

Date: December 13, 2023

Purpose: Citizen-Led Oversight Committee (CLOC) Meeting

Location: Okatie Elementary School Media Center and Via Zoom

Committee Member Attendees:

Ted Barber, Daniel Clare, Marion Johnson Payne, Richard Tritschler, Ray Warco

Beaufort County School District (BCSD) Representatives Present:

Robert Oetting, Jennifer Hamblin, Carol Crutchfield, Lou Ackerman

Turner & Townsend Heery Attendees:

Robert Corbin, David Waggoner, Agustin Vargas

Other Attendees:

Halie Cooler, Olivier, Inc.

Todd Hill, Stage Front

Meeting Minutes

1. Prior to the December 13, 2023, CLOC meeting, the following materials were distributed to the committee members via email: Meeting Agenda; Meeting No. 48 Presentation Materials; Public Comment Card; Minutes from the November 8, 2023 CLOC Meeting (Draft); Referendum Projects 2019 Financial Summary; Project Level Financial Details; 2019 Referendum Project Contingency Log; Cash Flow Projections vs Actuals.
2. Mr. Barber opened the meeting with the Pledge of Allegiance.
3. Mr. Barber confirmed with Mr. Oetting that there were no public comments.
4. Mr. Barber asked for a motion to approve the draft meeting minutes from the November 8th meeting. A motion was made by Mr. Warco and seconded by Mr. Tritschler. The motion was approved by all. The approved meeting minutes will be posted to the CLOC website.
5. **Hilton Head Island High School – Advanced Design Update**

Mr. Corbin provided the update on Hilton Head High School's advanced design, which is being reported under budget and on schedule. Architect is working with MB Kahn to obtain updated construction cost estimate based on Phase 1 75% CD's and Phase 2 SD's. On November 28th the project was submitted to Hilton Head Design Review board. 75% CD plan review comments have been provided to Little Diversified. Little Diversified is preparing the Phase 1 100% CD's. Project manager is scheduling a meeting with Little Diversified and MB Kahn to discuss destructive testing to avoid the situation that occurred with the new Robert Smalls Leadership Academy. Little Diversified has scheduled the Phase 1 100% CD review with OSF for January 11, 2024, and January 12, 2024.

Mr. Barber asked how long the Hilton Head Island Design Review Board (HHIDRB) takes in their review of the design documents.

Mr. Oetting responded by saying that there currently is no specific timeframe on the duration of the review. However, from previous experience with the HHIDRB, these reviews can take a long time. There have been previous meetings with the HHIDRB and they are aware of the importance of getting this project approved in an expeditious manner. So far, this entity has been receptive to requests and has provided positive feedback regarding the HHHS Addition and Building Renovations.

6. Project Updates:

Battery Creek High School (BCHS) - Jumper Carter Sease Architects (JCS) and MB Kahn Construction Company, Inc. (MBK)

Mr. Corbin gave the report for BCHS, which is under budget and on schedule. MB Kahn has completed the improvements for BCHS; The Performing Arts Center replacement curtains were delivered sooner than scheduled and the curtains have been installed; Punch list was completed in November 2023; This will be the last monthly report for this project.

Robert Smalls Leadership Academy (RSLA) – LS3P Associates, Ltd. (LS3P) and JE Dunn Construction Company (JE Dunn)

Mr. Corbin gave the report for RSLA, which is being reported under budget and on schedule. The punch list contained 1,091 items to correct when issued; All items have been completed except for the asphalt paving that has been postponed three times due to weather; Site utilities remainder work will be completed after the Phase 2 demolition. Phase 2 athletic scope is progressing on schedule. JE Dunn Amendment No. 11 has been fully executed, the demolition phase is progressing and is approximately 75% complete.

Okatie Elementary School (OES) – SGA|NarmourWright Design (SGA|NW) and Thompson Turner Construction (TTC)

Mr. Corbin gave the report for OES, which is under budget and on schedule. IT Room Expansion/Buildout: Demolition began in November 2023; MDF demolition will occur during winter break 2023. Structured cabling contractor has furnished the pre-installation report; Structured cabling is 85% complete. Electrical overhead work and exterior penetrations are complete. The generator is scheduled to arrive in October 2024.

