



BOARD OF EDUCATION
REGULAR MEETING
4480 N. BRAWLEY AVENUE
NUTRITION SERVICES
FRESNO, CA 93722
board.fresnounified.org

MINUTES – BOARD OF EDUCATION REGULAR MEETING

Fresno, California

October 09, 2024

Fresno Unified School District, Nutrition Services, 4480 N. Brawley Avenue, Fresno, CA 93722.

At a Regular Meeting of the Board of Education of Fresno Unified School District, held on October 09, 2024, there were present Board Members: Cazares, Islas, Jonasson Rosas, Levine, Thomas, Clerk Davis, and Board President Wittrup. Interim Superintendent Mao Misty Her was also present.

Board President Wittrup CONVENED the Regular Board Meeting at 4:32 p.m.

For the record, Member Cazares arrived at 4:33 p.m., Member Islas arrived at 4:39 p.m., and Member Thomas at 4:41 p.m.

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Ambra O'Connor led the Flag Salute on behalf of Emily Epperly who was out due to illness.

For the record, Board President Wittrup announced staff pulled from the Consent Agenda item C-8, APPROVE Agreement with Community Responsive Education; therefore, no discussion or action took place on item C-8.

OPPORTUNITY for Public Comment on Closed Session Items

For the record, the Board received zero (0) requests to address the Board on Closed Session items.

A. RECEIVE INFORMATION & REPORTS

For the record, there were no items for this section of the agenda.

Board President Wittrup ADJOURNED the Regular Board Meeting to Closed Session at 4:33 p.m.

Board President Wittrup RECONVENED the meeting to Open Session at 6:02 p.m.

For the record, Board President Wittrup announced staff pulled from the Consent Agenda item C-8, APPROVE Agreement with Community Responsive Education; therefore, no discussion or action took place on item C-8.

RECOGNIZE Student Board Members for the 2024/25 School Year

The Board and Interim Superintendent welcomed the Student Board Members for the 2024/25 School Year. Lykamae Alacar, Sunnyside High School; Emily Epperly, Fresno High School; alternates Kasandra Alvarado Lopez, Design Science Middle College High School; and Joshua Felipe, Patiño School of Entrepreneurship.

Reporting Out of Closed Session

- On a motion by Board Clerk Davis, seconded by Board member Cazares, the board acted in closed session on Resolution #25-23 approving the dismissal charges of a permanent classified employee by a vote of 7-0-0-0 as follows: AYES: Board Members: Cazares, Islas, Jonasson Rosas, Levine, Thomas, Board Clerk Davis, and Board President Wittrup.
- On a motion by Board Clerk Davis, seconded by Board Member Jonasson Rosas, the Board voted in closed session to accept the panel recommendations on a student record challenge appeal by a vote of 7-0-0-0 as follows: AYES: Board Members: Cazares, Islas, Jonasson Rosas, Levine, Thomas, Board Clerk Davis, and Board President Wittrup.
- On a motion by Board Clerk Davis, seconded by Board Member Jonasson Rosas, the Board voted in closed session to accept the panel recommendations on a student record challenge appeal by a vote of 7-0-0-0 as follows: AYES: Board Members: Cazares, Islas, Jonasson Rosas, Levine, Thomas, Board Clerk Davis, and Board President Wittrup.
- On a motion by Board Clerk Davis, seconded by Board Member Cazares, the Board voted in closed session to promote Abraham Olivares to Executive Officer in Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion, by a vote of 7-0-0-0 as follows: AYES: Board Members: Cazares, Islas, Jonasson Rosas, Levine, Thomas, Board Clerk Davis, and Board President Wittrup.

B. CONFERENCE/DISCUSSION AGENDA

B-1, PRESENT and DISCUSS Strategies to Improve Student Outcomes

For the record, the Board received zero (0) requests from the public to address the Board on agenda item B-1.

For the record, Board members had comments/questions pertaining to agenda item B-1. A summary is as follows:

Member Jonasson Rosas requested clarity related to the terms of response to intervention and academic intervention. Member Jonasson Rosas asked how this looks different in a dual immersion classroom.

