

K-2 Science Primary Resource Review Committee Meeting - 4/21/2022

Meeting Summary

1.1 Introductions

The meeting started at 5:06 pm with introductions of the committee participants. Liberty employee participants in attendance were Natasha Camp, Loretta Zumbro, Deb Rilley, Charissa Lowe, Jenn Crandall, Zuzana Finn, Christine Mendoza, Bedelicia Reyna, Allison Becker, and Dr. Shough. Parent participants present were Katie Heier, and Catharina Steir.

1.2 Purpose and Background on Previous Work of the Committee

Ms. Camp reviewed the timeline of the K-2 Science Adoption Process.

SY 2020-2021

July 20, 2020 - Met with LESD science leaders to provide information about the process for science adoption
July 23, 2020 - Constructed the formal criteria for science adoption.
July 28, 2020 -Met with science leaders and Picture Perfect Science representatives to begin initial evaluation of Picture Perfect materials using rubric.
August 5, 2020 - February 5th - Pilot of Discovery Education was begun immediately because a free pilot was offered for all remote students.
August 12, 2020 -August 18th - Review of Amplify using evaluation criteria. Did not meet alignment of content by grade level. Set aside for future review.
August 20, 2022 - Reviewed Discovery Education with science leaders to further determine the alignment for science inquiry and cross cutting concepts.
August 27, 2020 - K-5 training for Discovery based on alignment evaluation and needs of teachers in virtual learning.
January 15, 2021 - Feedback session with Discovery Ed and teacher leaders about alignment and quality of resources. Communicated the lack of science inquiry and social studies disciplinary skills within the program which focuses primarily on building content knowledge.
March 31, 2021 - Picture Perfect STEM training for K-2 pilot teachers
April 1st - May 8, 2021 -K-2 Picture Perfect Science pilot
May 21, 2021 - Virtual review of resources, Picture Perfect Science pilot was completed. Committee recommended Picture Perfect Science as their first preference for easy to use and engaging science instruction for students integrated with reading.

SY 2021-2022

September 27, 2021 -Adoption committee was reconvened. The budget for the K-2 science adoption was presented to committee members (\$94,000). The committee then began to determine the alignment of the Picture Perfect Science lesson modules to the Arizona Science Standards for each core idea of science (Earth, Life, Physical).
November 2, 2021 - The committee selected one standards aligned module for each grade level, K-2, for each core idea of science (Earth, Life, Physical).
November 8, 2021- Administrative Report provided to the LESD Governing Board on the committee process and recommendation of K-2 science resources to begin the 60-day public review of materials.

Ms. Camp asked the committee to comment on anything additional. The committee did not have any additional comments.

1.3 Review of Criteria for Scoring and Confirmation of Scores for Amplify, Discovery and Picture Perfect

Ms. Camp explained the scoring process for the three primary resources. All three resources would receive a score from the committee members for each of the 10 questions asked in the scoring forms. The score will range from a strength level of 1 to 4. 1 - Weak, 2 - Some Strength, 3 - Many Strengths and 4 - Very Strong. Mrs. Camp reviewed the summary of the individual scoring by the committee and then asked the group to come to consensus on a single committee score for each question. Discussion of each question took place prior to scoring.

Question 1: Resources are aligned to the AZ Standards for each grade level.

Amplify: Ms. Mendoza stated all three resources contained the standards, but Amplify required “crosswalking” or using content from other lessons to fill in the gaps. Ms. Crandall liked that this resource had a breakdown of what lessons met each standard. Ms. Lowe also felt overwhelmed by the amount of information Amplify provided. Ms. Crandall agreed with Ms. Lowe.

Scoring: Amplify - 3, Discovery - 3, Picture Perfect - 3

Question 2: Resource has a menu or table of contents that contains references to text, visuals, content topics and subtopics, making it easy to locate pertinent information.

Amplify: Ms. Lowe said it was easy to use and everything was laid out for you. Ms. Crandall said it was easy to navigate.

Discovery: Ms. Lowe said it was not easy to navigate.

Picture Perfect: Ms. Rilley liked how user friendly it was. Ms. Steir stated it would be easy for a substitute to make a lesson.

Scoring: Amplify - 4, Discovery - 3, Picture Perfect - 4

Question 3: Resources support lessons that involve a real-world context, including phenomenon that students will explore. Phenomenon is giving the student a reason to spark their interest and engage them, to ask questions.

