BEAUFORT COUNTY SCHOOL DISTRICT
RECONSIDERATION COMMITTEE CHECKLIST

Committee Number: 63 **Date** _____

Name of Novel A Lesson in Vengeance by Lee, Victoria

Directions: After reading the selected novel, review the material using the below criteria. Note upon review of the book the following Beaufort County School District Non Discrimination will be taken into consideration:

Non-Discrimination. The BCSD affirms the right of all individuals to be treated with respect and to be protected from intimidation, discrimination, physical harm, and/or harassment. The BCSD is committed to nondiscrimination and equal opportunity for all students, parents/legal guardians, staff, visitors, applicants for admission and employment, personnel, and community members who participate or seek to participate in its educational programs or activities. Accordingly, the BCSD does not discriminate against any individual on the basis of race, religion, gender, gender identity, sexual orientation, sex, pregnancy, childbirth, or any related medical conditions, color, physical or mental disability, age (40 or older), ancestry, genetic information, national origin, or any other applicable status protected by Title VI, Title VII, Title IX or any other local, state, or federal law.

EDUCATIONAL SIGNIFICANCE	**Check all that apply**
The novel supports the BCSD's mission, vision, and goals.	
The novel directly supports the acquisition of related standards. (Educational Significance)	
The novel contributes to improved academic achievement for a variety of learners and learning styles.	
The novel promotes the integration of higher-level thinking skills.	
The novel reflects the needs/interests of the school and the culture of the school community.	
The novel/material adds value to the library/school collection	
The novel reflects a clear, adequate, and broad presentation of the content.	✓
Evidence from the text or standards relating to EDUCATIONAL SIGNIFICANCE:	

QUALITY, CONTENT, MANNER OF PRESENTATION	Check all that apply
The novel is to be engaging and able to meet a variety of student needs. Meet high standards of quality in factual content and presentation to include, but not limited to: i. No errors, validity, accuracy; ii. Objectivity; iii. Well written; and iv. Strong visual appeal.	
Ensure reputation and significance of author and producer.	
The novel/material contains a value/currency commensurate with cost.	✓
The novel/material has high artistic quality, and/or literary style.	
The novel/material avoids bias and adheres to standards of sensitivity relative to student race, sex, religion, culture, ethnicity, disability, and socioeconomic status.	
Ensure that the novel/material contains clarity adequacy, and scope of test.	
The presentation of contents is organized in a manner that provides clarity and ease to the reader.	✓
The novel/material ensures a high degree of readability and/or comprehensibility.	✓
Evidence from the text relating to QUALITY:	

AVOIDANCE OF PERVASIVE VULGARITY	Check all that apply
When considered as a whole, the novel does not appeal to sexual interest in a shameful way.	
The novel does not depict or describe sexual conduct in a clearly offensive way.	
The novel abides by prevailing standards in the adult community in regard to suitable material for minors.	
The novel is free from graphic depictions of sexual activity.	✓
Evidence from the text relating to PERVASIVE VULGARITY:	

APPROPRIATENESS	K-5	6-8	9-12
The novel is appropriate to the age and grade level of students.			
The novel is appropriate to the maturity level of students.			
The novel is appropriate to the content area.			
The novel/material reflects the contemporary community standards.			
Evidence from the text relating to APPROPRIATENESS:			

Not appropriate

BEAUFORT COUNTY SCHOOL DISTRICT
RECONSIDERATION COMMITTEE CHECKLIST

Committee Number: 63 **Date** 8-2-2023

Name of Novel A Lesson in Vengeance by Lee, Victoria

Directions: After reading the selected novel, review the material using the below criteria. Note upon review of the book the following Beaufort County School District Non Discrimination will be taken into consideration:

Non-Discrimination. The BCSD affirms the right of all individuals to be treated with respect and to be protected from intimidation, discrimination, physical harm, and/or harassment. The BCSD is committed to nondiscrimination and equal opportunity for all students, parents/legal guardians, staff, visitors, applicants for admission and employment, personnel, and community members who participate or seek to participate in its educational programs or activities. Accordingly, the BCSD does not discriminate against any individual on the basis of race, religion, gender, gender identity, sexual orientation, sex, pregnancy, childbirth, or any related medical conditions, color, physical or mental disability, age (40 or older), ancestry, genetic information, national origin, or any other applicable status protected by Title VI, Title VII, Title IX or any other local, state, or federal law.

