

**HAWORTH BOARD OF EDUCATION
HAWORTH, NEW JERSEY 07641
MINUTES
December 15, 2016**

I. CALL TO ORDER – 7:33 p.m.

II. FLAG SALUTE

III. SUNSHINE LAW STATEMENT

All requirements of the Open Public Business Meetings Law have been met for this meeting of the Board of Education of the Borough of Haworth. On August 17, 2016 advance written notice was emailed to **The Suburbanite and The Record**, filed with the Borough Clerk, posted on the school website and forwarded to the Presidents of the Home and School Association and Teachers Association, and all persons requesting such notice.

IV. MISSION STATEMENT

The Haworth Public School District, a safe and nurturing small school environment, in partnership with our community, is dedicated to providing every student with educational excellence through a comprehensive, innovative and rigorous curriculum that fosters productive and responsible life-long learners in a global society. Adopted—May 28, 2013.

V. ROLL CALL:

Mrs. Mary Anne Doran
Mr. Matthew Gilbert - **ABSENT**
Mrs. Anna Reduce
Mr. Warren Sutnick
Mrs. Stacey Wunsch - **ABSENT**
Mr. Jeff Ashkenase, Vice President
Mrs. Nicole Brennan, President
Mr. Paul Wolford, Business Administrator
Ms. Jennifer Montesano, Superintendent/Board Secretary

VI. OPEN TO THE PUBLIC ON AGENDA ITEMS ONLY

The Board is interested in hearing your comments. In order to ensure that everyone has the opportunity to speak, we are asking that you speak once and limit your comments to three minutes. We further ask that all comments be directed to the Board. We recognize that everyone has the freedom to speak but advise you that anything said in public may have legal ramifications. There is no protection regarding statements made by the public. Please state your name before you begin.

VII. CLOSE THE PUBLIC PORTION - 7:34

VIII. SUPERINTENDENT'S/BOARD PRESIDENT'S REPORTS

- Enrollment Report to date
- HIB/Incident Report to date
- Kids with Character Award Presentation – criteria for the month of December is Respect. For December the following children have been chosen:

Kindergarten: Sadie Poirot and Emmeline Paneque
Grade 1: Komi Soware and Jillian Montello
Grade 2: Talia Zirin and Henry Winik
Grade 3: Casey Ashkenase and Romack Goldstein
Grade 4: Sruthi Vattimilli and Tomir Sawicki
Grade 5: Camille Sposato and Conor Verdon
Grade 6: Ethan Hod and Madeline Shalonov
Grade 7: Max Boos and Aliyah Sayid
Grade 8: David Buzharsky and Audrey Kim

- Board Resolution and recognition of Mr. Matthew Gilbert:

WHEREAS Mr. Gilbert has served as a member of the Haworth Board of Education since January 7, 2014, and

WHEREAS Mr. Gilbert's term will expire from the Haworth Board of Education effective January 4, 2017 and,

WHEREAS Mr. Gilbert gave 3 years of dedicated and effective service to the community and the children of Haworth and,

WHEREAS during that time, Mr. Gilbert served in a leadership role as a member of the Facilities, Public Relations and Finance Committees and also served as the Liaison to the HHSA,

WHEREAS the Haworth Board of Education is desirous of recognizing his many years of service to the school district and also wishes to express their appreciation and gratitude for his efforts,

NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that this resolution be read into the record of the December 15, 2016 Haworth Board of Education minutes as permanent testimony to his outstanding service as a member of the Haworth Board of Education.

- Board Resolution and recognition of Mrs. Anna Reduce:

WHEREAS Mrs. Reduce has served as a member of the Haworth Board of Education since April 15, 2008, and

WHEREAS Mrs. Reduce's term will expire from the Haworth Board of Education effective January 4, 2017 and,

WHEREAS Mrs. Reduce gave 8 years and 8 months of dedicated and effective service to the community and the children of Haworth and,

WHEREAS during that time, Mrs. Reduce served in a leadership role as a member of the Program & Personnel, Facilities, Finance & Policy Committees and also served as the Joint Boards Representative and Liaison to NJSBA, NVRHS and the Senior Citizens;

WHEREAS the Haworth Board of Education is desirous of recognizing her many years of service to the school district and also wishes to express their appreciation and gratitude for her efforts,

NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that this resolution be read into the record of the December 15, 2016 Haworth Board of Education minutes as permanent testimony to her outstanding service as a member of the Haworth Board of Education.

