



ROCHESTER COMMUNITY SCHOOLS

PRIDE IN EXCELLENCE

501 W. University Drive • Rochester, MI • 48307

Phone: 248.726.3000 Fax: 248.726.3105

Memorandum of Recommendation

DATE: December 10, 2021

TO: Dr. Robert Shaner, Superintendent

FROM: Dana Taylor, Assistant Superintendent for Business Affairs

RE: Fiber 2021

Rochester Community Schools has its own self-provisioned fiber (SPF) network that was installed in 2001 using Bond 1997 and Bond 2000 funds. Our fiber plant consists of 32 miles of fiber connecting 25 buildings. District owned fiber is eligible for Category one E-Rate reimbursement, which allows for a 40% reimbursement on eligible expenses.

In coordination with our e-rate consultant Triple-R and our Technology Services and Purchasing departments, an RFP was issued to connect our districtwide fiber service to the new administration building. This project is addressing infrastructure needs required to continue providing a robust, adaptable, state-of-the-art network.

We received three bids for lit fiber, two bids for dark fiber, and three bids for SPF (self-provisioned fiber). After a comprehensive analysis of the bids, it was determined that continuing with self-provisioned fiber would be the most cost-effective. All three of the SPF bids were evaluated and determined to be compliant.

We recommend awarding the bid to Fiber Link. They met the bid specifications, offered competitive pricing, and have been our long-standing fiber network service provider since 2001.

This is a technology bond project and has been coordinated with e-rate for an approximate reimbursement of 40% on eligible equipment and services. The expected E-Rate filing amount of \$272,175.55 carries an expected E-Rate reimbursement of \$108,870.22.

We recommend the following:

- Accept conditional E-Rate agreement with the Fiber Link, for \$272,175.55
- RCS make-ready costs of approximately \$70,000
These are "make ready" costs required to prepare utility poles to receive a new fiber attachment.
- Include a 20% contingency of \$55,000

Project total for all of the recommendations is \$397,175.55

We recommend that the Board of Education awards the following contract:

Fiber 2021

Vendor: Fiber Link

Amount: Fiber Link contract in the amount of \$272,175.55 plus make-ready costs of \$70,000 and a contingency of \$55,000 for a total project cost of \$397,175.55 (Expected E-Rate reimbursement of \$108,870.22)

TO: Cindy Lindner, Executive Director of Technology and Strategic Initiatives
Rochester Community Schools

FROM: Robert Rice, President
Triple R Consultants

DATE: December 10, 2021

RE: Approval for Self-Provisioned Fiber Build (SPF)

BOARD OF EDUCATION RECOMMENDATION

Whereby Rochester Community Schools released request for Self-Provisioned Fiber (SPF), lit fiber and dark fiber to connect the existing building back to the new Administration Building for FY22 E-Rate year.

Whereby Rochester Community Schools received three bids for the lit fiber, two bids for dark fiber and three bids for SPF. A 20-year cost analysis was performed on all 8 bids and it was determined that the SPF bids were the most cost effective service type of the three listed services. (See attached Fiber Cost Analysis).

Whereas after reviewing the three SPF bids, all were reviewed for compliance. It was determined that all bids, 123.net, Fiber Link and Turnkey were in compliance with the bid specifications. Upon further review, it was determined that the Fiber Link bid was slightly higher than Turnkey's bid, however, when evaluation of the additional factors was taken into consideration, it was determined that Fiber Link scored higher on the bid overall evaluation. (See attached Bid Evaluation).

Therefore, based on the review of the bid responses, it is recommended that Rochester Community Schools enter into a conditional E-Rate agreement with the Fiber Link, for \$287,556.30 (less make ready cost of \$15,380.75) which the district is paying directly to DTE so they can get the process completed and installation of the fiber project can begin at or around January 1st. E-Rate rules do not allow construction to start prior to January 1st, 2022. The expected E-Rate filing amount of \$272,175.55 with an expected E-Rate reimbursement of \$108,870.22.

E-rate FY 2022-23 - Rochester Community Schools Cost Analysis Fiber Project

Bidder	Service Type	Lease or Own	Recurring Cost	Non-Recurring Cost	Network Electronics	Maintenance	First Year	Months	20 Year Total
123..net	Dark	Lease	\$ 22,500.00	\$ -	\$ 78,095.20	\$ -	\$ 100,595.20	240	\$ 5,478,095.20
Crown Castle	Dark	Lease	\$ 3,998.00	\$ 125,000.00	\$ 78,095.20	\$ 4,154.00	\$ 211,247.20	240	\$ 2,159,575.20
							\$ -		
123..net	Lit	Lease	\$ 22,500.00	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 22,500.00	240	\$ 5,400,000.00
AT & T	Lit	Lease	\$ 22,847.50	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 22,847.50	240	\$ 5,483,400.00
ClearRate	Lit	Lease	\$ 33,150.00	\$ 12,974.00	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 46,124.00	240	\$ 7,968,974.00
							\$ -		
123.net	SPF	Own	\$ -	\$ 2,004,600.00	\$ 78,095.20	\$ 1,542.00	\$ 2,084,237.20	240	\$ 2,452,775.20
Fiber Link	SPF	Own	\$ -	\$ 287,566.30	\$ 78,095.20	\$ 4,154.00	\$ 369,815.50	240	\$ 1,362,621.50
Turnkey	SPF	Own	\$ -	\$ 276,046.84	\$ 78,095.20	\$ 4,154.00	\$ 358,296.04	240	\$ 1,351,102.04