Member Thomas asked what strategies are used to help students in grades nine through twelve that may be struggling in math.

Clerk Davis asked, in relation to the thinking classrooms, what is the secret sauce, what makes this strategy work.

Member Cazares commented that it is crucial to Member Cazares that teachers are involved in the collaboration process when making changes to instruction. Member Cazares commented on hearing from principals that sometimes the cost to cover a program has to come out of school site funds and asked the administration to find a way to financially support sites.

Member Islas referenced slides 14 and 15 and requested clarity related to the use of percentages versus points. Member Islas asked how we learn from the bright spots and then inform others and requested examples as well. Member Islas asked if the same level of opportunity is available to all teachers across all grade levels and if these types of cross walks are being created for specialty schools. Member Islas commented on the sharing of the data and provided a shout out to the McLane English teachers.

President Wittrup thanked staff for the presentation and examples of how research-based strategies are being utilized.

Member Jonasson Rosas offered a suggestion to staff to provide networking opportunities, informal structures for people to get to know their peers. Member Jonasson Rosas requested to see data on schools that may be regressing not to shame them but to discuss how those sites might be helped.

Member Thomas requested data for schools that may be regressing as well, a side-by-side of last assessment. Member Thomas asked if teachers were using the program Beyond the Basics.

For the record, Interim Superintendent Her, Marie Williams, Ed.D., Principal Anderson of Sunnyside High School, and Principal Ramirez of Greenberg Elementary School were available to provide clarity.

B-2, PRESENT, DISCUSS, and HOLD a Public Hearing in the Matter of the University High School Charter Renewal Petition

For the record, Member Levine read a statement as follows:

“Agenda item B-2 on tonight’s agenda, pertains to the University High School Charter Renewal Petition. University High School is located on the campus of California State University, Fresno and I am employed by Fresno State.

Because of my employment with Fresno State, I have a remote financial interest in this item.

Therefore, in the interest of full transparency, I am abstaining from this vote pursuant to Board Bylaw 9270.”

For the record, Member Levine left the dais prior to presentation of item.

For the record, Board President Wittrup opened the public hearing at 6:52 p.m.

For the record, the Board received seven (7) requests to address the Board on agenda item B-2. The individuals’ name and a summary of topic are as follows:

1. Olivia Dean: Spoke in support of University High School.
2. Abigail Dean: spoke in support of University High School.
3. Sarah Dean: Spoke in support of University High School.
4. Emma Dean: Spoke in Support of University High School.
5. Nichole Walsh: Spoke in support of University High School.
6. Leo Jamesanagnos: Spoke in support of University High School.
7. Kyle Zheng: Spoke in support of University High School.

For the record, Board members had comments/questions pertaining to agenda item B-2. A summary is as follows:

Clerk Davis requested clarity as to University High School’s demographic comparison, specifically in relation to special education, economically disadvantaged, and English learner enrollment. Clerk Davis request clarity as to Title I funds and how University High School deals with fees.

Member Jonasson Rosas commented that a challenge for Member Jonasson Rosas is University High School does not match the population of Fresno Unified in terms of social/economically disadvantaged students and requested clarity on University High School’s suggested donations. Member Jonasson Rosas asked if

transportation is provided if afterschool programs are provided. Member Jonasson Rosas would like the demographics for students in the categories of foster youth, English learners, homeless, and special education to be reflected in University High School's population as well.

Member Islas commented on beings surprised to see a slide in the presentation that said the program is free and asked if there is a cost for students to participate, if there is a waiting list. Asked if the wait list refreshed each year or if students on the waiting list had to reapply. Requested information on foster youth and homeless students. Requested clarity as to requirements to attend University High School if there was an academic requirement to be met.

Member Cazares asked how students on the waiting list are chosen.

President Wittrup asked what the furthest distance is students have traveled to attend.

For the record, Felicia Olais and Susan Hatmaker were available to provide clarity. Jeffie Esparza Hickman, Superintendent/Principal, Aaron Morgan, Vice Principal, and Jim Scheible, Charter Renewal Consultant were available as well.

For the record, Board President Wittrup closed the public hearing at 7:33 p.m.

