

**NOTICE OF PUBLIC MEETING
KINGMAN UNIFIED SCHOOL DISTRICT #20
EMERGENCY MEETING
GOVERNING BOARD MEETING MINUTES
4/20/2021**

- 1) Call to Order @ 6:30 pm (Action)
- 2) Pledge of Allegiance was said (Action)
- 3) Roll Call: Dr. Charles Lucero, Present Mr. Roger Jacks, Present Mrs. Carole Young, Telephone Conference (Action)
 Mrs. Jen Shumway, Present Mrs. Beth Weisser, Present

Dr. Lucero- I thank everyone for getting together on such quick notice when Governor Ducey announced the change in the mask mandate in the schools, the district started receiving a lot of calls, there was some confusion, and I thought it would be important for us to meet immediately to give the superintendent direction on that.

- 4) Call to the Audience (The Board will listen to any comment from the public but will not respond except as permitted by A.R.S. § 38-431.01(G). The Board may refer the item to the administration or request to have it placed on a future agenda.) (Discussion)

Susan Collins- Good evening KUSD school board. I'm here tonight representing myself as an employee and parent within the Kingman Unified School District and as an advocate for quality public education in every zip code. I have watched the school board meeting during the current global pandemic, every meeting, and most of those prior to the pandemic, I would like to say that I've seen a spirit of openness and compromise. I would also like to say that all viewpoints had been heard and valued. I would like to say that calm discussion of differing views has taken place. Unfortunately, I cannot say any of those statements with a clear conscience. President Lucero in your position as president of the board, you set the tone for all discussions. This is especially true when opinions are from differing viewpoints. What I have witnessed in this boardroom and in the virtual setting is a simple tolerance for opposing views. I have not witnessed open discussion that focuses on shared values, with an intent to conclude on a workable compromise. Instead I have witnessed a lack of openness to opinions that differ from yours, and refusal to support your motions when staff. Once again, this board is tasked with making a binding decision on a controversial topic. I'm certain that the previous pattern of discussion and steamroller decision making will prevail. This is greatly concerning to me. I believe that every person on this board, and every person in KUSD wants what is best for students, teachers, and parents, just because there are differing views on what that looks like, does not mean that workable solutions, honoring all opinions cannot be reached. It does mean that those conversations will not be short, and they will not be easy. President Lucero, you have the responsibility of removing your emotions from the discussion and mediating a fair and equitable debate that focuses on shared values. Unfortunately, what I have seen as emotionally charged reactions that build more division, rather than bringing people together. My challenge to the board and President Lucero specifically, is to find common ground to work together for what is in the best interest of all stakeholders in this district, but the majority and the dissenting opinions.
Thank you.

- 5) Discussion and possible motion on KUSD Masks Policy in School (Discussion/Action)

Dr. Dorner- There was a flurry of activity in 24 hours and I will publicly say and I, as I have said before that I have a lack of appreciation for information just being distributed on a television channel with no information being sent, and no time for us to process the information. All due respect to Governor Ducey's position. When that hit the media, we didn't know what was happening. I learned through my phone and the emails all of a sudden last evening and then immediately some sister districts put out some information without talking to the board. So, having said all that, this last 24 hours has been very busy as Susan referenced, there are a lot of opinions on both sides so I just would like to share a summary of that. I did put out a survey today. To the staff, I started this morning and they answered the submission started coming in very rapidly. I was told at some point during the day that there was a possibility, people will submitting multiple times because it didn't have the mechanism turned off, you can have surveys where they can submit more than once or you can have a survey working only happened once on a device. So, I was carefully watching the data to make sure it wasn't skewed I can tell you that it started at seven out of 10 rate and it ended at a seven out of 10 rate and when you're looking at statistics that does lean toward a valid result when you don't see it tip or skew all of a sudden, so I'm fairly confident that seven out of 10 of the respondents were in favor of a modified