MC Riley Elementary School (MCRES) & MC Riley Early Childhood Center (MCRECC) – Rosenblum Coe Architects, Inc. (RCA) and Ajax Building Company, LLC (Ajax)

Mr. Corbin reported on MCRES and MCRECC, which are under budget and on schedule. MCRES interior cameras are 90% complete and exterior cameras are 85% complete. Demolition of decommissioned systems began in November 2023 and are 25% complete. MCRECC interior cameras are complete and exterior cameras are 85% complete. Demolition of decommissioned systems was completed in November 2023. New emergency generators are scheduled to arrive in January 2024.

May River High School (MRHS) – Quackenbush Architects and Planners, LLC (QAP) and Ajax

Mr. Corbin gave the report for MRHS, which is being reported under budget and on schedule. The camera system and PA/Intercom are scheduled to be completed in Q1 2024. Structure cabling was completed in November 2023. The prefabricated restroom building for the athletic fields was delivered to the site on December 8, 2023. CTE Expansion: DDs have been received and are ongoing review; Permit submittals have begun.

Following the conclusion of Mr. Marshall's project updates, Mr. Corbin asked if there were any questions.

No questions were received on Mr. Marshall's project updates.

Hilton Head Island Early Childhood Center (HHIECC) – SGA|NW and TTC

Mr. Corbin gave the report for HHIECC, which is being reported under budget and on schedule. Installation of technology cabling commenced in November 2023. The Pre-K playground fencing is scheduled to be replaced during winter break. The new generator (long lead item) is scheduled to arrive in Q2 2024.

Bluffton Elementary School (BLES) and Bluffton Early Childhood Center (BLECC) – JCS and MBK

Mr. Corbin gave the reports for BLES and BLECC, which are on schedule and under budget. At BLES, all work has been completed. MB Kahn is assembling closeout documentation and the final pay application. At BLECC, cabling installation is approximately 50% complete. Front entry vestibule was completed in November 2023.

Red Cedar Elementary School (RCES) – RCA and Charles Perry Partners, Inc. (CPPI)

Mr. Corbin reported on RCES, which is under budget and on schedule. Phase 1 Safety/Security and Technology/Infrastructure scope was completed in September 2023, except for new interior IT room doors. Phase 2 Safety/Security and Technology/Infrastructure cabling installation is approximately 50% complete. Front entry vestibule was completed in November 2023. The arrival date for the Phase 2 generator has improved to June 5, 2024.

River Ridge Academy (RRA) – JCS and CPPI

Mr. Corbin reported on RRA, which is under budget and on schedule. Front entry vestibule was completed in November 2023; Cabling installation is scheduled to be completed in January 2024. MBK Amendment No. 54 for the remaining athletics was approved at the November 7, 2023 Board meeting. Permits from BJWSA and Town of Bluffton are both anticipated to be received in January 2024.

Hilton Head Island Middle School (HHIMS) – LS3P and TTC

Mr. Corbin reported on HHIMS, which is under budget and on schedule. Renovations of the 800-classroom wing are approximately 95% complete; Final OSF inspection is scheduled to occur on December 19, 2023. Renovations for the 700-classroom wing are scheduled to begin in December 2023.

Hilton Head Island High School (HHIHS) – MPS and MBK

Mr. Corbin reported on HHIHS, which is under budget and on schedule. PA/Intercom and cabling are scheduled to be completed in December 2023. Town of Hilton Head permit for the new field house and remaining athletics was received in November 2023; MPS continues to work with SCDHEC to obtain remaining permit. Perimeter silt fence has been installed; Demolition for related athletic scope has commenced. Replacement of HVAC equipment for the existing field house has commenced.

Bluffton High School (BLHS) – JCS and MBK

Mr. Corbin reported on BLHS, which is under budget and on schedule. Initial Owner PA/Intercom training was completed in November 2023; Programming of call boxes is being completed in December 2023 and once completed, final Owner training will be scheduled.

Following the conclusion of Mr. Summers' project updates, Mr. Corbin asked if there were any questions.

No questions were received on Mr. Summer's project updates.