EDUCATIONAL SIGNIFICANCE	**Check all that apply**
The novel supports the BCSD's mission, vision, and goals.	
The novel directly supports the acquisition of related standards. (Educational Significance)	
The novel contributes to improved academic achievement for a variety of learners and learning styles.	
The novel promotes the integration of higher-level thinking skills.	
The novel reflects the needs/interests of the school and the culture of the school community.	
The novel/material adds value to the library/school collection	
The novel reflects a clear, adequate, and broad presentation of the content.	✓
Evidence from the text or standards relating to EDUCATIONAL SIGNIFICANCE: Novel effectively depicts (6) components of literary fiction as to plot, characters, etc.	

QUALITY, CONTENT, MANNER OF PRESENTATION	Check all that apply
The novel is to be engaging and able to meet a variety of student needs. Meet high standards of quality in factual content and presentation to include, but not limited to: i. No errors, validity, accuracy; ii. Objectivity; iii. Well written; and iv. Strong visual appeal.	
Ensure reputation and significance of author and producer.	
The novel/material contains a value/currency commensurate with cost.	
The novel/material has high artistic quality, and/or literary style.	✓
The novel/material avoids bias and adheres to standards of sensitivity relative to student race, sex, religion, culture, ethnicity, disability, and socioeconomic status.	
Ensure that the novel/material contains clarity adequacy, and scope of test.	
The presentation of contents is organized in a manner that provides clarity and ease to the reader.	✓
The novel/material ensures a high degree of readability and/or comprehensibility.	✓
Evidence from the text relating to QUALITY: Theme, character development, plot, and setting are effectively portrayed as a fiction novel.	

AVOIDANCE OF PERVASIVE VULGARITY	Check all that apply
When considered as a whole, the novel does not appeal to sexual interest in a shameful way.	
The novel does not depict or describe sexual conduct in a clearly offensive way.	
The novel abides by prevailing standards in the adult community in regard to suitable material for minors.	
The novel is free from graphic depictions of sexual activity.	

Evidence from the text relating to PERVASIVE VULGARITY:

Evidence of multiple usage of profanity
(1) sexually explicit scene between Felicity & Ellis
(1) scene depicting heightened sexual sensitivity while participating in a choking episode

APPROPRIATENESS	K-5	6-8	9-12
The novel is appropriate to the age and grade level of students.			
The novel is appropriate to the maturity level of students.			
The novel is appropriate to the content area.			
The novel/material reflects the contemporary community standards.			

Evidence from the text relating to APPROPRIATENESS:

Evidence of..
- Underage drinking / pot smoking
- Depiction of graphic violence (death of Clara) "stabbing" & "throat slit"
- Choking with garrote
- Promotion of capital crime with no consequences. Felicity kills Ellis and is not charged for murder.

BEAUFORT COUNTY SCHOOL DISTRICT
RECONSIDERATION COMMITTEE CHECKLIST

Committee Number: 63 **Date** 8-2-23

Name of Novel A Lesson in Vengeance by Lee, Victoria

Directions: After reading the selected novel, review the material using the below criteria. Note upon review of the book the following Beaufort County School District Non Discrimination will be taken into consideration:

Non-Discrimination. The BCSD affirms the right of all individuals to be treated with respect and to be protected from intimidation, discrimination, physical harm, and/or harassment. The BCSD is committed to nondiscrimination and equal opportunity for all students, parents/legal guardians, staff, visitors, applicants for admission and employment, personnel, and community members who participate or seek to participate in its educational programs or activities. Accordingly, the BCSD does not discriminate against any individual on the basis of race, religion, gender, gender identity, sexual orientation, sex, pregnancy, childbirth, or any related medical conditions, color, physical or mental disability, age (40 or older), ancestry, genetic information, national origin, or any other applicable status protected by Title VI, Title VII, Title IX or any other local, state, or federal law.

