

## Challenged Materials Committee Report

### Material Being Challenged:

Library Book: *This One Summer* by Jillian Tamaki and Mariko Tamaki

Date of Challenge Committee Meeting: 12/14/21

### Regulation 6241 outlines that the Challenged Materials Committee shall:

- Examine and/or read the challenged resource
- Determine professional acceptance by reading critical review of the resource
- Weigh positives and negatives and form opinions based on the material as a whole rather than on passages or sections taken out of context
- Discuss the challenged resource in the context of the educational program
- Prepare a written report which states the decision, rationale for the decision, and the official vote (without identifying votes of individual members of the committee)
- Recommend that the questioned materials be retained without restriction, retained with restriction or not retained

### Agenda:

1. Norms and meeting operation
2. Parent concerns over the material
3. Library policy and procedures
4. Committee Discussion of the Value of the material
5. Committee consensus

### Library Media Information Shared with the Committee

#### Library Mission Statement from the Rockwood Library Handbook

- The Rockwood School District believes inclusive library media services and access for all students and staff will raise levels of student performance. Therefore, the Rockwood Library Media Program strives to provide welcoming library spaces, robust collections of materials, and dynamic library media instruction that will empower students to become critical thinkers, ethical users of information, responsible and engaged citizens, and lifelong learners and readers.

- page 3 of The RSD Library Media Handbook

#### Intellectual Freedom

- Intellectual freedom, as guaranteed by the First Amendment, is a core value of the library media profession and a basic right in our democratic society. The school library media program in the Rockwood School District will play a role in the promotion of intellectual freedom and serve as a point of voluntary access and offer opportunities for all students to learn in an atmosphere of free inquiry. Every student regardless of race, color, sex, national origin, ethnicity, disability, religion, sexual orientation shall be given equal access to library media resources.

-page 4 of The RSD Library Media Handbook

#### Collection Development

- In managing the library collection, the library media specialist shall be mindful of the objectives listed in Regulation 6310. In addition, the library media specialist shall also:
  - Consider the importance of diverse literary representation. The collection should provide literature that serves as both mirrors, windows, and sliding glass doors so students are exposed to books and characters that reflect their own experiences as well as experiences of others.
  - Consider the degree of user appeal as measured by reviews in professional library journals and

inclusion on award lists, including but not limited to the Missouri Association of School Librarians Readers' Awards lists, the Young Adult Library Services Association Awards lists, and the Association for Library Services to Children Awards lists.

- page 6 of The RSD Library Media Handbook

### Professional Reviews & Awards Regarding This Material

#### Awards:

- **Horn Book Guide Starred**, 10/01/2014
- **School Library Journal Starred**, 05/01/2014
- **Publishers Weekly Starred**, 03/17/2014
- **Caldecott Honor Book**, 2015
- **Printz Honor Book**, 2015
- **Eisner Award**, 2015