mask schedule. Three out of 10 wanted to leave it just as it is, did not have opinions on that survey, but I did have quite a few follow up emails from folks who are wanting to keep the mask mandate, consistent so I want to share some of those thoughts, some of the supporting ideas behind continuing the mask mandate exactly as it is in the return to learn guidance now include that consistency through the end of the year that a lot of people are looking for that and students are used to it. There are classes, such as some of our special area classes where, and I guess this is a good example when music, kids are singing and the aerosol out of the mouths of our young ones can spread. That was one opinion that while there are a lot of people vaccinated we don't really know have a span of determination on how well the vaccinations working so those were some of the emails that I received in support. I also received some emails from a few parents and the number of staff members that say, the number of vaccinations that are in our district, the fact that all of our employees had the opportunity to become fully vaccinated because we are sitting at no student cases maybe one pending case a student and one pending case as a staff member, everything we've done, especially now that we're fully live is working and that we would like to see a little more time and space for an opportunity to take the mask off. So, again, when you look at the survey, we definitely are leaning toward folks wanting that option of personal choice. But the minority who are speaking in favor of the mask mandate continuing to make some good points as well. I just have a meeting with principals at two o'clock this afternoon I asked them how their day had gone I have to admit to you, I thought it was to be a horrible morning, I was prepared for chaos and that did not occur. So, I want to give accolades to our parents and our students and our staff members for having an excellent day. Because there was a little bit of a social media blitz last night. The masks are over, when the Governor says I'm rescinding the mask mandate for schools, what is heard by the public is no more masks. That's why I expected a little bit of chaos this morning 10 out of 10 principals reported that they had an excellent day that there were kids that were coming without a mask but that they handed one to them and they wore them, there was compliances. I think we have a grace period because I know the public is waiting for a decision to be made. I don't know what it looks like after the decision is made, that's a general picture of where we are right now.

Mr. Jacks- The 10 principals, was it 10 for 10 return in favor of an optional mask requirement.

Dr. Dorner- Yes, there are 11 in the meeting but one doesn't have kids on the campus right now and all but one are in favor of the optional. I asked what their staffs general feeling and the culture of that feeling on campus was to see if it match the survey results and they said it was very similar. There are people who would really like to continue the mandate and there are others that would like the optional.

Mr. Jacks- Has Mohave Health said anything since Governor Ducey statement?

Dr. Dorner- County Health Department has said nothing we have very minimal interaction with them unless we seek them out, even then it's sometimes hard to get ahold of them. We did receive a letter from the Arizona Department of Education, this afternoon, it's just very simple. It reminds us that universal correct use of masks is a very top mitigation strategy for safe and in person learning. So, as the state no longer mandates mask wearing in the K-12 settings but they encourage us to continue recommending and using them. In my opinion in my interpretation, even in a modified manner. If we do move forward with any kind of modification masks should no longer be obsolete. I think there's still a time and a place for them. Whenever there's a group setting.

Mr. Jacks- Last question I have is, was there any discussions as to why or schools felt like they could be successful with mask requirement?

Dr. Dorner- These are opinions based on observations, but a lot of people are pointing to the fact that we have done an excellent job, whatever your interpretation of that is based on who reports their positivity and their illness, and having no positive cases on our campuses. Since we've been live there have literally been minimal to no cases. So, they feel like we're getting it right, there's a debate is that because of the mask. Do we have no cases, are we sitting in a really good position are we feeling confident because of the masks, and if the masks come off will that change, or, are we going to still be in a good place because we have all of our other mitigation strategies in place and I think the consensus was among the group I talked to today, that they feel comfortable that many people would continue to wear them, then that our other strategies are working as well.

Dr. Lucero- My main purpose for bringing the meeting, like I said in the beginning is that there was a lot of confusion yesterday when Ducey gave his, update on rescinding the mask mandate in the school so, I thought it was important for us to meet. I know schools around the Kingman community are already making decisions and we were going to have a lot of questions so, that is the intent of the meeting to find out if we're wanting to keep the policy as is, or we would like to change it.

Mrs. Shumway- What are your thoughts?

Dr. Lucero- I think that we've done an excellent job with all the challenges that we've had, there have been some scary decisions that we've made, we've had some very in-depth board discussions about what is best for KUSD, obviously we have our own opinions, but I think we've asked a lot of our students, our staff, our family, our parents, and so forth. I think that we are at a point now where, like Dr. Dorner said we aren't going to get rid of them masks may be around a long time we don't know what the future holds but I think we're at a point where we can make them optional, and make it a family decision, if students and staff want to wear masks and they can wear masks if they feel they do not want to wear masks and they don't have to I think that's where we're at right now, at this point in time.

