

# **ISSUER COMMENT**

17 January 2020

#### **RATING**

## General Obligation (or GO Related) <sup>1</sup>

Aa2 Stable

#### Contacts

Sam Krouse +1.214.979.6842
Associate Lead Analyst
sam.krouse@moodys.com

Rachel Cortez +1.312.706.9956 Senior Vice President/Manager rachel.cortez@moodys.com

#### **CLIENT SERVICES**

Americas 1-212-553-1653
Asia Pacific 852-3551-3077
Japan 81-3-5408-4100
EMEA 44-20-7772-5454

# Cincinnati City School District, OH

Annual Comment on Cincinnati City SD

# **Issuer Profile**

Cincinnati City School District is located in Hamilton County in the southwestern corner of Ohio. The county has a population of 808,703 and a high population density of 1,985 people per square mile. The county's median family income is \$71,692 (2nd quartile) and the November 2019 unemployment rate was 3.5% (3rd quartile)  $\frac{2}{3}$ . The largest industry sectors that drive the local economy are health services, professional/scientific/technical services, and manufacturing.

# **Credit Overview**

Cincinnati City SD has a very high quality credit position, and its Aa2 rating is a little stronger than the US school districts median of Aa3. Key credit factors include a robust financial position, a large tax base, a sizable debt burden, an elevated pension liability, and a somewhat weak wealth and income profile.

**Finances:** The district's financial position is healthy when compared to the assigned rating of Aa2. The cash balance as a percent of operating revenues (30.1%) is on par with the US median, and grew modestly from 2014 to 2018. Additionally, Cincinnati City SD's fund balance as a percent of operating revenues (40.2%) is stronger than other Moody's-rated school districts nationwide.

**Economy and Tax Base:** Overall, the district has a satisfactory economy and tax base in comparison to its Aa2 rating. The total full value (\$18.5 billion) greatly exceeds the US median, and increased from 2014 to 2018. On the contrary, the full value per capita (\$55,520) is slightly below the US median. Furthermore, the median family income equals 71.9% of the US level.

**Debt and Pensions:** Cincinnati City SD's debt and pension burdens are heavy overall when compared to the Aa2 rating assigned. The district's net direct debt to full value (3%) is materially higher than the US median. That said, this percentage declined from 2014 to 2018. Additionally, the Moody's-adjusted net pension liability to operating revenues (2.7x) unfavorably is materially above the US median.

Management and Governance: Ohio school districts have an institutional framework score of "A", which is moderate. The sector's major revenue sources are property taxes and state aid, with wealthier districts relying more heavily on property tax. Local property tax do not have a rate cap, but can be increased with voter approval only. Some school districts also levy a local income tax, which requires voter approval. Revenues and expenditures tend to be predictable. Ohio has public sector unions, which can limit the ability to cut expenditures.

#### **Sector Trends - Ohio School Districts**

Ohio school districts generally face a stable operating environment. The state's current biennium budget increases total school funding by 3% over fiscal years 2018 and 2019; however, the state is targeting the latest increases toward lower-wealth districts. School levy elections are becoming increasingly important throughout the state, and districts with strong voter support for new taxes can best align revenues with expenditures. Competition from charter schools is concentrated in large metropolitan areas. School district pension burdens are high, but will fall due to a recent suspension of cost of living adjustments.

EXHIBIT 1 **Key Indicators** 4 5 Cincinnati City SD

	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018	US Median	Credit Trend
Economy / Tax Base							
Total Full Value	\$16,931M	\$17,187M	\$17,298M	\$17,475M	\$18,474M	\$1,919M	Improved
Full Value Per Capita	\$51,149	\$51,848	\$52,086	\$52,516	\$55,520	\$87,328	Improved
Median Family Income (% of US Median)	72%	71%	72%	72%	72%	101%	Stable
Finances							
Available Fund Balance as % of Operating Revenues	37.8%	37.7%	39.4%	40.3%	40.2%	22.3%	Stable
Net Cash Balance as % of Operating Revenues	25.5%	28.7%	20.0%	22.8%	30.1%	27.2%	Stable
Debt / Pensions							
Net Direct Debt / Full Value	3.9%	3.7%	3.5%	3.3%	3.0%	1.6%	Improved
Net Direct Debt / Operating Revenues	1.27x	1.16x	1.07x	0.94x	0.90x	0.73x	Stable
Moody's-adjusted Net Pension Liability (3-yr average) to Full Value	10.0%	8.1%	8.0%	9.2%	9.1%	3.3%	Improved
Moody's-adjusted Net Pension Liability (3-yr average) to Operating Revenues	3.23x	2.56x	2.42x	2.63x	2.73x	1.48x	Improved
	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018	3 US Median	_
Debt and Financial Data							_
Population	331,025	331,499	332,113	332,757	332,75	7 N/A	_
Available Fund Balance (\$000s)	\$197,723	\$205,776	\$225,570	\$247,097	\$248,28!	\$9,391	_
Net Cash Balance (\$000s)	\$133,076	\$156,602	\$114,580	\$139,971	\$185,530	\$11,164	
Operating Revenues (\$000s)	\$522,568	\$546,146	\$571,950	\$613,189	\$616,96!	\$42,583	
Net Direct Debt (\$000s)	\$664,965	\$635,670	\$609,365	\$576,945	\$553,900	\$29,872	
Moody's Adjusted Net Pension Liability (3-yr average) (\$000s)	\$1,688,743	\$1,396,162	\$1,384,378	\$1,610,476	5 \$1,681,73	7 \$62,410	

