

Bridgewater-Raritan Regional School District Evaluation Committee Report for the Custodial & Management Services RFP

1. List of Proposers:

- ABM
- ACB
- Aramark
- Pritchard

2. List of Evaluation Committee Members:

- Peter Starrs
- Patti Wilson
- Kevin Lomski
- Steve Santurro

Evaluation Committee Report

3. Cost of Proposals (Ranked from lowest to highest five-year price):

BRIDGEWATER RARITAN REGIONAL COST COMPARISON OVER 5 YEARS									
Description	Details	Aramark		ABM		Pritchard		ACB	
		Percent	Total Charges	Percent	Total Charges	Percent	Total Charges	Percent	Total Charges
Custodial	Charge for Employee Wages		\$10,610,505.03		\$10,376,538.49		\$10,784,228.00		\$10,537,841.60
	Charge for Health Care Benefits	47%	\$4,995,411.57	43%	\$4,469,265.93	43%	\$4,638,281.05	46%	\$4,849,457.60
	Charge for Other Fringe Benefits	6%	\$670,010.11	14%	\$1,424,033.16	0%	\$0.00	14%	\$1,439,329.81
	Charge for Payroll Taxes	9%	\$985,540.53	4%	\$445,199.63	8%	\$895,188.24	19%	\$2,002,189.90
Consultant Recom'd FTE's	53.00	No. of FTEs (1 FTE=2080 Hrs. per Yr.) -	53.00	52.40	53.00	53.00	53.00	53.00	
Cnslt. Recom'd Wage Rate	\$16.80	Avg. Hrly. Wage Rate (Excl. Benes. & Taxes) -	\$19.25	\$19.04	\$19.57	\$19.12	\$19.12	\$19.12	
Custodial Overtime	Charge for Employee Wages		\$433,121.12		\$428,420.65		\$440,212.50		\$430,155.00
	Charge for Payroll Taxes	8%	\$34,059.00	14%	\$58,794.67	19%	\$84,961.01	19%	\$81,729.25
Required Hours	3000	Number of Annual Hours	3,000	3,000	3,000	3,000	3,000	3,000	
Cnslt. Recom'd Wage Rate	\$25.20	Avg. Wage Rate Excl. Benefits & Taxes	\$28.87	\$28.56	\$29.35	\$28.68	\$28.68	\$28.68	
Custodial - Head/Leads	Charge for Employee Wages		\$4,859,363.14		\$4,846,598.80		\$4,865,432.00		\$4,747,600.00
	Charge for Health Care Benefits	44%	\$2,132,068.37	43%	\$2,087,472.52	40%	\$1,925,324.21	42%	\$2,012,982.40
	Charge for Other Fringe Benefits	6%	\$300,881.04	4%	\$207,940.63	0%	\$0.00	12%	\$578,718.90
	Charge for Payroll Taxes	9%	\$443,387.00	14%	\$665,127.14	19%	\$939,028.38	19%	\$902,044.00
Consultant Recom'd FTE's	22.00	No. of FTEs (1 FTE=2080 Hrs. per Yr.) -	22.00	22.00	22.00	22.00	22.00	22.00	
Cnslt. Recom'd Wage Rate	\$19.10	Avg. Hrly. Wage Rate (Excl. Benes. & Taxes) -	\$21.24	\$21.18	\$21.27	\$20.75	\$20.75	\$20.75	
Custodial Heads/Lead Overtime	Charge for Employee Wages		\$127,430.85		\$127,096.12		\$127,590.00		\$124,500.00
	Charge for Payroll Taxes	8%	\$9,999.00	14%	\$17,442.15	19%	\$24,624.87	19%	\$23,655.00
Required Hours	800	Number of Annual Hours	800	800	800	800	800	800	
Cnslt. Recom'd Wage Rate	\$28.65	Avg. Wage Rate Excl. Benefits & Taxes	\$31.86	\$31.77	\$31.90	\$31.13	\$31.13	\$31.13	
Courier	Charge for Employee Wages		\$196,175.54		\$198,025.54		\$199,940.00		\$200,553.60
	Charge for Health Care Benefits	49%	\$96,912.20	43%	\$85,291.33	44%	\$87,514.74	46%	\$91,499.20
	Charge for Other Fringe Benefits	6%	\$11,869.36	4%	\$8,496.18	0%	\$0.00	8%	\$16,204.36
	Charge for Payroll Taxes	9%	\$18,265.00	14%	\$27,176.21	19%	\$38,588.42	19%	\$38,104.78
