

Suffield Historic District Commission Meeting Minutes

Regular Meeting: March 4, 2024; 7:30 P.M.

Town Hall Upper Level Meeting Room

Chairman Mayne called The Historic District Commission meeting to order at 7:30 p.m. on Monday, March 4, 2024.

Attendees: Commissioner

Doug Mayne

John Schwemmer

Beth Tracey

Scott MacClintic

Aysha Moore-Manwaring (Alternate)

Crystal Quandt (Alternate)

Absent: Commissioner

Bill Moryto

Klaire Bielonko (Alternate)

Designation of Voting Members

Chairman Mayne noted that the designated voting members this evening would be Commissioner Mayne, Commissioner Schwemmer, Commissioner Tracey, Commissioner MacClintic and Commissioner Moore-Manwaring.

Approval of Minutes

Commissioner Moore-Manwaring motioned and Commissioner Schwemmer seconded to accept the meeting minutes from the February 5, 2024 Regular meeting with the changes requested by Commissioner MacClintic as follows:

- 1) Correction to method of identification of members. The original document uses the first initial of the members first name followed by the last name or the terms "Ms." or "Mr." The use of a first initial or the term Ms. or Mr. should be replaced with "Commissioner."
- 2) All references to "coin", "coins" or "coining" should be corrected to read "quoin", "quoins" or "quoining."
- 3) Page 1, Section A, in the third sentence of the first paragraph, the word "repair" should be changed to "replace."
- 4) Page 2, Section A, in the third sentence "hardie board product" should be changed to "Hardie Plank lap siding." This same change should also be made in the 6th sentence.
- 5) Page 2, Section A, in the 7th sentence it should read "...keeping the siding on the main building intact..."
- 6) Page 2, Section B, first paragraph, in the 5th sentence the word "group" should be changed to "Commission."
- 7) Page 2, Section B, first paragraph, in the 16th sentence, add "A" in order for the sentence to read "A timeline between..."
- 8) Page 2, Section B, first paragraph, in the last sentence the word "this" should be changed to "a similar."
- 9) Page 2, Section B, last paragraph, in the third sentence, the word "push" should be changed to "advocate."
- 10) Page 3, removal of the following statements:

- a. Ms. Bielonko expressed shock over the decision and strongly encouraged those who voted in favor to reconsider. The members discussed their rationale for their vote. She argued that this was not how a Historic District should act.
 - b. K. Bielonko asked the group to consider a motion to reconsider or a motion to rescind, explaining that they “still have options.” She questioned each member that voted in favor of demolition and they all remained firm with their original vote.
- 11) Page 3, “South Main Street House Construction Update” should include the house number “423.”
- 12) Page 3, Add second sentence to the section pertaining to “423 South Main Street House Construction Update” that reads as follows: “The homeowner has been informed that they need to appear before the HDC with a CoA application before work may proceed.”

Vote: 4 in favor (Schwemmer, MacClintic, Tracey and Moore-Manwaring in favor and 1 abstain (Mayne.)
Motion passed.

Public Comment

None.

Applications for a Certificate of Appropriateness

- a. 82 N. Main Street, Proposed Siding and Trim Replacement

Ben Hildebrand, a representative of Sage Engineering & Contracting, explained that he had attended the February 5, 2024 HDC Regular Meeting in order to gain a better understanding of the concerns the Historic District Commission had with the proposed exterior repairs on 82 N. Main Street. This evening he is back looking for the commission’s approval to move forward with the project. He noted that a permit has been submitted to the Building Department proposing to remove and replace approximately 2,500 s.f. of damaged and /or rotted wood clapboard siding and corner quoining with wood clapboard and wood quoining. All trim will remain intact including window trim, door trim and the dentil molding. The replacements will be made to the north, south and west elevations. A brief refresher of the February 5, 2024 conversation ensued and the commission members deliberated and asked questions of Mr. Hildebrand. The commission expressed concern with the clapboard siding being replaced with pine wood versus cedar. Other concerns included replacing all of the quoining, versus only replacing areas that absolutely need to be replaced and the possible loss of depth. The historical significance of this building, and the prime location in the center of town, were emphasized as they considered the extent of the quoin replacements. Mr. Hildebrand shared his concerns, and described possible issues with a partial quoin replacement with the commission responding to his concerns accordingly.