- Presentation of the Year End 2015-16 Audit – ~~Mr. Andrew Kucinski representing our Board approved auditing firm of Nisivoecia, LLP.~~ Mr. Jeffrey Ashkenase, Board of Education Finance Committee Chairperson.

N. Brennan: I would like to thank publicly our two outgoing board members, Anna Reduce and Matthew Gilbert. Anna has served eight years and eight months on this board. She has served on various committees and she is a tireless, fantastic, intelligent and fiery member of the Board of Education. Anna always comes prepared and I have learned so much from you. We are so sad to see you go. Thank you so much, you will be greatly missed. I would like to thank Matthew; unfortunately he could not be here tonight, for his three years of service and his expertise and excitement, as well as his leadership on the Public Relations Committee. We thank Matthew very much.

W. Sutnick: Anna and I started on the board together and we barely knew each other at the time. Anna and I have dealt with many issues throughout the years. Anna is an outstanding board member and advocate for the children of Haworth and for public education. Nobody can really appreciate that fact unless you have worked on this board with Anna. You really are an incredible person and I am honored to have served on this board with you and as a result of that we have developed a friendship.

A. Reduce: I thought back over the eight years, eight months that I have served on this board. I have worked with five Superintendents, as well as five Principals. I have served with eight other board members over that time whose contributions were also long lasting. I have seen three settled contracts and we are hoping to get to the fourth; I wish it had happened while I was still here. I have sat in on way too many committee meetings to even count. The point is that the time all members of the school board volunteers is extraordinary. It is all for the betterment of our school and most importantly our students. The most important thing to learn when you begin on the board is that you are not here to administer the school but rather to help select the best people you possibly can to be the school administrators. I can honestly say that after all of this time that we are in the best hands we can possibly be in with our current administration. They are committed, dedicated, smart and the kids always come first. I feel very good with the place that I am leaving now, so thank you all very much.

J. Ashkenase: The auditor was not able to attend tonight at the last minute. We met with the auditor last night and in his words, our district is in as good of a financial position as the state will allow us to be. There a tremendous number of regulations and operating principles which we have to manage the schools finances and based on that, we are in as solid of a position as we can be. Some of the highlights from last year were that a number of our capital projects came in under budget, which now allows us to take that money and put it back into our fund balance and use it for capital projects in the next budget year. This audit is of the prior year before Mr. Wolford started as our Business Administrator. The auditor made

some minor recommendations for this coming year and Mr. Wolford has already taken care of all of those things.

A. Reduce Moved, W. Sutnick Seconded
Roll Call: 5/0

IX. MINUTES

- a. Approval of meeting minutes from the November 3, 2016 regular business meeting.

A. Reduce Moved, M. Doran Seconded
Roll Call: 5/0

X. PROGRAM AND PERSONNEL

- a. Upon the recommendation of the Superintendent, the Haworth Board of Education approves the Elevate Education study skills program for grade 6 at a cost of \$1,815.00.
- b. Upon the recommendation of the Superintendent, the Haworth Board of Education approves Suzanne Schmalzer as a Substitute Aide in the After School Care Program for the 2016-2017 school year, at a rate of \$25 per hour.
- c. Upon the recommendation of the Superintendent, the Haworth Board of Education accepts, with regret, the retirement of Jane Cabourg, Middle School Teacher. Last day of employment is June 30, 2017.
- d. Upon the recommendation of the Superintendent, the Haworth Board of Education accepts, with regret, the resignation of Karen Erner, Confidential Administrative Assistant for Data and Technology. Last day of employment is December 19, 2016.
- e. Upon the recommendation of the Superintendent, the Haworth Board of Education approves the payment of 10 days of accrued unused vacation time for Karen Erner upon resignation on December 19, 2016 in the amount of \$2,500.00.
- f. Upon the recommendation of the Superintendent, the Haworth Board of Education approves Donald Turner to attend the Rutgers Continuing Studies Educational Facility Management Program in Paterson, NJ at a cost of \$482.00, plus travel expenses to two sessions.
- g. Upon the recommendation of the Superintendent, the Haworth Board of Education approves Donald Turner to attend the Rutgers Continuing Studies Environmental Code Compliance & Sustainability Program in Paterson, NJ at a cost of \$874.10, plus travel expenses to ten sessions.