EDUCATIONAL SIGNIFICANCE	Check all that apply
The novel supports the BCSD's mission, vision, and goals.	✓
The novel directly supports the acquisition of related standards. (Educational Significance)	✓
The novel contributes to improved academic achievement for a variety of learners and learning styles.	✓
The novel promotes the integration of higher-level thinking skills.	✓
The novel reflects the needs/interests of the school and the culture of the school community.	✓
The novel/material adds value to the library/school collection	✓
The novel reflects a clear, adequate, and broad presentation of the content.	✓
Evidence from the text or standards relating to EDUCATIONAL SIGNIFICANCE: Touches on important questions such as mental illness + how strong/ angry women are accused of being hysterical / insane.	

QUALITY, CONTENT, MANNER OF PRESENTATION	Check all that apply
The novel is to be engaging and able to meet a variety of student needs. Meet high standards of quality in factual content and presentation to include, but not limited to: i. No errors, validity, accuracy; ii. Objectivity; iii. Well written; and iv. Strong visual appeal.	✓
Ensure reputation and significance of author and producer.	✓
The novel/material contains a value/currency commensurate with cost.	✓
The novel/material has high artistic quality, and/or literary style.	✓
The novel/material avoids bias and adheres to standards of sensitivity relative to student race, sex, religion, culture, ethnicity, disability, and socioeconomic status.	✓
Ensure that the novel/material contains clarity adequacy, and scope of test.	✓
The presentation of contents is organized in a manner that provides clarity and ease to the reader.	✓
The novel/material ensures a high degree of readability and/or comprehensibility.	✓
Evidence from the text relating to QUALITY: Reviews from professional journals give starred reviews. Written at level appropriate for young adult readers.	

AVOIDANCE OF PERVASIVE VULGARITY	Check all that apply
When considered as a whole, the novel does not appeal to sexual interest in a shameful way.	✓
The novel does not depict or describe sexual conduct in a clearly offensive way.	✓
The novel abides by prevailing standards in the adult community in regard to suitable material for minors.	✓
The novel is free from graphic depictions of sexual activity.	✓
Evidence from the text relating to PERVASIVE VULGARITY: Very little sexual content, and mild in nature.	

APPROPRIATENESS	K-5	6-8	9-12
The novel is appropriate to the age and grade level of students.			✓
The novel is appropriate to the maturity level of students.			✓
The novel is appropriate to the content area.			✓
The novel/material reflects the contemporary community standards.			✓
Evidence from the text relating to APPROPRIATENESS: Reviews of text from professional library journals recommend the book for grades 9-12.			

53 CHERRY POINT RD, OKATIE

BEAUFORT COUNTY SCHOOL DISTRICT
RECONSIDERATION COMMITTEE CHECKLIST

Committee Number: 63 **Date** 8/2/2023

Name of Novel A Lesson in Vengeance by Lee, Victoria

Directions: After reading the selected novel, review the material using the below criteria. Note upon review of the book the following Beaufort County School District Non Discrimination will be taken into consideration:

Non-Discrimination. The BCSD affirms the right of all individuals to be treated with respect and to be protected from intimidation, discrimination, physical harm, and/or harassment. The BCSD is committed to nondiscrimination and equal opportunity for all students, parents/legal guardians, staff, visitors, applicants for admission and employment, personnel, and community members who participate or seek to participate in its educational programs or activities. Accordingly, the BCSD does not discriminate against any individual on the basis of race, religion, gender, gender identity, sexual orientation, sex, pregnancy, childbirth, or any related medical conditions, color, physical or mental disability, age (40 or older), ancestry, genetic information, national origin, or any other applicable status protected by Title VI, Title VII, Title IX or any other local, state, or federal law.

EDUCATIONAL SIGNIFICANCE	**Check all that apply**
The novel supports the BCSD's mission, vision, and goals.	
The novel directly supports the acquisition of related standards. (Educational Significance)	✓
The novel contributes to improved academic achievement for a variety of learners and learning styles.	✓
The novel promotes the integration of higher-level thinking skills.	✓
The novel reflects the needs/interests of the school and the culture of the school community.	
The novel/material adds value to the library/school collection	
The novel reflects a clear, adequate, and broad presentation of the content.	

