

Robert Shaner, Ph.D.
Superintendent

Debi Fragomeni
Deputy Superintendent of Teaching and Learning



Matthew McDaniel, CPA
Assistant Superintendent of Business Operations/FOIA Coordinator

52585 Dequindre Road, Rochester, Michigan 48307. Phone: 248.726.3000. Fax: 248.726.3105.

Memorandum of Recommendation
March 13, 2023

TO: Dr. Robert Shaner, Superintendent
FROM: Matthew McDaniel, Assistant Superintendent of Business Operations
RE: **Recommendation for Approval of Fiber Maintenance 2023**

Rochester Community Schools has its own self-provisioned fiber (SPF) network that was installed in 2001 using Bond 1997 and Bond 2000 funds. Our fiber plant consists of 32 miles of fiber connecting 25 buildings. District owned fiber is eligible for E-Rate reimbursement, which allows for a 40% reimbursement on eligible expenses.

In coordination with our e-rate consultant Triple-R and our Technology Services and Purchasing departments, an RFP was issued for 3 years of fiber maintenance. Three bids were received and evaluated based on e-rate eligible costs, service transition factors, adherence to specifications, prior experience, past performance, understands needs, personnel qualifications, management capabilities, financial stability, and labor rates. Note: the fiber maintenance RFP is structured so that the district only pays for services if they are rendered. So, if there were no maintenance cost for a year, there would be no charges for the service that year.

We recommend awarding the bid to Fiber Link. Fiber Link has had a long-standing relationship with Rochester Community Schools. They designed and installed the fiber network in 2001 and have been our sole service provider since. They deliver excellent service and support and are able to be highly responsive given the extensive knowledge of our fiber plant.

This technology project and has been coordinated following e-rate guidelines for an approximate reimbursement of 40% on eligible equipment and services. The expected E-Rate filing amount of \$115,500 carries an expected E-Rate reimbursement of \$46,200.

We recommend the following:

- Fiber Maintenance E-Rate agreement for 3 years with the Fiber Link for \$115,500

**We recommend that the Board of Education awards the following contract:
Fiber Maintenance 2023**

Vendor: Fiber Link
Amount: Fiber Link contract in the amount of \$115,500 for a total project cost of \$115,500
(Expected E-Rate reimbursement of up to \$46,200)

TO: Cindy Lindner
Rochester Community Schools

FROM: Robert Rice, President
Triple R Consultants

DATE: March 3, 2023

RE: Approval for Fiber Maintenance

BOARD OF EDUCATION RECOMMENDATION

Whereby Rochester Community Schools released a request for proposal (RFP) for Self-Provisioned Fiber Maintenance in FY232 E-Rate year for a three-year agreement (FY23, FY24 and FY25).

Whereby Rochester Community Schools received three bids for fiber maintenance from AmComm, Fiber Link and Western Telecom. The fiber maintenance RFPs are structured so that the district only pays for service if they are rendered. So, if there were no maintenance cost for a year, there would be no charges for the service that year.

Whereas after reviewing the three SPF bids, the bid from Western Telecom was for the three lowest bid, however, their annual price was \$31,000 including \$18,000 per year for Miss Dig charges. The prior three years fiber maintenance cost was approximately \$82,000, \$52,000, and \$33,500. Therefore, the Western Telecom annual bid pricing is not sufficient to cover the annual maintenance cost and require the district to pay 100% if the cost for any amount over their annual bid amount. AmComm's bid was for \$62,900 per year which would still be insufficient to cover the cost in one of the past three years. Fiber Link's bid was for \$115,500 annually which is sufficient to cover all the cost from each of the past three years. Further review of the bids between AmComm and Fiber Link of the cost of per hour charges are higher for AmComm than Fiber Link. For example, Fiber Link charges \$90 per hour for a supervisor and \$82 per hour for an operator. AmComm price for supervisor is \$150 per hour and operator is \$95 per hour.

Whereas Fiber Link is the current fiber maintenance provider and has complete knowledge of the district's current fiber plant.

Therefore, based on the review of the bid responses, it is recommended that Rochester Community Schools enter into a Fiber Maintenance E-Rate agreement with the Fiber Link, for an annual amount of \$115,500 for three years. (See attached Bid Evaluation). The expected E-Rate reimbursement would be 40% of the cost incurred each of the next three years.

**BID EVALUATION WORKSHEET
FY23: 2023-2024**

District Name: Rochester Community Schools

Bid Opening Date: 1/17/2023

Service Description: Fiber Maintenance

Evaluation Factors	Factor %Weight*	Service Provider Fiberlink		Service Provider Amcomm		Service Provider Western Tel-com		Service Provider [Insert Name]		Service Provider [Insert Name]	
		Rating**	Weight***	Rating**	Weight***	Rating**	Weight***	Rating**	Weight***	Rating**	Weight***
E-rate Eligible Costs*	30	3	18.00	4	24.00	5	30.00		0.00		0.00
Service Transition Factors	20	5	20.00	4	16.00	3	12.00		0.00		0.00
Adherence to Specifications	10	4	8.00	4	8.00	4	8.00		0.00		0.00
Prior Experience	5	5	5.00	4	4.00	3	3.00		0.00		0.00
Past Performance	5	5	5.00	4	4.00	4	4.00		0.00		0.00
Understands Needs	5	5	5.00	4	4.00	2	2.00		0.00		0.00
Personnel Qualifications	5	4	4.00	4	4.00	3	3.00		0.00		0.00
Management Capabilities	5	4	4.00	3	3.00	3	3.00		0.00		0.00
Financial Stability	5	4	4.00	3	3.00	4	4.00		0.00		0.00
Labor Rates	10	5	10.00	3	6.00	5	10.00		0.00		0.00
Other (specify)	0		0.00		0.00		0.00		0.00		0.00

Total Ratings: ****

Selected Service Provider:
Approved by:
Title:
Date:

Comments:

* Page 276 of 283
 Factor %Weight=Weight of each factor where Price is the heaviest weight
 Service Provider Rating: 1=Poor 2=Fair 3=Good 4=Better 5=Best
 Service Provider Weight=(Factor %Weight) x (Service Provider Rating) x (.2)
 Total Factor %Weight must=100%