#### Professional Reviews:

- **Horn Book Guide**, 10/01/2014  
Rose's family goes to Awago Beach every summer. This year she's feeling too old for some of the activities she used to love--and even for her more-childish friend Windy. Rose's contemplative observations and flashbacks, along with the book's realistic dialogue, offer insight into her evolving personality, while the dramatic perspective changes and purply-blue ink illustrations capture the graphic novel's raw emotional core.
- **School Library Journal Starred**, 05/01/2014  
Gr 8 Up—Every summer, Rose and her parents vacation at a lakeside cottage. The rest of the world fades away as Rose reunites with her friend Windy and delves into leisurely games of MASH, swimming, and the joy of digging giant holes in the sand—but this summer is different. Rose is on the cusp of adolescence; she's not ready to leave childhood behind but is fascinated by the drama of the local teens who are only a few years older, yet a universe apart in terms of experience. They drink, they smoke, they swear. As Rose and Windy dip their toes into the mysterious waters of teen life by experimenting with new vocabulary ("sluts!") and renting horror movies, her parents struggle with their own tensions that seem incomprehensible to Rose. Layers of story unfurl gradually as the narrative falls into the dreamlike rhythm of summer. Slice-of-life scenes are gracefully juxtaposed with a complex exploration of the fragile family dynamic after loss and Rose's ambivalence toward growing up. The mood throughout is thoughtful, quiet, almost meditative. The muted tones of the monochromatic blue-on-white illustrations are perfectly suited to the contemplative timbre, and the writing and images deserve multiple reads to absorb their subtleties. This captivating graphic novel presents a fully realized picture of a particular time in a young girl's life, an in-between summer filled with yearning and a sense of ephemerality. The story resolves with imperfect hope and will linger in readers' mind through changing seasons.
- **Publishers Weekly Starred**, 03/17/2014  
Rose and Windy, friends for two weeks every summer in nearby Ontario lake cottages, have hit early adolescence. Rose, a bit older, has knowledge and polish that tubby, still-childish Windy lacks, and Windy sometimes bores her. Yet Windy's instincts are often sound, while Rose is led astray by an infatuation with a local convenience store clerk. As Rose's parents' marriage founders and the taunts of local teens wake her to issues of social class, Rose veers between secret grief and fleeting pleasure in

the rituals of summer. Jillian Tamaki's exceptionally graceful line is one of the strengths of this work from the cousin duo behind *Skim*. Printed entirely in somber blue ink, the illustrations powerfully evoke the densely wooded beach town setting and the emotional freight carried by characters at critical moments, including several confronting their womanhood in different and painful ways. Fine characterization and sensitive prose distinguish the story, too—as when Rose remembers the wisdom a swimming teacher shared about holding his breath for minutes at a time: “He told me the secret was he would tell himself that he was actually breathing.” Ages 12–up.

### Concerns the Challenger Shared Regarding The Book *This One Summer* by Jillian Tamaki and Mariko Tamaki

- The book contains profanity.
- The book is included on a banned book list.
- This book is a graphic novel, and graphic novels are enticing to many children.
- The book is littered with the “F” word, “prick,” “asshole,” “getting laid,” and “bitch.” It is very impressionable.
- The book is not a good example for students to follow.
- Page 39 - “Okay, sluts, let’s go.” Teaches boys it’s ok to talk this way.
- Page 189 - “She might not even be pregnant, right? You said she still has to go to the doctor”.
- Page 60-61 - Says guys owe twizzlers to girls for blow jobs. Do we want to teach young girls to give blow jobs for a gift? This causes a harmful view of women.
- Page 246 - Boys discussing that a girl is lying about being pregnant. This shows boys as uncaring and irresponsible.
- Page 276 - Girl accuses boy of rape and then he says go to the doctor.
- Putting restrictions on it won’t keep the students from picking up the book from the shelf. Current plan is insufficient I hope the committee will make the right call. It is a fallacy that many parents don’t know these books are in the library.
- I want to believe that it was not chosen for its content, but ordered not knowing what was in it.
- It’s a shame that it took kids checking it out to get to this point. There is good literature out there, why would we fill the library with this filth?
- Rockwood wants to teach kids kindness and to be a good human being.
- I insist the book be removed. Kids find the book and it sends the message that this is ok. Do you think this is ok?

### Committee’s Comments on the Value of This Material

- This is a coming of age story. Girl, Rose, is struggling. She doesn't know where she belongs as a teenager. Guessing she's maybe 12 or 13. Windy is older. They used to have a lot of fun together. Windy represents the childhood that Rose used to have, but she is wondering what it’s like to be a teenager. Her mother corrects her when she uses bad language. This is a classic coming of age novel.
- I see real value for some of the things said above. Adolescence is a confusing time and so many issues that are brought up that they are trying to navigate.
- It is important that kids be able to have exposure to the issues that occur in a book in a place that opens up conversation with adults.
- I looked up the author and illustrator and they mentioned that the main character is often afraid, confused, and upset that things are happening. Reading about these topics allows students to see these struggles at a distance without a price. She is exposed to things outside of her comfort zone.
- The book promotes having empathy for others. Developing empathy is very much needed in our current climate. I agree with this. Rockwood promotes social emotional learning.
- The challenger talked about how the book encourages things. I don't think the book encourages