Mrs. Weisser- I called KRMC public relations currently, they have six COVID patients. On the flip side 28.5% of Mohave County residents are vaccinated. That's really, really low when we need 70% per immunity. CDC the operational strategy for K-12 schools through phase prevention. It reiterates regardless of the level of community transmission, it is critical that schools use and layer prevention strategies. Five key prevention strategies are essential to safe delivery of in person instruction and helps prevent COVID-19 transmission in schools, #1 universal and correct use of masks. #2 physical distancing, #3 handwashing respiratory etiquette, #4 cleaning and maintaining healthy facilities, and #5 contact tracing. Schools providing in person instruction should prioritize to prevention

strategies. #1 Universal and correct use of masks, should be required. #2 physical distancing to be maximized to the greatest extent possible. That's the CDC, John Hopkins is very similar. Nobody knows exactly what all is going on, except that this is respiratory and it comes out through the nose and mouth and it comes in through the nose and mouth. CDC still guides us to make sure we're requiring everybody's wearing masks. We stated back at the beginning of the second semester in January. We want to stay consistent through all second semester. I mean, if we change it now, we're not doing that. Consistency is something we train and teach our students. We are trying to produce children who will be happy, well adjusted successful in their own minds, as adults, inherent is that is safety. Are we going to allow teachers to say, it's my classroom? These are my classroom rules and masks are mandated. Are we going to allow them to do that? This is a pandemic. Those are my statements. Thank you.

Mr. Jacks- My thoughts were throughout this whole pandemic KUSD staff, KUSD schools have really done an outstanding job throughout the whole process and think we all agree to that. When January came around, and the staff and the schools said you know we really ought to go back to virtual learning for a couple of weeks to kind of see where we are since we came out of the holidays, and they were right. That's what we ended up doing. But my point is, once again, we followed the advice that we got from the district and the schools. I think as far as board members we're not in the schools. We're not in there day to day, seeing what they're seeing. So, where I'm coming from, is if our schools the principals, say we can do this, and 70% of the staff says we can do this, and the district staff says, we can do this, I think it's worth giving it a try. If we do run into problems, then we'd have to go back to the masks.

Mrs. Shumway- The problem is, if things go wrong that's lives that we're talking about when things go wrong. Those are people's lives and future health complications because of it. So, I absolutely respect our teachers, but not to override CDC scientist's guidance. When Ducey announced his resending the mask requirement in schools, he cited the change of CDC guidelines, however, still on the CDC website it says under key points. School guidance all schools should implement and layer prevention strategies and should prioritize universal and correct use of masks and physical distancing. So, my point one Ducey lied to further his own agenda. ASBA Arizona School Board Association, who we use to help guide our policies put out a statement saying, quote unquote, they fear this will add to the concerns of some parents they already had regarding in person learning. While some parents might have reservations about sending their children to in person school. It was our commitment to our return to learn guide and mitigation strategies that have given them peace of mind this entire time, vaccines have not been approved for people under 16 years of age. Yet, the new COVID variants, South African, in particular, they found can break through the Pfizer vaccine has been found to be more contagious and harmful to young people, on our website and our mission statement number one strategic goal says that we will ensure student safety and KUSD number one priority and resources are allocated to meet changing strategies, and needs. That is what we said that we put students, safety first. Kathy Hoffman, Arizona superintendent of public instruction, put out a statement condemning Ducey's move, and said, quote unquote, universal masking has allowed schools to operate safely during the pandemic. The community spread data within the schools has been significantly less than the community spread, taking place in Kingman proper. This can be attributed to the adherence to the return to learning guide, and the staff, students and teachers doing their part to follow the guide and teach each other safe. Even Lucero and Young, at various times in last meetings attributed their willingness to go to in person learning, because of the well designs, returned to learn guide and the safety it provided our students and employees. Roger, when he was out campaigning on his Facebook page, Roger Jacks for school board, he actually was supporting masks before it was taken down. In conclusion, there is enough research and data to support using masks, and doing so has kept the children in our community, learning, and safe. This is why I'm here, and the other board members here want that to, if they want to continue keeping our staff, our students, our community safe, they will vote to keep the mask requirements in our schools and in our return to learn guide. Thank you.

