Alum Rock Union School District
Project Delivery Comparison – Workforce Housing

	DESIGN-BUILD	TRADITIONAL DESIGN-BID-BUILD	LEASE-LEASEBACK
Structure	Players/Roles • District • CM (optional, District Team) • Bridging/Criteria Architect (District Team) • Architect/Contractor Team (DBE) ○ Bridging/Criteria Architect cannot be on DBE	Players/Roles • District • CM (optional, District Team) • Architect (District Team) • General Contractor	Players/Roles • District • CM (optional, District Team) • Architect (District Team) • Developer

Procurement	Steps
	1. Bridging/Criteria Architect
	• Selected based on qualifications
	• Award contract after negotiation
	• Resulting Performance Specifications [Plans] used in selection of DBE
	2. Design-Build Entity
	• Request for Qualifications
	• Request for Proposals
	  ○ Optional: stipend for proposers if design competition
	• Award contract after negotiation
	• DSA must approve plans
	• Construction
		Steps
		• Prequalification of prime and subcontractors, if District requires
		• Hard Bid, must be advertised
		  ○ Subcontractor proposals included
		• Award contract, negotiating not allowed
		• Construction
			Steps
			• Prequalification of prime and MEP subcontractors
			• Request for Proposals, must be advertised
			• Award contract (without price) after negotiation for Preconstruction Services costs only
			• Preconstruction Services
			• Once DSA approves plans, subcontracts bid and GMP prepared
			• After GMP negotiated, Facilities Lease amended
			• Construction

Selection	Best Value (qualifications, price, life cycle costs over 15+ years) or Lowest Price	Lowest Price	Best Value (qualifications, price, safety) or Lowest Price
Phasing of Project	• Design (with Manufacturer Design Input) • Construction Design-Build team has control over the design, and is responsible for designing to overall project budget and making necessary adjustments, including breaking up project into increments.	• Design (with Manufacturer Design Input) • Construction If the project is broken into increments, then the above phases are repeated, including bidding. District may end up with different contractors for each increment. Later bids subject to market escalation. District may pay the cost of extra design.	• Design • Manufacturer Design Input & Preconstruction • Construction If the project is broken into increments, then the above phases are repeated, including subcontractor bidding and GMP negotiation. Subsequent GMP negotiations subject to market escalation. District may pay cost of extra design.
When Cost is Determined	When design-build contract awarded • Change orders can still occur	After DSA approves plans and bidding, when the contract awarded • Change Orders likely to occur However, the comparable cost to the alternatives would be at the end of the project after change orders	After contract is awarded, DSA approves plans, and when GMP amendment approved by the Board • GMP usually includes contingency for scope gaps, etc. so price will be higher upfront than Design-Bid-Build • Change orders can still occur

Miscellaneous	• More flexibility for DBE
	• Less involvement/control by District (turnkey project)
	• Can lock in a contractor for entire project sooner
	• Skilled and Trained Workforce Requirements
	
	Traditional or Alternative Design-Build options. Differences based on
		• Less information available when negotiating change orders (bid is a lump sum)
		• Potential delays for scope gaps, constructability, value engineering if need to resubmit plans to DSA
		• Potential delays for redesign if bids exceed budget
			• More teamwork between Architect and Developer where early involvement before DSA submittal
			  ○ Mitigate number of change orders/get competitive price while negotiating GMP
			  ○ Mitigate number of change orders/avoid delay if must resubmit to DSA
			• District access to subcontractor bids (“open book”) when negotiating contract
			• Can lock in a contractor for entire project sooner
			• Skilled and Trained Workforce Requirements