

**Date:** July 1, 2020

**Purpose:** Citizen-Led Oversight Committee (CLOC) Meeting

**Location:** Zoom Meeting

**Committee Members Attendees:**

Ted Barber (Chair), Mike McNally (Vice Chair), Carlton Dallas, Ron Groteluschen, Ray Warco, Richard Tritschler, Derrick Coaxum, David Ames, Kimberly Fleming

**Beaufort County School District (BCSD) Representatives Present:**

Dr. Frank Rodriguez, Richard Geier, Robert Oetting, Reggie Murphy, Tonya Crosby, Jim Foster, Candace Bruder, Alexander Marshall, Timothy Summers

**CBRE | Heery Attendees:**

Robert Corbin, David Waggoner, Marc Brewster, Todd Hill (AJT sub-consultant)

**Meeting Minutes**

---

1. Prior to the meeting, a meeting agenda and draft minutes from the June 3<sup>rd</sup> meeting were distributed to the committee members via email. Also distributed were the following documents: Meeting 7 Presentation; Updated Glossary of Acronyms; Updated Referendum Project Schedule; Referendum Capital Projects 2019 Financial Summary; BCHS (Battery Creek High School) Renovation Financial Details; MRHS (May River High School) Addition Financial Details; RRA (River Ridge Academy) Additions Financial Details; RSIA (Robert Smalls International Academy) Replacement Financial Details; Referendum Project Contingency Log; Referendum Cash Flow Projection vs Actual Expenditures (REV2); CBRE Heery Performance Review.
2. Mr. Barber opened the meeting with the Pledge of Allegiance.
3. Mr. Barber asked if there were any adjustments to the agenda. No adjustments were noted.
4. Mr. Barber asked if there were any changes or corrections to the minutes for the last meeting. No changes or corrections were requested. A motion was made by Mr. Dallas to approve the minutes. The motion was seconded by Mr. McNally and approved by all.
5. Mr. Corbin presented the Updated Glossary of Acronyms and noted the additions include "CTE", "LULL", "MCT" and "VCT". Mr. Warco requested the assigned number (2-digit school location code) for each school be added to the school acronyms.
6. Project Manager Alexander Marshall presented a video tour of the MRHS project. Mr. Marshall highlighted the following activities and progress shown in the video: Exterior envelope; CMU walls; Installation of lintels; Mechanical, Electrical and Plumbing (MEP) for first and second floors; HVAC is near completion on first floor; Fire sprinkler installer should be done by end of this week; Electrician is making good progress; Placed concrete mezzanine floor slab yesterday; Framing will begin Monday; HVAC units will be set end of next week.

7. Mr. Marshall presented update for MRHS project, which is under budget and on schedule. Masonry crew will be supplemented next week to focus on exterior masonry walls. Masons are scheduled to begin installing exterior brick prior to the end of July. MEP rough-in is ongoing. MB Kahn is focusing on sealing building in order to begin conditioning the space.
8. Project Manager Tim Summers presented video tour of RRA project. Mr. Summers highlighted the following activities and progress shown in the video: All veneer brick is up on 800 wing; MEP installed in the 800 wing; Window frames are on site and will be installed next week; Domestic water fountains and tile have been installed in the 400 and 600 wings.
9. Mr. Summers gave update of RRA project, which is under budget and on schedule. Window frames are in for the 400 and 600 wings. Glass should be installed by July 13<sup>th</sup>. MB Kahn is focusing on sealing building in order to begin conditioning the space. MCT and casework is scheduled to be installed the second half of July. OSF overhead inspection is next Monday. Furniture will be arriving for 400 and 600 wings in August. Mr. Corbin advised that a walk-through overhead inspection with the third party inspector was completed last week with only minor punch list items identified, which MB Kahn focused on clearing this week.

Mr. Barber asked how the OSF inspections are scheduled. Mr. Summers responded that they set a target date with the GC and then the architect schedules that date with OSF two or three months in advance.

10. Mr. Corbin provided updates on summer work:

**LS3P Architects and Thompson Turner Construction (TTC) Projects**

Mr. Corbin addressed that the status flag comments for all summer work projects have been updated to reflect that additional details associated with the use of Referendum Project Contingency can now be found on the Contingency Use Log that was distributed prior to this meeting. GMP Amendment 02 has been fully executed. Demolition at Beaufort High (BHS) is almost completed and framing should be completed by July 10<sup>th</sup>. The Coosa Elementary School (CES) generator is scheduled to arrive at the end of August. Construction activities are ongoing at BHS and CES. The technology schedule concerns at Lady's Island Middle (LIMS) have been resolved and the secured entry is 80% complete. The demolition at Right Choices (RC) has been completed and the security vestibule is scheduled to be completed in September. The arrival date for the playground equipment at St. Helena Early Childhood Center (SHECC) is the week of July 27<sup>th</sup>.

