school library that is air conditioned, they may periodically take students outdoors, and when the temperature is not too hot, they may use classrooms. The school library is fully utilized throughout the summer for instruction, professional development, and meetings. For staff working during the summer who are not in air-conditioned spaces, we have flexed their hours to avoid working during the hottest time of the day or during days where the temperatures are dangerously high. Summer school has been typically held at Victor or Canandaigua.

Matt also provided the Board of Education and myself with this opinion in his document:

Any activity where students from our school compete against students from other schools is considered by me to be a sport and should be funded like any other team. This includes teams we are not funding such as Robotics and Shooting Sports.

Response: Red Jacket currently offers thirty-two (32) clubs with the total number of active clubs at thirty (30). The District pays a stipend to the club advisors and, when needed, the District pays for transportation. Six (6) of the thirty-two clubs are competitive.

Clay Target Club was started by Bill Lawrence and Jeff Gallahan and was supported by the entire Board and myself. Mr. Gallahan told the Board that there would be no cost to the District for this club. Like all the other clubs, this club could do fundraising activities, but they have chosen not to. The District pays the advisor a stipend and pays for transportation. Mr. Lawrence asked the District to annually pay for shirts the students could keep. This would be considered a gift of public funds. The District offered to pay for a uniform top that would be turned in at the end of the Club's season, but they declined the offer. In the past, Mr. Gallahan and Mr. Lawrence said they had gotten funds from the National Rifle Association (NRA) to help pay for supplies and they stated that the Shortsville Rod and Gun Club has been supporting the Club. Parents are responsible for paying for ammunition and rifles. All clubs have a fundraising mechanism. To date, Clay Target Club has chosen not to do fundraising. We are grateful to the generosity and commitment our community members have provided to support the Clay Target Club.

Matt recently conducted "research" for the Board on schools who recognize Clay Target as a sport rather than a club. He provided the Board with the name of one (1) school that provides it as a sport. While we value both sports and club offerings, it seems that there may be a perception that sports are more important than clubs. We have purposefully increased our club offerings over the years so that more students can participate in a wider variety of extracurricular activities. An important benefit to expanding our club offerings is that students can participate in clubs and athletics simultaneously, without having to make a choice for one over another.

As has been discussed previously, it is inappropriate for individual Board members to conduct "research," make inquiries or speak on behalf of the Board. When Matt reached out to a business official from another school district to ask about their "shooting sport," he said he was "researching how other public schools fund or support their shooting sports in an attempt to mimic other districts." When asked if he was a school business official, Matt responded with, "BOE doing research for a presentation to other BOE." Then Matt emailed the Red Jacket Board with his "research" findings that included information from one school. It seems deceptive to me that Matt chose to exclude me from the email he sent to the Board, and then chose not to provide the Board with complete information. This lack of transparency is disappointing, concerning, and must serve a purpose. President Gardner provided me with the email so I could look into this further. Here are the facts. In the WFL BOCES Region, consisting of twenty-six (26) schools, there are twelve (12) schools who currently offer Clay Target as a club, one (1) school offers it as a sport, and thirteen (13) schools do not offer Clay Target at all. Additionally, I would like to note that at this time, Clay Target is not a Section V sanctioned sport.

Recently Matt emailed the business administrator with several questions and requests. Just as a reminder, individual questions from individual board members should be sent to the Board President and Superintendent and not to individual staff members. Individual Board members should not be making requests of staff. The Board President and/or Superintendent will either address the question, provide the information to the entire Board if they feel it is beneficial, or bring it to the Executive Committee for consideration to add the question(s) to the Board of Education meeting agenda.

One of the requests Matt made to the Business Administrator is:

Please send me the current contract for the teachers (or a cut and paste of the section). Specifically, as it relates to the preference of teachers as coaches, the expiration date, and when you typically begin negotiations.

Since this is a topic that we have addressed several times in the past and is being requested once again, I included the information in my Board report. I would like to note that while the Superintendent makes the annual appointment recommendations to the Board for coaching positions, qualifications and certifications are to be made in accordance with the Regulations of the Commissioner of Education and not made simply by a subjective choice of the Superintendent, Athletic Director, or Board members. I provided the Board with the contractual language in my report. I am not going to read it to the Board.