OPPORTUNITY for Public Comment on Consent Agenda Items

For the record, the Board received zero (0) requests to address the Board on the Consent Agenda.

On a motion by Board Member Islas, seconded by Board Member Jonasson Rosas, the Board approved the Consent Agenda except for agenda item C-8 which was pulled from the consent agenda, and C-12 and C-16 which was pulled for further discussion, by a roll call vote of 7-0-0-0, as follows: AYES: Board Members: Cazares, Islas, Jonasson Rosas, Levine, Thomas, Clerk Davis, and Board President Wittrup.

ALL CONSENT Agenda items are considered routine by the Board of Education and will be enacted by one motion. There will be no separate discussion of items unless a Board member requests, in which event, the item(s) will be considered following approval of the Consent Agenda. Pulled Consent Agenda items will be considered for approval after the Conference/Discussion Agenda.

C. CONSENT AGENDA

C-3, APPROVE Personnel List

APPROVED as recommended, the Personnel List, Appendix A, as submitted

C-4, ADOPT Findings of Fact and Recommendations of District Administrative Board

ADOPTED as recommended, the Findings of Fact and Recommendations of District Administrative Panels resulting from hearings on expulsion and readmittance cases conducted during the period since the regular meeting of the Board held September 25, 2024.

C-5, APPROVE Meeting Minutes

APPROVED as recommended, the draft minutes for the September 25, 2024, regular meeting of the Board of Education.

C-6, ADOPT Resolution 25-15, Certifying Course-Based Independent Study, Farber Independent Studies, and Online School

ADOPTED as recommended, Resolution 25-15, Certifying Course-Based Independent Study at Farber Independent Studies, and Online School for the 2024/25 school year.

C-7, ADOPT Resolution 25-20, Recognizing the Month of October as National Cyber Security Awareness Month

ADOPTED as recommended, Resolution 25-20, Recognizing the Month of October as National Cyber Security Awareness Month.

C-8, APPROVE Agreement with Community Responsive Education

ITEM PULLED BY STAFF, no discussion or action taken.

C-9, APPROVE Award of RFP 25-06, Climate-Smart Foods–Proteins

APPROVED as recommended, information on Request for Proposals (RFP) 25-06, Climate-Smart Foods–Proteins, to establish fixed pricing on Climate-Smart menu items for delivery to Nutrition Services. The term is one-year with the option to extend for two additional one-year periods beginning November 01, 2024. Approval of the following vendor is recommended: Cream Co. Meats (Oakland, California) estimated annual amount of \$357,000.

C-10, APPROVE Board of Education Shared Agreements

APPROVED as recommended, the Board of Education shared agreements. The shared agreements are an essential component of the Student Outcomes Focused Governance work with the Council of Great City Schools.

C-11, APPROVE Board Item Submission Timeline

APPROVED as recommended, the Board Item Submission Timeline. The timeline is one component of the Student Outcomes Focused Governance work with the Council of Great City Schools.

C-12, APPROVE Potential 2024 Bond Measure Project Priority Lis

APPROVED as recommended, the staff recommended potential 2024 Bond Project List and Priorities. Future project implementation will depend on project definition and scoping, funding availability and Board approval.

For the record, Board members had comments/questions pertaining to agenda item C-12. A summary is as follows:

Member Thomas thanked Mr. Idsvoog and commented that it is hard to work for seven people with different ideologies and ideas of what equity looks like. Member Thomas commented on being grateful the equity calculator was used, for the most part, as the Board wanted. Member Thomas requested clarity as to turf, track, and lighting.

Member Thomas thanked Interim Superintendent Her for keeping the information at the forefront. Member Thomas commented this is not political for Member Thomas because all students need to be served.

President Wittrup thanked Mr. Idsvoog for responding to the questions submitted which came directly from voters.

President Wittrup commented as follows, "I can not support this item because the project list is coming for approval after voting has already started. I do not feel the public has had ample opportunity to participate and ask questions."