Consultant Recom'd FTE's	1.00	No. of FTEs (1 FTE=2080 Hrs. per Yr.) -	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00	
Cnslt. Recom'd Wage Rate	\$16.67	Avg. Hrly. Wage Rate (Excl. Benes. & Taxes) -	\$18.86	\$19.04	\$19.23	\$19.28	\$19.28	\$19.28	
General Manager	Charge for Employee Wages		\$543,839.66		\$578,689.27		\$513,760.00		\$514,363.20
	Charge for Health Care Benefits	30%	\$163,151.90	12%	\$71,167.41	9%	\$48,000.00	18%	\$91,499.20
	Charge for Other Fringe Benefits	6%	\$32,086.54	0%	\$2,807.94	0%	\$0.00	8%	\$40,809.99
	Charge for Payroll Taxes	8%	\$44,479.00	12%	\$67,414.76	19%	\$99,155.68	19%	\$97,729.01
Consultant Recom'd FTE's	1.00	No. of FTEs (1 FTE=2080 Hrs. per Yr.) -	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00	
Cnslt. Recom'd Wage Rate	\$53.46	Avg. Hrly. Wage Rate (Excl. Benes. & Taxes) -	\$52.29	\$55.64	\$49.40	\$49.46	\$49.46	\$49.46	
Custodial Evening Supervisor/s	Charge for Employee Wages		\$700,447.43		\$671,321.18		\$674,120.00		\$717,392.00
	Charge for Health Care Benefits	30%	\$210,134.23	12%	\$82,559.31	14%	\$96,000.00	26%	\$182,998.40
	Charge for Other Fringe Benefits	6%	\$41,326.40	0%	\$3,257.41	0%	\$0.00	3%	\$23,487.53
	Charge for Payroll Taxes	9%	\$59,615.85	12%	\$78,205.97	19%	\$130,105.16	19%	\$136,304.50
Consultant Recom'd FTE's	2.00	No. of FTEs (1 FTE=2080 Hrs. per Yr.) -	2.00	2.00	2.00	2.00	2.00	2.00	
Cnslt. Recom'd Wage Rate	\$31.01	Avg. Hrly. Wage Rate (Excl. Benes. & Taxes) -	\$33.68	\$32.28	\$32.41	\$34.49	\$34.49	\$34.49	
Clerical	Charge for Employee Wages		\$229,044.51		\$240,626.49		\$242,996.00		\$316,888.00
	Charge for Health Care Benefits	30%	\$68,713.35	12%	\$29,592.33	20%	\$48,000.00	29%	\$91,603.20
	Charge for Other Fringe Benefits	6%	\$13,513.63	0%	\$1,167.58	0%	\$0.00	7%	\$20,869.63
	Charge for Payroll Taxes	9%	\$20,396.00	12%	\$28,031.93	19%	\$46,898.23	19%	\$60,208.70
Consultant Recom'd FTE's	1.00	No. of FTEs (1 FTE=2080 Hrs. per Yr.) -	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00	
Cnslt. Recom'd Wage Rate	\$23.23	Avg. Hrly. Wage Rate (Excl. Benes. & Taxes) -	\$22.02	\$23.14	\$23.37	\$30.47	\$30.47	\$30.47	
Contractor Start Up Charges -			\$0		\$117,616		\$0		\$5,500
Total Start Up Changes Amount Amortized Over 5 Yrs.			\$0.00		\$23,523.10		\$0.00		\$5,500.00
Contractor Charge for Computerized Quality Assurance System			\$9,285.66		\$24,613.72		\$720.00		\$7,950.00
Contractor Charge for Office and/or Warehouse Rent			\$0.00		\$0.00		\$0.00		\$0.00
Contractor Charge for Required Office Equipment			\$44,272.52		\$9,652.44		\$3,500.00		\$18,750.00
Contractor Charge for Supplies & On-Going Operating Costs			\$0.00		\$0.00		\$0.00		\$0.00
Enter Cost Per Employee =		\$1,415.26	\$566,105.21	\$1,273.63	\$505,630.30	\$7,079.65	\$2,831,861.60	\$200.00	\$80,000.00
Contractor Management Fee		1.8%	\$530,935.84	4.9%	\$1,427,691.01	2.9%	\$893,580.93	2.2%	\$673,000.00
Total Contract Charge Over Five Years			\$29,202,346.61		\$29,318,871.28		\$30,679,611.02		\$31,155,918.76