- h. Upon the recommendation of the Superintendent, the Haworth Board of Education approves the following Fairleigh Dickinson University 3 credit graduate level course for Lori Scheps; no re-imbursement requested.
 - Multisensory Reading 2
- i. Upon the recommendation of the Superintendent, the Haworth Board of Education approves the following Fairleigh Dickinson University 3 credit graduate level course for Arlene Domalewski; no re-imbursement requested.
 - Multisensory Reading 2
- j. Upon the recommendation of the Superintendent, the Haworth Board of Education approves the following William Paterson University 3 credit graduate level course for Arlene Domalewski; no re-imbursement requested.
 - Research in Special Education 2
- k. Upon the recommendation of the Superintendent, the Haworth Board of Education approves the following Fairleigh Dickinson University 3 credit graduate level course for Erin Carr; no re-imbursement requested.
 - Multisensory Reading 2
- l. Upon the recommendation of the Superintendent, the Haworth Board of Education approves the following Fairleigh Dickinson University 3 credit graduate level course for Anne Marie Dunn; no re-imbursement requested.
 - Multisensory Reading 2
- m. Upon the recommendation of the Superintendent, the Haworth Board of Education approves the following Fairleigh Dickinson University 3 credit graduate level course for Angelica Formica; no re-imbursement requested.
 - Multisensory Reading 2
- n. Upon the recommendation of the Superintendent, the Haworth Board of Education approves the following Fairleigh Dickinson University 3 credit graduate level course for Lesley Carboneri; no re-imbursement requested.
 - Multisensory Reading 2
- o. Upon the recommendation of the Superintendent, the Haworth Board of Education approves the re-imbursement \$270.00 to Carrieann Malanga-DeVito for the annual fee for her Dyslexia

Therapist Certification.

- p. Upon the recommendation of the Superintendent, the Haworth Board of Education approves Kathleen Jasionowski as a substitute classroom aide for the 2016-2017 school year, not benefit eligible.
- q. Upon the recommendation of the Superintendent, the Haworth Board of Education approves the grades 3-8 winners of the Dorney Poetry contest to travel to Northern Valley Demarest High School for the Dorney Poetry Festival on June 5, 2017, no cost for students, plus bus fee. Trip Coordinator: Jennifer Montesano
- r. Upon the recommendation of the Superintendent, the Haworth Board of Education approves the 6th grade overnight field trip to Philadelphia, PA from April 20, 2017 through April 21, 2017, cost not to exceed \$535 per student.
- s. Upon the recommendation of the Superintendent, the Haworth Board of Education approves the following teacher chaperones for the 6th grade overnight field trip to Philadelphia from April 20 through April 21, 2016, with a stipend of \$100 per night per chaperone (pending contract ratification):
- Cristina Martell (trip coordinator \$250)
 - Suzanne Schmalzer
 - Kevin Lane
 - Lori Scheps
 - James Antony Muir
 - Lauren Wolstein
 - Carrieann Malanga-DeVito
 - Jennifer Montesano
 - Nurse (Bayada Nursing Services)
 - Jeanne Rispoli (Alternate)
 - Virginia Newman (Alternate)
 - Jessica Cooley (Alternate)
 - Paul Wolford (Alternate)
- t. Upon the recommendation of the Superintendent, the Haworth Board of Education approves the grades 6-8 Science Olympiad students field trip to Union County College in Cranford, NJ on January 10, 2017 (snowdate: January 13, 2017), at no cost to students, plus bus fee.
- u. Upon the recommendation of the Superintendent, the Haworth Board of Education approves the December Teacher's College Foundational Reading Skills 2-day Mini Institute in Manhattan, NY for Connie Alcoser, Carol Szurgot and Angelica Formica at a total cost of \$1,950.00, plus travel expenses.
- v. Upon the recommendation of the Superintendent, the Haworth Board of Education approves the Teacher's College DIY Literacy/Book Clubs in Manhattan, NY for Lori Scheps and Arlene

Domalewski on December 19, 2016, no cost for workshop, plus travel expenses.