Source: Moody's Investors Service

This publication does not announce a credit rating action. For any credit ratings referenced in this publication, please see the ratings tab on the issuer/entity page on www.moodys.com for the most updated credit rating action information and rating history.

EXHIBIT 2

Available fund balance as a percent of operating revenues was stable from 2014 to 2018



Source: Issuer financial statements; Moody's Investors Service

EXHIBIT 3

Full value of the property tax base increased from 2014 to 2018



Source: Issuer financial statements; Government data sources; Offering statements; Moody's Investors Service

EXHIBIT 4

Moody's-adjusted net pension liability to operating revenues decreased from 2014 to 2018



Source: Issuer financial statements; Government data sources; Offering statements; Moody's Investors Service

#### **Endnotes**

- 1 The rating referenced in this report is the issuer's General Obligation (GO) rating or its highest public rating that is GO-related. A GO bond is generally backed by the full faith and credit pledge and total taxing power of the issuer. GO-related securities include general obligation limited tax, annual appropriation, lease revenue, non-ad valorem, and moral obligation debt. The referenced ratings reflect the government's underlying credit quality without regard to state guarantees, enhancement programs or bond insurance.
- 2 The demographic data presented, including population, population density, per capita personal income and unemployment rate are derived from the most recently available US government databases. Population, population density and per capita personal income come from the American Community Survey while the unemployment rate comes from the Bureau of Labor Statistics.
  - The largest industry sectors are derived from the Bureau of Economic Analysis. Moody's allocated the per capita personal income data and unemployment data for all counties in the US census into quartiles. The quartiles are ordered from strongest-to-weakest from a credit perspective: the highest per capita personal income quartile is first quartile, and the lowest unemployment rate is first quartile.
- 3 The institutional framework score assesses a municipality's legal ability to match revenues with expenditures based on its constitutionally and legislatively conferred powers and responsibilities. See <u>US Local Government General Obligation Debt (December 2016)</u> methodology report for more details.
- 4 For definitions of the metrics in the Key Indicators Table, <u>US Local Government General Obligation Methodology and Scorecard User Guide (July 2014)</u>. Metrics represented as N/A indicate the data were not available at the time of publication.
- 5 The medians come from our most recently published local government medians report, <u>Medians Tax base growth underpins sector strength</u>, <u>while pension challenges remain (May 2019)</u> which is available on Moodys.com. The medians presented here are based on the key metrics outlined in Moody's GO methodology and the associated scorecard.

© 2020 Moody's Corporation, Moody's Investors Service, Inc., Moody's Analytics, Inc. and/or their licensors and affiliates (collectively, "MOODY'S"). All rights reserved.