Evaluation Committee Report

4. Evaluation Criteria - The following was the criteria used by the committee in evaluating the proposals:

The Criteria Used in Evaluating Proposals <i>The points awarded range from 1 to 5, with 5 being the highest score and 1 being the lowest</i>	Weighting Factor	Points
1. Program Price: What is the price of the program proposed and its impact upon the District's operating budgets? Are the charges detailed in the proposal form realistic; i.e., Health care costs, payroll taxes, management fee, etc.	20%	1 to 5
2. Contractor's financial viability, strength, capability and record of performance: Considers the Contractor's capability and experience as measured by financial statements, performance record, litigation, years in the industry, number of public school districts served and references.	10%	1 to 5
3. On-Site Management: Considers the references; proposal resumes, face to face interviews and any other method to discover the capabilities and skill level of the on-site management. At a minimum the proposed candidate must demonstrate the following: On- site Manager(s): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Should have at least two years' experience in managing a comparable sized educational institution. • Should have four years' experience in the custodial management industry. • Must have a high school diploma or GED equivalent diploma. • Must be in the process of obtaining or have a Black Seal License by 7-1-2023. • Must be fluent in English. • Must be a NJ Certified Educational Facilities Manager (CEFM) pursuant to 18A:17-49 or obtain it within two years of contract start date. On- site Supervisor(s): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Should have at least one year experience in managing a comparable sized educational institution. • Should have two years' experience in the custodial management industry • Should have a high school diploma or GED equivalent diploma. • Must be in the process of obtaining or have a Black Seal License by 7-1-2023. • Must be fluent in English. 	30%	1 to 5
4. Staffing Viability: Considers whether proposed wages and staffing levels are sufficient to recruit and maintain a stable workforce by the proposed wage rates to the following: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The current outsourced average wage rates and wages as detailed in Exhibit 6 wage rates. • The Consultant's Recommended Staffing, Wage Rates and Salaries as detailed in Exhibit 7. • Are benefits and paid time off provided/offered and employee contribution to insurance premiums and copays/deductibles sufficient to recruit and maintain a stable workforce? • Is the number of proposed custodial, management and clerical staff sufficient to meet the Scope of Work in this RFP? • Can the Contractor meet the black seal requirement? 	20%	1 to 5
5. Contractor's Proposed Program: Are the Proposer's program, systems, training, and procedures for custodial and management services thorough and comprehensive to meet the scope of work?	10%	1 to 5
6. Contractor's Start Up/Transition Plan: Is the Proposer's start-up plan customized to the needs of the District? Is the plan detailed from pre- planning (30 days prior to the start of the contract) through the start of the contract and the first three months to September 30, 2023? Did it detail the additional management and resources they shall be providing as well as the startup task, any requirements for the District, implementation date, estimated completion date, and who is responsible (name and title)? Did the plan have 100 or more different (not repetitive) tasks listed covering the startup activities in implementation, management, HR, custodial and training? Was it submitted in Excel format or a Gantt chart?	10%	1 to 5