**McMillan Pazdan Smith Architects (MPS) and HG Reynolds Co., Inc. (HGR) Project**

GMP Amendment 02 has been fully executed. The remaining Construction Documents (CDs) for the IT Packages should be received by the middle of this month. HGR is completing the demolition of the first floor slab this week and all slabs will be placed by the end of next week. The new HVAC cooling towers and the modular classroom building have been delivered to Beaufort Elementary School (BES). The renovations for the second floor have commenced. MPS is preparing the media center furniture plans.

**Jumper Carter Sease Architects (JCS) and MB Kahn Construction (MBK) Projects**

GMP Amendment 02 has been fully executed. The playgrounds at Bluffton Elementary School (BLES) and Hilton Head Island Elementary School (HHIES) have been completed. All of the remaining CDs for IT Packages will be received by the week of July 27<sup>th</sup>.

Construction has commenced at BLES, HHIES, Hilton Head Island School for Creative Arts (HHSCA) and H.E. McCracken Middle School (HEMMS). Main focus for MBK currently is laying out the new Technology Rooms. The construction for the stadium lights for Hilton Head Island High School (HHIHS) should take place after football season.

**Rosenblum Coe Architects (RCA) and Contract Construction (CC) Projects**

GMP Amendment 02 has been fully executed. The CDs for the remaining IT Packages are to be received by middle of July. Construction at Whale Branch Elementary (WBES) and (WBMS) has commenced. Focus is on laying out new Technology Rooms so that they can be completed before the staff/students return. Working with contractor on obtaining shipments dates for playground and athletic equipment. Target dates can then be established for those projects.

11. Mr. Corbin presented a new section for Design Projects. The Board approved architects for BCHS (JCS) and RSIA (LS3P) at the end of May. JCS submitted a revised proposal letter on June 29<sup>th</sup>. Upon approval of proposal letter, the AIA Agreement will be sent out for execution. Request for Proposals (RFP) Number 21-002 for Construction Management (CM) at Risk Services has been prepared and is being routed for BCSD reviews and approvals. Goal is to issue RFP this week, with proposal due date of August 14, 2020 by 2:00 PM. The AIA Agreement was sent to LS3P on June 29<sup>th</sup> for execution. RFP for CM at Risk Services has been prepared and is being routed for BCSD reviews and approvals. Goal is to issue RFP this week, with proposal due date of August 14, 2020 at 2:00 PM.

Mr. McNally asked if CBRE Heery is submitting a proposal. Mr. Corbin explained that CBRE Heery is not providing construction services, but instead working in the role of Owner's Representative. Mr. Corbin also explained CM @ Risk. Mr. Barber suggested that after the agenda item on CBRE Heery Evaluation Tool, if there are still questions, the Project Sub-Committee sit down with Mr. Oetting and Mr. Corbin separately to discuss the contract and then share findings with CLOC.

12. Mr. Corbin presented the Updated Schedule with Traffic Lights. The RSIA replacement school projects was added, along with contractual dates that were established in AIA agreements. Working with CM @ Risk vendors to finish phasing plans that have been put under GMP. Will populate out the remaining projects when updated construction managements schedules are received from contractors.

Mr. Barber asked when it is anticipated that the IT yellow lights will be turning to green. Mr. Corbin advised that is fully expected the majority of those lights will be green within the next couple of weeks, with one or two outliers that should be green by the August report.

Mr. Dallas asked if any minority and/or women businesses (MWBE) have been responding to solicitations. Mr. Corbin responded that is being worked on two sides. One is with CM @ Risk firms soliciting proposals. They are working with Black Chamber of Commerce and

running advertisements to recruit MWBE participation at subcontractor level, as well as with suppliers. For RFP process, there are sections in RFP that outlines district's goals of obtaining 20% MWBE participation for the projects, as well as what the requirements are for those firms responding to proposals.

Mr. Dallas asked if quarterly report on progress toward obtaining the 20% goal can be given. Mr. Corbin said that the District runs quarterly reports and should have numbers from the contractors by mid-July. As soon as report can be compiled, it will be shared with CLOC, either at August or September meeting.