Member Jonasson Rosas commented that the potential priority project list she has contains the turf, track, and lighting item asked about by Member Thomas. Member Jonasson Rosas commented that Roosevelt may not need the full \$15 million allocated for turf, track, and lighting and would like any remaining unexpended funds from the \$15 million allocated to Roosevelt to go to the next school on the list which is Lowell and requested the motion to include that language.

Member Islas requested clarity on the motion.

Member Thomas changed the original motion to include the request by Member Jonasson Rosas that any of the \$15 million not expended on Roosevelt's turf, track, and lighting go to Lowell because it is the next school listed in the equity assessment.

Member Islas commented that while she can appreciate that there are unique things that happen that might alter the timing or priority of things, does think there is a need for some fidelity to the list because some of these schools have consistently come on and been pushed off for very valid reasons, the Duncan project was used as an example. Member Islas commented on the need to be critical of the reasons a project is moved on the list.

Member Islas commented that there is not a qualifier that helps people understand what constitutes a score of unsatisfactory. A qualifier will help people understand how a school receives an unsatisfactory score, it was because of a deficiency, and it is important for the district to showcase because the equity assessment was a very objective tool looking at specific criteria to order priority and that message has been missing from the conversation.

Member Cazares commented that Hoover High School is not on the list for turf, track, and lighting because that money is being used for library renovation and cafeteria construction at Centennial Elementary School and portable replacements at Pyle Elementary School which were two of the poorest ranked schools by the equity tool in the Hoover region.

Member Cazares commented on being hypersensitive to comments that the Board did not allow for community input into this process and recalled prior discussions from approximately a year ago when discussion of the possibility of a bond first began; the discussions and were always in open session and were not hidden or conducted in a way to deceive the public. Member Cazares asked Mr. Idsvoog to comment from his perspective on community involvement.

Member Cazares commented the school district has been working with the City of Fresno since 2010 and commented it is not about, “my Hoover kids” it is about all kids that is why the Board took on this equity tool and that is why Member Cazares is happy the list looks as it does, and thanked staff and Interim Superintendent Her for being focused on the equity tool as well

Member Levine expressed gratitude to Interim Superintendent Her, the Facilities team, specifically Paul and Alex for the long nights over the last several weeks incorporating the Board’s feedback and really doing all they can to make sure the equity tool is being used as much as possible, setting aside funding in each individual region for schools that may not have scored unsatisfactory but have facility improvement needs, and for just trying to do the impossible.

Member Levine commented that the reality is this is a bond for \$500 million and there is still \$2 billion more in need. Expressed thanks that all the unsatisfactory schools are on the list and some of the lowest ranked in the poor tier are on the list, but there are still several schools ranked poor that deserve investment that the district does not have the capacity for, so we are using this equity tool to invest in the worst first, the facilities in the most urgent need of investment.

Member Levine expressed appreciation for the district leaning into that and staff trying to figure out ways to make this all work. Member Levine mentioned the pursuit of other revenue sources that often have a matching requirement and passing this \$500 million bond will help the district qualify for those opportunities to help meet the other \$2 billion of need.

Member Levine referenced an article in the *Fresno Bee* with an interactive map that shows a school's condition score, and the amount of investment needed.

Member Jonasson Rosas commented that the list is not the perfect embodiment of the equity tool, and hopes the Board can get there soon, as students deserve the elimination of all politics.

Member Jonasson Rosas commented on being encouraged by the direction of the list and use of the equity tool. Member Jonasson Rosas referenced a time she had to speak from the podium on the lack of attention to elementary schools and remembered the conversation and attitude of the Board at that time; and since then, in a short amount of time the Board has changed its language and attitude.

Member Jonasson Rosas gave the Board kudos for going on this journey together and being where they are to approve this list; and commented it is not perfect, not exactly what I want but I am okay and happy to vote on this and happy to talk to our community about how this Board will move forward.

Clerk Davis thanked the staff for the many hours they poured into this work. Commented that at the heart of Fresno is an educated child. Referenced past bond measures and expressed gratitude for those bonds being approved and commented that intentional investment in the community is important as the Sunnyside region would not be in place without those investments. Clerk Davis commented that it is unfortunate others in the City Council think people should vote against it because there are not enough resources allocated to a specific region.