Evaluation Committee Report

BRIDGEWATER RARITAN REGIONAL COST COMPARISON OVER 5 YEARS

Description	Details	Aramark		ABM		Pritchard		ACB	
		Percent	Total Charges	Percent	Total Charges	Percent	Total Charges	Percent	Total Charges
Custodial	Charge for Employee Wages		\$10,610,505.03		\$10,376,538.49		\$10,784,228.00		\$10,537,841.60
	Charge for Health Care Benefits	47%	\$4,995,411.57	43%	\$4,469,265.93	43%	\$4,638,281.05	46%	\$4,849,457.60
	Charge for Other Fringe Benefits	6%	\$670,010.11	14%	\$1,424,033.16	0%	\$0.00	14%	\$1,439,329.81
	Charge for Payroll Taxes	9%	\$985,540.53	4%	\$445,199.63	8%	\$895,188.24	19%	\$2,002,189.90
Consultant Recom'd FTE's	53.00	No. of FTEs (1 FTE=2080 Hrs. per Yr.) -	53.00		52.40		53.00		53.00
Cnslt. Recom'd Wage Rate	\$16.80	Hrly. Wage Rate (Excl. Benes. & Taxes) -	\$19.25		\$19.04		\$19.57		\$19.12
Custodial Overtime	Charge for Employee Wages		\$433,121.12		\$428,420.65		\$440,212.50		\$430,155.00
	Charge for Payroll Taxes	8%	\$34,059.00	14%	\$58,794.67	19%	\$84,961.01	19%	\$81,729.25
Required Hours	3000	Number of Annual Hours	3,000		3,000		3,000		3,000
Cnslt. Recom'd Wage Rate	\$25.20	Avg. Wage Rate Excl. Benefits & Taxes	\$28.87		\$28.56		\$29.35		\$28.68
Custodial - Head/Leads	Charge for Employee Wages		\$4,859,363.14		\$4,846,598.80		\$4,865,432.00		\$4,747,600.00
	Charge for Health Care Benefits	44%	\$2,132,068.37	43%	\$2,087,472.52	40%	\$1,925,324.21	42%	\$2,012,982.40
	Charge for Other Fringe Benefits	6%	\$300,881.04	4%	\$207,940.63	0%	\$0.00	12%	\$578,718.90
	Charge for Payroll Taxes	9%	\$443,387.00	14%	\$665,127.14	19%	\$939,028.38	19%	\$902,044.00
Consultant Recom'd FTE's	22.00	No. of FTEs (1 FTE=2080 Hrs. per Yr.) -	22.00		22.00		22.00		22.00
Cnslt. Recom'd Wage Rate	\$19.10	Hrly. Wage Rate (Excl. Benes. & Taxes) -	\$21.24		\$21.18		\$21.27		\$20.75
Custodial Heads/Lead Overtime	Charge for Employee Wages		\$127,430.85		\$127,096.12		\$127,590.00		\$124,500.00
	Charge for Payroll Taxes	8%	\$9,999.00	14%	\$17,442.15	19%	\$24,624.87	19%	\$23,655.00
Required Hours	800	Number of Annual Hours	800		800		800		800
Cnslt. Recom'd Wage Rate	\$28.65	Avg. Wage Rate Excl. Benefits & Taxes	\$31.86		\$31.77		\$31.90		\$31.13
Courier	Charge for Employee Wages		\$196,175.54		\$198,025.54		\$199,940.00		\$200,553.60
	Charge for Health Care Benefits	49%	\$96,912.20	43%	\$85,291.33	44%	\$87,514.74	46%	\$91,499.20
	Charge for Other Fringe Benefits	6%	\$1,869.36	4%	\$8,496.18	0%	\$0.00	8%	\$16,204.36
	Charge for Payroll Taxes	9%	\$18,265.00	14%	\$27,176.21	19%	\$38,588.42	19%	\$38,104.78
Consultant Recom'd FTE's	1.00	No. of FTEs (1 FTE=2080 Hrs. per Yr.) -	1.00		1.00		1.00		1.00