Riverview Charter School (RVCS) – QAP and TTC

Mr. Corbin reported on RVCS, which is under budget and on schedule. Installation of the PA/Intercom system is complete and Owner training is complete. Project closeout has begun; This will be the last monthly construction report for this project. Remaining activities will be reported under Project Closeouts.

Coosa Elementary School (CES) – LS3P and TTC

Mr. Corbin reported on CES, which is under budget and on schedule. Network switchover is being coordinated to occur in December 2023. Commissioning of Audio Enhancement and Allied Universal Systems and Owner training will occur once the Network switchover is complete.

Mossy Oaks Elementary School (MOES) – QAP and TTC

Mr. Corbin reported on MOES, which is under budget and on schedule. Cameras, Access controls, and PA/Intercom punch list items are scheduled for completion in December 2023. Commissioning of the systems and Owner training is being coordinated to occur after completion of punch list items.

Port Royal Elementary School (PRES) – RCA and Ajax

Mr. Corbin reported on PRES, which is under budget and on schedule. Cameras, Access controls, and PA/Intercom punch list items are scheduled for completion in December 2023. PA/Intercom follow-up training will be coordinated once the commissioning report is complete; Camera follow-up training will be coordinated once the punch list items for cameras are addressed.

Pritchardville Elementary School (PVES) – JCS and TTC

Mr. Corbin reported on PVES, which is under budget and on schedule. Electrical penetrations, conduit and raceways are complete; Structured cabling installation is complete. Network switchover is being scheduled to occur in January 2024. Commissioning of the Audio Enhancement and Allied Universal Systems and Owner training will occur once the network cutover is complete.

Beaufort Middle School (BMS) –SGA|NW and TTC

Mr. Corbin reported on BMS, which is under budget and on schedule. Structure cabling is complete; Network cutover is being coordinated to occur in January 2024. Commissioning of the Audio Enhancement and Allied Universal Systems and Owner training will occur once the network cutover is complete. Prefabricated restroom building and concessions building are installed; Lift station installation is scheduled to occur in January 2024.

Beaufort High School (BHS) – LS3P and TTC

Mr. Corbin gave the report for BHS, which is under budget and on schedule. Punchlist items are progressing and are scheduled for completion in December 2023. Demolition of the decommissioned data systems is progressing as scheduled; TTC Amendment No. 65 for the practice field restrooms is fully executed and construction is scheduled to be complete in Q3 2024. Lead time on modular restroom structure is approximately 20 weeks.

Whale Branch Early College High School (WBECHS) – QAP and CPPI

Mr. Corbin gave the report for WBECHS, which is under budget and on schedule. Structured cabling is complete; Network switchover is being coordinated to occur in December 2023. Commissioning of the new systems is scheduled to occur once the network switchover is complete. TTC Amendment No. 64 for the baseball batting cages has been fully executed; Construction is scheduled to begin in Q2 2024.

Following the conclusion of Mr. Koll's project updates, Mr. Corbin asked if there were any questions.

No questions were received on Mr. Koll's project updates.

Mr. Corbin turned the meeting over to Mr. Vargas for updates on his projects.

Lady's Island Elementary (LIES) – MPS and Ajax

Mr. Vargas reported on LIES, which is under budget and on schedule. Camera installations are 95% complete; Completion of video system is scheduled to occur in December 2023. Emergency generator is scheduled to arrive in January 2024.

St. Helena Elementary School (SHES) – MPS and Ajax

Mr. Vargas reported on SHES, which is under budget and on schedule. Camera installations are 95% complete and are scheduled to be complete in December 2023. Emergency generator is scheduled to arrive in late February 2024. Gymnasium and Transportation Suite IT updates: Card readers are currently pending power supply equipment arrival to finalize installations in the Transportation suite.

Broad River Elementary School (BRES) - LS3P and TTC

Mr. Vargas reported on BRES, which is under budget and on schedule. Security camera punch list items are being addressed; IT Room card readers are scheduled for completion in December 2023. Structure cabling demolition is scheduled for completion in December 2023.

Joseph S. Shanklin Elementary School (JSES) – RCA and Ajax

Mr. Vargas reported on JSES, which is under budget and on schedule. Camera installations are 90% complete. The generator is scheduled to arrive in January 2024.