anything. It really discourages the behavior. It's realistic fiction and helps you draw your own conclusion and decide it's not right. I don't agree that this book is glamorizing, encouraging or demeaning towards women. You don't get a favorable impression of the guys that are talking this way. I think it does the opposite of demeaning women. It shows women who are strong and powerful. The mom saves the girl from drowning. It has real value in helping kids understand the complexity of growing up.

- In reference to the slut shaming, the mom shut that down and made it known that it was not ok. It was not glamorizing, but showed that it was a horrible thing.
- This is a cautionary tale and proves that boys might not be there for the girl. He might not be their knight in shining armor, and there are repercussions for behavior. I'd rather my kids read about these things and not have real life consequences.
- The mother's miscarriage and the trouble it caused in their marriage as a result was realistic. A kid may have this happen and may not realize how impactful that can be. This is something I've never read before at a young adult level. Didn't find much explicit content in this book.
- I don't love this book. It's not a great plot line. It doesn't nicely tie a bow on the lesson, but isn't that what adolescent life is like?
- The book mimics the chaos of adolescence. It's hard to be the oldest friend and youngest friend. It's hard to have a baby you don't want or want a baby you can't have. It shows that there are so many ways being a woman can be challenging.
- It was a sample of the difficulties of adolescence. The author did a good job in creating the discomfort of adolescence. It leaves people a little uneasy, but it works.
- This book reminds me of summer camp. This is what kids do when adults are not around. This is what happens. It's not a language that I like, but it is accurate.
- I was not a fan of the book, but I don't understand why it's being challenged. It is not going to teach kids any words that they haven't already heard.
- This was not my favorite book, but it touched on a lot of things. Readers can experience these things from a safe distance and have a chance to observe and pass their own judgment and draw their own conclusions. None are presented in a light that is favorable. The main character didn't want to be in that world. The ending did a nice job of helping her understand what her mom and dad were going through. This book included issues a lot of kids struggle with.
- The book also honors the value of art. It won a Caldecott honor which was given to the illustrator.
- There is a lot of perspective to consider in this book. There are a range of ages: grandma, parents, teens and preteens.
- The challenger mentioned the book at the middle school level. This book is only at the high schools according to Destiny.
- The challenger felt like there were no good human beings in this book, but I thought there were. The author does a good job in making us dislike some that were in the book.
- Teens were calling each other names in the book, but that's realistic.
- Kids can see through happy, rosey stories right away. It is true we want kids to handle a situation better than those boys did. This story was set up as a cautionary tale and shows what not to do. The ramification is cause and effect leading to bad choices which leads to more bad choices.
- You can learn something from good behavior or bad behavior; you either want to emulate or don't want to emulate. For example, I'm not doing that because it didn't work out the way they thought it would. We cannot have all rosey pictures in the books we read as that isn't reasonable.
- The challenger stated that graphic novels are an enticement to reluctant/struggling readers. I see that as good; we want to entice reluctant readers to read.
- This book is not one of my favorites, but don't see anything that would harm a high schooler. If it was a movie, it may be rated PG 13 or 14.

### Questions the Committee Asked

You mentioned rape - I did

My understanding is that they were in a relationship. On page 193, Wendy

not see rape in the book.	says "I wonder if they do DNA tests here..." "They probably don't have a lab. I wonder where they do rape kits." The girl who is possibly pregnant is not talking about being raped. There is no rape in the book.
---------------------------	--

<b>Committee's Rationale and the Decision</b>	
Consensus of the committee	Retain without restriction in the high school library.
How does the decision impact the accessibility of the material moving forward?	The book will remain without restriction in Rockwood high school libraries.