Cnslt. Recom'd Wage Rate	\$16.67	Hrly. Wage Rate (Excl. Benes. & Taxes) -	\$18.86		\$19.04		\$19.23		\$19.28
General Manager	Charge for Employee Wages		\$543,839.66		\$578,689.27		\$513,760.00		\$514,363.20
	Charge for Health Care Benefits	30%	\$163,151.90	12%	\$71,167.41	9%	\$48,000.00	18%	\$91,499.20
	Charge for Other Fringe Benefits	6%	\$32,086.54	0%	\$2,807.94	0%	\$0.00	8%	\$40,809.99
	Charge for Payroll Taxes	8%	\$44,479.00	12%	\$67,414.76	19%	\$99,155.68	19%	\$97,729.01
Consultant Recom'd FTE's	1.00	No. of FTEs (1 FTE=2080 Hrs. per Yr.) -	1.00		1.00		1.00		1.00
Cnslt. Recom'd Wage Rate	\$53.46	Hrly. Wage Rate (Excl. Benes. & Taxes) -	\$52.29		\$55.64		\$49.40		\$49.46
Custodial Evening Supervisor/s	Charge for Employee Wages		\$700,447.43		\$671,321.18		\$674,120.00		\$717,392.00
	Charge for Health Care Benefits	30%	\$210,134.23	12%	\$82,559.31	14%	\$96,000.00	26%	\$182,998.40
	Charge for Other Fringe Benefits	6%	\$41,326.40	0%	\$3,257.41	0%	\$0.00	3%	\$23,487.53
	Charge for Payroll Taxes	9%	\$59,615.85	12%	\$78,205.97	19%	\$130,105.16	19%	\$136,304.50
Consultant Recom'd FTE's	2.00	No. of FTEs (1 FTE=2080 Hrs. per Yr.) -	2.00		2.00		2.00		2.00
Cnslt. Recom'd Wage Rate	\$31.01	Hrly. Wage Rate (Excl. Benes. & Taxes) -	\$33.68		\$32.28		\$32.41		\$34.49
Clerical	Charge for Employee Wages		\$229,044.51		\$240,626.49		\$242,996.00		\$316,888.00
	Charge for Health Care Benefits	30%	\$68,713.35	12%	\$29,592.33	20%	\$48,000.00	29%	\$91,603.20
	Charge for Other Fringe Benefits	6%	\$13,513.63	0%	\$1,167.58	0%	\$0.00	7%	\$20,869.63
	Charge for Payroll Taxes	9%	\$20,396.00	12%	\$28,031.93	19%	\$46,898.23	19%	\$60,208.70
Consultant Recom'd FTE's	1.00	No. of FTEs (1 FTE=2080 Hrs. per Yr.) -	1.00		1.00		1.00		1.00
Cnslt. Recom'd Wage Rate	\$23.23	Hrly. Wage Rate (Excl. Benes. & Taxes) -	\$22.02		\$23.14		\$23.37		\$30.47
Contractor Start Up Charges -			\$0		\$117,616		\$0		\$5,500
Total Start Up Changes Amount Amortized Over 5 Yrs.			\$0.00		\$23,523.10		\$0.00		\$5,500.00
Contractor Charge for Computerized Quality Assurance System			\$9,285.66		\$24,613.72		\$720.00		\$7,950.00
Contractor Charge for Office and/or Warehouse Rent			\$0.00		\$0.00		\$0.00		\$0.00
Contractor Charge for Required Office Equipment			\$44,272.52		\$9,652.44		\$3,500.00		\$18,750.00
Contractor Charge for Supplies & On-Going Operating Costs			\$0.00		\$0.00		\$0.00		\$0.00
Enter Cost Per Employee =		\$1,415.26	\$566,105.21	\$1,273.63	\$505,630.30	\$7,079.65	\$2,831,861.60	\$200.00	\$80,000.00
Contractor Management Fee		1.8%	\$530,935.84	4.9%	\$1,427,691.01	2.9%	\$893,580.93	2.2%	\$673,000.00
Total Contract Charge Over Five Years			\$29,202,346.61		\$29,318,871.28		\$30,679,611.02		\$31,155,918.76