James J. Davis Early Childhood Center (JJDECC) – RCA and Ajax

Mr. Vargas reported on JJDECC, which is under budget and on schedule. Camera installations are 95% complete. The generator is scheduled to arrive in January 2024.

Whale Branch Elementary School (WBES) – RCA and CCI

Mr. Vargas reported on WBES, which is under budget and on schedule. The final punch list items are pending receipt of electrical gear for disconnect boxes in December 2023; Upon receipt and installation, punch list inspection will be scheduled. Closeout documents are being assembled for review and approval.

Whale Branch Middle School (WBMS) – RCA and CCI

Mr. Vargas reported on WBMS, which is under budget and on schedule. The final punch list items are pending receipt of electrical gear for disconnect boxes in December 2023; Upon receipt and installation, punch list inspection will be scheduled. Closeout documents are being assembled for review and approval.

Bluffton Middle School (BLMS) – SGA|NW and TTC

Mr. Vargas reported on BLMS, which is under budget and on schedule. Existing structured cabling repairs are scheduled to be completed in December 2023. PA/Intercom equipment installations are complete; Reprogramming of equipment is necessary and is scheduled to occur in December 2023. Commissioning and Owner training is scheduled to occur after programming issues are addressed. Camera and Access Controls installation continues to progress and is scheduled for completion in January 2024. Bi-Directional Amplifier (BDA) parts are on order and installation is scheduled for completion in December 2023. The generator is scheduled to arrive in Q1 2024.

Following the conclusion of Mr. Vargas' project updates, Mr. Corbin asked if there were any questions.

Mr. Tritschler asked if the District would be conducting a lessons learned questionnaire or survey for school staff and principals.

Mr. Oetting responded by saying lessons learned discussions with school staff and principals have not taken place. Mr. Oetting added that as of right now the District has conducted lessons learned with the Operations and IT departments. The CLOC lessons learned discussions are to take place tonight, and afterwards there will be lessons learned discussions with the Operations Committee before lessons learned are discussed with the Board of Education.

Mr. Tritschler suggested that the District consider conducting lessons learned with the staff at District schools to collect their input as well.

Mr. Barber clarified what is being asked by Mr. Tritschler is for the District to receive feedback from the staff at the schools for project scope that has been completed.

Mr. Tritschler agreed that this was indeed what he was trying to ask.

Mr. Vargas added that we are constantly receiving feedback back from the principals. If issues arise the PM's work with the contractors to be made aware of the issue.

Mr. Barber responded that the feedback we are seeking should be shared with the design teams for the 2023 Bond Referendum Program so that lessons learned in the 2019 Bond Referendum Program can be implemented into future designs to make the next round of projects better.

Mr. Corbin added that we have done this in the past as a post-occupancy evaluation so that we can learn what they like about the new spaces as well as how the overall design could be improved.

Mr. Barber concurred that this is what should be done to receive this feedback from the end users and reiterated that Dr. Rodriguez has a goal of a Bond Referendum to occur every four years.

No further questions were received on Mr. Vargas' project updates.

7. Mr. Corbin provided the Project Closeout updates. Thirty-five (35) project closeouts remain. Seven (7) projects are targeted for completion in Q4 2023 and Eight (8) projects are targeted for completion in Q1 2024.
8. Mr. Corbin provided the Financial Update, which is being reported with a “green” traffic light. Standard monthly Financial Reports have been distributed. As of November 30, 2023, the Current Budget remains at \$375,710,000. The Paid and Committed Funds total \$372,527,517 (99.15%). The Total Remaining Funds to Commit (including Contingency) total \$3,182,483 (0.85%). Contingency Activity in November 2023 shows \$250,450 in savings returned and \$1,506,513 in contingency used. The remaining available contingency is \$259,958.

Mr. Clare asked about the remaining funds to commit and inquired if the \$3,182,483 was for projects that are yet to be placed under contract.

Mr. Corbin explained that the District has put the Referendum Projects under contract. The remaining funds will be used to purchase remaining Owner furnished items that include, but are not limited to, athletic equipment, technology equipment, furniture and equipment.

Mr. Clare asked what the total cost forecast for these purchases amounts to.