Mrs. Young- I have two questions. Since the Governor did away with the mandate of the masks what's our liability enforcing it and what is Kingman Academy doing? Mandated for masks, and if students come to school without masks because the Governor has said, release that mandate. How do we enforce it?

Mrs. Shumway- Well imagine it's like any uniform policy, we require it. We would give them a mask which we have been doing.

Dr. Dorner- We'd have people ask us about, civil liberties, there's no precedents for this and we've made it through the year and I'm really proud of our community for wearing the masks when they didn't want to, because many, many, many of them haven't wanted to, and they have, for the sake of keeping schools open kept their masks on. I am nervous about the next step, KAOL has made it optional. I think Emmanuel Christian has made it optional. One of the board members shared a list Phoenix Union Mesa some of the larger districts in Phoenix are keeping the mask mandate going. So now we've got different schools doing different things. We're going to add into this chaotic year, our kids going to withdraw or they're going to refuse or they're going to show up and say my civil liberties are being denied, I have no idea board member Young, what tomorrow will bring I wish I knew, that I don't know.

Mrs. Young- That was my concern about the civil liberties of our students, our parents.

Dr. Dorner- We do have a right to have a board policy and to enforce it.

Mrs. Young- So, the Academy went optional?

Mrs. Dorner- Yes

Mrs. Young- I'm kind of confused because I been watching on COVID, on C span, and I've listened to Dr. Fauci and I visited CDC, and there's been a lot of contradictions. What about on the buses they are closer together?

Dr. Dorner- I've been thinking this afternoon and I did propose this to the principals and I'll share my mindset because I wasn't exactly sure where this conversation would go. I like the idea of coming to a mutual collaborative decision. We really need to keep the mandate going here, or let's make it optional. Is there any way to tier it a little bit because the CDC has reduced to six feet down, the social distance has been brought a little closer and we can fit more kids

within those parameters in the classrooms? If kids are at their desks or if they're in a room like we're in and the teachers at the front, can they have a break from masks under those circumstances where they're stationary and there's not movement and they have space, does it have to be all or nothing, I guess is the question.

Mrs. Shumway- That's a broader question and it requires some really well thought out strategy, because what you're saying we can't just put out a blanket statement. With those ideas going through our heads and that was what the return to learn guide did, it took our thoughts that were swirling around with all of the data that was coming in, and we clearly put out in this scenario, this is what's required, in this scenario this, so to rethink that and provide these options, requires us to dig into that return to learn guide, and really put that plan in place.

Dr. Dorner- They were the original options board member Shumway where we, talked about if there's less than 10 people in a room in their space. If we had several scenarios. I'm not making this recommendation or asking you to go this direction but I am sharing the idea. Well mask not required in Arizona schools ADHS is still encouraging schools to wash hands, utilize sanitizer, clean, maintain health facilities, and stay home when sick. So, I wondered, you know, why are masks, not on the list from ADHS, they're still on the CDC, there is a lot of confusion surrounding this. It's just another approach to look at. If the world is changing and we're evolving. Does it have to be masks on or masks off? Can it be just like we had in the return to learn guide originally, they're not at lunch, they're not at recess, they're not in smaller groups with the space but if you're moving in the hallway or you're in a collaborative setting the masks need to go on in other words, nobody should be showing up without them.

Mrs. Shumway- Now the return to learn guides is always, no exception.

Dr. Dorner- No, the Governor Ducey mandate trumps the return to learn guide last fall. When we did not update it to include we just said it supersedes what was in the guide but, we still have the original wording. It's just an idea.

Mrs. Shumway- How many students do we have in a classroom, our biggest classroom versus our smaller classroom.

Dr. Dorner- Their range is in the mid to high teens to the mid to high 20s.

Mrs. Shumway- Even in our high schools and they have that definite three feet between them at all times.

Dr. Dorner- In many or most cases. Each principal could tell you, every classroom in their building. We have a Manzanita representative, she teaches music which is a little different.

Mrs. Shumway- So, it's different because you only have one class at a time.