Board of Education member Matt Schaertl's responses to the Superintendent Dehn's statements from the April 12, 2023 Board meeting and comments from Board of Education President Barbara Gardner:

Response from Mr. Matt Schaertl:

At the first meeting as a BOE member, on the first presentation, on the first slide, item #1 was the priority of the BOE was academics.

Brain development and academics are connected and there are MANY studies reinforcing learning instrumental music increase brain development.

In Appendix F last highlighted the musical. We spend thousands in high school for a limited number of students, for a few weeks after the most critical brain development has already occurred. Both the Valedictorian and Salutatorian were active participants at an early age in the music program and it is consistently the case. I would estimate that there is also a disproportionate number of NHS students that also have or had backgrounds in early musical instruments.

It is in the best interest of the student's development to partake in instrumental learning.

Source: National Library of Medicine, National Institute of Health and US Department of Health.

World's Fair NYC:

My source for the World's Fair successes is the "Shortsville Enquirer" newspaper. It was in the 1930's. I can pull that edition if you would like. It came from the Village of Shortsville records.

Music Instruments:

The discussions years ago about the financial donation for musical instruments had two requirements: The first is that it would be anonymous, and the source would never be mentioned, and the other is that all students would participate. A copy of the email can be pulled from the RJ server (email dated 3-3-21 to the Assistant Superintendent). If the school no longer has server access, I still have the email. I am not attaching the email as the last portion of it discusses a student in need. If you wish to see the email confidentially, I can send it to you. Student portion of email has been removed.

President Gardner's Comments: The two (2) Musical Production Directors are contractual positions and paid on step. The stipend range for 2022-2023 is \$3,561-\$4,329, and is based on the step the director is in. The directors are paid out of the General Fund. The number of students involved each year is between 40-60 and they practice, on average, for around 3 months. For the latest play (Cinderella), the RJ Music Club took in a profit around \$5,000 after expenses were paid. This amount is carried over to the next year for Musical startup funds.

The Superintendent acknowledged the connection between music and brain development. The issue was that the caveat to Mr. Schaertl's request was that all students in grades 4, 5 and 6 would be required to play an instrument. From the Superintendent's Board Report, she stated she was not going to make it a requirement that students must play an instrument. She expressed that she believes this should be a student and parent decision.

The elementary band classroom has brand new storage units that the Band teacher selected for her newly renovated room. These units are in her band classroom and they provide ample storage space for the elementary school band program as it is currently. If *all* 4th, 5th and 6th grade students were required to play an instrument, there would need to be a storage solution. The District would address this need if it were to ever become one.

The District has an email from Mrs. Guerri to Mr. Schaertl, which expressed gratitude for his generosity and the District's commitment to involve as many students in playing instruments as possible. Again, the District was not going to commit to

forcing all students in these grade levels to play an instrument, as Mr. Schaertl requested, but the District would encourage the student involvement. The subsequent email from Mr. Schaertl, on March 11, 2021, to Mrs. Guerri expressed his personal need to pull back from his original offer.

Response from Mr. Matt Schaertl: Summer School

“Coordinated” with BOCES, is not dictated by.

I noticed there was no reference as to how summer school was conducted prior to last summer. How did that previous arrangement work for decades and all of a sudden was not possible last summer?

The reasons I offered to alter summer school are still valid (taxpayer cost savings, convenience to teachers and summer staff, ability for families to take long weekend vacations).

The air conditioners used in the administration are still in storage in the old bus garage. They were placed there when central air runs were extended to the admin areas of the school. They were offered to the school previously when the lack of A/C was used as a reason for needing the library. The response back was negative on the offer. The units are still there and still available at no-cost.

In response to the Superintendent's response that they cannot be used due to fire Code, there is nothing in NFPA 90, 90A, or 90B that indicates these units are prohibited or do not meet Code. If SED has banned them, as they are the AHJ (Authority Having Jurisdiction) for school construction, I have not found any document that states this.

<https://16557801101891546621.googlegroups.com/attach/14166db0d4a8ec/NFPA%2090A%202015%20HB-%20Std,%20Inst%20of%20AC%20and%20Ventilating%20Systems%20-%202015%20Handbook.pdf?part=0.1&vt=ANaJVrEsgyfid0BE7NJDxDye6bdNuAH10FWH6PZ5kUiZWURXAbtjC1c8cv2E9f-PzXMh-uXWWxTJ36aaXWCzLV4xisAQnA2FpsFHSnOcgVkSHOLThm75Ffk>

President Gardner's Comments: The District has partnered with WFL BOCES and area school districts to provide Summer School services to our students for many years. There was no reference to how summer school was conducted prior to last summer because, other than during the pandemic, there have been no changes. It is the most efficient and cost-effective way to provide our students with the summer school courses with the certified teachers they need to gain the credits needed toward graduation. The summer school date range is relatively standard and very predictable; however, as soon as the details are available to the District, it is communicated to those it is applicable to.

