[redacted]

From: Ivie Szalai [redacted]
Sent: Tuesday, October 8, 2024 2:19 PM
To: Bruder, Candace L <Candace.bruder@beaufort.k12.sc.us>
Cc: Stratos, Mary E <Mary.Stratos@beaufort.k12.sc.us>; Cartledge, Wendy B <Wendy.Cartledge@beaufort.k12.sc.us>
Subject: Re: Regulation 43-170

Good afternoon. I am just following up to get clarification if the board has acted on this. I am looking to find out if there was a motion and approval by the board to uphold their previous decisions on every single book.
Thank you for addressing this matter.
Ivie

Ivie Szalai

On Tue, Sep 24, 2024 at 12:48 PM Ivie Szalai [redacted] wrote:

> Can you clarify if the Board has addressed that they will hold true to the previous decisions made? I cannot take this to the State Board until the local Board addresses it under the new Regulation. It is not for the District to decide. If the Board has moved and voted on that stance, can you please direct me to which meeting that took place?
> Thanks, Ivie Szalai

Ivie Szalai

On Tue, Sep 3, 2024 at 4:35 PM Bruder, Candace L <Candace.bruder@beaufort.k12.sc.us> wrote:

> Dear Ms. Szalai,
> Thank you for sharing your position regarding this matter. It is however, contrary to the District's position after consulting with legal counsel in this matter. In light of the extensive review to which the 96 challenged titles from last year were subjected, the District will allow any parent to appeal those titles directly to the State Board of Education. Therefore, as previously communicated, please submit a written appeal to the State Board of Education to include the additional SC Instructional Materials Uniform Parent Complaint Form you submitted for *Flamer*, a title that has already been reviewed as part of your previous 96 book challenges.
> Regards,
> Candace
> Dr. Candace Bruder | Communications Officer
> Beaufort County School District | SC
> Office: 843-322-2432
> Cell: 843-941-9178
> Email: candace.bruder@beaufort.k12.sc.us
> Follow us! Facebook | Instagram | X
>
> **From:** Ivie Szalai [redacted]
> **Sent:** Friday, August 30, 2024 2:52 PM
> **To:** Bruder, Candace L <Candace.bruder@beaufort.k12.sc.us>
> **Cc:** Stratos, Mary E <Mary.Stratos@beaufort.k12.sc.us>; Cartledge, Wendy B <wendy.cartledge@beaufort.k12.sc.us>; Community Comments <community.comments@beaufort.k12.sc.us>
> **Subject:** Re: Regulation 43-170
>
> Thank you for your reply. While these titles have already been reviewed, that was prior to the implementation of the Regulation. As such, those reviews are null and void and the new process must be followed. The Board cannot abdicate its responsibility in reviewing these titles under current Regulatory law. We can agree that a good faith effort was made for all of the prior books therefor, as I submit them they must be addressed. I will rescind my submittal of Ugly Love and contact the principal at that school. In its place, I am submitting Flamer as book 1 of 5 for the 5 books that I am submitting for the month of August.
> Kindly, Ivie Szalai
>
> Flamer

Ivie Szalai

On Fri, Aug 30, 2024 at 12:54 PM Bruder, Candace L <Candace.Bruder@beaufort.k12.sc.us> wrote:

> Dear Ms. Szalai,
> The district is in receipt of the five SC Instructional Materials Uniform Parent Complaint Forms you submitted on August 26, 2024.
> The district has already reviewed four of the titles submitted as part of your previous 96 book challenges. The committee decisions regarding these titles and the accompanying school library materials review committee documents were submitted to the Board of Education as part the appeal process, with the committee decisions being upheld. Therefore, please submit a written appeal to the State Board of Education so the State Board can "notify the district boards in the State or shall otherwise make available to them information identifying the materials at issue in any appeal(s) pending before the State Board. Any district boards in which a challenge to the same material is also pending shall stay their proceedings and abstain from further review or the rendering of a decision to await the State Board's decision to appeal."
> Unlike the other four SC Instructional Materials Uniform Parent Complaint Forms you submitted, *Ugly Love* has not been previously reviewed by the district. As part of a "good faith effort" as detailed in SCDE Regulation 43-170, please contact the school where this title is currently in library circulation, Whale Branch Early College High School. The principal, Dr. Sonji Leach, can be reached at sonji.leach@beaufort.k12.sc.us.
> Regards,
> Candace
> Dr. Candace Bruder | Communications Officer
> Beaufort County School District | SC
> Office: 843-322-2432
> Cell: 843-941-9178
> Email: candace.bruder@beaufort.k12.sc.us
> Follow us! Facebook | Instagram | X
>
> **From:** Ivie Szalai[redacted]
> **Sent:** Monday, August 26, 2024 11:08 AM
> **To:** Gwozdz, Christina S <Christina.Gwozdz@beaufort.k12.sc.us>; Rodriguez, Francisco J <Francisco.Rodriguez@beaufort.k12.sc.us>; Bruder, Candace L <Candace.Bruder@beaufort.k12.sc.us>; Community Comments <community.comments@beaufort.k12.sc.us>
> **Subject:** Re: Regulation 43-170
>
> WARNING: This email originated from outside of Beaufort County School District's email system. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.
>
> Monday of last week has come and gone so now we move on to the phase of submitting the SC Instructional Materials Uniform Parent Complaint Forms. I really had hoped this was not the direction that the District/Board would take as I have offered my assistance to help several times. You know the material is there. You know it violates the Regulation but you are choosing to require me to jump through the hoops to make you or ultimately the State Board of Education enforce it. The time, money and resources that this whole ordeal will take, once again, is inexcusable. But if this is the path that you choose, so be it. I just want the public to know that I offered every opportunity for this not to happen all over again. I communicated with the District twice to verify no preemptive actions were being taken and this email is my second time communicating with you to try and resolve the issue.
> Please find attached the first 5 books that I am making complaints against. I really hope that you all do the right thing and not prolong the process.
> Again, I am willing to work with the District to help identify the offending books. Please reach out if you are willing to work together on this.
> Finally, please note that this Regulation supersedes any prior reviews or decisions.
> Kindly, Ivie Szalai
>
> Ugly Love
>
> Perks of Being A Wallflower
>
> Damsel
>
> All Boys Aren't Blue
>
> Push