Evaluation Committee Report

5. Scoring: The following are the actual and weighted points for each proposer:

TOTALS									
CRITERIA	Weighing Percent	Points Awarded (1 to 5)				Weighted Points			
		Aramark	ABM	Pritchard	ACB	Aramark	ABM	Pritchard	ACB
Program Price:	20%	20.00	16.00	12.00	4.00	4.00	3.20	2.40	0.80
Contractor's capability and record of	10%	20.00	15.00	12.00	8.00	2.00	1.50	1.20	0.80
On-Site Management:	30%	17.00	9.00	9.00	7.00	5.10	2.70	2.70	2.10
Staffing Viability	20%	18.00	15.00	15.00	14.00	3.60	3.00	3.00	2.80
Contractor's Proposed Program:	10%	19.00	14.00	14.00	12.00	1.90	1.40	1.40	1.20
Contractor's Start Up/Transition Plan:	10%	18.00	12.00	11.00	9.00	1.80	1.20	1.10	0.90
TOTALS	100%	112.00	81.00	73.00	54.00	18.40	13.00	11.80	8.60

6. Scoring Summary

- a. **Aramark: 18.40 Points** – Aramark ranked first for Program Price because they had the lowest five-year price. Contractor's Capability and Record of Performance was based on the references provided as well as financial stability and was worthy of first place. For On-Site Management, Aramark's proposed candidate stood out as being the strongest, therefore ranked in first place. The proposed staffing, wages and benefits provided caused their proposal to be the most advantageous to the District in terms of Staffing Viability. Aramark also ranked first in the Contractor's Proposed Program and the Contractor's Startup/Transition Plan because they demonstrated that they had the systems, procedures and corporate support to achieve success through the life of the contract.
- b. **ABM: 13.00 Points** - ABM had the second lowest price therefore ranked second. The school districts served and references had them place in second place for Contractor's Capability and Record of Performance. ABM's proposed candidate tied for second amongst the companies for On-Site Management. ABM also tied for second in Staffing Viability. They tied in second place for the Contractors Proposed Program. They ranked in second place for their Transition Plan.
- c. **Pritchard: 11.80 Points** - Pritchard had the third lowest five-year contract price therefor ranked in third place. Their list of school districts served and references had them rank third regarding Contractor's Capability and Record of Performance. In reviewing Pritchard's proposed candidate's resume, they tied for second place for On-Site Management. Pritchard also tied for second in Staffing Viability. Pritchard tied for second place for Proposed Program of the four contractors. They ranked in third place for their Transition Plan.
- d. **ACB: 8.60 Points** - ACB had the highest price which earned them the lowest ranking for Program Price. Their references were good enough to earn fourth place for Contractor's Capability and Record of Performance. In reviewing the resume of ACB's proposed candidate, they were ranked in third place score for On-Site Management. ACB received the third place score for Staffing Viability. They also received the third place score for Contractor's Proposed Program. Startup Plan/Transition Plan ranked them in fourth place.

7. Recommendation of the Bridgewater-Raritan Regional School District's Custodial RFP Evaluation Committee:

- Upon review of the proposals submitted and based upon the RFP evaluation criteria, the committee concludes that the Aramark proposal is most advantageous for the Bridgewater-Raritan Regional School District.