- w. Upon the recommendation of the Superintendent, the Haworth Board of Education approves Nicole Auriemma as Confidential Administrative Assistant for Data & Technology an annual salary of \$43,000.00, benefit eligible. Start date of January 3, 2017.
- x. Upon the recommendation of the Superintendent, the Haworth Board of Education approves Nicole Auriemma to work for purposes of training on December 16, 2016 and December 19, 2016 at a rate of \$20 per hour, not to exceed 16 total hours.
- y. Upon the recommendation of the Superintendent, the Haworth Board of Education approves Segundo Valderrama as a substitute custodian for the 2016-17 school year, pending criminal history review, not benefit eligible.

M. Doran: We met on December 7th and we met with a representative from Elevate Education for a presentation on a study skills program, which will be rolled out in January which will enhance our current study skills program. Mr. O’Keefe also spoke to us regarding the analization of the PARCC scores and helping the teachers learn to analyze their data to help inform their future instruction.

M. Doran Moved, A. Reduce Seconded
 Roll Call: 6/0

XI. FINANCE

- a. Upon the recommendation of the Superintendent, the Haworth Board of Education approves the bills for the period of November 1, 2016 to November 30, 2016 which has previously been approved by the various committees and payment made through the Valley National Bank from funds in the appropriate accounts as follows:

Bills Description	Dated	Amount
Payroll – Operating Account	11/15/16	\$154,458.03
State Share – FICA	11/15/16	\$13,218.02
Board Share – FICA	11/15/16	\$4,575.98
	TOTAL:	\$172,252.03

Bills Description	Dated	Amount
Payroll – Operating Accounting	11/30/16	\$140,150.21
State Share – FICA	11/30/16	\$13,078.31
Board Share – FICA	11/30/16	\$3,441.93
	TOTAL:	\$156,670.45

- b. Upon the recommendation of the Superintendent, the Haworth Board of Education approves the Bills and Claims for the month of November, 2016.
- c. Be it resolved that the Board, upon recommendation of the School Business Administrator acknowledges receipt of the Comprehensive Annual Financial Report for the fiscal year ended June 30, 2016 and the Auditor's Management Report on Administrative Findings Financial Compliance and Performance, and approves the Corrective Action Plan. (Attachment)
- d. Upon the recommendation of the Superintendent, the Haworth Board of Education approves the 2016-2017 Valley Program tuition contract for student ID#294032 at a total (pro-rated) rate of \$44,464.71.

J. Ashkenase: As I mentioned before we met last night and in addition to reviewing the audit we spent some time talking about our Asbury Park accounting system and the need of having to replace it in the near future as there are better systems out there to better meet our needs.

J. Ashkenase Moved, A. Reduce Seconded
Roll Call: 5/0

XII. FACILITY

- a. Upon the recommendation of the Superintendent, the Haworth Board of Education approves the purchase of rubber playground mulch (23 tons) and repair services to existing playground structures/equipment from General Recreation Inc. at a total cost of \$7,973.40.

J. Ashkenase: At our Facilities Committee meeting we met with three potential architect firms who did presentations for the upcoming year. Once we choose a new firm, they will come in and do a comprehensive review of our entire building.

A. Reduce Moved, J. Ashkenase Seconded
Roll Call: 5/0

XIII. POLICY

- a. Upon the recommendation of the Superintendent, the Haworth Board of Education approves the second reading of the following policies:
 - 6147 – Standards of Proficiency
 - 6164.2 – Guidance Services
 - 6171.2 – Gifted and Talented
 - 4113/4213 – Assignment; Transfer

- 6171.1 – Remedial Instruction
- 6172 – Alternative Education Programs
- 5145.4 – Equal Educational Opportunity
- 6121 – Nondiscrimination/Affirmative Action
- 4111.1/4211.1 - Nondiscrimination/Affirmative Action
- 3290 – Cash Management/Investment
- 6142.12 – Career and Technical Education
- 4131/4131.1 – Staff Development; Inservice Education/Visitations/Conferences