CREDIT RATINGS ISSUED BY MOODY'S INVESTORS SERVICE, INC. AND/OR ITS CREDIT RATINGS AFFILIATES ARE MOODY'S CURRENT OPINIONS OF THE RELATIVE FUTURE
CREDIT RISK OF ENTITIES, CREDIT COMMITMENTS, OR DEBT OR DEBT-LIKE SECURITIES, AND MATERIALS, PRODUCTS, SERVICES AND INFORMATION PUBLISHED BY MOODY'S
(COLLECTIVELY, "PUBLICATIONS") MAY INCLUDE SUCH CURRENT OPINIONS. MOODY'S INVESTORS SERVICE DEFINES CREDIT RISK AS THE RISK THAT AN ENTITY MAY
NOT MEET ITS CONTRACTUAL FINANCIAL OBLIGATIONS AS THEY COME DUE AND ANY ESTIMATED FINANCIAL LOSS IN THE EVENT OF DEFAULT OR IMPAIRMENT. SEE
MOODY'S RATING SYMBOLS AND DEFINITIONS PUBLICATION FOR INFORMATION ON THE TYPES OF CONTRACTUAL FINANCIAL OBLIGATIONS ADDRESSED BY MOODY'S
INVESTORS SERVICE CREDIT RATINGS. CREDIT RATINGS DO NOT ADDRESS ANY OTHER RISK, INCLUDING BUT NOT LIMITED TO: LIQUIDITY RISK, MARKET VALUE RISK, OR
PRICE VOLATILITY. CREDIT RATINGS, NON-CREDIT ASSESSMENTS ("ASSESSMENTS"), AND OTHER OPINIONS INCLUDED IN MOODY'S PUBLICATIONS ARE NOT STATEMENTS
OF CURRENT OR HISTORICAL FACT. MOODY'S PUBLICATIONS MAY ALSO INCLUDE QUANTITATIVE MODEL-BASED ESTIMATES OF CREDIT RISK AND RELATED OPINIONS OR
COMMENTARY PUBLISHED BY MOODY'S ANALYTICS, INC. AND/OR ITS AFFILIATES. MOODY'S CREDIT RATINGS, ASSESSMENTS, OTHER OPINIONS AND PUBLICATIONS ARE NOT
AND DO NOT PROVIDE INVESTMENT OR FINANCIAL ADVICE, AND MOODY'S CREDIT RATINGS, ASSESSMENTS, OTHER OPINIONS AND PUBLICATIONS ARE NOT
AND DO NOT PROVIDE RECOMMENDATIONS TO PURCHASE, SELL, OR HOLD PARTICULAR SECURITIES. MOODY'S ISSUES ITS CREDIT RATINGS, ASSESSMENTS, OTHER OPINIONS AND
PUBLICATIONS DO NOT COMMENT ON THE SUITABILITY OF AN INVESTMENT FOR ANY PARTICULAR FLOCAL HINVESTOR WILL, WITH DUE CARE, MAKE ITS OWN STUDY
AND EVALUATION OF EACH SECURITY THAT IS UNDER CONSIDERATION FOR PURCHASE. HOLDING. OR SALE.

MOODY'S CREDIT RATINGS, ASSESSMENTS, OTHER OPINIONS, AND PUBLICATIONS ARE NOT INTENDED FOR USE BY RETAIL INVESTORS AND IT WOULD BE RECKLESS AND INAPPROPRIATE FOR RETAIL INVESTORS TO USE MOODY'S CREDIT RATINGS, ASSESSMENTS, OTHER OPINIONS OR PUBLICATIONS WHEN MAKING AN INVESTMENT DECISION. IF IN DOUBT YOU SHOULD CONTACT YOUR FINANCIAL OR OTHER PROFESSIONAL ADVISER. ALL INFORMATION CONTAINED HEREIN IS PROTECTED BY LAW, INCLUDING BUT NOT LIMITED TO, COPYRIGHT LAW, AND NONE OF SUCH INFORMATION MAY BE COPIED OR OTHERWISE REPRODUCED, REPACKAGED, FURTHER TRANSMITTED, TRANSFERRED, DISSEMINATED, REDISTRIBUTED OR RESOLD, OR STORED FOR SUBSEQUENT USE FOR ANY SUCH PURPOSE, IN WHOLE OR IN PART, IN ANY FORM OR MANNER OR BY ANY MEANS WHATSOEVER, BY ANY PERSON WITHOUT MOODY'S PRIOR WRITTEN CONSENT.

MOODY'S CREDIT RATINGS, ASSESSMENTS, OTHER OPINIONS AND PUBLICATIONS ARE NOT INTENDED FOR USE BY ANY PERSON AS A BENCHMARK AS THAT TERM IS DEFINED FOR REGULATORY PURPOSES AND MUST NOT BE USED IN ANY WAY THAT COULD RESULT IN THEM BEING CONSIDERED A BENCHMARK.

All information contained herein is obtained by MOODY'S from sources believed by it to be accurate and reliable. Because of the possibility of human or mechanical error as well as other factors, however, all information contained herein is provided "AS IS" without warranty of any kind. MOODY'S adopts all necessary measures so that the information it uses in assigning a credit rating is of sufficient quality and from sources MOODY'S considers to be reliable including, when appropriate, independent third-party sources. However, MOODY'S is not an auditor and cannot in every instance independently verify or validate information received in the rating process or in preparing its Publications.

To the extent permitted by law, MOODY'S and its directors, officers, employees, agents, representatives, licensors and suppliers disclaim liability to any person or entity for any indirect, special, consequential, or incidental losses or damages whatsoever arising from or in connection with the information contained herein or the use of or inability to use any such information, even if MOODY'S or any of its directors, officers, employees, agents, representatives, licensors or suppliers is advised in advance of the possibility of such losses or damages, including but not limited to: (a) any loss of present or prospective profits or (b) any loss or damage arising where the relevant financial instrument is not the subject of a particular credit rating assigned by MOODY'S.