The 3 connectivity “Service Types” are:

- Dark Fiber – Leased connectivity that is not in use (not active), and can be used solely by a customer (not shared connectivity).
- Lit Fiber – Leased connectivity that is already active, which means has data already on the fiber as well as other customers (shared connectivity).
- SPF – Self Provisioned Fiber is built for and owned by RCS.

Notes:

- All Cost are extended over a 20 year period for analysis purposes (the projected life-span of fiber is 25+ years). Current annual SPF Maintenance for RCS locations is \$49,848.00 / \$4,154.00 monthly. Lit and Dark Fiber are leased and not owned by RCS.
- Crown Castle's response was to provide dark fiber to the splice point of the existing RCS self-provisioned fiber. This proposal requires the use of the existing district owned fiber to connect each of the 25 buildings. Therefore, this proposal requires the district to continue to maintain their existing fiber plant. Due to this, the same annual fiber maintenance and network electronics as a self-provisioned fiber plant will be required, so those costs have been added to it. This raises their 20 year cost to a higher dollar amount than two of the self-provisioned fiber bids.

Per the language in the RFP: the District reserves the right to perform a cost analysis of all bids received and decide which service type is the most cost-effective type of service (i.e., Dark Fiber, Lit Fiber, or Self-Provisioned Fiber (SPF) or other third-party network solutions). Once the most cost-effective service type is selected by the District, a bid evaluation will only be performed on that type of service to decide the bid award.

Based on the cost analysis, continuing with Self Provisioned Fiber is the most cost effective. Therefore, a comprehensive bid evaluation was performed on the three SPF proposals.

- 123.net response for SPF assumed new fiber for all locations, and provided what the monthly maintenance would be. This is the \$1,542 maintenance figure.
- Turnkey's response was to provide SPF to the splice point of the existing RCS SPF. This proposal requires the use of the existing district owned fiber to connect each of the 25 buildings

E-RATE BID EVALUATION WORKSHEET
FY22: 2022-2023

District Name: Rochester Community Schools

Bid Opening Date: 8/5/2021

Service Type: Telecommunications

Service Description: Self-Provisioned Fiber

Evaluation Factors	Factor %Weight*	Service Provider 123.net		Service Provider Fiber Link		Service Provider Turnkey		Service Provider [Insert Name]		Service Provider [Insert Name]	
		Rating**	Weight***	Rating**	Weight***	Rating**	Weight***	Rating**	Weight***	Rating**	Weight***
E-rate Eligible Costs*	30	2	12.00	4.5	27.00	5	30.00		0.00		0.00
Service Transition Factors	20	1	4.00	5	20.00	4	16.00		0.00		0.00
Adherence to Specifications	10	3	6.00	5	10.00	5	10.00		0.00		0.00
Prior Experience	5	3	3.00	5	5.00	4	4.00		0.00		0.00
Past Performance	5	3	3.00	5	5.00	4	4.00		0.00		0.00
Understands Needs	10	4	8.00	5	10.00	5	10.00		0.00		0.00
Personnel Qualifications	5	5	5.00	5	5.00	5	5.00		0.00		0.00
Management Capabilities	5	4	4.00	5	5.00	5	5.00		0.00		0.00
Financial Stability	10	5	10.00	5	10.00	5	10.00		0.00		0.00
Other (specify)	0		0.00		0.00		0.00		0.00		0.00
Other (specify)	0		0.00		0.00		0.00		0.00		0.00

Total Ratings: ****

Selected Service Provider:	Fiber Link
Approved by:	Cindy Lindner
Title:	Executive Director of Technology and Strategic Initiatives
Date:	8/23/2021

Comments: Fiber Link has had a long-standing relationship with Rochester Community Schools. They designed and installed the fiber network in 2001 and have been our sole service provider since. They deliver excellent service and support and are able to be highly responsive given the extensive knowledge of our fiber plant.

*Factor %Weight=Weight of each factor where Price is the heaviest weight
 **Service Provider Rating: 1=Poor 2=Fair 3=Good 4=Better 5=Best
 ***Service Provider Weight=(Factor %Weight) x (Service Provider Rating) x (.2)
 ****Total Factor %Weight must=100%