Susan- I have seven classes a day, eight on another day so I average 200 students a day through my room. There is a lot of data out there, the music community came together and did concrete data on aerosol transmissions through singing through all different types of instrument playing, and I can send that to you, and is the guideline for singing without masks on, is 12 feet.

Mrs. Shumway- I can tell you in an elementary classroom, we are singing every day. Even in a fifth-grade class. We use singing and body mapping all day long. So, doesn't have to be a music class to be singing. When you're an effective teacher. We only have five weeks left of school if we could just be consistent.

Dr. Lucero- We've been consistent I think for me, when we're talking consistently we're talking about leaving kids in school full time versus going back to hybrid or going back to virtual, I think that's the consistency in the model.

Mrs. Weisser- We allow it to be optional so there's enough room, your class sizes are small enough, you've enough room in your classroom, you can go without masks because there's enough distancing, but then you have to make sure that they're getting their masks on before they get out of the classroom and in the hallway. That becomes a nightmare for every teacher.

Mrs. Shumway- You've got actual teachers on this board, who have had to manage going to uniforms from not requiring uniforms it was difficult. So, in a year where we are rounding it out we're about to finish. Students are just getting into a groove, but wait, but maybe this, but perhaps here, you're going to create a mud pit.

Dr. Lucero- Mrs. Weisser what's going to change now verse, in July? Are you considering or are you thinking possibly that we could be wearing masks, or we could be having a mask mandate in our schools, in July, when we start the next school year?

Mrs. Weisser- No, I'm actually very hopeful that beginning next school year we won't have to have mask.

Dr. Lucero- You think there's a possibility we still will.

Mrs. Weisser- Because of the UK variant, the South African variant, I mean, the fact that they're hitting the kids, it's all dependent on how much vaccination we'd get done, how much per community we get done, but I think we're really close that we could make it to not need mask at the beginning of the school year again.

Mrs. Shumway- If nothing else, that gives us time to lay those options out into a return to learn guide for the 21/22 school year, that provides those options to start fresh and give the teachers that they do need that option. The option, but we clearly write it out because we've taken the time to do it.

Mrs. Weisser- Another thing that I skipped over in my list of things was bullying. I'm really concerned about bullying we make it optional because all of a sudden, you've kids that are going to be saying, you're not wearing a mask you need your mask and other kids going, you're silly ha ha you have to wear a mask, you know, it's going to be rampant, all through the classroom.

Dr. Dorner- Board member Weisser, do you think that will be a problem also in July? I still feel there will be families and adults who will continue to wear masks beyond the borders of the school year so I think that conversation is going to have to be dealt with.

Mrs. Weisser- I think that we would have a better opportunity because at the beginning of the next school year, people we will have a better idea of knowing where we're at. For one thing, at that point. and people will choose if they're going to go virtual or not because they've gone through this already. I'm just looking at, it's the end of the year. We're almost done. I do understand too that we're looking at graduation and people want to be able to not only have graduation but they want to be able to have their pictures, and they want to be able to enjoy their graduation and get

on school grounds without having to wear a mask. We're going to be outside. I don't see why we would have to have a mask mandate at graduation.

Dr. Dorner- We're going to have challenges regardless whether you vote this evening to continue or you vote this evening to modify. We just have to decide which set of challenges.

Mr. Jacks- What would you foresee as far as phasing and if we went to an optional plan. Would there be some time that would be needed to work with the schools?

Dr. Dorner- Like continue masks until the May board meeting.

Mr. Jacks- I just thrown that out as an idea.

Mrs. Shumway- I think we're just looking for something to grab a hold of. I mean this entire year. It feels like we're all treading water, and the minute we get a log to grab we do. Masks on both sides. One side, recognize that this might just be one of those evils that we have to accept so that we can get our kids in school, that we can have our schedule back so we can get back to work. The other side was like, I don't really want to be in school but at least there's masks. We all kind of grabbed a hold of this log. And all we're just asking this hold let us hold on for a couple more weeks.

Mrs. Weisser- Keep the consistency and I'm referring to, it's a mandate that this has been a school policy everybody's used to it. That's consistency, and not requiring more of the teachers right now, at the end of the year.

Mrs. Young- Does the city still have a mandate for masks?

Mrs. Shumway- Are you not here in Kingman?

Dr. Dorner- The state and city mandate were gone; the school was left.