W. Sutnick: We have been updating our policy books and this is a second reading of these.

A. Reduce Moved, M. Doran Seconded
Roll Call: 5/0

XIV. COMMITTEE REPORTS

Finance
Facilities
Policy
Program/Personnel
BCSBA/NJSB
Joint Boards
Public Relations
Haworth Home & School Association
Northern Valley Regional HS/
NV Educational Foundation
Legislative Chairperson
Senior Citizens Liaison
Town Council Liaison
Negotiations

N. Brennan: On January 10th we will be meeting with the mediator again for our third fact finding session which is the next step in the negotiations process for the teacher's contract. We met with our attorney last night to go over all of the information that we are going to present to the fact finder and get an overall summary of where we are, as far as what things we are going to be asking for as well as some of the things we would be willing to give up on. The report that we will give the fact finder will be posted on the website for the community to look through. After that, it takes about 2-3 months for the fact finder to render his decision. The decision will also be posted on the website so the community can see what the fact finder has recommended.

XV. Open to the Public on any item – 7:58 p.m.

The Board is interested in hearing your comments. In order to ensure that everyone has the opportunity to speak, we are asking that you speak once and limit your comments to three minutes. We further ask that all comments be directed to the Board. We recognize that everyone has the freedom to speak but advise you that anything said in public may have legal

ramifications. There is no protection regarding statements made by the public. Please state your name before you begin.

Larry Rothstein – 36 Paulson Place - If you present your case on January 10th and then it is 2-3 months from that, it brings us to April. Does that mean there is no way for a decision to be made before that timeline?

N. Brennan: That is of no fault to either the HTA or the Board as we all have to wait for that report to come back.

L. Rothstein: So as a Board, do you have a timeline for a settlement after the findings are made?

N. Brennan: We would like to have already had a contract in place. Once the findings are accepted we will move to have the contract ratified immediately.

L. Rothstein: As far as the findings that will be posted on the district website, will that be of both the teacher's union perspective or of just the Board's perspective?

N. Brennan: No it would just be the Board's perspective.

J. Ashkenase: Just to clarify. What will happen on January 10th is each side will present their proposal and all the details with comparables and everything to justify what is being asked for. We will present our side and the HTA will present their side to the fact finder. The next morning the board will post what we presented for our side on the website. The fact finder will take all of the information from the meeting and render a recommendation, which takes 2-3 months. Both sides then have to agree to it or not agree to it. Our hope is that we will get this resolved as soon as possible, because one of the things we are asking for is a change in the schedule which we think will greatly enhance the educational experience of our children. The longer this process goes on, the longer it is going to take us to implement that schedule. We would really like this to be resolved as soon as possible.

L. Rothstein: How would the teachers get their perspective out to the community?

N. Brennan: They can choose to disseminate the information from their side to the public any way they would like.

W. Sutnick: The fact finder is a mediator appointed from the state and he renders his opinion after hearing both sides. Neither the Board or the HTA has to accept the fact finders recommendation as it is non-binding on either side. I can say that both sides are looking to resolve this contract and are negotiating in good faith.

L. Rothstein: If everyone is mediating in good faith, what do you feel is the hold up?

W. Sutnick: There are many complicated issues. None of us are looking for this to be acromonyous to the public and for the most part both sides have been negotiating professionally.

L. Rothstein: I feel the community does not have an outpouring of support on either side, which I feel is disturbing.

W. Sutnick: I feel the community is respectful of the professionalism of both sides.

J. Ashkenase: We have had a tremendous number of meetings where we tried to resolve the issues. One it goes to the step of mediation, then the timeline is driven by the mediators schedule.

W. Sutnick: Our meetings are always very professional, but we disagree on some of the topics. We are all hopeful that this process will get us to a point where we can all agree.

Tom Martin: 292 Crocket Place – I grew up in Closter and I now live here. I want to thank you as I know the board makes many important decisions for our entire town. I went through our regional high school and I know that I stand on the shoulders of some really excellent teachers in our school district. I am a parent of four children and I would recommend erring on the side of the teachers as it will effect the future of our town. I want my kids to stand on the shoulders of these teachers. I worked very hard to move back into this area because of the excellent schools.