Evidence from the text or standards relating to EDUCATIONAL SIGNIFICANCE:

- ✓ LANGUAGE
- ✓ VOCABULARY
- ✓ SENTENCE STRUCTURE
- ✓ GRAMMAR
- ✓ HIGH LEVEL SKILLS

QUALITY, CONTENT, MANNER OF PRESENTATION	Check all that apply
The novel is to be engaging and able to meet a variety of student needs. Meet high standards of quality in factual content and presentation to include, but not limited to: i. No errors, validity, accuracy; ii. Objectivity; iii. Well written; and iv. Strong visual appeal.	
Ensure reputation and significance of author and producer.	
The novel/material contains a value/currency commensurate with cost.	
The novel/material has high artistic quality, and/or literary style.	✓
The novel/material avoids bias and adheres to standards of sensitivity relative to student race, sex, religion, culture, ethnicity, disability, and socioeconomic status.	✓
Ensure that the novel/material contains clarity adequacy, and scope of test.	
The presentation of contents is organized in a manner that provides clarity and ease to the reader.	✓
The novel/material ensures a high degree of readability and/or comprehensibility.	✓
Evidence from the text relating to QUALITY: I DID NOT FIND THE NOVEL TO BE ENGAGING.	

AVOIDANCE OF PERVASIVE VULGARITY	Check all that apply
When considered as a whole, the novel does not appeal to sexual interest in a shameful way.	✓
The novel does not depict or describe sexual conduct in a clearly offensive way.	✓
The novel abides by prevailing standards in the adult community in regard to suitable material for minors.	✓
The novel is free from graphic depictions of sexual activity.	✓
Evidence from the text relating to PERVASIVE VULGARITY: THE NOVEL WAS FAIRLY MODEST IN ITS PORTRAYALS OF SEXUAL ACTIVITY. DEFINITELY NOT GRAPHIC.	

APPROPRIATENESS	K-5	6-8	9-12
The novel is appropriate to the age and grade level of students.			✓
The novel is appropriate to the maturity level of students.			✓
The novel is appropriate to the content area.			✓
The novel/material reflects the contemporary community standards.			✓
Evidence from the text relating to APPROPRIATENESS:			

A Lesson in Vengeance: My Notes

I read novels for enjoyment and I have a very simple standard: after reading a few pages, do I care enough about the main characters to want to accompany them on their journey, wherever the author plans to take them?

Including this novel, I have now read 7 of the 97 books that were pulled from the Beaufort County School Libraries. If I applied my simple standard to the other 6 books (1) my answer would be a resounding, "YES!" Unfortunately, for *A Lesson in Vengeance* my answer would be, "No, not really."

For whatever reason, I never developed any great feelings of compassion or empathy for Felicity Morrow, Ellis Haley, or the other main characters in *A Lesson in Vengeance*. I honestly did not care what they did or what happened to them. If I hadn't made a commitment to read and review *A Lesson in Vengeance*, I would have never made it past page 10. This novel just did not speak to me. (I acknowledge that I'm not in the target demographic for this novel).

Having said this, I believe that *A Lesson in Vengeance* should be restored to the BC School Libraries. While I would not recommend this book, I did not find anything in it that would constitute an imminent threat or danger to young adult readers.

I fully understand why this novel was on the book removal advocates' hit list. Anything that falls outside their highly restricted worldview is deemed inappropriate and unacceptable and this book hit almost all their trigger points. It contained drug, alcohol, and tobacco use. It contained profanity. It contained some rather modest depictions of sexual activity. It contained gay and nonbinary characters. It contained references to suicide and young women dabbling in witchcraft. However, I don't believe anything in this novel would endanger or shock a young adult reader who has a moderate awareness of the world they inhabit.

Because of its grammar, vocabulary, sentence structure, and literary references, I believe this novel would be more appropriate for grades 9-12 and probably not appropriate for grades 6-8.

(1) The Kite Runner, The Art of Driving in the Rain, The Handmaid's Tale, Fade, Almost Perfect, and Water for Elephants.