The District appreciates the offer to use the air conditioner units that have been in storage, but the Health and Safety Specialist through Genesee Valley BOCES, who conducts the District's fire and safety inspections, has stated window units would need the proper electric supply and the use of extension cords in classrooms are not allowed per the fire code. While these units may have been used by the school many years ago, they are not currently installed and in use. Adding non-existing, non-conforming window air conditioner units, that no longer meet the current ASHRAE standards, would not be approved by the New York State Education Department. The R422 refrigerant is no longer manufactured and the R410a will no longer be in use after January 1, 2024. According to our contact at Landry Mechanical, the old units cannot use alternative refrigerants and the District cannot disregard the energy code requirements.

Additionally, there are air quality health and safety concerns related to the fans blowing air potentially containing mold and mildew spores, even if the District attempted to clean them, since the units have been stored in a barn for many years.

The use of the school library for instruction, meetings and professional development and providing teachers with flexible options, currently meets everyone's needs. While the offer to use them is appreciated, there is not a need for the use of these window air conditioner units.

Response from Mr. Matt Schaertl: Shooting Sports

The team is fundraising April 29th at Budd Park in partnership with Crossman out of Bloomfield. The Shortsville Rod & Gun Club which the Superintendent has acknowledged as financially supporting the team does annual fundraising and has done for years.

The statement that I was researching “For THE Board” is incorrect. I was researching for a presentation to the BOE. The Oxford dictionary definition of presentation is “a speech or talk in which a new product, idea, or piece of work is shown and explained to an audience” with the audience being the BOE. Any knowledgeable discussion on any topic would require some research in advance. More importantly, as we all know, per the *Public-School Financial Transparency Act* of 2018,

all public-school budgets and expenditures are classified as being in the public domain and are required to be accessible to any taxpayer.

Here are two links, the first titled "*Athletic Placement Process for Interscholastic Athletic Programs*" and is authored by *The New York State Education Department Office of Curriculum and Instruction*.

<https://www.p12.nysed.gov/sss/documents/AthleticPlacementProcess12-11-17FINALRevised.pdf>

Page 25 of that document lists the requirements for 7th and 8th grader "students" to compete on the "Varsity" athletic team.

The other link is "*NYSPHSAA Section III Athletics*" listing "Rifle" as a sport with a photograph of three students from Central Square at a range. <https://section3.org/sports/rifel>

The next page has a banner in front of three female students stating "NYSPHSAA Section III Champions."

I am not sure what the other "complete information" is that the Superintendent references that implies I am withholding, but I have already forwarded the emailed information I have received. Ironically, the information that has not been shared with the BOE is what was discussed at the February meeting that the Superintendent had with others specifically regarding this topic and funding with no BOE member present. It lacks transparency from the Superintendent when a budgetary or change in policy request is made that is not disclosed to the full BOE for consideration, especially when it is made by someone that is also a State Representative.

If the "complete" information is regarding the school districts and sizes, I don't know how that would impact the decision, but Section V covers 12 counties including Rochester and Section III covers 11 counties. With Monroe County being in Section V, the decision to recognize shooting sports as sports may have different considerations and concerns.

Not including the Superintendent on all emails addressed to other BOE members:

The Superintendent is not a member of the Board. The Superintendent executes those decisions and policies the Board has enacted. If the BOE President wants to include her, as she has, that is part of her role to make that judgement.

President Gardner's Comments: Matt Schaertl independently conducted Board business when he sent an email to a business official from another school district stating he was "researching how other public schools fund or support their shooting sports in an attempt to mimic other districts." When asked if he was a school business official, Mr. Schaertl responded with, "BOE doing research for a presentation to other BOE." The Board of Education did not request a presentation on the topic from Mr. Schaertl nor did he offer to present to the Board on the topic.