13. Mr. Corbin presented the Financial Update. Much of the information was included in the handouts and attachments that were provided prior to the meeting, including the Referendum Capital Projects Financial Summary, the Project Level Financial Details and the Referendum Project Contingency Log. The contingency log starts with the original amount allocated for contingency and then itemizes the list of use, amount of contingency used and details. The running balance is on the right side of the log.

Mr. Barber asked the Financial Sub-Committee and other CLOC members to review the log.

Mr. Warco advised that the reports that were received for tonight's meeting will be reviewed at the next Financial Sub-Committee meeting and reported on at the next CLOC meeting.

14. Mr. Corbin presented the Cash Flow Projection vs Actual Expenditures, now referred to as REV2. REV1 was shared previously with the committee and included remodeled cumulative totals to better align with the launch of the program. REV2 was created because the projected cumulative total was going above the total referendum amount. This math error has been corrected and for period ending June 30<sup>th</sup>, the total monthly expenditure amount was \$9.44 Million. This is below the monthly projected expenditure of \$20.3 Million. Factors in this difference include accounts payable (AP) cycles that occur every two weeks. The next AP cycle runs tomorrow, adding another approximate \$3.2 million. Mr. Corbin anticipates that the numbers will correct themselves in the months coming up.

15. Mr. Corbin presented the Community Outreach slide. Mr. Barber and Mr. McNally conducted site visits at the MRHS and RRA projects on June 10<sup>th</sup>. Also present were representatives from three TV stations and two newspapers. Media coverage was excellent and clearly communicated that the projects are on schedule and under budget. It also highlighted that M.B. Kahn has done an excellent job of adhering to social distancing best practices while maintaining delivery of materials and coordination of sub-contractors during COVID-19 crisis.

Mr. Barber summarized the site-visits. Projects reflected good quality construction, although the crews could do better job of site clean-up. He spoke to reporters, and the interview was on television that evening. Everything reflects what is being reported to committee.

Mr. Foster said that there was a combination of two stories with the media coverage. They were able to see the projects and also report the COVID-19 angle, for example the

construction pods (groups of workers that took breaks and lunches together so that if there was a COVID case, that pod could be quarantined but the project could continue). He advised there was great video and the interviews with M.B. Kahn and Mr. Barber were terrific. Good publicity for Board and the public could see the progress and the CLOC involvement.

16. Mr. Oetting presented the Updated Draft CBRE-Heery Evaluation Tool. The draft tool was sent out today. Includes three main categories of staffing, project management and referendum management, with sub-categories under each. After receiving CLOC input last month, Mr. Oetting presented the tool to BCSD Board Operations Committee, who felt it is very good tool and asked that it be presented to entire Board. Comments from Board included that they wanted completed evaluation brought back for review and comment. They also asked for formal metrics on how the items would be scored. Based on comments from CLOC and Board, this draft tool was created. Mr. Oetting discussed each category and subcategory, with metrics explained. The surveys will be given to pertinent BCSD staff, BCSD Board Operations Committee members and CLOC members. He suggested surveys be rotated through CLOC members, rather than every member receiving surveys every quarter. Mr. Oetting reviewed the survey items and explained that for some of the survey questions that not everything is under CBRE Heery's control, such as website maintenance; however, the feedback might indicate need for additional CBRE Heery services.

Mr. Dallas said the survey is very thorough, however if it is only given to one member, the responses might not be as accurate as they would be if given to a group of people. Mr. Dallas also commented on public opinion and suggested that, perhaps when buildings are up, public be invited to see quality of work. This would be reflective of CBRE Heery's leadership and project management skills. Different methods of gathering public opinion were discussed.

Mr. Barber asked the CLOC members to review the document and provide input to Mr. Oetting. He also asked Mr. Oetting to recommend CLOC members or groups of members to receive surveys. Item will be added to agenda again next month for follow up. Mr. Oetting would like to take the tool to BCSD Board at same time Mr. Barber gives next quarterly review.