Amplify: Ms. Lowe likes the age appropriateness of it.

Discovery: Ms. Lowe did not like this resource. It was boring and hard to get the students interested. Ms. Mendoza explained “phenomenon” and stated it did include the phenomenon component.

Scoring: Amplify - 3, Discovery - 3, Picture Perfect - 4

Question 4: The resource supports students in engaging in their own investigations based on questions and problems.

Amplify: Ms. Stier liked how it had a lot of questions encouraging student discussions. Ms. Finn liked how the modules were pre-set for students.

Discovery: The consensus was there are too many videos. Does not engage students.

Picture Perfect: This resource was very engaging for students.

Scoring: Amplify - 3, Discovery - 2, Picture Perfect - 4

Question 5: Resource provides information and activities through multi-modality. Multi-modality does not always mean the use of technology. It can also be hands on, books, pictures, music.

Amplify: Ms. Reyna likes the hands-on component. Ms. Lowe likes having actual books for reading.

Scoring: Amplify - 3, Discovery - 2, Picture Perfect - 3

Question 6: Resource provides multiple references at the topic and subtopic level.

Mrs. Camp explained that multiple references could be multiple references of information, multiple references of subjects, multiple references of materials at the Topic and Subtopic level. She gave an example of the topic being Sound with the subtopic being how sound travels....

Scoring: Amplify - 3, Discovery - 3, Picture Perfect - 3

Question 7: Resource meets the criteria of credible sources (i.e., accurate, current, research based).

Scoring: Amplify - 3, Discovery - 3, Picture Perfect - 3

Question 8: Resources provide aligned, meaningful activities and assessment opportunities.

Amplify: Ms. Mendoza stated Amplify required “crosswalking” or using content from other lessons to fill in the gaps.

Scoring: Amplify - 2, Discovery - 2, Picture Perfect - 3

Question 9: Activities and assessments have a range of rigor from DOK 1 (Depth of Knowledge) multiple choice or fill in the blank to DOK 3 in which students use more complex thinking.

Scoring: Amplify - 3, Discovery - 3, Picture Perfect - 3

Question 10: Activities and assessments include DOK 3, combining references and complex thinking as well as DOK 4 that requires complex thinking with opportunities for problem-based or project-based learning.

Scoring: Amplify - 3, Discovery - 3, Picture Perfect - 3

1.4 Discussion of Feedback Received from 60 day Public Review of Picture Perfect Science

At the November 8, 2021 Governing board meeting, administration presented information about Picture Perfect and informed the Board and the public of a 60-day public review time period in which feedback could be provided on the resources. The materials were on display at the district office. It was also publicized on the district website and social media. A Google form was available for the public to provide feedback. The district did not receive any feedback on the materials.

1.5 Discussion and Possible Recommendation to the Governing board to Consider Approval of K-2 Science Primary Textbook Resource for Instructional Use

The committee reviewed the scores of the three resources. The committee agreed to remove Discovery and Amplify as options for 60-day review. The consensus was to recommend Picture Perfect as the Primary resource. Ms. Camp will be sharing the committee's recommendation to the Governing Board to approve Picture Perfect as a Primary resource for Science.

1.6 Future Meeting Dates and Items for Future Agendas

The committee agreed that no further meetings were needed.

The meeting adjourned at 6:17 pm.

Science Adoption: Final Comparison			
Criteria	Amplify	Discovery	Picture Perfect
Resource is aligned to the AZ Standards for each grade level. If this is not met, do not continue.	3	3	3
Resource has menu or table of contents that contains references to text, visuals, content topics and subtopics, making it easy to locate pertinent information.	4	3	4
Resource supports lessons that involve a real-world context, including phenomenon that students will explore.	3	3	4
The resource supports students in engaging in their own investigations based on questions and problems.	3	2	4
Resource provides information and activities through multi-modality.	3	2	3
Resource provides multiple references at the topic and sub-topic level.	3	3	3
Resource meets the criteria of credible sources (i.e., accurate, current, research based).	3	3	3
Resources provides aligned, meaningful activities and assessment opportunities.	2	2	3
Activities and assessments have a range of rigor from DOK 1 multiple choice or fill in the blank to DOK 3 in which students use more complex thinking.	3	3	3
Activities and assessments include DOK 3, combining references and complex thinking as well as DOK 4 that requires complex thinking with opportunities for problem-based or project-based learning.	3	3	3