Mr. Schaertl provided the Board with the name of one (1) school district that provides Clay Target as a sport rather than a club. However, in the WFL BOCES Region, consisting of twenty-six (26) schools, there are twelve (12) schools that currently offer Clay Target as a club, one (1) school offers it as a sport, and thirteen (13) schools do not currently offer Clay Target. The information Mr. Schaertl provided to the Board was inadequate if the point was to make an informed decision as to whether or not Clay Target should be a sport or a club. Mrs. Dehn pointed out the benefit of providing students with club options, is that they are also able to play sports simultaneously. Additionally, Mrs. Dehn noted that Clay Target League is currently not a Section V Athletics sanctioned sport.

The Superintendent meets with many people any given day. She does not report her meetings to the Board of Education unless there is a reason. Mr. Jeff Gallahan texted Mrs. Dehn on Monday, February 6, 2023 and requested a meeting. Mrs. Dehn invited High School Principal Bryon George to the meeting. She introduced Mr. George to Mr. Gallahan, she provided Mr. George with background on how the Clay Target Club was started, and they discussed how the Club could do fundraising to help offset the cost for parents. Mr. Gallahan was receptive to fundraising. He expressed concerns about advisor attendance and they agreed they would address the concern. The purpose of the February 16, 2023, 1:00 p.m. meeting with Mr. Gallahan was to communicate the Clay Target League Informational Meeting information and he provided Mrs. Dehn with a flyer to share with students and their parents. On February 21st, Mrs. Dehn sent the informational flyer to families through ParentSquare. There was no discussion about or requests made for any "policy" changes made at this meeting.

There was no need for Mrs. Dehn to communicate this meeting to the Board of Education. There is absolutely no issue with the Superintendent's transparency. She has always demonstrated that she values truth and transparency.

The Superintendent never said she wanted to be included in all emails, however, if we, as the Board, wanted factual and thorough information on a topic or for her to conduct research, she should have been asked and included in the communication. Instead, Mr. Schaertl took it upon himself to conduct "research" and provided the Board with incomplete information. The information he provided was, indeed, misleading.

Response from Matt Schaertl regarding the coaching portion of the RJFA contract:

The Superintendent referenced that this has been discussed previously. Since I joined the BOE, this has never been discussed. The request was made after I read the public document on file at www.seethroughny.net. My inquiry was to see if the posted file is accurate with no additional addendums that have not yet been uploaded. That section of the contract is poorly written and should be revised or clarified in a memo until the next contract is adopted. Modifications I would suggest are:

- The sentence that “members may respond” should be “members may apply.” Reason: A *response* could be “how much does it pay.” An *application* is stating you want the position.
- The statement that “the Superintendent or designee will determine if the applicant(s) are qualified and certified” should be definitive as to who is ultimately responsible. Reason: In the past, we had coaches who were not current with their certifications. Who would be held responsible in a legal situation? The AD saying it’s the Superintendent or the Superintendent saying it’s the AD (or the school as a whole because the BOE for approved the contract)
- The contract refers to the Superintendent and her “recommend appointment” (must be certified/qualified) to the BOE. In the sentence that follows, it does not say that the Superintendent has the role of recommending *non-certified* or *non-qualified* potential coaches. It only states “..outside the unit may be considered for *appointment*.” Since the other language refers to the Superintendent “recommendations” and the BOE’s “appointments” then the contract, as it is written today, implies that the Superintendent can ONLY recommended staff members which are qualified and certified and all others fall to the responsibility of the BOE. I do not believe that is the intent as it has not been the practice.
- It also does not address who can select a non-qualified person who is a member of the unit or is in the process of being certified but not completed. Is it the Superintendent because the person recommended is a member of the unit, or is it the BOE because the candidate currently lacks the certifications/qualifications?
- The phrase “in most cases” should never be used in a contract. It should be replaced with language similar to “unless otherwise directed in writing by the Board.”

(Also, not relevant to the responses but relevant to the Contract clarity: Under “Appendix C” in relation to the discussion of Coaching vs Advising I believe there are some that need to be reviewed. In full, this is what is listed:

“Coaching”

- *Musical Productions Directors (2) Level IV*
- ***Yearbook Advisors (2) Level III***
- *Robotics Level IV*
- *Jazz Band Level V*
- *Marching Band Level V*

Under “Advisors”

- *Newspaper \$1,472*
- *Student Council \$1,178*
- *NHS \$1,178*
- ***Masterminds \$735***
- *Store \$735*
- *Art Club \$735*
- ***Ski Club \$17.16 per hour)***

President Gardner’s Comments: Contracts are negotiated. The language in the referenced section(s) is old contractual language that has been in the contract prior to the Superintendent and current and past RJFA President began in their roles. For more than two decades, this is the process that has been followed. The wording of the contractual language has not been raised as an issue of concern by either negotiating party to this date.