Mr. Corbin responded by saying that based on current forecasts and available funds, the total cost of the remaining items and forecasted savings will result in a “Soft Landing” where at the end of the 2019 Bond Referendum Program, savings estimated at \$544,540 will remain.

9. Mr. Corbin presented the Cash Flow Projections vs. Actual Expenditures slides. The Referendum funds paid as of November 30, 2023, total \$290,095,464. The total forecasted expenditures through November 30, 2023, was \$344.46 million. The total payments made in November 2023 were \$6,908,886.
10. Mr. Corbin shared that there were no Community Outreach activities to report for the month of November 2023.
11. Mr. Corbin turned the meeting over to Mr. Waggoner for the Lessons Learned from the 2019 Bond Referendum Program.

Mr. Waggoner briefed on the Lessons Learned and recapped on the yearly sessions held with the District. The recap highlighted the most prominent items throughout the lifespan of the program.

In 2020 (Year 1) the most prominent items were:
Start Design Phase Earlier; Developing Technology Requirements/Standards; Improved Communications with Principals; Provide Vendor Training on Invoicing/Payment Requirements; and Commence Project Closeout Process Earlier.

Mr. Waggoner began discussions regarding issues with timely project closeouts and the contractual liquidated damages contained in each CM's agreement.

Mr. Corbin added that another way to get contractors to closeout projects quicker is to stop awarding future contracts until prior project closeouts have been finalized. However, Mr. Corbin pointed out that this could cause a negative impact to future project schedules.

Mr. Barber asked if there are incentives we could offer to the CM's for closing projects out quicker.

Mr. Corbin responded by saying this would need to be vetted by District's Legal to ensure that if the District chose to implement incentives, that there would be no violations of State statutes.

Mr. Warco emphasized the statements made by Mr. Geier in previous meetings regarding penalties to CM's for missing the contractual timelines for closeout.

Mr. Corbin responded by saying the current contracts include liquidated damages. Mr. Corbin added that we could investigate using higher dollar amount for liquidated damages in future Agreements.

Mr. Oetting added to the discussions by saying that as a whole the District needs to do a better job at setting expectations for the CM's as to the process of gathering and submitting closeout documents and the associated final invoice.

Mr. Barber suggested that the District consider doing training sessions with the contractors to walk them through the process and set the timeframes expected to be met.

Mr. Warco suggested that possibly on the CLOC side, the threshold for paid to date vs. construction in place should increase or decrease understanding that there is a couple months lag in the invoicing from contractors for work that is in place. This is feedback the CLOC finance committee is open to receiving from the District knowing the time period that payments lag from contractors.

Mr. Oetting responded to Mr. Warco's comment regarding the paid to date vs. construction in place typically has a lag of two months to three months.

Mr. Barber added that hopefully CM's would improve in their processing times considering that some of the contractors already know the District procedures.

Mr. Waggoner presented the lessons learned for 2021 (Year 2) and the most prominent items which were:

Perform Project Scope Validation Reports, Encourage use of Project Charter Meetings, Require Designers to Perform Additional Field Verifications; CM's to Improve on Preconstruction Services, Develop Technology Network Cutover Checklists, and Updating Technology Design Guidelines.

During 2022 (Year 3) the most prominent Lessons learned included: Involvement of a Liaison between the Facilities Department and the Instruction Services Department (Mr. Lawton) is very beneficial; Investigate advantages of a Project Management Information System (PMIS); Introduce Future AIA Agreement Revisions to Hold Designers Accountable for Better Documentation, Construction Administration, and Project Closeout Services; Improve Documentation for Design Review Meetings and Introduce the Use of Checklists; Increase IT Department Participation in Reviews of Design Documents and Specifications; Increasing the Participation of the IT Department in Reviews of Design Documents and Specifications; Order Long Lead Items ASAP; and Develop Digital Storage for Closeout Documents.

The list for 2023 (Year 4) included: Increasing the Level of Detail/Milestones for Design Schedules Including Time for Progress Reviews of Each Design Phase; Implementation of Future QC/QA Requirements for Designers and Contractors; Ensure IT Department Perform Progress Design Reviews; Develop a Responsibility Matrix for Project Team Participants; Evaluation Forms for Architects as well as CM Firms; Require Designers to Distribute a Log of all Design Review Comments and Provide Written Responses on How Comments Have Been Addressed Including References to Sheet Number's and/or Details. Summertime Frames Have gotten Shorter, Be Prepared for Shorter Summers. Development of RFP for PMIS which is currently underway.