Mrs. Young- These kids are still out in the community where they aren't wearing masks.

Mrs. Shumway- Well it's optional right, it might be.

Mrs. Young- If it's optional in the city I don't see why we can't go to school.

Mrs. Weisser- Isn't it required in the city buildings and in county buildings. Masks are still required in the city buildings and in the county.

Mrs. Shumway- I don't know about the county but in the city, Yes. The teachers have to be there. They have to be in this room specifically for this amount of time. They can't recognize that a room is full, and they step out, they don't have that option to escape when they feel uncomfortable.

Dr. Lucero- As a board member, I look at my role as representing our community and trying to make the best decision. The information we have is that all the principals except for one thought that making mask optional could work in the schools. We have 70% of the survey that was sent out yes, we would like to see an optional mask policy in the schools. I'm looking at it that way that's what our constituents are asking for.

Mrs. Shumway- I guess it depends on who you talk to. I had four families in particular message me today that if the mask mandate goes away and it's optional, they will be unenrolling their children tomorrow.

Dr. Dorner- I had a family saying, if it doesn't go away I will be unenrolling my children. I think you said it perfectly board member Shumway a minute ago about that log analogy.

Mrs. Young- You're going to have that on both sides.

Mrs. Shumway- The differences the one side is mad the other side is scared. I can feel more toward the family that is afraid for their health versus being mad or throwing a tantrum.

Dr. Lucero- What do you mean by they're mad?

Mrs. Shumway- They're upset because they still have to wear masks versus the people that wants people to wear masks for their own safety. They're afraid. I can feel for the people that are afraid, versus the people that are just mad, they have to wear them.

Dr. Dorner- I don't feel like we should minimize anyone.

Mrs. Shumway- I'm not minimizing their opinion, I'm telling you that I feel for them. People that are afraid for their family's health or their children's health.

Mrs. Weisser- For me it comes down to the consistency and the bullying and the additional classroom management. I'm afraid we are going to lose teachers over this stress load.

Dr. Lucero- Most of the teachers are asking, or the staff is asking, an optional policy.

Mrs. Weisser- I don't know how to find a compromise, because of all the things we've talked about, I don't know how we find a policy that's a compromise.

Mrs. Shumway- I think the compromise is going to happen this summer, when we rebuild that return to learn guide with those options, and we really sit down and think about that. I think that's where the compromise is going to be useful, because that's where we'll be able to come out of a school year, we will have learned what we learned and learned what we don't know and be able to really put pen to paper about these options that we're speaking about. That's going to compromise to me, will be the best and most logical.

Mrs. Weisser- Well, if we go optional I won't be voting for optional. Then we're going to be dealing with close proximity in hallways, and at the high school level, they're old enough to carry and transmit. That's scary.

Mrs. Shumway- I make the motion that we leave the mask policy in place, as it has been, and continue forward until our June or July meeting to revisit the return to learn guide.

Dr. Lucero- We have we a motion; do we have a second?

Mrs. Weisser- I will second that.

Dr. Lucero- We will do a roll call,

Mrs. Young- No

Mrs. Weisser- Yes

Dr. Lucero- No

Mr. Jacks- No

Mrs. Shumway- Yes

Dr. Lucero- The motion fails 2-3

Dr. Lucero- Do we have another motion or discussion?

Mr. Jacks- I'll make a motion that we go with the optional mask requirement, at KUSD, except on the buses, the buses would have mandatory masks.

Dr. Lucero- We have a motion; do we have a second?

Mrs. Young- I will second

Dr. Lucero- Any discussion? No discussion so we will do a roll call vote

Mrs. Young- Yes

Mrs. Weisser- No

Dr. Lucero- Yes

Mr. Jacks- Yes

Mrs. Shumway- No

Dr. Lucero- Motion passes, 3-2

Motion was made by Mr. Jacks to go with optional mask requirement at KUSD except on the buses, the buses would have mandatory masks.

Motion was seconded by Mrs. Young

Motion passed in favor 3-2

6) Adjourn @ 7:25 pm

(Action)

Motion to adjourn was made by Dr. Lucero

Motion was second by Mr. Jacks

Dr. Charles Lucero, President

Mr. Roger Jacks, Vice President