Claims Auditor Report

2021 Capital Project Update

X. FINANCIAL REPORTS:

President Gardner acknowledged receipt of the financial and treasurer’s report on behalf of the Board.

Establishment of Drivers Education Fee

A motion by Lisa Lombardi, seconded by Heather Bachman, and unanimously approved: RESOLVED, that the Board hereby accepts the recommendation of the Superintendent to have the tuition fee for the 2023 Summer Driver’s Education Program remain at \$150.

Fixed Asset Salvage

A motion by Lisa Lombardi, seconded by Scott Van Aken, and unanimously approved: RESOLVED, that the Board hereby accepts the recommendation of the Superintendent to authorize the following items to be classified as salvage and removed from fixed assets.

Item #	Tag #	Location	Item	Reason For Disposal
1	1143	Tech Room	Lenovo 300e Chromebook Purchased 2021-PF2R3MR7	Damaged – Used for parts
2	1349	Tech Room	Lenovo 300e Chromebook Purchased 2021- PF2QT0GX	Damaged – Used for parts
3	1018	Tech Room	Lenovo 300e Chromebook Purchased 2021- PF2N92BT	Damaged – Used for parts
4	1033	Tech Room	Lenovo 300e Chromebook Purchased 2021- PF2QV03C	Damaged – Used for parts
5	1064	Tech Room	Lenovo 300e Chromebook Purchased 2021 – PF2QRTJD	Damaged – Used for parts
6	1182	Tech Room	Lenovo 300e Chromebook Purchased 2021 – PF2QV24R	Damaged – Used for parts
7	1314	Tech Room	Lenovo 300e Chromebook Purchased 2021 – PF2QV3PL	Damaged – Used for parts
8	1172	Tech Room	Lenovo 300e Chromebook Purchased 2021 – PF2QRFP2	Damaged – out of warranty
9	1189	Tech Room	Lenovo 300e Chromebook Purchased 2021- PF2R30BN	Damaged – out of warranty
10	1217	Tech Room	Lenovo 300e Chromebook Purchased 2021- PF2QTXHX	Damaged – out of warranty
11	11697	Tech Room	Lenovo 300e Chromebook Purchased 2021	Damaged
12	521	Tech Room	HP M452NM Color Laserjet Printer – VNB3C15921	Broken
13	175	Tech Room	E instruction CPS Unit 32 Remotes purchased 1995	Obsolete
14	002349	Tech Room	Camera Vertical Besseler Printmaker purchased 2002	Obsolete
15	002350	Tech Room	Camera Vertical Besseler Printmaker purchased 2002	Obsolete
16	002351	Tech Room	Camera Vertical Besseler Printmaker purchased 2002	Obsolete
17	002352	Tech Room	Camera Vertical Besseler Printmaker purchased 2002	Obsolete

18	002353	Tech Room	Camera Vertical Besseler Printmaker purchased 2002	Obsolete
19	002354	Tech Room	Camera Vertical Besseler Printmaker purchased 2002	Obsolete
20	002355	Tech Room	Camera Vertical Besseler Printmaker purchased 2002	Obsolete
21	002356	Tech Room	Camera Vertical Besseler Printmaker purchased 2002	Obsolete
22	002357	Tech Room	Camera Vertical Besseler Printmaker purchased 2002	Obsolete
23	215	Tech Room	HP Printer Purchased 2008	Damaged
24	351	Tech Room	Luems Document Camera Purchased 2008	Damaged
25	543	Tech Room	Go Pro Purchased 2017	Damaged

Cooperative Bid Program

A motion by Heather Bachman, seconded by Amy Walton, and unanimously approved: RESOLVED, that the Board hereby accepts the recommendation of the Superintendent to approve the attached cooperative bid resolution.

WFL BOCES Election and Administrative Vote

Discussion on Election and Administrative Vote – Official Vote will be on April 26, 2023.

ADJOURNMENT:

Moved by Lisa Lombardi, seconded by Amy Walton, and carried unanimously: RESOLVED, that the Board hereby stands adjourned at approximately 9:24 p.m.

Kimberly Brown, Board Clerk