Michael Winik: I am concerned with the class sizes. I have a child in the 3rd grade and there are over 50 kids in the class. I was wondering what the trigger is to add another section?

J. Ashkenase: This is something we have discussed with the architect regarding how to make more room for educational space within our current four walls. We agree that class size is very important and it is going to require some creativity within the current building and within the schedule.

M. Winik: I feel like this is a quality of life issue for the kids.

N. Brennan: We totally agree with you and I know that the number one concern with any of the teachers we have spoken to is that of class sizes, especially in the lower grades.

I. Borek: If we are able to build on that is obviously 3-4 years out, what do we do with the oversized classes before this is able to happen.

J. Montesano: Right now we are in the midst of trying to come up with a plan for that. We only have so much physical space so we are working on coming up with a more immediate plan.

Terry Galla: Is there a ball park figure on the legal fees being spent on negotiations?

J. Ashkenase: The fee for the mediation is the same for both sides, as far as our attorney fees we would have to break it down before giving out any facts.

T. Galla: I want to reference your letter of November 28 as I do not understand why you feel that a better schedule is needed for better transition to high school? I have two sons who went through this school system and the high school, who both went to fabulous colleges and were very well prepared.

J. Montesano: I think it is important to note that the high school has changed tremendously over the past two years. They passed a referendum to add labs for STEM, as well as many other things. Our goal is to continue what your children have experienced here. In order for us to do that we must keep up with the trend. The high school offers a new program called Career Pathways and we would like to start giving those type of electives to not only our eighth graders, but also our sixth and seventh graders.

T. Galla: Why do we feel it is necessary to offer those type of electives here in the lower grades?

J. Montesano: We would like to give them exposure here so when Haworth students go up to the high school, not only do they achieve, they are at the top. In order to achieve that we need to begin to mirror the foundations of those programs before they get to the high school.

J. Ashkenase: One of the things that I hear from community members is they love the diversity of opportunities offered here and at the high school. We would like to provide as many different opportunities as we can, which is one of the things that is driving what we are doing.

J. Cabourg: I would like to celebrate for a moment the students. This year our incoming eighth grade students took an academic merit test which decides their placement in high school. We met with the high school teachers who scored the test, which was a test of non-fiction reading and writing and our students received the highest scores in the entire Valley. That is to the credit of the students as well as to the credit of this highly effective staff.

N. Brennan: We absolutely agree with you and we thank the staff.

I. Borek: Which field is the playground mulch for?

P. Wolford: It is for the turf field and beyond the playground. It was inspected by our insurance carrier and it was not meeting certain safety standards.

N. Brennan: We would like to recognize Mrs. Cabourg on her retirement at the end of this year. You have given our students a great service and we thank you very much and for being a wonderful educator for our students.

Marchisio: This is regarding the Gifted & Talented program. I have been trying to get the results and I have reached out to three staff members to no avail. Are the students tested every year to get into Gifted & Talented?

J. Montesano: No, once you are in you can stay in.

N. Brennan: This entire program is going to be changing so that may not be the case going forward, but for now they are grandfathered in.

Close the Public portion: 8:20

XVI. OLD BUSINESS

XVII. NEW BUSINESS

XVIII. CLOSED SESSION

WHEREAS the following subject is not appropriate to be discussed in a public meeting and is within the exemptions which may be discussed and acted upon and,

WHEREAS only the following subject shall be discussed in private recess by the Board and the minutes made available to the public as soon as the reason for exemption no longer exists, it is therefore,

BE IT RESOLVED at the Public Meeting of the Borough of Haworth Board of Education on this day Thursday, December 15, 2016 pursuant to Sections 7 & 8 of the Open Public Meetings Act, the following subject shall be discussed in a session of the Board closed to the public: Please be advised that the Board will not be going into executive session.

XIX. MOTION TO ADJOURN.

A. Reduce Moved, W. Sutnick Seconded
All in favor.

ADJOURNMENT 8:20 p.m.

Nicole Brennan, President
Haworth Board of Education

Jennifer Montesano
Superintendent/Board Secretary