Commissioner MacClintic motioned to accept the Certificate of Appropriateness with the change that as much of the corner quoining as can be maintained is indeed maintained and not replaced in full.

Commissioner Schwemmer made a friendly amendment to the motion to include wording that stated “the depth of the trim should be maintained and the clapboard lap should match the current lap.”

Commissioner MacClintic accepted the friendly amendment and Commissioner Schwemmer seconded the revised motion with additional wording. Vote: 5-0 in favor. Motion passed unanimously.

- b. 423 South Main Street, Proposed siding and Trim Replacement

Rob Boido addressed the commission and explained that he is proposing to “replace exactly what is there by taking off the pieces that are rotting and put new cedar on and all the trim the same.” Chairman Mayne noted that the HDC has been chasing this project for a while and Mr. Boido noted that he was aware and had made numerous attempts to reach out with no success. Mr. Boido claimed he did not understand what the process

entailed with regard to filling out the appropriate permits for work and decided to make repairs, without HDC approval, because of extreme circumstances that required immediate attention. Chairman Mayne suggested they begin the conversation by walking through the work that has already taken place and then move on to the proposed work still to be done. Mr. Boido stated that he was more than happy to work with the commission to do whatever they suggest. Extensive discussion ensued about the changes already made which include a new surround around the front door and a change to the trim on the windows. Both alterations are inconsistent with the size, structure and age of the building. The commission offered suggestions as to what they would like to see happen with some of the work already done, and provided guidance for future projects including a full window replacement and replacement of the front step area. The group also reviewed historical photos of the home to determine what might have been original to the design and what had been changed over the years. The commission asked the applicant to match the existing trim to the windows based on a sample to be provided by the homeowner and return the front door surround and window surrounds to existing. Mr. Boido offered to drop off the requested sample to Chairman Mayne's home for review. The homeowner will be required to submit a separate application for replacing the windows.

Commissioner Schwemmer motioned and Commissioner Tracey seconded to approve the application for 423 South Main Street with the following amendments: the siding replaced matches the same lap as the current siding, the front door surround be restored to the original door surround per the photographs provided by Commissioner MacClintic and that the window trim in need of repair or replacement matches the existing profile and dimensions of the current windows based on the sample to be provided to Chairman Mayne.

Commissioner Quandt questioned whether the lights should be adjusted if the trim is returned to its original location and if so, should that be included in the motion. The photographs were examined by the commission and homeowner to determine how the lights would be impacted.

Commissioner Schwemmer amended the motion and Commissioner Moore-Manwaring seconded to include moving the front lights closer to the door after the trim is removed in order to bring them into balance and the commission also approves the replacement of the front step with a single brownstone slab step. Vote: 5-0 in favor. Motion passed unanimously.

New Business

Chairman Mayne noted that he was waiting for a post and bracket in order to replace the Historic District sign that went missing on North Main Street.

Commissioner Quandt asked for the February 5, 2024 Historic District Commission Meeting to be posted on the Town Website. She reasoned that this meeting should be posted, as there was quite a bit of dialog that would be hard to capture in the minutes and in order to be transparent, she felt this information should be available to the public. A brief discussion ensued among the commissioners.

Chairman Mayne motioned to post the February 5, 2024 Historic District Commission Regular Meeting recording to the town website. No second was received. Motion failed.

Commissioner Schwemmer motioned and Commissioner MacClintic seconded to adjourn at 8:34 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Kristen O. Lambert
Recording Secretary