Mr. Waggoner expanded on the discussions by presenting the Lessons learned which took place with the IT Department in October 2023. Takeaways were: Increased Communications with IT Department Staff on Scopes, Budgets, and Schedules; making sure that they are monitoring construction work.

Mr. Waggoner conveyed the discussions from the IT department suggests bringing in an IT consulting firm to assist in working with project design teams and to monitor construction work on behalf of the IT Department. Provide more uniformity of system designs and quality standards. More IT designers are needed to work with designers to implement future QA/QC requirements for designers and contractors. Better commissioning and documentation/ checklist are needed for everyone to stay on the same page.

Mr. Corbin recapped on the input brought forth by the CLOC to bring Lessons Learned recommendations to the Operations Committee and ultimately to the Board of Education: Recommend getting feedback from end users (teachers, principals, admin staff), Exploring the use of post occupancy evaluations, Add provisions in the contracts for timely project closeouts, the ability to set timely expectation levels for designers and contractors, implementing training for new project teams in specific requirements for payment applications and project closeouts.

Mr. Barber concluded that the recapped items were accurate.

Mr. Barber asked if there were any additional questions on lessons learned. There were none.

12. Mr. Corbin turned the meeting over to Mr. Barber for the CLOC Sub-Committee Reports/Updates

Mr. Barber had no updates to report for the Project Sub-Committee as well as from the Communications Sub-Committee.

Mr. Warco provided a report from the Finance Committee and the following Finance Committee concerns:

- i) In relation to the soft landing, Mr. Warco asked Mr. Corbin if he expects to return additional cost savings to the program contingency that are currently being held at the project level?

Mr. Corbin responded by saying yes.

- ii) Mr. Warco also addressed the analysis performed by the Finance Committee regarding the difference between the percentage of work completed versus percentage paid to date. The number of projects where this difference is 18% or greater is down from last month's seven (7) projects to six (6) projects.

13. Mr. Barber addressed the following forward-looking items.

Mr. Barber asked Mr. Oetting for a meeting with the Superintendent to discuss an official closeout for the 2019 Bond Referendum Program with the members of the CLOC and to inquire if there will be a formal request of the CLOC members to provide oversight for the 2023 Bond Referendum Program. Mr. Barber would also like to discuss at this meeting with the Superintendent a recognition event for the members of the CLOC for their years in service. At this meeting there will also be discussions to have a clear line of delineation between the 2019 and 2023 Bond Referendum Programs and how meetings will be led going forward so that there is no conflicting information between the two programs.

Mr. Oetting agreed that there is a need to have these discussions with the Superintendent and that he will formalize a meeting with Dr. Rodriguez. Mr. Oetting foresees the need for the CLOC to continue to provide their oversight for the 2023 Bond Referendum Program.

Mr. Barber reinforced that for the CLOC to provide their oversight, there will be a need for a formal request from Dr. Rodriguez.

14. Mr. Corbin discussed the date for the next CLOC meeting. Since the next meeting was scheduled to occur on February 14, 2024 (Valentine's Day), consensus was reached to hold the next meeting on February 21, 2024 at the District Office in the Media Center.

15. Mr. Barber asked if there were any more items to discuss.

Mr. Warco asked if the Audit Report had been delivered to the District.

Mr. Oetting responded by saying the Audit Report had been delivered on December 12, 2023 and was glad to report there were no findings.

Mr. Warco requested to receive a copy of the Audit Report.

Mr. Ackerman let Mr. Warco know that the Audit Report may already be had been posted to the BCSD website.

On February 12, 2024, Mr. Corbin confirmed that the Audit Report is posted on the District website and can be accessed using the following link:

<https://resources.finalsite.net/images/v1701893260/beaufortk12scus/jpuaebfocdpavtdh2xfi/FY23ACFR-FINAL.pdf>

No further questions were asked.

16. Mr. Barber adjourned the meeting.