17. Mr. Barber gave update on the Project Sub-Committee. They performed a detailed site review on June 10<sup>th</sup> and piggy-backed this with the media event. The visits reflected what has been recorded and reported to CLOC. The construction quality and masonry work was very good. Project managers were able to answer all questions on-site. Will be scheduling future visits to different sites. Will also be reviewing CBRE Heery information as Mr. McNally suggested.
18. Mr. Warco advised that the Finance Sub-Committee met on June 9<sup>th</sup>. The Finance Sub-Committee is using the Referendum 519 report as a basic report and tying other ancillary reports to it. Looked at last report submitted which detailed the construction costs, but there was over \$400,000 of design services listed at District level. Committee is requesting some report on non-construction dollars spent. Mr. Warco reported that they looked at budget for BCHS and not all allocated referendum funding was utilized in the budget, by almost

\$29,000. Looking for that gap to be filled in. Saw that construction contingency and design contingency totaling almost \$3 Million or 5.3% of total and owner contingency of \$2.3 Million or 4.1%. Felt that number is high. Mr. Warco asked if this is fairly normal. Mr. Oetting stated that the standard contingency is 5%. Demolition/renovation work is typically a higher owner contingency because the chance is greater that you will find unknowns. Mr. Corbin added that there is also a contingency component to construction typical to GMP amendments to address items that are unforeseen. For District office budget on design services, Mr. Warco asked if those figures should be moved to the different schools. Mr. Barber suggested that the expenditures be broken out by architectural firm. Mr. Oetting advised that there are four teams that are assigned nine projects. He advised that those figures can be broken out by school for the CLOC, however the District tracks it in a different manner. Mr. Warco said that District should continue reporting as it is tracked by them. Mr. Warco asked if there is a reason that not all schools have Technology budgets. Mr. Warco will give Mr. Oetting the specific schools that didn't show technology budgets and Mr. Oetting will explain. Mr. Warco advised that on the 519 report, some schools have three, four or five different sub classifications. He asked if everything could be listed consistently and put zeros in non-applicable categories. Mr. Oetting advised that he can do that but will have to expand report because elementary schools and middle/high schools have different projects. Mr. Warco said that he will submit an example of what the subcommittee would like to see and Mr. Oetting can advise if that can be done. Mr. Warco reported that the biggest issue the subcommittee saw was scope changes and he wanted to discuss if process needed to change to avoid similar problems in the future. Mr. Oetting advised that contingency log was developed to try to answer those concerns and if there are questions that were not addressed by the log that he would answer them. Mr. Corbin said that everyone is closely monitoring the issue. Amount of GMPs represent 20% of referendum funding. Amount of contingency funding utilized is 15% of overall contingency funds. Feels it is moderate in its use. Mr. Dallas said concern is that contingency is being used so early in 48-month referendum project. Mr. Corbin said based on original scope, WBECHS batting cages were to be installed, however existing drainage issues came to light that needed correcting prior to the work. These issues can be encountered in projects because early on preliminary scope is high level, and it is not until designer is put under contract and begins to identify all work that needs to be done that true scope is realized. Biggest problem was price of turf field, which was an anomaly in modeling. The budget was not nearly adequate. Mr. Corbin advised that everyone is mindful that there needs to be adequate contingency funding to utilize for future projects. Mr. Warco said that the sub-committee needs budgets for CES, RC, SHECC and LIMS if they are summer projects.

19. Mr. Ames reported for the Communications Sub-Committee. The committee met and would like to utilize Mr. Barber's report to send to media. They are also recommending consideration of use of billboards on semiannual basis and the creation of distribution list for digital information. Sub-committee will work with District communications staff regarding Mr. Barber's reports. Mr. Ames advised there is another level of information that needs to be distributed to the advocate supporters of the process, and the sub-committee is working on that list.
20. Mr. Barber gave update to Board in June and this was published. He asked Dr. Rodriguez for feedback. Dr. Rodriguez advised that the update was excellent and thoroughly captured

the work of the committee. He further said the CLOC is doing a fantastic job and that is evident in presentations. He also advised that the presentations are in language that everyone understands. Mr. Barber asked Mr. Geier if last report was what they needed. Mr. Geier advised that the Board does not have anyone with construction expertise so the fact that people with expertise are looking objectively at work is very important to Board. Mr. Barber said that he did mention the yellow on the dashboard and that CLOC is following those items closely.

21. Mr. Barber reported that for the next CLOC agenda we will keep standard items. He asked other members to notify Mr. Oetting and Ms. Unsworth if there are any additional items for agenda. He advised that he would like CLOC to meet face-to-face eventually when this is feasible and safe.
22. Mr. Oetting advised they are scheduling RSIA design charrettes, probably via Zoom. First is tentatively set for July 21. Will send invitation to CLOC.
23. Mr. Foster commended CLOC committee's work and advised that it will be instrumental in the restoration of confidence in school district for transparency.
24. Meeting was adjourned.