For the record, Paul Idsvoog was available to provide clarity.

On a motion by Board Member Thomas, seconded by Board Member Islas, the Board approved agenda item C-12 with the amendment that any unexpended resources of the \$15 million allocated to Roosevelt for turf, track, and lighting go to Lowell which is next on the list, by a roll call vote of 6-1-0-0 as follows: AYES: Board Members: Cazares, Islas, Jonasson Rosas, Levine, Thomas and Board Clerk Davis. NOES: Board President Wittrup.

C-13, RATIFY Change Orders

RATIFIED as recommended, information on Change Orders for the projects as follows:

Bid 23-02, Edison High School Career Technical Education (CTE) Building and Interim Housing
Change Order 3 (CTE Building) presented for ratification: \$111,960

Bid 23-09, Sunnyside High School New Career Technical Education Health Science Building
Change Order 3 presented for ratification: \$44,763

Bid 23-46, Jefferson Elementary School T-K Portable Improvements
Change Order 1 presented for ratification: \$126,108

Bid 24-43, Education Center Annex Interior Finish Upgrades
Change Order 2 presented for ratification: \$10,262
Change Order 3 presented for ratification: \$9,448

Bid 24-69, Section B, Exterior Painting at Various Sites, Eaton Elementary School
Change Order 1 presented for ratification: \$ - 2,488

Bid 24-69, Section C, Exterior Painting at Various Sites, Kratt Elementary School
Change Order 1 presented for ratification: \$ - 8,216

C-14, RATIFY the Filing of a Notice of Completion

RATIFIED as recommended, a Notice of Completion for the project which has been completed according to plans and specifications as follows: Bid 24-43, Education Center Annex Interior Finish Upgrades.

C-15, RATIFY Purchase Orders from July 01, 2024, through July 31, 2024 – Primary Report

RATIFIED as recommended, information on purchase orders issued from July 01, 2024, through July 31, 2024 – Primary Report. Two agenda items are presented to ratify purchase orders. The first item includes the Primary Report with all purchase orders issued during the reported dates with the exception of those that may present a potential conflict of interest for an individual Board member. All remaining purchase orders are in the Supplemental Report and presented as a second agenda item.

C-16, RATIFY Purchase Orders from July 01, 2024, through July 31, 2024– Supplemental Report

RATIFIED as recommended, information on purchase orders issued from July 01, 2024, through July 31, 2024 – Supplemental Report.

For the record, Member Levine read a statement as follows:

“Agenda item C-16 on tonight’s Consent Agenda, contains purchase orders for the California Teaching Fellows Foundation, the CSU Fresno Foundation, CSU Fresno Association. I am currently employed by Fresno State.

Additionally, item C-16 contains purchase orders with the Fresno County Economic Opportunities Commission, and I am employed by Fresno County EOC, which is a nonprofit corporation.

I did not participate in the making of the purchase orders related to

this agenda item; however, because of my employment with both Fresno State and Fresno County EOC I have a remote financial interest in those purchase orders.

Therefore, in the interest of full transparency, I am abstaining from this vote pursuant to Board Bylaw 9270.”

On a motion by Board Clerk Davis, seconded by Board Member Jonasson Rosas, the Board approved agenda item C-16 by a vote of 6-0-1-0, as follows: AYES: Board Members: Cazares, Islas, Jonasson Rosas, Thomas, Board Clerk Davis, and Board President Wittrup. ABSTENTIONS: Board Member Levine.

OPPORTUNITY FOR UNSCHEDULED ORAL COMMUNICATIONS

For the record, the Board received one (1) request to address the Board during Unscheduled Oral Communications. The individual’s name and a summary of topic are as follows:

1. Vanush: Spoke on the excessive cost of PG&E and asked for people to advocate for affordable energy.

For the record, Board President Wittrup ADJOURNED the regular meeting to closed session at 8:08 p.m.

For the record, Board President Wittrup RECONVENED to open session at 9:08 p.m.

Reporting Out of Closed Session

For the record there were no reports from Closed Session.

D. ADJOURNMENT

Board President Wittrup ADJOURNED the meeting at 9:08 p.m.