Ivie Szalai

On Thu, Aug 15, 2024 at 5:46 PM Ivie Szalai[redacted] wrote:

> Dear Dr. Gwozdz,
> I had hope that it would not come to me having to contact you but after communication with Dr. Bruder and confirmation that the most egregious books have not been removed from the libraries, I have no choice. The District has made it clear to me that they feel they are in compliance with the Regulation and that the directive from the state in the Memorandum was: *to "consider to what extent a preemptive review of existing materials is prudent" while allowing that "no district is required to review preemptively."* While many Districts may not need to do a preemptive review if they have not allowed this material to enter into the schools, I know that you, the rest of the Board, and the District knows that a few of these books violate the Regulation because they contain language that depict descriptions or visual depictions of "sexual conduct". I have read them at Board meetings and have included excerpts in my appeals. You cannot pretend that they do not. You cannot act like you do not know.IS-38 currently does not mirror the language of Regulation 43-170, although Dr. Bruder says that it does. It does not include: ***Instructional Material is not "Age and Developmentally Appropriate" for any age or age group of children if it includes descriptions or visual depictions of "sexual conduct," as that term is defined***

*by Section 16-15-305(C)(1).** You cannot cherry pick from the Regulation what you want to implement while leaving out the most important part.
This Regulation was drafted specifically to address this and BCSD's neglect in removing such material was among the reasons for the need.
I have offered now twice to work with the District to help locate and review books that need to be removed to be in compliance. Thus far the District has repeatedly acted like nothing needs to be done. I am following the chain of command and now contacting you. Per the Regulation, it is ultimately the Boards responsibility to see that the District is in compliance. I would like to give the Board the chance to do that; however, I am setting a deadline before I move to the next step of reporting the District's willful violation of the Regulation. I would like to hear back from you by the close of business Monday with a thorough plan of action. Please remember that this Regulation went into full effect August 1st. You are now 15 days past the deadline to become compliant.
If I have to move to the next step, I will simultaneously begin to submit the SCDE's Material Uniform Complaint Forms for the offending books. Please know that this Regulation supersedes any prior decisions or regulations therefore I do not have to wait 5 years to be able to submit the books that have already been reviewed. Please note that I have every confidence that the SCDE will ensure that the Regulation is enforced but that I don't want to lose the chance at submitting 5 books for the month of August. I should not have to do this; however, I am covering my bases. There were many complaints last time about the time, resources, and money that were wasted. I would hate to see even more go to this effort when all you have to do is remove the material that is in violation.
I look forward to hearing back from you and hope that we can resolve this together.
*SC CODE OF LAWS
CHAPTER 15
Offenses Against Morality and Decency ARTICLE 3 Obscenity, Material Harmful to Minors, Child Exploitation, and Child Prostitution
SECTION 16-15-305(C)(1) (C)
As used in this article:
(1) "sexual conduct" means:
(a) vaginal, anal, or oral intercourse, whether actual or simulated, normal or perverted, whether between human beings, animals, or a combination thereof;
(b) masturbation, excretory functions, or lewd exhibition, actual or simulated, of the genitals, pubic hair, anus, vulva, or female breast nipples including male or female genitals in a state of sexual stimulation or arousal or covered male genitals in a discernably turgid state;
(c) an act or condition that depicts actual or simulated bestiality, sado-masochistic abuse, meaning flagellation or torture by or upon a person who is nude or clad in undergarments or in a costume which reveals the pubic hair, anus, vulva, genitals, or female breast nipples, or the condition of being fettered, bound, or otherwise physically restrained on the part of the one so clothed;
(d) an act or condition that depicts actual or simulated touching, caressing, or fondling of, or other similar physical contact with, the covered or exposed genitals, pubic or anal regions, or female breast nipple, whether alone or between humans, animals, or a human and an animal, of the same or opposite sex, in an act of actual or apparent sexual stimulation or gratification; or
(e) an act or condition that depicts the insertion of any part of a person's body, other than the male sexual organ, or of any object into another person's anus or vagina, except when done as part of a recognized medical procedure.
Kindly, Ivie Szalai

Ivie Szalai