

**Kingston High School  
And  
North Kitsap High School  
(North Kitsap School District)  
2016 Yearbook Bid Analysis**

Lisa Gray-Fritz (Kingston High School) and Tina Smallbeck (North Kitsap High School) conducted a thorough evaluation of the bids of Balfour, Herff Jones, Jostens and Walsworth. We examined sample books, references, resources and the actual bids through an extensive process lasting approximately eight hours.

We started with the bid analysis specified in the Request for Bid (RFB). We ended up with several questions while reading the bid documents and comparing the services offered. Mostly for our own curiosity, we conducted a secondary evaluation with additional questions sent to all four vendors.

The results of the secondary evaluation are compiled and listed as well.

We based our decision solely upon the Bid Analysis, but were encouraged when the secondary evaluation yielded a preference for the same vendor. Both high schools are interested in on-line ad sales and wanted to find out more about issues that North Kitsap High School experienced while piloting the process this year. Two of our additional questions are related to on-line ad sales. Kingston High School was charged for late days this year, while North Kitsap was not charged but had a delayed ship date. Both high schools wanted clarification on late days for deadlines and proofs. The final question related to Crack-and-peel stickers used to rectify mistakes and errors.

Our analysis is attached. Our preferred vendor for both high school is Jostens. Our secondary analysis is also included, and substantiated the recommendation for Jostens.

Thank you,

Lisa Gray-Fritz  
Kingston High School  
Yearbook Adviser  
360.396.3388  
[Lgray-fritz@nkschools.org](mailto:Lgray-fritz@nkschools.org)

Tina Smallbeck  
North Kitsap High School  
Yearbook Adviser  
360.396.3155  
[Tsmallbeck@nkschools.org](mailto:Tsmallbeck@nkschools.org)

# North Kitsap School District

## Yearbook Bid Analysis

June 2016

Lisa Gray-Fritz & Tina Smallbeck

	<b>Balfour</b>	<b>Herff Jones</b>	<b>Jostens</b>	<b>Walsworth</b>
<b>Current Resumes of Rep &amp; Plant - 10</b>	<b>8</b> (vague)	<b>10</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>5</b> (Missing resume + spelling error)
<b>Service &amp; Management Plan - 25</b> Service Plan - 15 Curriculum - 10	<b>15</b> Service Plan - 5 (Doesn't list how & when reps will support schools) Curriculum & plug-ins - 10	<b>18</b> Service Plan - 10 (Vague) § Curriculum & plug-ins - 8 (Curriculum is very brief)	<b>25</b> Service Plan - 15  Curriculum & plug-ins - 10	<b>25</b> Service Plan - 15  Curriculum & plug-ins - 10
<b>Complete Cost Proposal - 25</b>	<b>* 20</b> does not offer laser-cut, used by both high schools in 2016	<b>22</b> (Second least expensive - offers all services requested)	<b>15</b> (Most expensive - offers all services requested)	<b>25</b> (Least expensive - offers many services)
<b>References and/or Samples - 40</b>	<b>25</b> Samples - 15 References - 10 (Low print quality on samples)	<b>35</b> Samples - 25 References - 10 (Some color match issues)	<b>40</b> Samples - 30 References - 10 (Best print quality)	<b>30</b> Samples - 20 References - 10 (Some color match issues on samples)
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>* 68</b>	<b>87</b>	<b>90</b>	<b>85</b>

\* No reductions for not offering this service, but it would be an issue if this were the high bid.

§ - Listed service plan has not been implemented when the contract was awarded to Herff Jones.

*This does not impact the current score, but would be a factor if Herff Jones were the winning bidder.*

### On-line Ad Sales:

- Balfour - Free; can support 1/9 page; can set parameters
- Herff Jones - 10% of sales; cannot support KHS's 1/9 of page, can set parameters
- Jostens - Free, cannot support 1/9 of page, cannot set parameters
- Walsworth - \$5 per ad, can support 1/9 page; can set parameters
- Order of preference: 1 - Balfour, 2 - Walsworth, tie for 3<sup>rd</sup> - Herff Jones + Jostens

### **On-line Ad Services:**

- Balfour – Ad sales can be tracked and generated into an excel file.
  - Online ads are placed into either your online project or a zip file that you can easily download into your InDesign project and place on your pages.
- Herff Jones – eBusiness site has an ad page sales tracker. This will help to keep track of your school's intended sales goals. However, it will not automatically stop sales for yearbooks or ads when the goal is reached. This just helps you to know at-a-glance what the current numbers are for your school so you can make adjustments to your order, or close those sales as necessary.
- Jostens – Once you run out of space, you and I both get an email that we need to assign more pages to Jostens (so we both know, and between the two of us we make sure it happens). Once that happens, they place the remaining ads that are on hold.
  - Option 1: just sell them online (so you are not worrying about collecting payment and it is easy for parents to go online to pay with a credit card).
  - Option 2: parents go online to pay for them and put them together.
  - You will designate pages on your page ladder for ads, and Jostens will place them on those pages as they are sold. You can pull a report at any point that shows you who purchased, when, and what page their ad is placed on. So that way it is impossible for anything to be left out – every ad needs a home. You can download this info into excel, or print a pdf.
- Walsworth - You can limit the amount of ad space sold.
  - Normally, we do not have a hand in the ad process. Ads are retrievable via the online members only site and are able to be placed by the school or vendor if you would like for a charge of \$55 per hour.
- Order of Preference: Jostens, Balfour, Walsworth, Herff Jones

### **Late days:**

- Balfour – no late charges through year, but can affect shipment.
  - If extremely late, schools need to pay for expedited production (\$50 per signature per week). Standard turn-around time is one week
- Herff Jones – no late fees on deadlines or proofs.
  - Significantly late might result in rescheduling of ship date.
- Jostens – 14 non-final grace days. Non-final late days are \$5/day, or \$20/day on final.
- Walsworth – after grace period, overtime charges to keep ship date. Might be other options. If final proofs are late, could jeopardize the ship date.
- Order of preference: Herff Jones\*, Jostens, Balfour, Walsworth (\* New policy)

### **Crack-and-Peel stickers for 6 pica x 12 pica sticker:**

- Balfour – \$207
- Herff Jones – \$413
- Jostens – \$135
- Walsworth – < \$200
- Order of preference: Jostens, Walsworth, Balfour, Herff Jones

### **For additional items not included on scoring matrix:**

*Vendor are assigned a number 1 – 4 for each service. The numbers are added together, with the lowest number being preferable.*

Balfour: 1, 2, 3, 3 = 9

Herff Jones: 3, 4, 1, 4 = 12

Jostens: 3, 1, 2, 1 = 7

Walsworth: 2, 3, 4, 2 = 11

**Order of preference: Jostens, Balfour, Walsworth, Herff Jones**