To the extent permitted by law, MOODY'S and its directors, officers, employees, agents, representatives, licensors and suppliers disclaim liability for any direct or compensatory losses or damages caused to any person or entity, including but not limited to by any negligence (but excluding fraud, willful misconduct or any other type of liability that, for the avoidance of doubt, by law cannot be excluded) on the part of, or any contingency within or beyond the control of, MOODY'S or any of its directors, officers, employees, agents, representatives, licensors or suppliers, arising from or in connection with the information contained herein or the use of or inability to use any such information.

NO WARRANTY, EXPRESS OR IMPLIED, AS TO THE ACCURACY, TIMELINESS, COMPLETENESS, MERCHANTABILITY OR FITNESS FOR ANY PARTICULAR PURPOSE OF ANY CREDIT RATING, ASSESSMENT, OTHER OPINION OR INFORMATION IS GIVEN OR MADE BY MOODY'S IN ANY FORM OR MANNER WHATSOEVER.

Moody's Investors Service, Inc., a wholly-owned credit rating agency subsidiary of Moody's Corporation ("MCO"), hereby discloses that most issuers of debt securities (including corporate and municipal bonds, debentures, notes and commercial paper) and preferred stock rated by Moody's Investors Service, Inc. have, prior to assignment of any credit rating, agreed to pay to Moody's Investors Service, Inc. for credit ratings opinions and services rendered by it fees ranging from \$1,000 to approximately \$2,700,000. MCO and Moody's investors Service also maintain policies and procedures to address the independence of Moody's Investors Service credit ratings and credit rating processes. Information regarding certain affiliations that may exist between directors of MCO and rated entities, and between entities who hold credit ratings from Moody's Investors Service and have also publicly reported to the SEC an ownership interest in MCO of more than 5%, is posted annually at <a href="https://www.moodys.com">www.moodys.com</a> under the heading "Investor Relations — Corporate Governance — Director and Shareholder Affiliation Policy."

Additional terms for Australia only: Any publication into Australia of this document is pursuant to the Australian Financial Services License of MOODY'S affiliate, Moody's Investors Service Pty Limited ABN 61 003 399 657AFSL 336969 and/or Moody's Analytics Australia Pty Ltd ABN 94 105 136 972 AFSL 383569 (as applicable). This document is intended to be provided only to "wholesale clients" within the meaning of section 761G of the Corporations Act 2001. By continuing to access this document from within Australia, you represent to MOODY'S that you are, or are accessing the document as a representative of, a "wholesale client" and that neither you nor the entity you represent will directly or indirectly disseminate this document or its contents to "retail clients" within the meaning of section 761G of the Corporations Act 2001. MOODY'S credit rating is an opinion as to the creditworthiness of a debt obligation of the issuer, not on the equity securities of the issuer or any form of security that is available to retail investors.

Additional terms for Japan only: Moody's Japan K.K. ("MJKK") is a wholly-owned credit rating agency subsidiary of Moody's Group Japan G.K., which is wholly-owned by Moody's Overseas Holdings Inc., a wholly-owned subsidiary of MCO. Moody's SF Japan K.K. ("MSFJ") is a wholly-owned credit rating agency subsidiary of MJKK. MSFJ is not a Nationally Recognized Statistical Rating Organization ("NRSRO"). Therefore, credit ratings assigned by MSFJ are Non-NRSRO Credit Ratings. Non-NRSRO Credit Ratings are assigned by an entity that is not a NRSRO and, consequently, the rated obligation will not qualify for certain types of treatment under U.S. laws. MJKK and MSFJ are credit rating agencies registered with the Japan Financial Services Agency and their registration numbers are FSA Commissioner (Ratings) No. 2 and 3 respectively.

MJKK or MSFJ (as applicable) hereby disclose that most issuers of debt securities (including corporate and municipal bonds, debentures, notes and commercial paper) and preferred stock rated by MJKK or MSFJ (as applicable) have, prior to assignment of any credit rating, agreed to pay to MJKK or MSFJ (as applicable) for credit ratings opinions and services rendered by it fees ranging from JPY125,000 to approximately JPY250,000,000.

MJKK and MSFJ also maintain policies and procedures to address Japanese regulatory requirements.

REPORT NUMBER 1201558

## **CLIENT SERVICES**

 Americas
 1-212-553-1653

 Asia Pacific
 852-3551-3077

 Japan
 81-3-5408-4100

 EMEA
 44-20-7772-5454

